

Defining Differences:

The Religious Dimension of Early
Modern English Travel Narratives,
c. 1550 - c. 1800

PhD History, 2015

Hector Benjamin Roddan

71,981 words

Contents

Declarations	iv
Notice of Submission	v
Summary	vi
Acknowledgements	vii
Note on Sources	ix

Chapter 1	1
Introduction: Transnational Perspectives and Early Modern English Travel Writing, c.1550 – c.1800	

Perspectives: Travel and Religion

Chapter 2	40
Hakluyt Remembered and Hakluyt Reinterpreted: Two Key Moments in Early Modern Protestant Uses and Reuses of Travel Writing	
Chapter 3	78
'Coining a New Kind of Doctrine and Religion': Mahomet and Providence in William Biddulph's <i>Travels</i> (1609) and Henry Blount's <i>Journey</i> (1636)	

Deviants: Unbelievers and Witches

Chapter 4	116
Slavery, Apostasy and Conversion: Negotiating Religious Identity in Joseph Pitts' <i>True and Faithful Account of the Religion and Manners of the Mahometans</i> (1704)	
Chapter 5	152
'Some Things may seeme Fabulous, and in maner Incredible': Witchcraft and the Supernatural in European Travellers' Accounts of Lapp Rituals, (c. 1550 – c. 1700)	

Dissidents: Freethinkers and Evangelicals

Chapter 6	181
'To trace all forms of Divine Worship to one Sacred and Primeval Source': Deism and Heterodoxy in Eighteenth-Century Orientalist Travel Writing	
Chapter 7	224
'Tahiti Has Its Own Customs, and Other Countries Have Theirs': Congregationalism and Indigenous Beliefs in the London Missionary Society <i>Transactions</i> (1796-1815)	
Chapter 8	262
Conclusion	
Bibliography	289

Declarations

DECLARATION

This work has not been submitted in substance for any other degree or award at this or any other university or place of learning, nor is being submitted concurrently in candidature for any degree or other award.

Signed (candidate) Date: 17 / 12 / 2015

STATEMENT 1

This thesis is being submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of PhD

Signed (candidate) Date: 17 / 12 / 2015

STATEMENT 2

This thesis is the result of my own independent work/investigation, except where otherwise stated.

Other sources are acknowledged by explicit references. The views expressed are my own.

Signed (candidate) Date: 17 / 12 / 2015

STATEMENT 3

I hereby give consent for my thesis, if accepted, to be available for photocopying and for inter-library loan, and for the title and summary to be made available to outside organisations.

Signed (candidate) Date: 17 / 12 / 2015

STATEMENT 4: PREVIOUSLY APPROVED BAR ON ACCESS

I hereby give consent for my thesis, if accepted, to be available for photocopying and for inter-library loans **after expiry of a bar on access previously approved by the Academic Standards & Quality Committee.**

Signed (candidate) Date: 17 / 12 / 2015

Notice of Submission of Thesis

NOTICE OF SUBMISSION OF THESIS: POSTGRADUATE RESEARCH DEGREES

SECTION A: TO BE COMPLETED BY THE CANDIDATE AND SUBMITTED WITH THE THESIS

CANDIDATE'S LAST NAME	Roddan	
CANDIDATE'S FIRST NAME(S)	Hector Benjamin	
CANDIDATE'S ID NUMBER	0504878	
SCHOOL	SHARE	
TITLE OF DEGREE	PhD History	
FULL TITLE OF THESIS	Defining Differences: The Religious Dimension of Early Modern English Travel Narratives, c. 1550 - c. 1800	
IS THIS A RESUBMISSION?	YES	
THESIS SUBMITTED FOR EXAMINATION IN	Permanent Binding <input type="checkbox"/> Temporary binding <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
CANDIDATE SIGNATURE		DATE: 17/12/15

Thesis Summary

Student ID Number:	0504878
Surname:	Roddan
First Names:	Hector Benjamin
School:	School of History, Archaeology and Religion
Title of Degree:	PhD - resubmission
Full Title of Thesis:	Defining Differences: The Religious Dimension of Early Modern English Travel Narratives, c. 1550 - c. 1800

Summary of Thesis:

This thesis explores the role of religious debates and ideas in published early modern English travel writing between c.1550 and c. 1800. It focuses on four principal regions: the Ottoman Empire and Islamic Mediterranean, Muscovy and western Siberia, British-administered India and adjoining territories, and the Pacific. I investigate connections between English accounts of religious beliefs and ritual practices in these areas and domestic theological norms and debates.

It investigates how travel writing practices and editorial conventions influenced the representation of other faiths. Specifically, it explores how domestic religious discourses concerning providence, apostasy, witchcraft, deism and congregationalism influenced representations of the rituals and practices of various other societies. Although the thesis considers published travel literature over a broad geographic area and long period of time, it also deepens our understanding of the confessional identities of particular traveller writers and editors.

It builds upon recent transnational scholarship and shows how confessional identities were articulated through reports of other societies beliefs and practices. This thesis aims to be more than simply another evaluation of Orientalism in a precolonial setting. It argues that confessional matters are central to our understanding of the wider role that travel literature played in early modern culture. It examines reports of deviant practices abroad and the travel narratives by dissident individuals and groups in order to highlight the transnational and cosmopolitan character of such literature. Representations of other societies' beliefs and practices served a variety of functions and emerged from specific intercultural encounters. Travel texts can thus be used to explore a range of orthodox and heterodox confessional perspectives.

Acknowledgements

This project could not have been completed without the generous financial support of an Arts and Humanities Research Council Block Grant Partnership Doctoral grant. I would also like to thank Cardiff University for financial support that facilitated various research visits and conference attendance.

I have enjoyed excellent supervision from Dr. Garthine Walker throughout my PhD. Her tireless feedback and guidance has enabled me to develop immensely as both a researcher and a writer. Her tireless pursuit of excellence in research has been an inspiration. Additionally, she has gone above and beyond the call of duty on numerous occasions in providing attentive pastoral support. For all of this, I am immensely grateful.

I am exceptionally grateful to my examiners, Dr. Simon Ditchfield and Dr. Lloyd Bowen, for their insightful comments and guidance on reframing and improving this thesis.

I am also grateful to Dr. Mark Williams for taking the time to discuss several of the ideas presented here, as well as general support and encouragement throughout the writing process.

I trialled many of the ideas in this thesis at conferences at University of Portsmouth, Nottingham University, Leeds University, UCL, Newcastle University and Northumbria University. I would like to thank all the organisers and participants at these events for their stimulating discussion, feedback and encouragement, especially the organisers of the Institute of Historical Research HistoryLab Plus seminars where I most recently spoke at length about my research.

I would like to thank staff in the Special Collections and Archives, Cardiff University (in particular, Peter Keelan, Alison Harvey and Lisa Webley) and the Asian and African Studies reading room at the British Library for invaluable help and assistance in using their collections.

Social networking has brought multiple benefits to this researcher. I would like to acknowledge with gratitude innumerable conversations with fellow researchers in a variety of fields via Twitter. This online community of fellow PhD students and other academics has provided superlative support, entertainment and mutual encouragement.

Various people were responsible for encouraging me to undertake a PhD, and so the pages in front of you would not exist were it not for the inspiration, faith and encouragement of Dave Thompson and Dr. Pete Dorey.

The pages you are about to read have benefitted from insightful comments and diligent proof reading by Karen Elwis, Phillip Jones, Steven Kenward, Emily Cottrell, Rob Callaghan, Lincoln Smith, Kate Neale and Kat Deerfield. I am grateful to them all for insightful comments and suggestions.

The last two years have been greatly enriched by the presence of Lincoln Smith in my life. Additionally, a number of friends and colleagues have provided support and guidance in the construction of this thesis.

Finally, I would not have been able to complete this thesis without the unending support, encouragement and love of my mother, Debbie Roddan.

Note on Sources

All contractions in quotations from original sources have been silently expanded. Repeated words have been silently corrected. Place names and proper nouns have been standardised and modernised. Otherwise, original spelling has been retained.

For clarity, I have endeavoured to avoid unnecessary foreign terms. Where essential, these are italicised with translations given in [square brackets] after the first mention.

A project of this scope requires clarity on the ethonyms used, especially for minority cultural and religious groups. My practice here has been to prefer contemporary terms found in my sources. For example:

- The term 'Mahomet'/'Mahometan' has been standardised throughout and, following Dimmock (2010) is used to distinguish European constructions of Islam from the Muslim faith (Islam), particularly in Chapters 3 and 4.
- The contemporary exonym 'Lapp' is preferred over 'Sami' for the western Siberian peoples discussed in Chapter 5 since it is difficult to map modern ethnic identities onto early modern travel reports.
- Likewise, 'Burmese' is preferred over 'Ava'/'Pegu' and various other exonyms and autonyms used in my sources, chiefly in Chapter Six.
- In Chapter 7, for Tahitian names, artefacts and institutions, I follow the forms and definitions given in Jessop (2010) and other recent works, including Smith (2010) and Lamb et al (2000).

For texts included in Hakluyt's *The Principal Navigations* (1589, 1598-1600), I cite the original author and date composed where Hakluyt has specified these. Not only does this allow readers to easily locate particular sections via the various online editions of the text, it also emphasises the piecemeal structure of the text.

Chapter 1

Introduction: Transnational Perspectives and Early Modern English Travel Writing, c.1550 – c.1800

This thesis explores how travellers represented themselves, their own confessional identities and the other religious worlds they encountered between c. 1550 and c. 1800. It will investigate how divisive religious issues impinged upon Anglophone descriptions of other cultures' beliefs as well as how representations of foreign doctrines and ceremonies influenced domestic religious debates. Religious questions have been sidelined in much recent scholarship on early modern travel writing and this thesis sets out to redress that balance by exploring how travellers engaged with a range of confessional issues during a period of unprecedented religious change in England and the wider Christian world. This period saw marked religious and philosophical transformations as first the Reformation and then the Enlightenment transformed Christian religious beliefs and practices.¹ Simultaneously, England's overseas trade expanded dramatically, leading to formal and informal empires with substantial economic and political influence. Formal and informal colonial enterprises brought European social, religious, economic and political forms into contact and conflict with other societies on a global scale.² This thesis

¹ The following is an indicative list of scholarship on the English religious change: Gary S. De Krey, 'Between Revolutions: Re-Appraising the Restoration in Britain', *History Compass*, 6/3 (2008), pp. 738-73; Peter Marshall, '(Re)defining the English Reformation', *Journal of British Studies*, 48.3 (2009), pp. 564-86; *The Impact of the English Reformation, 1500-1640*, ed. by Peter Marshall (London and New York: Arnold, 1997); Michael Questier, *Conversion, Politics and Religion in England, 1580-1625* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996); John Spurr, 'The English "Post-Reformation"?', *The Journal of Modern History*, 74.1 (2002), pp. 101-19; Patrick Collinson, *The Reformation* (London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 2003); Eamon Duffy, *Saints, Sacrilege and Sedition: Religion and Conflict in the Tudor Reformations* (London: Bloomsbury, 2012); Caroline Litzenberger, 'Defining the Church of England: Religious Change in the 1570s', in *Belief and Practice in Reformation England: A Tribute to Patrick Collinson from His Students*, ed. by Susan Wabuda and Caroline Litzenberger (Aldershot: Ashgate, 1998), pp. 137-53; David Loades, *Revolution in Religion: The English Reformation 1530-1570* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1992); Stephen Buick, '"We Are yet Strangers in Our Own Country": Foreign and Mysterious Elements in the Elizabethan Settlement of Religion', in *The Mysterious and the Foreign in Early Modern England*, ed. by Helen Ostovich, Mary V. Silcox, and Graham Roebuck (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2008), pp. 234-48 (pp. 234-5).

² The historiography of British imperial power is extensive. See, for example, David Armitage, 'The Elizabethan Idea of Empire', *Transactions of Royal Historical Society*, 14 (2004), pp. 269-77; Linda Colley, *Captives: Britain, Empire and the World, 1600-1850* (London: Jonathan Cape, 2002); Lesley B. Cormack, 'Britannia Rules the Waves?: Images of Empire in Elizabethan

seeks to understand how various kinds of travellers articulated their confessional outlooks through writing about encounters with different beliefs and practices. I show how travel texts drew upon and were influenced by wider religious discourses at home, and examine how the fragmentation and transformation of domestic Protestant belief and practice during this period were reflected in representations of other religions.

I examine English travel writing about the Levant, North Africa, Russia, Lapland, India and the Pacific from (approximately) the Elizabethan Religious Settlement in 1558 through to the outbreak of revivalism in the early nineteenth century. In recent scholarship, the religious element of early modern travel literature has been downplayed in favour of a focus on the political and economic dimensions of nascent colonialism.³ This thesis explores how various English religious discourses influenced contemporary travel texts, including debates around providence, apostasy, witchcraft/magic, deism and Congregationalism. Clearly, this is not a comprehensive list of early modern religious contentions. Rather, these issues recur within the travel texts I have examined and provide the opportunity to reflect upon how individual

England', in *Literature, Mapping and the Politics of Space in Early Modern Britain*, ed. by Andrew Gordon and Bernhard Klein (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), pp. 45-68; Natasha Glaisyer, 'Networking: Trade and Exchange in the Eighteenth-Century British Empire', *The Historical Journal*, 47.2 (2004), pp. 451-76; Stephen H. Gregg, 'Introduction', in *Empire and Identity: An Eighteenth Century Sourcebook* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 1-25; Harriet Guest, *Empire, Barbarism, and Civilisation: James Cook, William Hodges, and the Return to the Pacific* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007); Jessica L. Harland-Jacobs, 'Incorporating the King's New Subjects: Accommodation and Anti-Catholicism in the British Empire, 1763-1815', *Journal of Religious History*, 39.2 (2014), pp. 1-21; Gerald MacLean, *Looking East: English Writing and the Ottoman Empire before 1800* (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007). A useful overview of global history during the early modern period can be found in Jack A. Goldstone, 'The Problem of the "Early Modern" World', *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient*, 41.3 (1998), pp. 249-84.

³ For the conventional view of travel literature, colonialism and imperial expansion, good overviews can be found in William H. Sherman, 'Settings and Searchings (1500-1700)', in *The Cambridge Companion to Travel Writing*, ed. by Peter Hulme and Tim Youngs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 17-36; Peter Hulme and Tim Youngs, 'Introduction', in *The Cambridge Companion to Travel Writing*, ed. by Peter Hulme and Tim Youngs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 1-16. On the formal structures, narratological and phonological features of the genre of travel writing, see David Chirico, 'The Travel Narrative as a (Literary) Genre', in *Under Eastern Eyes: A Comparative Introduction to East European Travel Writing in Europe*, ed. by Wendy Bracewell and Alex Drace-Francis (Budapest: Central European University Press, 2008), pp. 27-60 (pp. 37-59).

travellers' religious identities influenced their representations of their experiences overseas.

Kim Phillips has observed that there is much yet to be written about the religious identities of medieval travellers.⁴ Phillips' comments highlight the degree to which religious questions have been marginalised in scholarship on travel and intercultural encounter, though recent scholarship has begun to change that. For instance, Urs App's study of the religious identities of eighteenth-century Orientalists argues that contemporary Orientalism was as much a religious phenomenon as it was a politico-legal one.⁵ In Robert Travers' analysis, European knowledge of Indian traditions legitimated colonial rule in ostensibly Indian ways meaning that colonial appropriation and reverse transculturation are impossible to extricate from each other. Michael J. Franklin has recently observed that British Orientalists in eighteenth-century India were entirely comfortable with the knowledge that their historical and religious knowledge of Indian traditions facilitated rule by a tiny British elite.⁶ For the sixteenth century, Carina L. Johnson has explored in detail the different ways in which Habsburg writers mediated different forms of religious and civilisational difference amongst Muslims and Mesoamericans.⁷ I have also

⁴ Kim Phillips, *Before Orientalism: Asian People and Cultures in European Travel Writing, 1245-1510* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013), p. 11.

⁵ Urs App, *The Birth of Orientalism* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010), pp. xi-xiii.

⁶ Michael J. Franklin, *Orientalist Jones: Sir William Jones, Poet, Lawyer, and Linguist, 1746-1794* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), pp. 19-20; Robert Travers, *Ideology and Empire in Eighteenth-Century India* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007); Paul Stevens and Rahul Sapra, 'Akbar's Dream: Mughal Toleration and English/British Orientalism', *Modern Philology*, 104.3 (2007), pp. 379-411; Amal Chatterjee, *Representations of India, 1740-1840: The Creation of India in the Colonial Imagination* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2001); Natasha Eaton, 'Between Mimesis and Alterity: Art, Gift, and Diplomacy in Colonial India, 1770-1800', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 46.4 (2004), pp. 816-44. On complex economic relations, see Glaisyer, 'Trade and Exchange', pp. 451-76. A general overview of the period and Anglo-Indian relations can be found in Christopher Alan Bayly, *The New Cambridge History of India: Indian Society and the Making of the British Empire* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), II. For a catalogue of English accounts of Mughal India, see Meera Nanda, *European Travel Accounts During the Reigns of Shahjahan and Aurangzeb* (Kurukshetra: Nirmal Book Agency, 1994).

⁷ Carina L. Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy in Sixteenth-Century Europe: The Ottomans and Mexicans* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), pp. 262-9. On different visions of the Mughal Empire, see Saleema Waaraich, 'Competing and Complementary Visions of the Court of the Great Mogor', in *Seeing Across Cultures in the Early Modern World*, ed. by Dana Liebsohn and Jeanette Favrot Peterson (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 73-96.

been influenced by Rahul Sapra's argument that seventeenth-century European appraisals of Mughal society were based on two axes – of civility versus barbarism and religious orthodoxy versus heresy.⁸ Both Sapra and Johnson take a transnational approach, emphasising the entangled and complex nature of interactions between travellers and their host societies.⁹

This thesis is also indebted to recent postcolonial scholarship. However, by engaging with the questions and issues raised by the transnational turn, it aims to be more than simply another investigation of Orientalism in a precolonial setting.¹⁰ Alison Games' study of cosmopolitanism emphasises the fragmented nature of religious authority both in England and her overseas territories. The lack of any singular 'religious settlement' at home led English 'religious expression overseas' to be defined by 'heterogeneity and dispute and experimentation and, often, toleration'. The British Empire had its origins in 'the schismatic, innovative and dispersed nature of religious settlement' and was a consequence of 'decades of instability' at home.¹¹ Amongst English travellers, both ecumenism and fanaticism could provoke hostile comment. When John Covel, who had previously served as a chaplain to the English in Istanbul, took a posting serving the English Protestant community in Rome, it was rumoured that he had converted to Catholicism. Covel 'articulated a cosmopolitan posture' in his defence, whilst maintaining that he 'knew with certainty that he was Protestant'.¹² In contrast, William Biddulph was told that he would be recalled to England if he persisted in being so

⁸ Rahul Sapra, *The Limits of Orientalism: Seventeenth Century Representations of India* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2011), pp. 12-14, 29, 76, 124.

⁹ Sapra, *Limits of Orientalism*, pp. 29-32.

¹⁰ The following examples of transnational historiography have been particularly influential: Nancy Bisaha, *Creating East and West: Renaissance Humanists and the Ottoman Turks* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004); Alison Games, *The Web of Empire: English Cosmopolitans in an Age of Expansion, 1560-1660* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008); E. Natalie Rothman, *Brokering Empire: Trans-Imperial Subjects between Venice and Istanbul* (New York: Cornell University Press, 2012); Suzanne L. Marchand, *German Orientalism in the Age of Empire: Religion, Race and Scholarship* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009).

¹¹ Games, *Web of Empire*, p. 253.

¹² Games, *Web of Empire*, pp. 236-7, citing Covel to George Davis (consul at Naples), 5 July 1678, Rome, Add. 22,910, fols. 164r-165r, BL. Covel noted that the accusations against him implied that 'a man should not read and view the religious practices of others' if he wished to maintain his reputation (p. 237).

‘combative’ with his employers. Biddulph’s fiery Protestantism had antagonised the English factors he was sent to minister to at Aleppo.¹³

These examples attest to the conflicts between orthodoxy and heterodoxy within the ‘morally ambiguous world of trade factories and colonies’.¹⁴ Individuals attached to overseas ventures, whether as traders, ambassadors, craftsmen, seamen, antiquarians or missionaries, wrote all of the texts examined here. Like Games’ ministers, the sources I consider mingled together a variety of interests that are, in some respects and to differing extents, all fundamentally connected with the emergence of European imperialism and the various cosmopolitan outlooks that it engendered. Trade and economic gain, both personal and patriotic, were key motivating forces for travel, yet this was often conjoined with curiosity about ancient languages and religions, Scriptural history or contemporary polytheisms.¹⁵ The extent to which these activities were compatible with the evangelical impulse is a recurring theme of this present work. Writing in and about different religious contexts, all the travellers I consider here came to different accommodations concerning the propriety or otherwise of indigenous religious practices and the necessity or otherwise of rhetorically highlighting or seeking to reform perceived religious errors.¹⁶

All the travellers discussed here operated within transnational spaces in which signifiers of political, social, religious and commercial affiliation were prevalent.¹⁷ We cannot know how these individuals really mediated or negotiated day-to-day business in these circumstances.¹⁸

¹³ Games, *Web of Empire*, p. 226, citing Levant Company to William Biddulph, June 1607, SP 105/110, fol. 10 recto, TNA: PRO. Biddulph’s travel writing is explored in Chapter 3 below, pp. 78-115.

¹⁴ Games, *Web of Empire*, p. 238.

¹⁵ Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, p. 40; Jonathan Sheehan, ‘The Altars of the Idols: Religion, Sacrifice, and the Early Modern Polity’, *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67.4 (2006), pp. 649-73; Joan Pau Rubiés, ‘Instructions for Travellers: Teaching the Eye to See’, *History and Anthropology*, 9.2-3 (1996), pp. 139-91 (pp. 151-2, 154-5, 162-6).

¹⁶ Individual responses within individual communities could vary substantially, see, for example, Wendy Woodward, ‘The Petticoat and the Kaross: Missionary Bodies and the Feminine in the London Missionary Society, 1816-1828’, *Kronos*, 23 (1996), pp. 91-107 (pp. 104-6).

¹⁷ Sapra, *Limits of Orientalism*, pp. 60-88.

¹⁸ Sanjay Subrahmanyam, *Three Ways to Be Alien: Travails and Encounters in the Early Modern World* (Waltham: Brandeis University Press, 2011), pp. 15, 21-2. On go-betweens in Anglo-

However, their published works do indicate the limits of toleration and the forms of cosmopolitan identity that were considered acceptable, and how these varied in different locales at different times and between individuals of different status or confessional allegiances.¹⁹

This chapter is divided into four parts. Firstly, I situate my research in the context of recent scholarship on transnational approaches to travel writing and cultural exchange. Secondly, I provide a brief sketch of the evolution of Protestantism in England over the *longue durée* of this thesis. This context foregrounds the connective tissue that links the geographically and temporally diverse travel texts both with each other and with wider English religious culture. The third section populates this chronology with discussion of the specific travel texts upon which the

European relations, see Andreas Höfele and Werner von Koppenfels, *Renaissance Go-Betweens: Cultural Exchange In Early Modern Europe* (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2005).

¹⁹ It is worth noting here that two significant indicators of difference – gender and race – do not figure in my analysis. Owing to the heavy gender bias within published travel narratives, especially for the earlier part of the period, European men wrote all my sources. Although missionary women and female travellers became more common during the eighteenth century, there is insufficient space to do justice to the multiple and contested discourses surrounding gender or race at home, let alone also in relation to travel abroad. A study of the relationship between racial and/or gendered discourses and travel over this long timeframe would require separate theses. On gender, race and early modern culture, see Gregg, 'Introduction', pp. 1-25; Kate J. P. Lowe, 'Introduction: The Black African Presence in Renaissance Europe', in *Black Africans in Renaissance Europe*, ed. by Kate J. P. Lowe and Thomas Foster Earle (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), pp. 1-14; Jean E. Howard, 'An English Lass Among The Moors: Gender, Race, Sexuality and Nationality Identity in Heywood's *The Fair Maiden Of The West*', in *Women, 'Race' and Writing in the Early Modern Period*, ed. by Margo Hendricks and Patricia Parker (London and New York: Routledge, 1994), pp. 101-17; Bernadette Andrea, 'The Tartar Girl, The Persian Princess, And Early Modern English Women's Authorship from Elizabeth I to Mary Wroth', in *Women Writing Back/Writing Women Back: Transnational Perspectives from the Late Middle Ages to the Dawn of the Modern Era*, ed. by Suzanna van Dijk, Anke Gilleir, and Alicia Montoya (Leiden: Brill, 2010), pp. 257-82; Lady Mary Wortley Montagu, 'Letters... Written, during Her Travels in Europe, Asia and Africa (1763)', in *Empire and Identity: An Eighteenth Century Sourcebook*, by Stephen H. Gregg (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 96-103; Billie Melman, *Women's Orients: English Women and the Middle East, 1718-1918: Sexuality, Religion and Work* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1995); David M. Whitford, *The Curse of Ham in the Early Modern Era: The Bible and the Justifications for Slavery* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009); Nancy Shoemaker, *A Strange Likeness: Becoming Red and White in Eighteenth-Century North America* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004). On missionary women, see Anna Johnston, *Missionary Writing and Empire, 1800-1860* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003); Jayachitra Lalitha, 'Did LMS Women Missionaries "Save" Native Women? Triple Colonisation of the Travancore Bible Women in the 19th Century', in *Construction of the Other, Identification of the Self: German Mission in India*, ed. by Martin Tamcke and Gladson Jathanna (Zurich & Berlin: Lit Verlag Münster, 2012), pp. 55-66; Jayachitra Lalitha, 'Postcolonial Feminism, The Bible and Native Indian Women', in *Evangelical Postcolonial Conversations: Global Awakenings in Theology and Praxis*, ed. by Kay Higuera Smith, Jayachitra Lalitha, and L. Daniel Hawk (Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 2014), pp. 75-87.

thesis focuses. I shall also highlight their common features and generic diversity, encompassing a range of subgenres of early modern travel writing. Finally, a brief outline of the thesis structure will introduce each section and chapter of the work that follows.

Context I: Entangled Histories and Early Modern Travel

I draw upon transnational and postcolonial scholarship throughout this thesis, bringing together approaches that emphasise the historical specificity of individual intercultural interactions and a wider body of discursive scholarship concerning the representation of these encounters.²⁰ On the postcolonial side, due respect must be paid to Edward Said's *Orientalism* (1978), arguably the founding text of postcolonial historiography and literary criticism. In Said's original formulation, European academic study of Asian societies tended to homogenise diverse cultures in order to facilitate a 'binary distinction' between the Orient and Occident. This validated an 'ideologically loaded discourse by which western societies have extended... and justified political, economic and other domination over eastern territories'.²¹ Despite Said's acknowledgment of the 'partisan' and polemical nature of his most famous work, its influence has been subtle.²² In the thirty years since the

²⁰ For a good overview of historiographical approaches with a similar *longue durée*, see James Harper, 'Introduction', in *The Turk and Islam in the Western Eye, 1450-1750*, ed. by James G. Harper (Ashgate: Farnham, 2011), pp. 1-20 (pp. 1-9). On literary traditions and historical specificity, see Alex Drace-Francis, 'Towards a Natural History of East European Travel Writing', in *Under Eastern Eyes: A Comparative Introduction to East European Travel Writing in Europe*, ed. by Wendy Bracewell and Alex Drace-Francis (Budapest: Central European University Press, 2008), pp. 1-26 (p. 15).

²¹ Edward W. Said, *Orientalism*, (London and New York: Penguin, 1978, 2005), pp. 20-1, 52, 54-7, 72-4, 101-6, 153-7, 260-3; Phillips, *Before Orientalism*, pp. 16-17. See also Ivo Kamps and Jyotsna G. Singh, 'Introduction', in *Travel Knowledge: European 'Discoveries' in the Early Modern Period*, ed. by Ivo Kamps and Jyotsna G. Singh (New York: Palgrave, 2001), pp. 1-17. For a good introduction to Said and postcolonial theory, see Robert Young, *Postcolonialism: An Historical Introduction* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2001), pp. 383-94.

²² Said himself described *Orientalism* as polemical, see Said, *Orientalism*, p. 340. For a selection of Said's other relevant works, see Edward W. Said, *Identity, Authority and Freedom: The Potentate and the Traveller* (Cape Town: University of Cape Town, 1991); Edward W. Said, 'Travelling Theory', in *The Edward Said Reader*, ed. by Moustafa Bayoumi and Andrew Rubin (New York: Random House, 2000), pp. 195-217; Edward W. Said, 'Travelling Theory Reconsidered', in *The Edward Said Reader*, ed. by Moustafa Bayoumi and Andrew Rubin (New York: Random House, 2000), pp. 436-52. On literary critical and historiographical reception of Said's theories, see Joshua Muravchik, 'Enough Said: The False Scholarship of Edward Said',

publication of *Orientalism*, literary scholars and historians have increasingly asked questions beyond the Orient/Occident dichotomy that characterises Said's work.²³

Whilst recent transnational scholarship has not superseded postcolonial categories in any straightforward manner, it has nonetheless underlined the problems associated with applying the insights of a 'partisan book' to historical analysis of premodern travellers' writings.²⁴ As Phillips states in her recent examination of late medieval representations of Asian cultures, Said's ideologically loaded view of the East-West binary 'has had wide utility and applications when treated as a tool for interpreting *certain* western representations of subjected cultures'. However, there are few 'specialists in Middle Eastern or Asian studies' who have been persuaded by his 'appraisal of... academic Orientalism' in the

World Affairs, (March/April 2013), <<http://www.worldaffairsjournal.org/article/enough-said-false-scholarship-edward-said>> [accessed 2 September 2014]; Daniel Martin Varisco, *Reading Orientalism: Said and the Unsaid* (Washington: University of Washington Press, 2007); M. G. Aune, 'Travel Writing After Orientalism', *Journal for Early Modern Cultural Studies*, 5.2 (2005), pp. 120-38; Jeffrey Cass, 'Introduction', in *Interrogating Orientalism: Contextual Approaches and Pedagogical Practices*, ed. by Diane Long Hoeveler and Jeffrey Cass (Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 2006), pp. 1-24; Raf Gelders and S. N. Balagangadhara, 'Rethinking Orientalism: Colonialism and the Study of Indian Traditions', *History of Religions*, 51.2 (2011), pp. 101-28; Jocelyn Hackforth-Jones and Mary Robert, 'Introduction: Visualising Culture across the Edges of Empires', in *Edges of Empire: Orientalism and Visual Culture*, ed. by Jocelyn Hackforth-Jones and Mary Robert (Oxford: Blackwell, 2005), pp. 1-19; Peter Heehs, 'Shades of Orientalism: Paradoxes and Problems in Indian Historiography', *History and Theory*, 42.2 (2003), pp. 169-95; Lisa Lowe, *Critical Terrains: British and French Orientalisms* (New York: Cornell University Press, 1991); Sucheta Mazumdar, Vasant Kaiwar and Thierry Labica, 'Introduction: From Orientalism to Postcolonialism: Asia, Europe and the Lineages of Difference', in *From Orientalism to Postcolonialism: Asia, Europe and the Lineages of Difference*, ed. by Sucheta Mazumdar, Vasant Kaiwar, and Thierry Labica (London: Routledge, 2009), pp. 1-16; Dennis Porter, 'Orientalism and Its Problems', in *Colonial Discourse and Postcolonial Theory: A Reader*, ed. by Laura Chrisman and Patrick Williams (Hemel Hempstead: Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1994), pp. 150-61; Gyan Prakash, 'Orientalism Now', *History and Theory*, 34.3 (1995), pp. 199-212; Emily C. Bartels, *Spectacles of Strangeness: Imperialism, Alienation and Marlowe* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1993), esp. pp. 54-6; Ali Behdad, *Belated Travellers: Orientalism in the Age of Colonial Dissolution* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1994); Dipesh Chakrabarty, *Provincializing Europe: Postcolonial Thought and Historical Difference* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000); Anthony Easthope, *Privileging Difference*, ed. by Catherine Belsey (Houndmills: Palgrave, 2002); Robert Irwin, *For Lust of Knowing: The Orientalists and Their Enemies* (London: Penguin, 2006).

²³ Marchand, *German Orientalism*, p. 334; Rothman, *Brokering Empire*, pp. 1-26; Robert A. Yelle, 'The Hindu Moses: Christian Polemics Against Jewish Ritual and the Secularization of Hindu Law Under Colonialism', *History of Religions*, 49.2 (2009), pp. 141-71.

²⁴ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 340.

colonial era.²⁵ This thesis thus also builds upon transnational historiography that has developed new methods for approaching and understanding intercultural encounters. This turn towards transnational approaches is implicit in the work of literary critic Gerald MacLean, whose *Rise of Oriental Travel* (2005) argued that the four Levantine travel texts he surveyed each betray their author's personal and partial (in both senses) biases.²⁶

Another influential evaluation of older postcolonial approaches can be found in Sanjay Subrahmanyam's critique of New Historicism. He comments on the New Historicist strategy of 'reading against the grain' to recover the indigenous (emic) truth hidden in the reports of European travellers.²⁷ In his critique of Tzvetan Todorov's account of the Spanish conquest of the Aztec Empire, he takes issue with New Historicist arguments that largely derive from 'semiotics and structural comparison'. Todorov had claimed that 'the Iberians and Mesoamericans had entirely different and largely incompatible systems of communication' and Subrahmanyam highlights two problems with Todorov's account. Firstly, he notes that such a totalising binary leaves 'a number of puzzles... unanswered' concerning the day-to-day transactions and translations of the Spanish soldiers during their initial stint in the Aztec capital. Subrahmanyam shows that New Historicist approaches fail to take account

²⁵ Phillips, *Before Orientalism*, pp. 21-2, citing Gerald of Wales, *Topographia Hiberniae*. *Emphases* in original. On Gerald of Wales and inclusive and exclusive conceptions of civility, see Jeffrey Jerome Cohen, 'Hybrids, Monsters, Borderlands: The Bodies of Gerald of Wales', in *The Postcolonial Middle Ages*, ed. by Jeffrey Jerome Cohen (New York: St. Martin's Press, 2000), pp. 85-106. On continuities between medieval and early modern world history more generally, see David Wallace, *Premodern Places: Calais to Surinam, Chaucer to Aphra Behn* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2004), pp. 10-11; Janet L. Abu-Lughod, *Before European Hegemony: The World System AD 1250-1350* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1989); Felipe Fernandez-Armesto, *Before Columbus: Exploration and Colonisation from the Mediterranean to the Atlantic, 1229-1492* (Houndmills: Macmillan Education, 1987).

²⁶ Gerald MacLean, *The Rise of Oriental Travel: English Visitors to the Ottoman Empire, 1580-1720* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), pp. xiii-xiv. For a useful appraisal of MacLean's approach to his subjects, see Jonathan Burton, 'Review of The Rise of Oriental Travel: English Visitors to the Ottoman Empire, 1580-1720, by Gerald MacLean (review 406)', *Reviews in History*, 2009, <<http://www.history.ac.uk/reviews/review/406>> [accessed 10 September 2012].

²⁷ Anthony Pagden, *European Encounters With The New World: From Renaissance to Romanticism* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1993), pp. 10-11, 13.

of the multiple and competing perspectives of different individuals on both sides of the Iberian-Aztec encounter.²⁸

Secondly, Subrahmanyam argues that it is 'not self-evident that Todorov's "model", even if it held true for America, could work in the Eurasian space where ideas and conceptions had regularly circulated over the centuries'.²⁹ In reference to the circulation of ideas in early modern Eurasia, Lawrence Danson and Caroline Finkel both examine the shared cultural ambitions and self-portrayals of Ottoman Sultans and Christian monarchs.³⁰ Finkel's study of diplomatic gift-giving and elite self-presentation amongst Christian and Muslim rulers has uncovered a mutual fondness for each other's art, sculpture and other cultural products. She argues that there were many shared 'cultural and symbolic parallels

²⁸ On the history of translation and wider trends in the history of cultural encounter, see Peter Burke and R. Po-Chia Hsia, 'Introduction', in *Cultural Translation in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Peter Burke and R. Po-Chia Hsia (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), pp. 1-4 (pp. 1-3).

²⁹ Subrahmanyam, *Three Ways to Be Alien*, p. 174. On New Historicism and its applications, see Tzvetan Todorov, *The Conquest of America: The Question of the Other*, trans. by Richard Howard (New York: Harper Perennial, 1992); Anthony Pagden, *The Fall of Natural Man: The American Indian and the Origins of Comparative Ethnology*, 2nd edn (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986); Inga Clendinnen, 'Cortes, Signs and the Conquest of Mexico', in *The Transmission of Culture in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Anthony Grafton and Ann Blair (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1990), pp. 87-130; Inga Clendinnen, "'Fierce and Unnatural Cruelty": Cortes and the Conquest of Mexico', in *New World Encounters*, ed. by Stephen Greenblatt (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1993), pp. 12-47; Stephen Greenblatt, *Marvellous Possessions: The Wonder of the New World* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991); Rolena Adorno, 'The Negotiation of Fear in Cabeza de Vaca's Naufragios', in *New World Encounters*, ed. by Stephen Greenblatt (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1993), pp. 48-85; Mary C. Fuller, 'Raleigh's Fugitive Gold: Reference and Deferral in The Discoverie of Guiana', in *New World Encounters*, ed. by Stephen Greenblatt (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1993), pp. 218-40; Anthony Pagden, 'Ius et Factum: Text and Experience in the Writing of Bartolome de Las Casas', in *New World Encounters*, ed. by Stephen Greenblatt (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1993), pp. 85-100. For an example of 'old world' historiography that draws on New Historicist categories, see Bernard S. Cohn, *Colonialism and Its Forms of Knowledge: The British in India* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996), esp. pp. 18-19. For further responses to New Historicism, see Andrew Hadfield, *Literature, Travel and Colonial Writing In The English Renaissance, 1545-1625* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1998), pp. 70-7; Gary Tomlinson, *The Singing of the New World: Indigenous Voice in the Era of European Contact* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), pp 190-6.

³⁰ Caroline Finkel, "'The Treacherous Cleverness of Hindsight": Myths of Ottoman Decay', in *Re-Orienting the Renaissance: Cultural Exchanges with the East*, ed. by Gerald MacLean (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 148-74 (p. 156). See also William Dalrymple, 'The Porous Frontiers of Islam and Christendom: A Clash or Fusion of Civilizations?', in *Re-Orienting the Renaissance: Cultural Exchanges with the East*, ed. by Gerald MacLean (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. ix - xxiii.

between [Ottoman] Sultans and European monarchs'.³¹ Danson explores English engagement with these intercultural exchanges. He discusses gift obligations attendant on Thomas Dallam, the organ-maker dispatched in 1599 to assemble a mechanical organ which Elizabeth I had gifted to the newly-crowned Sultan Murad III.³² My analysis engages with the early modern transnational spaces alluded to by Subrahmanyam, Danson and Finkel. I shall focus on how contemporary understandings of religious difference were developed through exposure to and representation of various other societies' beliefs and practices.³³

By appreciating the complexity of early modern intercultural encounters, it becomes apparent that English self-fashioning was equally likely to be defined against fellow Europeans as against non-Europeans. For instance, Andrew Hadfield situates positive Elizabethan depictions of indigenous Americans in the context of contemporary anti-Spanish prejudices. Francisco J. Borge concurs in his study of the travel anthologist Richard Hakluyt's representation of the Spanish. For Elizabethans, 'upsetting Spain in its New World territories had the practical goal of enlarging English dominions' whilst the Black Legend of Spanish cruelty served 'ideological purposes', reinforcing nationalistic conceptions of Protestant exceptionalism.³⁴ This is but one historical moment in a longer

³¹ Finkel, 'Treacherous Cleverness', p. 156, see also pp. 159-62.

³² Lawrence Danson, 'The Sultan's Organ: Presents and Self-Presentation in Thomas Dallam's Diary', *Renaissance Studies*, 23.3 (2010), pp. 639-58 (p. 645).

³³ Carmine G. di Biase, 'Introduction: The Example of the Early Modern Lexicographer', in *Travel and Translation in the Early Modern Period*, ed. by Carmine G. di Biase (Amsterdam and New York: Rodopi, 2006), pp. 9-32 (p. 24). This syncretic dimension of intercultural encounter was a two way process and influenced not only European representations of other societies but also the various ways in which Christian iconography and other practices were adopted and adapted in different settings. For an illuminating discussion of the circulation of Christian (specifically Catholic) material culture in early colonial Indian, New World and African contexts, see Simon Ditchfield, 'Catholic Reformation and Renewal', in *The Oxford Illustrated History of the Reformation*, ed. by Peter Marshall (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015), pp. 152-85.

³⁴ Hadfield, *Literature, Travel and Colonial Writing*, pp. 72-85; Francisco J. Borge, "'We (upon Peril of My Life) Shall Make the Spaniard Ridiculous to All Europe": Richard Hakluyt's "Discourse" of Spain', in *Richard Hakluyt and Travel Writing in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 167-76 (pp. 169, 171). See also William S. Maltby, *The Black Legend in England: The Development of Anti-Spanish Sentiment, 1558-1660* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1971); Rafael Veléz, 'Imperial Moments: The Cromwellian Black Legend', in *The Construction of the Other in Early Modern Britain: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis*, ed. by Rüdiger Ahrens (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter,

process whereby early modern 'English identities' were constituted. Jesús López-Peláez Casellas argues that 'nascent capitalism... the religious conflict between Catholics, Anglicans and Puritans' and a wider 'epistemological revolution' caused English identity to be transformed over the early modern period. Thus, whilst Protestant and nationalistic sentiments underpin many of the narratives I examine, they do not do so in a monolithic or ahistorical fashion. Such sentiments did not result in uniform reactions to others' beliefs and practices: other belief systems could be incorporated, assimilated, denigrated or excluded from English notions of civility or religious orthodoxy.³⁵

Early modern travel writing confirms these ambiguities concerning the representation of others. The genre of travel writing represents intercultural interactions, negotiations and exchanges with cultural and religious others to domestic audiences.³⁶ However, this picture of early modern travel writing as a genre is complicated somewhat when we examine the complex intercultural spaces in which travel took place. Eric Dursteler notes that seventeenth-century European travellers commented upon 'the multicultural complexity of the early modern Mediterranean'. Although 'nation and religion were among the primary categories' used by early modern people to 'order their world and to define themselves', these

2013), pp. 205-15. On contemporary politics as a motivating factor behind publishing reports from ambassadors and travellers overseas more generally, see Simon Testa, 'Travellers' Accounts, Historians and Ambassadors in the Sixteenth Century', in *Cross-Cultural Travel: Papers from the Royal Irish Academy International Symposium on Literature and Travel, National University of Ireland, November 2002*, ed. by Jane Conroy (Oxford: Peter Lang, 2003), pp. 31-8 (p. 36).

³⁵ Jesús López-Peláez Casellas, "'Menne of Straunge Borders": Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis. An Introduction', in *The Construction of the Other in Early Modern Britain: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis*, ed. by Rüdiger Ahrens (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter, 2013), pp. 1-12 (p. 3). On otherness, hybridity and the incorporation and/or exclusion of others in early modern English literature, see Gary Schmidt, *Renaissance Hybrids: Culture and Genre in Early Modern England* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013), pp. 3-7. On the tensions provoked by European conceptions of otherness, a good study is Mark Meuwese, 'Subjects or Allies: The Contentious Status of the Tupi Indians in Dutch Brazil, 1625-1654', in *Bridging the Early Modern Atlantic World: People, Products and Practices on the Move*, ed. by Caroline A. Williams (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009), pp. 113-30 (pp. 129-30).

³⁶ Chirico, 'Travel Narrative as (Literary) Genre', pp. 37-47. On invented travel which played on the conventions of the genre, see Raymond Howgego, 'Invented and Apocryphal Narratives of Travel from Ancient Egypt to the Present Day', in *The Hakluyt Society Annual Lecture* (London: Hakluyt Society, 2010), pp. 1-17.

identities were fundamentally 'variable and composite'.³⁷ This is corroborated in the late eighteenth-century narrative of the East India Company trader Thomas Forrest. Forrest wrote as part of a self-conscious genre of travel writing that sought to expand the boundaries of European knowledge and further economic objectives through trade with indigenous polities.³⁸ In these negotiations, Forrest constantly shifts between multiple positions, emphasising or concealing his confessional identity dependent on circumstance. He emphasises the benefits to local rulers of establishing trading relations with the British. Despite this, elsewhere in his narrative, he is circumspect about the benefits brought by competing European empires to the political economy of the region.³⁹ Through each of these interactions, Forrest emphasises different identities in order to negotiate successfully with a variety of interlocutors, demonstrating the pliable nature of his religious and political affiliations.

Confessional identity could be similarly flexible, and my research has focused on the fluctuating and at times conflicted confessional perspectives of English travellers. Travel narratives allowed individuals to confirm or question their religious affiliations. Religious conversion was increasingly common throughout the period and travellers encountered a variety of individuals who had reneged their Christianity or, through accident of birth, observed an alternative creed to Protestantism.⁴⁰ John-

³⁷ Eric R. Dursteler, *Venetians in Constantinople: Nation, Identity and Coexistence in the Early Modern Mediterranean* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2006), p. 103.

³⁸ On the overlap between travel writing and ethnography and how the latter evolved from the former, see Justin Stagl and Christopher Pinney, 'Introduction: From Travel Writing to Ethnography', *History and Anthropology*, 9.2-3 (1996), pp. 121-24. On the Classical roots of ethnography, see Wilfried Nippel, 'Facts and Fiction: Greek Ethnography and its Legacy', *History and Anthropology*, 9.2-3 (1996), pp. 125-38.

³⁹ Thomas Forrest, *A Voyage to New Guinea, and the Moluccas, from Balambangan: Including an Account of Magindano, Sooloo, and Other Islands...* (London, 1779), pp. 45, 48, 110, 290-4; Sapra, *Limits of Orientalism*, pp. 33-59; Rahul Sapra, 'Orientalism of Capitalism: Warren Hastings and the Rhetoric of Empire', in *Tall Tales and True: India, Historiography and British Imperial Imaginings*, ed. by Kate Brittlebank (Clayton: Monash University Press, 2008), pp. 8-19.

⁴⁰ On religious conversion, see Helen Smith, 'Metaphor, Cure and Conversion in Early Modern England', *Renaissance Quarterly*, 67.2 (2014), pp. 472-502; Tijana Krstić, 'Conversion and Converts to Islam in Ottoman Historiography of the Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries', in *Writing History at the Ottoman Court: Editing the Past, Fashioning the Future*, ed. by H. Erdem Çipa and Emine Fetvacı (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2013), pp. 58-79; Tijana Krstić, *Contested Conversion to Islam: Narratives of Religious Change in the Early*

Paul Ghobrial makes the cogent point that individuals' participation in economic and social networks affected their knowledge about foreign places and societies. Travel texts clearly influenced knowledge transmission in this networked view of early modern intercultural encounters, though we should not exaggerate the popularity or representativeness of the genre as a whole nor any constitutive part of it. More importantly, Ghobrial cautions against the assumption that 'someone living in, say, London or Paris, made sense of the Ottoman world primarily with reference to the local, national or confessional identities that we as historians ascribe to them'. In reality, 'a wide variety of factors... contributed to' both what and 'how people knew what they knew in this period'. In so doing, he unpacks a deeper methodological conundrum. How do we, as historians, relate 'the particular to the general': how can 'specific incidents' of exchange between individuals from different societies reveal information about the 'more general "encounter"' between them?⁴¹ Ghobrial argues that 'our pursuit of a general approach to what were highly varied and dissimilar exchanges' risks overlooking 'instances of spontaneity, idiosyncrasy and improvisation', as well as the central role of 'individuals with their own aspirations, fears and circumstances' in travelling and representing these travels.⁴²

This thesis considers the interplay between specific dialogic exchanges between individuals from different religious backgrounds and broader representations of other cultures. Stereotypes and existing

Modern Ottoman Empire (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2011); Selim Deringil, *Conversion and Apostasy in the Late Ottoman Empire* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012); Holly Crawford Pickett, 'Dramatic Nostalgia and Spectacular Conversion in Dekker and Massinger's "The Virgin Martyr"', *Studies in English Literature, 1500-1900*, 49.2 (2009), pp. 437-62; D. Bruce Hindmarsh, *The Evangelical Conversion Narrative: Spiritual Autobiography in Early Modern England* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008); Daniel J. Viktus, 'Turning Turk in Othello: The Conversion and Damnation of the Moor', *Shakespeare Quarterly*, 48.2 (1997), pp. 145-76.

⁴¹ John-Paul Ghobrial, *The Whispers of Cities: Information Flow in Istanbul, London and Paris in the Age of William Trumbull* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), pp. vii-ix.

⁴² Ghobrial, *Whispers of Cities*, pp. 87-8. For an example of a religious traveller with very individual confessional preoccupations, see Sylvia Brown, 'The Radical Travels of Mary Fisher: Walking and Writing in the Universal Light', in *Women, Gender and Radical Religion in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Sylvia Brown (Boston: Brill, 2008), pp. 39-64; Phyllis Mack, *Visionary Women: Ecstatic Prophecy in Seventeenth-Century England* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992), pp. 192, 207-8.

discourses about other religious groups were reinforced or undermined through the specific intercultural encounters reported in travel texts. Through travel writing, new knowledge and interpretations of other religions circulated, challenging or substantiating existing judgements.⁴³ Contemporary travellers also justified the authoritative status of their narratives through deriving general claims from specific encounters or events.⁴⁴ Interactions with specific individuals mingled with general prejudices or reports of other travellers in descriptions of particular places, societies and religious systems. In Natalie Rothman's analysis, Venetian House of Catechumen records of Muslim and Protestant converts to Catholicism show how 'complicated itineraries' and 'inconvenient details' are elided as a consequence of 'processes of subject-making and imperial consolidation' which established 'the moments of baptism and departure' as central to the 'legal fiction' whereby the convert 'radical[ly] break[s]' from their past and begins a new life.⁴⁵ Although the majority of travellers considered here were not obliged to transform their subjectivity as radically as these deponents before the Venetian inquisition, their texts provide similar opportunities for self-fashioning through their description of engagements with various religious others. Their depictions thus reveal a 'conflictive, fragmentary and discontinuous' process of representation whereby 'others... [are] simultaneously... absorbed, and expelled, attracted and rejected, on account of their paradoxical relation with the early modern English'. A 'complex interplay of contradictory attitudes to these others' can be found throughout early modern English travel literature which parallels the fragmented nature of domestic religious settlements but also the idiosyncratic nature of the cross-cultural encounters that are being represented.⁴⁶

⁴³ Nabil Matar, *Turks, Moors, and Englishmen in the Age of Discovery* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), pp. 80-1.

⁴⁴ For a useful anatomy of a travel text, see Chirico, 'Travel Narrative as (Literary) Genre', pp. 43-50. On establishing the authority of early modern travel texts, see Andrea Gerbig, 'Key Words and Key Phrases in a Corpus of Travel Writing: From Early Modern English Literature to Contemporary "Blogs"', in *Keyness in Texts*, ed. by Marina Bondi and Mike Scott (Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 2010), pp. 147-68.

⁴⁵ Rothman, *Brokering Empire*, pp. 92, 108-9, 114, 117, 123.

⁴⁶ López-Peláez Casellas, 'Menne of Straunge Borders', pp. 4-5.

I shall consider how individual English travellers' texts reflect the evolution of English Protestantism at different moments in its development. By grounding our understanding of these texts in the wider confessional world and travel experiences of their authors and editors, I advocate a microhistorical approach to seek out Ghobrialian idiosyncrasies and improvisations. Although the thesis as a whole considers religious elements of travel narratives over the *longue durée*, the individual case studies that make it up investigate how particular travel texts relate to discrete confessional issues, including the identification of diabolic magic and the relative prestige of different belief systems. The nature and cadence of these representations reflected the individual confessional identity of their authors and editors. Encounters with believers from other traditions could rhetorically reinforce or subvert expectations of proper religious practice.⁴⁷

It is a defining aspect of transnational history that it considers the 'movement or reach of peoples, ideas and/or things across national (or other defined) borders': it is interested in how 'local... contingencies' relate to 'broader global phenomena'. This project sits comfortably within this definition by exploring travel activities and their representations (multiple border crossings by both travellers and ideas) and by relating the particularities of these encounters and representations to wider cultural phenomena such as the history of English Protestantism and the development of colonial ideologies.⁴⁸ Though both these topics are revisited from different angles in the chapters that follow, it is worth

⁴⁷ López-Peláez Casellas, 'Menne of Straunge Borders', pp. 3-7, 11-12.

⁴⁸ Mae M. Ngai, 'Promises and Perils of Transnational History', *Perspectives on History*, 2012, <<https://www.historians.org/publications-and-directories/perspectives-on-history/december-2012/the-future-of-the-discipline/promises-and-perils-of-transnational-history>> [accessed 26 October 2015]. For discussion of the nature and scope of transnational history, see Christopher Alan Bayly and others, 'AHR Conversation', *American Historical Review*, 111 (2006), pp. 1441-64; *Comparative and Transnational History*, ed. by Heinz-Gerhard Haupt and Jürgen Kocka (Leamington Spa: Berghahn Books, 2012); Patricia Clavin, 'Defining Transnationalism', *Contemporary European History*, 14 (2005), pp. 421-39; *Transnational Challenges to National History Writing*, ed. by Matthias Middell and Lluís Roura Aulinas (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012); Neil Lazarus, 'Transnationalism and the Alleged Death of the Nation-State', in *Cultural Readings of Imperialism: Edward Said and the Gravity of History*, ed. by Keith Ansell-Pearson, Benita Parry, and Judith Squires (London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1997), pp. 28-48; Michael Werner and Bénédicte Zimmermann, 'Beyond Comparison', *History Theory*, 45 (2006), pp. 30-50.

briefly outlining the former since it serves as the principal connective tissue that holds this research together. This outline of the evolution of English Protestantism is intended to provide a general picture of key moments in its development over the period of this thesis. It should not be taken to be comprehensive but rather highlights key moments that are of most relevance to the analysis of contemporary travel texts presented herein.

Context II: English Protestantism, c. 1500–c. 1800

The consensus amongst historians of the Reformation is that it was a slow and multifaceted affair. What amounted to a national shift away from Catholicism was the result of profoundly local adaptations. Protestantism emerged in a variety of forms, and the term ‘Protestant’ concealed a variety of theological affiliations, as exemplified in recent scholarship on national crises such as the Civil Wars and the so-called Glorious Revolution. At both national and local levels, a variety of doctrinal positions existed and came into overt and less overt conflict.⁴⁹ Following the Restoration, these doctrinal conflicts led to vocal debates about toleration and censorship. Puritans, Presbyterians, Calvinists, Arminians and various others all had distinctive theological outlooks and these distinctions fuelled religious conflicts over the two centuries following the split from Rome. Below, I

⁴⁹ On the state, religion and politics, see Natalie Mears, ‘Public Worship and Political Participation in Elizabethan England’, *Journal of British Studies*, 51.1 (2012), pp. 4-25; Lloyd Bowen, ‘Royalism, Print and the Clergy in Britain, 1639-1640 and 1642’, *The Historical Journal*, 56.02 (2013), pp. 297-319. On local experiences of religious change, see Alexandra Walsham, *The Reformation of the Landscape: Religion, Identity and Memory in Early Modern Britain and Ireland* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), pp. 80-147; Christopher Haigh, ‘Success and Failure in the English Reformation’, *Past and Present*, 173 (2001), pp. 28-49; Eamon Duffy, *The Voices of Morebath: Reformation and Rebellion in an English Village* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2001). On religious alignment, see Spurr, ‘English Post-Reformation’, pp. 101-19; David Cressy, ‘Different Kinds of Speaking: Symbolic Violence and Secular Iconoclasm in Early Modern England’, in *Protestant Identities: Religion, Society, and Self-Fashioning in Post-Reformation England*, ed. by Muriel McClendon, Joseph P. Ward, and Michael MacDonald (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1999), pp. 19-42. See also Margaret Aston, *Faith and Fire: Popular and Unpopular Religion 1350-1600* (London and Rio Grande: The Hambledon Press, 1993); Alexandra Walsham, ‘The Godly and Popular Culture’, in *The Cambridge Companion to Puritanism*, ed. by John Coffey and Paul C. H. Lim (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), pp. 277-93. On the significance of the events of 1688 to later conceptions of British identity, see Edmund Rogers, ‘1688 and 1888: Victorian Society and the Bicentenary of the Glorious Revolution’, *Journal of British Studies*, 50.4 (2012), pp. 892-916.

sketch out some of the most relevant contemporary debates and indicate how these relate to my thesis.

Peter Marshall argues that ‘the wide range of doctrinal positions’ conventionally labelled as ‘Protestant’ during the sixteenth century failed to cohere around that term.⁵⁰ The term ‘Protestantism’ lacked precision even during the long period of stability under Elizabeth during which England became a ‘Protestant nation’ though not necessarily a ‘nation of Protestants’.⁵¹ In later centuries, denominational divisions persisted, indicating the inclusive value of the label but also its lack of clarity. It can be applied to ‘intra-Protestant’ freethinkers, including the early deist Herbert of Cherbury, but also encompassed the altogether more zealous evangelicals who formed the London Missionary Society in 1795.⁵² With this scope in mind, this thesis addresses the evolution of various ‘Protestant’ attitudes to religious difference and the different perspectives on foreign belief and practice of various subgroups over the *longue durée*. In so doing, I will address topics such as the evolution of different forms of Protestantism, debate around providentialism and disagreements about the nature of religious belief itself.

Despite its ubiquity, the term ‘Protestant’ usefully connotes reformed positions following the Reformation and brings together related strands of theological and nationalistic thought.⁵³ It can be used to refer to the discursive space in which contemporaries negotiated religious issues. By the end of Elizabeth’s reign, a Protestant consensus – in part unified

⁵⁰ Peter Marshall, ‘The Naming of Protestant England’, *Past and Present*, 214 (2012), pp. 87-128 (p. 93).

⁵¹ Christopher Haigh, *English Reformations: Religion, Politics and Society under the Tudors* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1993), p. 280. On apathy and resistance to religious change, see also Anne McLaren, ‘Gender, Religion and Early Modern Nationalism: Elizabeth I, Mary Queen of Scots, and the Genesis of English Anti-Catholicism’, *The American Historical Review*, 107.3 (2002), pp. 739-67 (pp. 746, 761–3).

⁵² Wayne Hudson, *Enlightenment and Modernity: The English Deists and Reform* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2009), pp. 1-2, 12; Anna Johnston, ‘British Missionary Publishing, Missionary Celebrity, and Empire’, *Nineteenth-Century Prose*, 32.2 (2005), pp. 20-47 (pp. 20-2); Anna Johnston, ‘Missionary Men: Forming Identities in Imperial Evangelical Britain’, *Australasian Victorian Studies Journal*, 9 (2003), pp. 89-105.

⁵³ Daniel Carey, ‘Richard Hakluyt as Editor’, in *The Hakluyt Society Annual Lecture* (London: Hakluyt Society, 2012), pp. 1-28.

against Catholicism – existed.⁵⁴ In his recent examination of the day-to-day experience of English Protestants, Alec Ryrie argues that the early seventeenth century saw the emergence of a ‘*broad-based* religious culture’ founded on Protestant principles.⁵⁵ Marshall suggests that, in general, English believers adopted the term with greater enthusiasm during the seventeenth century.⁵⁶ Despite this broad consensus, significant differences in practice, doctrine and identity persisted throughout our period. Therefore, I seek to clarify this term wherever appropriate with reference to the specific denominational concerns being discussed. That said, Ryrie is correct that the term provides a useful shorthand for Reformed English attitudes more generally, and I ask the reader to overlook any inadvertent slippages of meaning that result from this latter more casual usage.

Various forms of Protestantism emerged and interacted throughout our period. Post-revisionist scholarship has gone beyond Christopher Haigh’s claims for a halting and gradual change of national confessional allegiance in the latter half of the sixteenth century. In a recent review of later seventeenth-century religious politics, Gary S. De Krey argues that scholarship of the long Reformation must incorporate debates around toleration of Catholics and non-conformist Protestants in the decades surrounding the Glorious Revolution.⁵⁷ Similarly, Alex Barber has shown how both senior and parochial clergy ‘vociferously objected’ to the suspension of pre-publication censorship in 1695. Such concerns about the ‘seditious and irreligious tendencies inherent’ in popular print indicate that religious issues were integral to the Williamite public sphere. At the

⁵⁴ Litzenberger, ‘Defining the Church’, pp. 137-53.

⁵⁵ Alec Ryrie, *Being Protestant in Reformation Britain* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), p. 6. *Emphases* in original.

⁵⁶ Marshall, ‘Naming of Protestant England’, pp. 110-13.

⁵⁷ De Krey, ‘Between Revolutions’, p. 651. See also M. Goldie, ‘The Theory of Religious Intolerance in Restoration England’, in *From Persecution to Toleration: The Glorious Revolution and Religion in England*, ed. by O. P. Grell, Jonathan Israel, and Nicholas Tyacke (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991), pp. 331-68; G. M. Ditchfield, ‘“How Narrow with the Limits of This Toleration Appear?” Dissenting Petitions to Parliament, 1772-3’, in *Parliament and Dissent*, ed. by Stephen Taylor and David L. Wykes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2005), pp. 91-106. For a good general introduction to recent scholarship on toleration, see Evan Haefeli, ‘Toleration’, *Religion Compass*, 4/4 (2010), pp. 253-62 (esp. pp. 256-7).

same time as early Enlightenment debates around ‘freethinking’ were emerging, the question of what constituted appropriate forms of worship, identifications and publications, remained contentious. Restoration debates about the extent of religious toleration, and subsequent historiographical debates concerning James II’s intentions, show the longevity of concerns about the relationship between state policy and personal religious conscience.⁵⁸ Though it was rare for Anglophone travel texts to be directly censored, travellers adopted a variety of strategies for depicting religious differences that reflected upon domestic norms.

At the outset of the eighteenth century, interpreting the significance of the previous century’s religious changes was still a subject of contention between freethinkers and conservatives alike.⁵⁹ Religious deviance in the form of both Catholic and non-aligned forms of Protestantism were hotly debated throughout the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries.⁶⁰ The Catholic threat raises its head in Chapter 2, which documents how denigrations of Catholicism informed representations of other Christian denominations. Other threats – including irreligion or the appearance of it – were rhetorically significant throughout the period. Although actual levels of unbelief are hard to document, atheism, deism and scepticism became more common by the end of the period.⁶¹ Thus, mainstream

⁵⁸ De Krey, ‘Between Revolutions’, pp. 759-63. On debates about toleration and royal policy, see Steven Pincus, ‘The State and Civil Society in Early Modern England: Capitalism, Causation and Habermas’s Bourgeois Public Sphere’, in *The Politics of the Public Sphere in Early Modern England*, ed. by Steven Pincus and Peter Lake (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2007), pp. 213-31; Steven Pincus, ‘The European Catholic Context of the Revolution of 1688-89: Gallicanism, Innocent XI, and Catholic Opposition’, in *Shaping the Stuart World, 1603-1714: The Atlantic Connection*, ed. by A. I. MacInnes and A. H. Williamson (Leiden: Brill, 2006), pp. 79-114. On the consequences for the later seventeenth century, see Michael J. Braddick, *State Formation in Early Modern England, c. 1550-1700* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), pp. 221-6, 265-70.

⁵⁹ Alex Barber, “‘Why Don’t Those Lazy Priests Answer the Book?’ Matthew Tindal, Censorship, Freedom of the Press and Religious Debate in Early Eighteenth-Century England”, *History*, 98 (2013), pp. 680-707 (pp. 680, 691-4). For the fullest exploration of the oppositional model between ‘radical’ Enlightenment and conservative religious forces, see Jonathan Israel, *Radical Enlightenment: Philosophy and the Making of Modernity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001).

⁶⁰ William J. Bulman, ‘Enlightenment and Religious Politics in Restoration England’, *History Compass*, 10/10 (2012), pp. 752-64 (pp. 752-3); Scott Sowerby, ‘Opposition to Anti-Popery in Restoration England’, *Journal of British Studies*, 51 (2012), pp. 26-49.

⁶¹ Michael Hunter, ‘The Problem of “Atheism” in Early Modern England’, *Transactions of Royal Historical Society*, 35 (1985), pp. 135-57 (pp. 135-7).

Protestant identities could be defined against a variety of others including (but not limited to) foreign Catholics, other denominations of Protestants and the almost spectral presence of unbelief. Throughout the thesis, we explore different perspectives on these intersecting oppositions, demonstrating the value of a *longue durée* approach to confessional debates instigated by the Reformation.

Turbulent national politics was, however, only the tip of the iceberg. In a thorough review of Eamon Duffy's study of the religious life of the village of Morebath in Devon, Lucy Wooding suggests that parishioners and priests may have had different perspectives on the transformation the Reformation wrought to their everyday religious realities. Communities' reactions to the removal of religious ornamentation varied and local 'reactions to religious change were... complicated'. She advises against assuming sixteenth-century religious change was 'revolutionary', or that religious matters were ever fully disconnected from wider social and economic issues. Likewise, Natalie Mears argues that popular responses to the political deployment of collective worship during Elizabeth's reign revealed similar divisions within communities.⁶² For the purposes of this present study, which considers largely elite or middling individuals' experiences in foreign places a long way from the communities of their birth, we must be conscious of the range of confessional opinions in circulation throughout the period, and how this instability could provoke individuals to travel overseas.⁶³ The broad church of English Protestantism could incorporate recusants and radicals though the accommodation would not always be comfortable for everyone. Differing opinions on the various forms that the domestic religious settlement took inform many of the case studies that make up this thesis.

⁶² Lucy Wooding, 'Review of The Voices of Morebath: Reformation and Rebellion in an English Village, (review No. 266)', *Reviews in History*, (2001), <<http://www.history.ac.uk/reviews/review/266>> [accessed 4 July 2015]; Mears, 'Public Worship and Political Participation', pp. 4-25. On popular Protestant responses to vestigial symbols of Catholicism, see David Cressy, *Travesties and Transgressions in Tudor and Stuart England: Tales of Discord and Dissension* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), pp. 234-51.

⁶³ Games, *Web of Empire*, p. 253.

We must be alert to the manifold diversity of belief concealed by the label 'Protestant' throughout our period, from Elizabethan conflict between Calvinists and Puritans through to Restoration era debates between Episcopalian and Presbyterian forms of Protestantism, and the increasingly polarised debates about religious toleration.⁶⁴ We must also be alert to the fact that official sanctions against deviant beliefs and practices did not always impinge on the lived experiences of the growing number of English people who worshiped outside the auspices of the Church of England. Indeed, by the end of the seventeenth century, radical Protestant separatists enjoyed *de facto* protection of rights to freely articulate their views and freely assemble. Although these rights were formally denied to Catholics on various occasions from Elizabeth's accession onwards, at the upper levels of society, Catholic individuals were protected from legal sanction by their Reformed neighbours so long as their political loyalty to the English state was not in doubt.⁶⁵ Religious identities intersected with political loyalties, though for reasons of political expediency lived realities did not always substantiate the belligerent rhetoric of the Church of England and its supporters. Subsequent chapters explore how editors of travel works, apostate Barbary slaves and Orientalists reflected upon domestic norms and their own confessional identities, as well as how observations of foreign rituals allowed travellers to admire, assimilate, accommodate or reject other societies' beliefs and practices.

The eighteenth century saw competing pressures and a further splintering of Protestant denominations.⁶⁶ During the Enlightenment,

⁶⁴ De Krey, 'Between Revolutions', pp. 746-7; Sowerby, 'Opposition to Anti-Popery', pp. 26-7; Peter Denney, 'Popular Radicalism, Religious Parody and the Mock Sermon in the 1790s', *History Workshop Journal*, 74 (2012), pp. 51-78 (pp. 51, 54, 56-7).

⁶⁵ Martin Hugh Fitzpatrick, 'From Natural Law to Natural Rights? Protestant Dissent and Toleration in the Late Eighteenth Century', *History of European Ideas*, 40 (2014), pp. 1-27; Colin Haydon, 'Parliament and Popery in England, 1700-1780', *Parliamentary History*, 19.1 (2000), pp. 49-63 (pp. 50, 52-4, 56-8). On Catholic subjects in Britain's burgeoning empire and various strategies of toleration, see Harland-Jacobs, 'Incorporating the King's New Subjects', pp. 1-21. On the limits placed upon Catholics and the guarantees of their loyalty, see Michael Questier, 'Loyalty, Religion and State Power in Early Modern England: English Romanism and the Jacobean Oath of Allegiance', *The Historical Journal*, 40 (1997), pp. 311-29.

⁶⁶ Jeremy Gregory, 'Introduction: Transforming "the Age of Reason" into "an Age of Faiths": Or, Putting Religions and Beliefs (Back) into the Eighteenth Century', *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies*, 32.3 (2009), pp. 287-305 (p. 287-94).

religious certainties were not immune from criticism, as illustrated by the rise of deism and freethinking movements.⁶⁷ Towards the end of the century, a broad-based movement of working-class or lower middle-class enthusiasm for evangelical Christianity radically reshaped the denominational fabric of the nation. Methodism and other revivalist sects emerged, and older Protestant non-conformists gained legal recognition that had previously been jealously guarded by the Church of England.⁶⁸ Protestant radicals, both Puritan and non-conformist, figure prominently in subsequent discussions of seventeenth-century providentialism and eighteenth-century missionary literature. Amongst these splinter groups, it is worth drawing attention to the Congregationalists, who are discussed in Chapter 7. Their opposition to ecclesiastical hierarchies had marked them out as rebels during the religious wars of the seventeenth century.⁶⁹ Like other evangelical movements within and beyond the Church of England, their influence increased over the latter half of the eighteenth century. By the 1830s, they could claim to be the largest organisers of missionary activity and its most vocal publicists.⁷⁰

The foregoing outline of the development of English Protestantism demonstrates the importance of balancing microhistorical and *longue durée* approaches. It provides vital context to the confessional worlds of the individual travellers that we shall encounter. The individuals whose travel texts form the bedrock of this thesis all lived out their lives within an extended period of religious change, crisis and co-existence. Their perspectives on confessional issues were necessarily partial and were the

⁶⁷ Deism is discussed in Chapter 6 below, pp. 181-223. On the deist controversy, see David Berman, 'Deism, Immorality, and the Art of Theological Lying', in *Deism, Masonry, and the Enlightenment: Essays Honoring Alfred Owen Aldridge*, ed. by J. A. Leo Lemay (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1987), pp. 61-78; Wayne Hudson, 'Atheism and Deism Demythologized', in *Atheism and Deism Revalued: Heterodox Religious Identities in Britain, 1650-1800*, ed. by Jeffrey R. Wigelsworth, Wayne Hudson, and Diego Lucci (Farnham: Ashgate, 2014), pp. 13-24; Jeffrey R. Wigelsworth, "'Their Grosser Degrees of Infidelity': Deists, Politics, Natural Philosophy, and the Power of God in Eighteenth-Century England" (unpublished PhD thesis, University of Saskatchewan, 2005).

⁶⁸ De Krey, 'Between Revolutions', pp. 743, 747.

⁶⁹ Bryan D. Spinks, *Freedom or Order? The Eucharistic Liturgy in English Congregationalism 1645-1980* (Allison Park: Pickwick Publications, 1984), pp. 31-86. On non-conformism and the Establishment more generally, see David L. Wykes, 'Introduction: Parliament and Dissent from the Restoration to the Twentieth Century', *Parliamentary History*, 24.1 (2005), pp. 1-26.

⁷⁰ Johnston, 'British Missionary Publishing', pp. 20-1, 22-9.

product of a range of personal, social, cultural and other factors. Through their travel texts, they expressed distinctive confessional identities in their descriptions of other societies' religious beliefs and practices. Their individual experiences – both in terms of their travel itineraries and the domestic religious cultures from which they emerged – informed their reports of other societies' religious beliefs. Throughout this thesis, reference will be made to the particular social, cultural and religious milieu from which particular travellers originated. This context is essential if we want to understand how their representations of other religions reflected both their own confessional outlooks and those of their readers.

Sources: Early Modern Travel Writing

In Todorov's definition, genre incorporates both 'discursive properties', i.e. stylistic components, and 'historical fact[s]', i.e. the historically determined shared elements of their composition or dissemination. We can thus usefully talk about the genre of early modern travel writing, meaning published or otherwise circulated representations of other societies from an outsider's point of view. However, the term 'travel writing' conceals the scope of such narratives.⁷¹ These are often hybrid works, at once a 'travel narrative', 'ethnography' and 'cosmography'. There were important overlaps between these three categories and the genre of early modern travel writing is arguably defined by these overlaps.⁷² The hybrid character of these works facilitated domestic comprehension of foreign beliefs and practices by relating them to familiar domestic norms. In some senses, representing other societies served to translate otherness into similarity, or, failing that, at least to categorise the form and extent of cultural,

⁷¹ Chirico, 'Travel Narrative as (Literary) Genre', pp. 30-7; Tzvetan Todorov and Richard M. Berrong, 'The Origin of Genres', *New Literary History*, 8.1 (1976), pp. 159-70 (pp. 162-5). On genre in early modern publications more generally, see Ceri Sullivan, 'Disposable Elements? Indications of Genre in Early Modern Titles', *The Modern Language Review*, 102 (2007), pp. 641-53.

⁷² Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', pp. 147-58; Sheehan, 'Altars of the Idols', pp. 51-60; Joan Pau Rubiés, 'Christianity and Civilization in Sixteenth-Century Ethnological Discourse', in *Shifting Cultures: Interaction and Discourse in the Expansion of Europe*, ed. by Henriette Bugge and Joan Pau Rubiés (Munster: Lit Verlag, 1995), pp. 35-60. For a collection of other works by Rubiés', see Joan Pau Rubiés, *Travellers and Cosmographers: Studies in the History of Early Modern Travel and Ethnology* (Aldershot: Ashgate Variorum, 2007).

political, social or religious differences. These texts are also deeply entangled with the personal identities of their authors and editors.⁷³ In composing and publishing their works, travellers took cross-cultural engagements within complex transnational spaces and transformed them into stories that were meaningful to domestic audiences.⁷⁴ Early modern traveller writers sought to present themselves as knowledgeable European travellers.⁷⁵ This self-fashioning is integral to the genre of travel writing. Within these broad stylistic conventions, however, the precise self-presentation, descriptive strategies and topics covered could – and did – vary greatly over the long early modern period that this thesis addresses.⁷⁶

Between 1550 and 1800, travel writing was intimately connected with the ‘fragmentation of political and cultural spaces brought about by the Reformation’. The genre of travel literature became ‘central’ to Western European culture as its ‘continuous expansion’ gathered pace. The

⁷³ Julia Schleck, *Telling True Tales of Islamic Lands: Forms of Mediation in English Travel Writing, 1575-1630* (Cranbury: Susquehanna University Press, 2011); Julia Schleck, ‘Forming the Captivity of Thomas Saunders: Hakluyt’s Editorial Practices and Their Ideological Effects’, in *Richard Hakluyt and Travel Writing in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 129-38; Julia Schleck, ‘“Plain Broad Narratives of Substantial Facts”: Credibility, Narrative and Hakluyt’s Principall Navigations’, *Renaissance Quarterly*, 59.3 (2006), pp. 768-94; Linda McJannet, ‘Purchas His Pruning: Refashioning the Ottomans in Seventeenth-Century Travel Narratives’, *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 74.2 (2011), pp. 219-42; Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt, ‘Introduction: Early Modern Travel Writing: Varieties, Transitions, Horizons’, *Studies in Travel Writing*, 13.2 (2009), pp. 95-8; Daniel Carey, ‘Establishing Credibility in Early Modern Travel: Authors, Readers, and the Problem of Belief’, in *HCAS Symposium: Early Modern Journeys: Practices and Everyday Experiences of Travel* (presented at Early Modern Journeys: Practices and Everyday Experiences of Travel, 1450-1800, Helsinki Collegium Online, 2015), <<http://vn-rec.it.helsinki.fi/tcs/?id=53E28634-C090-43B6-AD20-1674553F57A4>> [accessed: 15 October 2015]; Matthew Dimmock, ‘Hakluyt’s Multiple Faiths’, in *Richard Hakluyt and Travel Writing in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 219-28; Philip S. Palmer, ‘“All Suche Matters as Passed on This Vyage”: Early English Travel Anthologies and the Case of John Sarra coll’s Maritime Journal (1586-87)’, *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 76.3 (2013), pp. 325-44.

⁷⁴ On the relationship between the activity of travel and writing about it, see Drace-Francis, ‘Towards a Natural History of East European Travel Writing’, pp. 2-5.

⁷⁵ Rubiés, ‘Teaching the Eye to See’, pp. 172-7. For discussion of the wider impact of European ‘discoveries’ and their effect upon European intellectual culture, see Anthony Grafton, April Shelford and Nancy Siraisi, *New Worlds, Ancient Texts: The Power of Tradition and the Shock of Discovery* (Cambridge, MA and London: Harvard University Press, 1992), pp. 253-6.

⁷⁶ On the evolution of travel writing over the latter part of this period, see Nigel Leask, *Curiosity and the Aesthetics of Travel-Writing, 1770-1840: ‘From an Antique Land’* (Oxford: Clarendon, 2002). My *longue durée* follows the range and scope of works such as P. J. Marshall and Glyndwr Williams, *The Great Map of Mankind: British Perceptions of the World in the Age of Enlightenment* (London: J. M. Dent & Sons, 1982); John Michael Archer, *Old Worlds: Egypt, Southwest Asia, India, and Russia in Early Modern English Writing* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001).

founding texts of this new genre were late sixteenth-century collections that 'combined a systematic compilation of sources with a critical attitude towards their contents'. These texts 'contributed to the creation of a body of quasi-mythological discourse inspired by a nationalistic identity' rooted in the religious conflicts that had divided Europe over the preceding century. Such texts also provided 'practical information and a political message to a community that may profit from the exploitation of trade routes'.⁷⁷ Travel writing 'formed a major literary genre' providing 'ethnographic descriptions' of foreign societies to 'patrons or audiences in their homelands'. All the texts examined here form part of this genre of describing others' 'customs from a foreign observer's point of view'.⁷⁸ Therefore, they also indicate what was considered noteworthy enough to be reported back home.⁷⁹

Travel works also provided 'moral and intellectual advice for a particular social group', whether they were young gentlemen, merchants, soldiers, ambassadors, spies or religious exiles. This guidance on the 'proper process of observation' of 'cosmographical information' on the peoples they would encounter seems to have originated within a 'fairly defined social context... of "cosmopolitan" noblemen' at the tail end of Elizabeth's reign. However, the subsequent profusion of travel texts shows that travel writing founded a 'self-sustaining myth of a personal identity in the figure of the scholarly traveller'. Later travellers from across the social spectrum articulated this identity in a variety of ways, and this thesis will deal with writings by individuals from a variety of occupations and of

⁷⁷ Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', pp. 147, 151, 153.

⁷⁸ Charles H. Parker, *Global Interactions in the Early Modern Age, 1400-1800* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), pp. 206, see also pp. 205-12.

⁷⁹ Daryl W. Palmer, *Writing Russia in the Age of Shakespeare* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004), pp. vii-viii, xvi-xvii. See also Piers Brown, "'That Full-Sail Voyage": Travel Narratives and Astronomical Discovery in Kepler and Galileo', in *The Invention of Discovery, 1500-1700*, ed. by James Dougal Fleming (Ashgate: Farnham, 2011), pp. 15-28 (p. 17). On the invention of 'discovery' in early modern discourses, see James Dougal Fleming, 'Introduction: The Invention of Discovery, 1500-1700', in *The Invention of Discovery, 1500-1700*, ed. by James Dougal Fleming (Ashgate: Farnham, 2011), pp. 1-13. On travellers' identities and reporting the marvellous, see Pramod K. Nayar, 'Marvellous Excesses: English Travel Writing and India, 1608-1727', *Journal of British Studies*, 44.2 (2005), pp. 213-38.

various social standings.⁸⁰ What unites their publications, if not their confessional allegiances or other biographical details, is their identification with this archetypal figure of the well-informed cosmopolitan traveller.

Early modern travel writing as a genre conforms to David Chirico's definition since it possesses specific historical and discursive features.⁸¹ Operating 'across generations', editors of global collections of travel narratives facilitated a 'process of continuous borrowing, revision, and updating' in an 'enterprise of collecting that was neither static nor monochromatic'. Through this process, the history of travel writing itself was reconstituted and 'by the eighteenth century, collections were tending to become histories based on collected extracts or summaries of the data provided by individual travellers' rather than collections of 'so-called original documents'.⁸² Although these global collections make up a small number of the texts I consider, separately published texts shared many of their generic features, not least in the self-presentation of traveller

⁸⁰ Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', pp. 168-72; Daniel Carey, 'Travel, Identity and Cultural Difference 1580-1700', in *Cross-Cultural Travel: Papers from the Royal Irish Academy International Symposium on Literature and Travel, National University of Ireland, November 2002*, ed. by Jane Conroy (Oxford: Peter Lang, 2003), pp. 39-48 (pp. 39-44); Anna Suranyi, *The Genius of the English Nation: Travel Writing and National Identity in Early Modern England* (Cranbury: Associated University Press, 2008), pp. 15-22. A good early example of such advice to travellers can be found in Hakluyt's excerpts of his uncle's advice to merchants seeking a northern passage to Cathay: Richard Hakluyt [the Elder], 'Notes in Writing, Besides More Privie by Mouth, That Were Given by M. Richard Hakluyt of Eiton in the Countie of Hertford, Esquire, Anno 1580: To M. Arthur Pet, and to M. Charles Jackman, Sent by the Merchants of the Moscovie Companie for the Discovery of the Northeast Straight, Not Altogether Unfit for Some Other Enterprises of Discovery, Hereafter to Be Taken By Hand', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), III, pp. 264-75. On published advice to travellers, a good example is Anon, *A Letter of Advice To Young Gentleman of an Honourable Family, Now in His Travels beyond the Seas...* (London, 1688).

⁸¹ Chirico discusses Eastern European travel writing specifically, though his cogent definition of genre, drawing on Todorov, is relevant to the discussion here: Chirico, 'Travel Narrative as (Literary) Genre', pp. 30-7. See also Todorov and Berrong, 'The Origin of Genres', pp. 159-70.

⁸² Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', pp. 142, 144; F. Thomas Noonan, *The Road to Jerusalem: Pilgrimage and Travel in the Age of Discovery* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007), pp. 67-8; Klaus A. Vogel, 'Cultural Variety in a Renaissance Perspective: Johannes Boemus on "The Manners, Laws and Customs of All People" (1520)', in *Shifting Cultures: Interaction and Discourse in the Expansion of Europe*, ed. by Joan Pau Rubiés (Munster: Lit Verlag, 1995), pp. 17-34 (pp. 19-20). A good example of a later summary of collections of travel documents is *A New General Collection of Voyages and Travels Consisting of the Most Esteemed Relations...* ed. by John Green, 4 vols. (London, 1745). On travel texts and collections with a regional focus, good recent analysis of travel to China and Japan can be found in *The Far East and the English Imagination, 1600-1730*, ed. by Robert Markley (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006).

writers.⁸³ In this regard, my approach is a logical development of recent studies that have examined how travellers 'discovered themselves' through 'discover[ing] foreign lands'.⁸⁴ This scholarship has focused on the wider social roles of individual travellers both at home and abroad, including such diverse identities as ambassadors, slaves, scholars, traders and missionaries. These wider social roles and identities informed their travel texts but so did their various confessional standpoints.⁸⁵ Travellers and their texts did not exist in a vacuum: they had the potential to endorse or subvert domestic norms, values and beliefs. This thesis then explores how early modern travel writing practices evolved, and how religious change at home influenced travellers' representations.⁸⁶

Since I am tackling a diverse selection of sources over a long time span, it is necessary to establish the similarities and differences between the specific materials that this thesis focuses upon. The sources I examine form a number of sub-genres of early modern travel writing, including the aforementioned anthologies of travel texts, missionary narratives, antiquarian or Orientalist works and slavery narratives. I shall outline how I propose to approach the temporal range of this thesis with the help of two texts from the beginning and end of the period covered by this project. It is clear that the perspective of, for example, an Elizabethan mariner on indigenous rituals in Lapland (Chapter 5) is very different from that of a Congregationalist missionary on Tahitian religious customs at the turn of the nineteenth century (Chapter 7).

However, the generic diversity of these materials is not so great as to render them incommensurable. The Elizabethan texts considered here contributed to Hakluyt's *magnum opus* and thus contribute to the

⁸³ Chirico, 'Travel Narrative as (Literary) Genre', pp. 37-40; Leask, *Curiosity*, pp. 5-14. On travel and the evolution of English literary writing more generally, see Melanie Ord, *Travel and Experience in Early Modern English Literature* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008).

⁸⁴ Aune, 'Travel Writing After Orientalism', pp. 120-38; Michael A. Di Giovine, 'Identities and Nation-Building in Early Modern Travel Accounts', *Journeys*, 12.1 (2011), pp. 93-105; Helga Quadflieg, '"As Mannerly and Civil as Any in Europe": Early Modern Travel Writing and the Exploration of the English Self', in *Perspectives on Travel Writing*, ed. by Glenn Hooper and Tim Youngs (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004), pp. 27-40. On Hakluyt, see Carey and Jowitt, 'Early Modern Travel Writing', p. 97.

⁸⁵ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 168-9; App, *Birth of Orientalism*, pp. xi-xiii.

⁸⁶ Noonan, *Road to Jerusalem*, p. 68.

foundational moment of the ‘self-sustaining myth’ of the informed, eyewitness traveller in Anglophone travel writing.⁸⁷ Variations on this self-presentation persisted into the eighteenth century, aided by the developing institutions of British colonialism. The same archetype informed the publicity of missionary organisations, and evangelical travellers had long contributed to post-Reformation travel writing. For example, Jean Baptiste Morgan de Bellegarde’s *Discours Préliminaire* (1707) situates an “‘infinity of religious” who have worked the mission fields’ in part of the ‘grand tradition’ of travel works suitable for inclusion in his collection.⁸⁸ Indeed, as religious revival profoundly reshaped the domestic religious landscape at the turn of the nineteenth century, the British public’s knowledge of foreigners was directly attributable to missionary publications.⁸⁹

All the works examined in this thesis are concerned with cultural self-definition: Lapps and Tahitians alike were “Others” to their respective traveller writers, yet there was no uniform approach to denigrating them.⁹⁰ Nancy Bisaha observes that ‘Renaissance humanists... present some important challenges’ to Saidian assumptions about East and West in the early modern period. She argues that a simplistic binary model does not ‘address more open-minded views of a large number’ of later Orientalists, and similarly fails to account for expressions of ‘relativism’ amongst humanist writers.⁹¹ Whilst Bisaha identifies multiple European discourses concerning Islam and the Ottoman Empire, this thesis considers a variety

⁸⁷ Rubiés, ‘Teaching the Eye to See’, p. 172.

⁸⁸ Noonan, *Road to Jerusalem*, pp. 68-9, citing Jean Baptiste Morgan de Bellegarde, *Histoire Universelle*, (n. p., 1707), pp. 7, 18, 31, 36. Noonan also observes that Columbus was instrumental in the origin myths of the new, secular mode of travel, and that this consequently downplayed or displaced the accounts of pilgrims and other religious travellers (pp. 168-70). See also Paris O’Donnell, ‘Pilgrimage or “Anti-Pilgrimage”? Uses of Mementoes and Relics in English and Scottish Narratives of Travel to Jerusalem, 1596-1632’, *Studies in Travel Writing*, 12.2 (2009), pp. 125-39. On the balance between ‘secular’ and ‘religious’ travel in Hakluyt and Purchas, see James P. Helfers, ‘The Explorer or the Pilgrim? Modern Critical Opinion and the Editorial Methods of Richard Hakluyt and Samuel Purchas’, *Studies in Philology*, 94.2 (1997), pp. 160-87.

⁸⁹ Johnston, ‘British Missionary Publishing’, pp. 20-9.

⁹⁰ Partha Mitter, ‘Can We Ever Understand Alien Cultures? Some Epistemological Concerns Relating to the Perception And Understanding of the Other’, *Comparative Criticism*, 9 (1987), pp. 3-34.

⁹¹ Bisaha, *Creating East and West*, p. 6; Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 27-9, 264.

of intercultural encounters and shows how competing confessional outlooks informed travellers' representations of them.

Within the corpus of early modern travel writing, a variety of inclusionary and exclusionary conceptions of other societies are advocated. Drawing on studies of medieval descriptions of Islam, Mongols and other eastern societies, Johnson examines the relationship between religious ritual, practice and faith and argues that 'in late fifteenth and early-sixteenth-century ethnographies, the very categories used to evaluate and describe [other] cultures supported a stance of religious relativism'.⁹² Phillips has applied similar categories to late medieval descriptions of a range of topics, including gender, food and civility.⁹³ Johnson suggests that the 'tension' between 'inclusionary conceptions of the world's peoples and exclusionary denigrations of heterodox Christians and non-Christians' predated the religious ructions of the sixteenth century. Following the Reformations, 'Catholics and Protestants worked to define faith' and consequently 'true religious practice' and 'adherence to correct religious doctrine became... the pre-eminent... evaluative category of a culture or people'.⁹⁴ The 'tangible experiences' of travellers were integral to these evaluations.⁹⁵

Through their representations – and the dissemination of travel texts via print – competing conceptions of other societies were articulated. This further unites the chronological limits of this thesis. Albeit working in different contexts and with (at times) radically different emphases, Hakluyt and the London Missionary Society editors produced works that contributed to the inclusion or exclusion of other societies from English conceptions of religious orthodoxy and civility. This pattern is not novel to

⁹² Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, p. 29, also pp. 21-5.

⁹³ Phillips, *Before Orientalism*, pp. 3-12, 15-27. For a similar approach but focusing on chivalry as a category of analysis in medieval cross-cultural encounters, see Jennifer Goodman, *Chivalry and Exploration, 1298-1630* (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1998), p. 23. On travel 'the other way' during the late medieval and early modern periods, see Muzaffar Alam and Sanjay Subrahmanyam, *Indo-Persian Travels in the Age of Discoveries, 1400-1800* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007).

⁹⁴ Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 263-4. A useful but dated counterpoint relating principally to Christian divisions can be found in Franklin L. Baumer, 'England, the Turk, and the Common Corps of Christendom', *The American Historical Review*, 50.1 (1944), pp. 26-48.

⁹⁵ Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, p. 264.

the early modern era. In Phillips' analysis, medieval travellers praised and denigrated a variety of Asian food customs dependent on how well they conformed to individual travellers' expectations and prior experiences at home and on the road.⁹⁶

Competing identifications with and against foreign practices also characterise many of the sources I examine in this thesis. Some of these representations were straightforwardly oppositional, as in the case of the ethnography of Lapp magical ceremonies or the missionary accounts of Tahitian rituals. However, other chapters address travellers whose relationships with the societies they visited were more complicated. In Chapter 4, Joseph Pitts' slavery narrative is complicated by his apostasy – indeed, his was the first English captivity narrative in which its author confessed to converting to Islam during his North African incarceration. Similarly, the eighteenth-century Orientalist writers discussed in Chapter 6 speculated about deviant religious identities through their engagement with Indian polytheistic traditions.

Individual travellers' justifications for travel were often intimately linked with the domestic religious situation. Employment by one of the joint stock trading companies allowed many early modern men to avoid the 'religious uncertainty' at home as the confessional pendulum swung back and forth.⁹⁷ This is evident in the groups of Protestant exiles encountered in Chapter 2: they travelled in part to avoid persecution under Mary I's Catholic regime. Throughout the seventeenth century, various other confessional groups were similarly affected. During the early seventeenth century, the Puritan companies trading in the New World recruited many chaplains unhappy with Arminian influence in the Caroline church. Later, during the Commonwealth, Anglican clergy found postings chiefly with the Levant Company. Games notes that ministers were 'particularly susceptible' to the 'political turmoil of the period'. During the

⁹⁶ Phillips, *Before Orientalism*, pp. 73-100, on travel writing and medieval European identity, see pp. 50-73. On medieval ethnography and perceptions of other societies, see *Medieval Ethnographies: European Perceptions of the World Beyond*, ed. by Joan Pau Rubiés (Farnham: Ashgate Variorum, 2009); K. Patrick Fazioli, 'The Erasure of the Middle Ages from Anthropology's Intellectual Genealogy', *History and Anthropology*, 25.3 (2014), pp. 336-55.

⁹⁷ Games, *Web of Empire*, p. 228.

1650s, ‘previously conforming Anglican ministers were turned into dissenters when their’ patrons and ‘supporters were out of power’.⁹⁸ The same holds true for freethinking, rationalist and deists in the eighteenth century: the circle of Indophilic antiquarians around Governor General Warren Hastings provided an intellectual climate that many antiquarians, including the linguist and religious scholar William Jones, found invigorating.⁹⁹ However, it would be wrong to suggest that their religious affiliations rendered these individuals or their published writings marginal. The Levant Company’s long tradition of employing moderate Anglican chaplains drove forward biblical and Scriptural historical studies, providing the textual bedrock for subsequent Orientalism and comparative religion.¹⁰⁰ Meanwhile, Jones’ literary productions earned him fame and favour from a literary and cosmopolitan elite in late eighteenth-century Britain.¹⁰¹ In Chapters 2 and 6, we revisit the long legacies of Hakluyt and Jones, indicating their respective influence over cosmopolitan elites engaged in managing or perpetuating overseas trade.

That said, we should not overestimate the dissemination or popularity of travel writing beyond such self-consciously cosmopolitan readers. For the majority of the sources I examine, we can demonstrate that they had long publishing lives, though of course this does not necessarily imply popularity, influence or that they reflected more general popular attitudes. Rather, their continued popularity does suggest their on-going relevance to travel and related fields of ethnography and comparative religion. Biddulph and Henry Blount’s texts, which are analysed in Chapter 3, were both reprinted or excerpted by later

⁹⁸ Games, *Web of Empire*, pp. 228-9.

⁹⁹ Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, pp. 1-42.

¹⁰⁰ Games, *Web of Empire*, p. 231: Levant Company chaplains were prodigious publishers themselves, producing a range of geographical descriptions, travel texts, contemporary and Scriptural translations throughout the seventeenth century, as detailed in Ziad Elmarsafy, *The Enlightenment Qur’an: The Politics of Translation and the Construction of Islam* (Oxford: Oneworld, 2009), pp. 7-8, 195.

¹⁰¹ Michael J. Franklin, “‘And the Celt Knew the Indian’: Sir William Jones, Oriental Renaissance and Celtic Revival”, in *English Romanticism and the Celtic World*, ed. by G. Carruthers and A. Rawes (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), pp. 20-37.

anthologists.¹⁰² Likewise, Pitts' narrative of his captivity (Chapter 4) went through three editions in the eighteenth century and cropped up in 'various compilations of ethnographic materials published in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries'.¹⁰³ Such slavery narratives were popular and enjoyed wide circulation, attested to in Matar's catalogue of 22 such narratives published between 1577 and 1703.¹⁰⁴ The returned slave or *renegado* was also a recurring figure in the popular drama of the period.¹⁰⁵ Yet returned slaves' narratives served a political motive: they demonstrated the returnee's patriotism and argued for further government ransoms to liberate other captives.¹⁰⁶ Like missionary narratives, these texts also enjoyed a wider, popular appeal as both exciting narratives and moralising texts.¹⁰⁷

¹⁰² *Early Modern Tales of Orient: A Critical Anthology*, ed. by Kenneth Parker (London and New York: Routledge, 1999), p. 105; Gerald MacLean, 'Ottomanism before Orientalism? Bishop Henry King Praises Henry Blount, Passenger', in *Travel Knowledge: European 'Discoveries' in the Early Modern Period*, ed. by Ivo Kamps and Jyotsna G. Singh (New York: Palgrave, 2001), pp. 75-96. Biddulph's text was excerpted by Samuel Purchas, see McJannet, 'Purchas his Pruning', pp. 223-4, 227. A copy of the 1638 edition of Blount's text was even presented as a prize in a rifle-shooting competition in 1856. More contemporaneously, James Howell 'borrowed liberally' from Blount's account for the second edition of his *Instructions and Directions for Forren Travell*: MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 120-1, 134, citing James Howell, *Instructions and Directions for Forren Travell* 2nd edn, (London, 1650). On Howell's wider life and interests, see Daniel Robert Woolf, 'Howell, James', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/13974>> [accessed 26 November 2010].

¹⁰³ *Piracy, Slavery and Redemption: Barbary Captivity Narratives from Early Modern England*, ed. by Daniel J. Viktus (New York: Columbia University Press, 2001), p. 219; Anita McConnell, 'Pitts, Joseph', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2010, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/22345>> [accessed 3 December 2013].

¹⁰⁴ Matar, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen*, pp. 81, 181-3. On the nature of such narratives, their contents and evolution over time, see pp. 71-81.

¹⁰⁵ Chantelle Thauvette, 'Masculinity and Turkish Captivity in Swetnam, the Woman-Hater', *Studies in English Literature 1500-1900*, 52.2 (2012), pp. 425-45.

¹⁰⁶ Matar, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen*, p. 81; Nabil Matar, 'Wives, Captive Husbands and Turks: The First Women Petitioners in Caroline England', *Explorations in Renaissance Culture*, 23 (1997), pp. 111-29.

¹⁰⁷ Matar, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen*, pp. 71-81; Johnston, 'British Missionary Publishing', pp. 20-9; Jeffrey Cox, *The British Missionary Enterprise since 1700* (Oxford and New York: Routledge, 2008). On the informative elements of travel publications more generally, see Noonan, *Road to Jerusalem*, p. 78. On popular images of the Turk in early modern England, see Daniel J. Viktus, *Turning Turk: English Theater And The Multicultural Mediterranean, 1570-1630* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003); Daniel J. Viktus, 'Turning Turk in Othello', pp. 145-76; Suheyra Artemel, '"The Great Turk's Particular Inclination to Red Herring": The Popular Image of the Turk during the Renaissance in England', *Journal of Mediterranean Studies*, 5.2 (1995), pp. 188-208; Jonathan Burton, *Traffic and Turning: Islam and English Drama, 1579-1624* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2005). On direct contact with Muslims, see Jacob

Where my sources are more obscure, I demonstrate their influence within the more circumscribed sphere in which they operated. For instance, the missionary *Transactions* discussed in Chapter 7 circulated principally within Congregationalist circles, though missionary leaders were confident that they were increasing ordinary British readers' knowledge of foreign societies through missionary propaganda.¹⁰⁸ Similar observations of influence, albeit of a more restricted nature, can be made for the accounts of Lapp witchcraft discussed in Chapter 5 which went on to inform a variety of demonological literature advocating credulous and sceptical views of supernatural causation. Dennis Kay argues that various early Jacobean marvels, including political prognosticating of celestial signs, popular theatre and travel reports of the New World, betray the 'contestation and disputation' surrounding marvels of all kinds.¹⁰⁹ Although the ethnography of Lapp magic discussed in Chapter 5 did not disseminate widely, this literature is as symptomatic of the early modern fascination with the marvellous and preternatural as reports of domestic witchcraft and demonological works.

This thesis then reflects on the personal confessional worlds of travellers and (where appropriate) the editors or compilers of anthologies of their narratives. In so doing, it highlights interconnections between contemporary religious debates and travel works. It is interested in how travel texts drew upon and contributed to wider public discourses about a variety of topics, including providence, apostasy, magic, deism and Congregationalism. The thesis examines the aforementioned traveller writers' representations of their experiences overseas and seeks to identify wider resonances for these descriptions in early modern culture. Consequently, it will investigate both specific textual connections and more general ideational links between the religious contents of travel texts and

Selwood, *Diversity and Difference in Early Modern London* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2010), pp. 159-88.

¹⁰⁸ Anna Johnston, 'The Book Eaters: Textuality, Modernity and the London Missionary Society', *Semeia*, 88 (1999), pp. 13-40.

¹⁰⁹ Dennis Kay, 'Who Says "Miracles Are Past"? Some Jacobean Marvels and the Margins of the Known', in *Wonders, Marvels, and Monsters in Early Modern Culture*, ed. by Peter G Platt (Newark and London: Associated University Press, 1999), pp. 164-86 (pp. 167, see also pp. 164-9).

wider contemporary debates and discourses. The sources I have examined reflect a variety of perspectives on the nature of travel, on deviant practices and on dissident beliefs.

The foregoing summary is not comprehensive nor is it intended to be. The publication history and influence of the sources outlined here figure throughout the chapters that follow. These travel texts described foreign places in ways that were good to think with for their authors and contemporaries. By taking a *longue durée* approach to a variety of different cross-cultural religious encounters, I explore interconnections between representations of various foreign societies' religious practices and domestic theological developments. I argue that this is a two-way process: witnessing foreign belief systems could influence the self-representation of English Protestants, while encountering foreign belief systems allowed for reflection, both positive and negative, upon domestic norms.¹¹⁰ These dialogues demonstrate the purchase that witnessing others' beliefs and practices had on the early modern imagination. The contemporary religious landscape provided a vital touchstone for travellers' commentaries on how religion was conducted in other societies. In the final section of this chapter, I outline the thematic subdivisions of my thesis and outline the general structure of the thesis.

Structure: Travel, Deviance and Dissidents, 1550–1800

The eight chapters that make up this thesis are divided into thematic pairs. Each chapter addresses a separate case study and discusses how a particular confessional issue raised by an individual or small group of travel texts reflected wider discourses and debates in contemporary culture. I shall investigate how the wider cultural milieu of the individual traveller and their experiences both at home and abroad are reflected

¹¹⁰ My approach is similar to that taken by a range of scholars on English representations of India, including: Peter Burke, 'The Philosopher as Traveller: Bernier's Orient', in *Voyages and Visions: Towards a Cultural History of Travel*, ed. by Joan Pau Rubiés and Jas Elsner (London: Reaktion Books, 1999), pp. 124-37; Pompa Banerjee, 'Burning Questions: Widows, Witches, and Early Modern European Travel Narratives of India', *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies*, 29.3 (1999), pp. 529-61; Raf Gelders, 'Genealogy of Colonial Discourse: Hindu Traditions and the Limits of European Representation', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 51.3 (2009), pp. 563-89.

through their published works. All the travellers I discuss provided different descriptions of religious practices abroad in light of pertinent domestic beliefs. Travellers, editors, deviants – including apostates and witches – and dissidents – such as deists and Congregationalists – are the principle *dramatis personae* in the pages that follow. Each chapter considers connections between domestic discourses and travel literature, focusing on the particular confessional outlook of individual travellers and their expression or elision through published travel texts.

The first pair of chapters considers the nature of travel writing in the period, and examines its connections with wider religious change. They explore the production and dissemination of travel anthologies and connections between travel texts and existing stereotypes of foreign societies. Chapter 2 provides a *longue durée* examination of religious discourses in Hakluyt's *Principal Navigations* (1589, 1598-1600), considering the reception of Hakluyt's Russian and Arctic materials at two discreet points in the evolution of English Protestantism. Chapter 3 examines travellers' representations of Islam in light of wider European constructs of Mahomet and his religion. Using providential beliefs as a touchstone, it explores the confessional identities associated with different European versions of Mahomet and their dissemination via travel narratives.

The second part of this thesis considers how other religions were portrayed as deviant. I shall explore how theological and moral controversies in England informed travellers' depictions of other societies. In chapter 4, we examine captivity narratives written by Englishmen who had been enslaved on the North African coast. Returned Barbary slaves' spiritual angst drew upon tropes found in devotional literature concerning the dangers of conversion, apostasy and unbelief. Chapter 5 considers a different type of deviance and examines how seventeenth-century ethnographies of Lapp religious ceremonies were infused with demonological ideas. Descriptions of deviant foreign practices not only allowed travellers and ethnographers to contribute to domestic debates

but also had the potential to radically reshape individual travellers' self-presentation.

The third part is concerned with the perspectives of different types of religious dissidents who travelled abroad. Travellers' particular confessional outlooks informed their depictions, as well as the ideological goals of their texts with different domestic religious audiences. Chapter 6 looks at the religious opinions of eighteenth-century Orientalists. It explores the relationship between Orientalist scholarship and deist criticisms of Protestant exceptionalism. Chapter 7 looks at missionary experience at the end of the eighteenth century and considers how field experience conflicted with Congregationalist doctrine and how this was resolved through their representations of indigenous ritual and political life. Finally, Chapter 8 provides a conclusion that highlights connections between the preceding chapters and indicates directions for future research.

The twin themes of deviance and dissidence that characterise the latter two thirds of the thesis should not be read as precluding overlap between them. Avoiding being identified as religious subversives was integral to certain Orientalists self-representation (Chapter 6), whilst Barbary slaves sought to verify their Protestant credentials against widespread suspicions that they had been contaminated by extended contact with the Islamic Other, since they had been both politically and religiously removed from their native English, Christian community (Chapter 4). Dissident perspectives of different kinds – Puritan and freethinking – inform Biddulph and Blount's depictions of Islam in Chapter 3. Furthermore, these categories are specifically anchored in the specific encounters and historical moments that are examined. Deviant and dissident identities and identifications shifted radically across the period 1550 to 1800. Indeed, the contrasting dissident perspectives explored in Chapters 6 and 7 demonstrate how both revivalism and rationalism reshaped the contours of the later part of that theological debate.

All the chapters are concerned in different ways with the self-presentation of particular individuals or groups who travelled. They

explore how travellers from different confessional backgrounds applied inclusive or exclusive conceptions of proper religious practice to different societies. Four further overlaps connect the case studies that make up this thesis. Firstly, we return throughout the thesis to questions of acceptable religious belief and practice. The changing face of English Protestantism is considered principally in Chapter 2, though all subsequent chapters investigate how travel texts reflect particular moments in the evolution of English Protestantism, from reflections on the Elizabethan Settlement in mid-sixteenth-century travel texts through to revivalist fervour at the opening of the Pacific to Christian missionaries.

A second theme that runs through this thesis is the contrast between domestic norms and experience abroad. Chapter 4 explores how Pitts' experience of slavery and conversion to Islam complicate the relationship between his Christian self and his past actions as an apostate. In contrast, demonological categories were mapped more logically onto foreign rituals (Chapter 5). Subsequently, we explore political debates about how English Christians legitimated rule over India's vast and religiously diverse population, thereby connecting the practicalities of colonial rule with emerging domestic calls for evangelism (Chapter 6). Yet the foreign was not always seen as 'other' and foreign individuals and institutions were frequently depicted positively. Contrasts between the familiar and unfamiliar did not always provoke an instinctive valorisation of the former at the expense of the latter, and travellers used complex strategies to depict religious differences. Both individual, spontaneous interactions and more general social norms and values influenced travellers' judgements on foreign rites and beliefs.¹¹¹

Thirdly, this thesis is concerned with the representation or elision of indigenous perspectives. This is made most explicit in the discussion of the London Missionary Society in Chapter 7, though it also informs earlier chapters. The European rhetorical construction of Mahomet and Mahometanism is shown to influence travel texts in spite of actual encounters with Muslims in Chapter 3. Additionally, Chapters 4 and 5

¹¹¹ Ghobrial, *Whispers of Cities*, pp. vii-ix.

consider the elision of native subjectivities through either the assertion of returned slaves' Christian identities or the application of demonological categories to Lapp ceremonies. The consequences of colonial knowledge production for Anglo-Indian cultural and religious exchanges are reflected upon in Chapter 6.

Fourthly and finally, there are important discursive connections between the sources I discuss here. The nature of unbelief and various constructions of it are discussed in Chapters 3, 5 and 6, covering much of the chronological range of the thesis. Chapters 3 and 6 also address the proper foundations of religious belief in some detail. The construction of Mahomet in European thought guides informs Chapter 3, yet is also tacitly deconstructed through the ethnographic elements of Pitts' slavery narrative (Chapter 4). Meanwhile, Scriptural histories also inform many of these case studies: from the biblical parallels applied to Hakluyt's compendium by later generations (Chapter 2) through to early nineteenth-century depictions of Tahitian indolence and idolatry (Chapter 7). As a whole, this thesis examines how contemporary travel writing engaged with a range of discourses and controversies within domestic English religious thought.

This thesis takes a long view of the evolution of travel literature and English Protestantism. It considers the construction of individual travel texts in terms of the dialogical intercultural encounters that occasioned them and the wider religious context into which they were disseminated. In so doing, it focuses our attention on hitherto overlooked elements of early modern travel writing as a genre. By asking questions about religious matters – the sorts of questions pertinent to contemporary travellers, deviants and dissidents – it investigates the influence of contemporary religious debates and discourses over the representation of foreign societies' beliefs and practices. These complex texts represented intercultural encounters in a variety of ways that betrayed partial and at times contradictory self-presentations. In the next chapter, we examine Hakluyt's *Principal Navigations* and the different religious crises during which his collection of ephemeral travel texts was used and reused.

Chapter 2

Hakluyt Remembered and Hakluyt Reinterpreted: Two Key Moments in Early Modern Protestant Uses and Reuses of Travel Writing

This chapter considers how the writings of contemporary travellers reflected developments in English Protestantism. Rather than attempting to offer a comprehensive analysis of all elements of Protestant thought, it will trace the influence of domestic religious issues on travellers' representations of other faiths at two key moments over the long English Reformation (to borrow Patrick Collinson's phrase).¹ In so doing, I explore how 'religiously complex' beliefs in early modern England influenced travellers' descriptions of beliefs and practices abroad.² My focus is upon the reception and reappraisal of Richard Hakluyt's *Principal Navigations*, the foremost late Elizabethan collection of travel texts, which was originally published in 1589 and then expanded in 1598-1600. By tracing some of Hakluyt's sources through their initial composition circa 1550 to the end of the seventeenth century, I shall examine interactions between particular domestic theological moments and representations of foreign cultures.

Hakluyt's tales were used and reused in a variety of different religious contexts over the history of the Reformation. By showing how this founding compendium of English travel texts drew on the recent past and how subsequent generations reused his materials, this chapter examines how English travellers' representations of foreign religious practices related to broader patterns of continuity and change during the English Reformation. Travel texts serve as touchstones to investigate how travellers and editors writings about foreign religions reflected complexities within domestic religious culture. This chapter also considers

¹ Patrick Collinson, *The Reformation* (London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 2003), pp. 102-4, 177-8, 180; Patrick Collinson, *The Birthpangs of Protestant England: Religious and Cultural Change in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries* (Houndmills: Macmillan, 1988), pp. ix, 7-11, 14-16, 21-7; Damian Nussbaum, 'Reviling the Saints or Reforming the Calendar? John Foxe and His "Kalendar" of Martyrs', in *Belief and Practice in Reformation England: A Tribute to Patrick Collinson from His Students*, ed. by Susan Wabuda and Caroline Litzenberger (Aldershot: Ashgate, 1998), pp. 113-36 (pp. 129-32).

² Shannon Gayk, 'Early English Orthodoxies: Reading the English Reformations', *Journal of English and Germanic Philology*, 112 (2013), pp. 495-510 (p. 500).

how contemporary editorial practices were applied to controversial descriptions of other societies.³ Individual travellers and their editors mediated other societies' beliefs and practices in ways that reflected upon contemporary religio-political concerns. Building upon the discussion of genre conventions in the previous chapter, I show how travel writing could reinforce a variety of confessional positions.⁴ The heterogeneous nature the travel texts presented here suggests that the pan-European imperial rhetoric identified by Kate Phillips in Samuel Purchas' preamble to *Purchas, His Pilgrims* (1625) was not the dominant (let alone sole) authorial identity expressed by early modern travel writers or editors.⁵ Rather, travel narratives and compilations of travel texts were configured at particular religious and political moments.⁶

I shall show how developing Reformed beliefs and doctrines informed Hakluyt's editorial practices concerning descriptions of eastern forms of Christianity. Additionally, I will investigate how subsequent writers appropriated Hakluyt for their own purposes. There are two parts

³ Hakluyt, and contemporary editorial practices have been examined by a range of recent scholars, including Mary C. Fuller, "'His Dark Materials': The Problem of Dullness in Hakluyt's Collections", in *Richard Hakluyt and Travel Writing in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 231-43; Mary C. Fuller, *Voyages in Print: English Travel to America 1576-1624* (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995), pp. 1-16; Daniel Carey, 'Hakluyt's Instructions: The Principal Navigations and Sixteenth-Century Travel Advice', *Studies in Travel Writing*, 13 (2009), pp. 167-85; Linda McJannet, 'Purchas His Pruning: Refashioning the Ottomans in Seventeenth-Century Travel Narratives', *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 74 (2011), pp. 219-42; Julia Schleck, 'Forming the Captivity of Thomas Saunders: Hakluyt's Editorial Practices and Their Ideological Effects', in *Richard Hakluyt and Travel Writing in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 129-38; Julia Schleck, 'Forming Knowledge: Natural Philosophy and English Travel Writing', in *Travel Narratives, the New Science and Literary Discourse, 1569-1750*, ed. by Judy A. Hayden (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 53-70; Julia Schleck, "'Plain Broad Narratives of Substantial Facts': Credibility, Narrative and Hakluyt's Principall Navigations", *Renaissance Quarterly*, 59 (2006), pp. 768-94. For bibliographic and biographical information about Hakluyt and his influence, see Anthony Payne, *Richard Hakluyt: A Guide to His Books and to Those Associated with Him, 1580-1625* (London: Bernard Quaritch, 2008); D. B. Quinn, *The Hakluyt Handbook*, 2 vols. (London: Hakluyt Society, 1974).

⁴ See discussion of sources in Chapter 1 above, pp. 24-35. On the genre conventions of travel writing more generally, see Joan-Pau Rubiés, 'Instructions for Travellers: Teaching the Eye to See', *History and Anthropology*, 9 (1996), pp. 139-91.

⁵ Kim Phillips, *Before Orientalism: Asian People and Cultures in European Travel Writing, 1245-1510* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013), pp. 63-4.

⁶ Within this tradition of travel collecting, a variety of previously printed sources and manuscript accounts were 'reprinted, excerpted, summarised or rearranged' for a variety of religious and political ends: F. Thomas Noonan, *The Road to Jerusalem: Pilgrimage and Travel in the Age of Discovery* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007), pp. 67-8.

to this chapter, each focusing on a particular moment in the evolution of English Protestantism. The first part concerns the consolidation of Protestantism under Elizabeth I. It will demonstrate that travel texts collected and published by Hakluyt provide evidence of contemporary editorial practices and indicate the evolution of a distinctly Reformed perspective on foreign Christians' liturgical practices. In the second part, we explore debates around idolatry in the later seventeenth century, focusing on the heteroglossic potential of Hakluyt's compendium and its influence on religious polemics. I suggest that later seventeenth-century Protestants distanced themselves from the more lackadaisical attitudes of their Tudor predecessors. Hakluyt's *magnum opus* was understood in distinct ways as a consequence of debates around religious toleration in the decades surrounding the so-called Glorious Revolution. In both contexts, we shall see travellers drawing upon exclusive and inclusive conceptions of Christian worship that either incorporated or denigrated other denominations and traditions.⁷

Editing the Past: Travellers' Pre-Reformation Memories

Within Hakluyt's *Principal Navigations*, Eastern Orthodox forms of Christianity are thoroughly described since Hakluyt wished to show that 'Russia [was] a place where England could prove itself as equal in endeavour to the Spanish, Italians and Portuguese'. A significant chunk of the first volume was dedicated to the Muscovy trade in order to highlight the value of England's new overseas trade.⁸ Before turning to descriptions of Russian religion itself, we must consider the limits of our source materials in an era of pre-publication censorship as well as the influence of Hakluyt's editorial on the texts he collated. We must also be aware of the

⁷ Carina L. Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy in Sixteenth-Century Europe: The Ottomans and Mexicans* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), pp. 21-35.

⁸ Felicity Stout, "'The Strange and Wonderful Discoverie of Russia': Hakluyt and Censorship', in *Richard Hakluyt and Travel Writing in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 153-63 (p. 154). On the evolution of British attitudes to others of various kinds, two distinct perspectives can be traced through Linda Colley's work: Linda Colley, *Britons: Forging the Nation 1707-1837* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992); Linda Colley, *Captives: Britain, Empire and the World, 1600-1850* (London: Jonathan Cape, 2002).

internal diversity of the *Principal Navigations*. This expansive collection of England's exploratory and imperial achievements comprises texts from a variety of sources. The variable truth status of these texts has been well documented by Julia Schleck and Mary C. Fuller. Indeed, a proper understanding of 'Hakluyt's sprawling collection of travel narratives' can only be achieved by paying attention to the partial, fragmentary and (at times) repetitious nature of the materials collected therein.⁹ Any consideration of Hakluyt's *magnum opus* must engage explicitly with Hakluyt's editorial strategies. Although Hakluyt's stories appear 'remarkably like modern prose nonfiction', we cannot assume the 'factuality' of these stories. Rather, we must be alert to the fact that the truth status of any travel text is 'culturally determined, and... not an ahistorical fixed point of reference'. Schleck and Steven Shapin assert that Hakluyt's *magnum opus* was popular with contemporaries because 'the status of its [many] contributors' reinforced the political impetus behind 'early colonial endeavours'.¹⁰

Hakluyt also edited earlier narratives of voyages to fit with the political outlook of the latter part of Elizabeth's reign. Daniel Carey has shown how references to Mary I and her husband, Philip II of Spain, were omitted when Hakluyt published official documentation relating to the earliest English voyages to Muscovy from the 1550s.¹¹ This kind of editorial intervention is also apparent in Hakluyt's handling of the narrative of the Elizabethan Muscovite ambassador, Giles Fletcher. By comparing two versions of Fletcher's *Of the Russe Common Wealth* (1591), Felicity Stout has shown how suppression of the first edition of Fletcher's text reflected contemporary political and diplomatic anxieties. Fletcher's first edition, which was quickly suppressed on publication in 1591, criticised the Russian government as autocratic. In 1598, Hakluyt included

⁹ Schleck, 'Plain Broad Hakluyt', p. 768; Fuller, 'His Dark Materials', pp. 231-43.

¹⁰ Schleck, 'Plain Broad Hakluyt', p. 771. On wider discourses of social status relating to what Schleck terms the 'knowledge-power regime that perpetuates the colonial project' (p. 771), see Steven Shapin, *A Social History of Truth: Civility and Science in Seventeenth-Century England* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994).

¹¹ Daniel Carey, 'Richard Hakluyt as Editor', in *The Hakluyt Society Annual Lecture* (London: Hakluyt Society, 2012), pp. 1-28, (p. 9).

a highly truncated edition in the second edition of the *Principal Navigations*. Fletcher's 'hybrid work of council, civil philosophy, travel,... trade information, and cosmographical reference' was 'exceptionally censored' by Hakluyt owing to the politically sensitive nature of Fletcher's observations on Russian tyranny. The 'rapid suppression' of the 1591 edition was apparently due to Muscovy Company concerns that it could damage their relations with the Muscovite court. However, Stout shows this was only part of the story. Similar criticisms of Russian autocracy by other Muscovite ambassadors were included in the *Principal Navigations* without being censored.¹²

Stout suggests that Fletcher's text was suppressed because of the wider implications of the political worldview that he advocated therein. His objections to overbearing Russian monarchical power chimed with wider debates about tyranny in Renaissance literature, particularly relating to the legitimacy of resistance to an overbearing sovereign.¹³ The ambassador's analysis of 'such subjects as popish religion, monopolies, colonisation, the function of Parliament, the role of counsel... and the extent and limit of the monarch's prerogative... would have touched many raw nerves in the 1590s' as Elizabeth's direct authority over religious and political matters increased. Fletcher's 'theorising of tyrannical government and how such government should be avoided' may have been 'viewed through the image of Russia' but criticised forms of political authority increasingly common within the English polity itself: hence Hakluyt's extensive self-censorship of the truncated edition found in the second edition of the *Principal Navigations*.¹⁴ Fletcher's objections 'chimed with controversial political debates' around legitimate resistance to 'overbearing royal authority' in the latter decades of Elizabeth's reign. By locating Fletcher's voyage within networks of politics and patronage, Stout

¹² Stout, 'Hakluyt and Censorship', pp. 156, 158, 160.

¹³ Stout, 'Hakluyt and Censorship', pp. 161-2. On the problem of distinguishing tyrants from monarchs, see Rebecca W. Bushnell, *Tragedies of Tyrants: Political Thought and Theater in the English Renaissance* (New York: Cornell University Press, 1990), p. 38; John Guy, 'Monarchy and Counsel: Models of the State', in *The Sixteenth Century, 1485-1603*, ed. Patrick Collinson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), pp. 113-44 (pp. 129-30).

¹⁴ Stout, 'Hakluyt and Censorship', pp. 161-3. See also Lindsay, 'Richard Hakluyt', pp. 312-27.

alerts us to the fact that royal authorities both sanctioned ambassadors' voyages and censored the representation of their experiences abroad to domestic audiences. Indeed, their influence was such that later editors like Hakluyt automatically excised politically controversial elements.¹⁵

This also tells us much about the liminal status of the Muscovite polity: its alikeness proved uncomfortable for senior figures in Elizabeth's court and descriptions of unjust Muscovite tyranny could be seen as encouraging domestic sedition.¹⁶ Samuel H. Baron and Irena Grudzinska Gross have demonstrated the existence of a Western European tradition of representing 'Russia as tyrannical, barbaric and deviant'. They trace this tradition back to one of the most influential early modern accounts of Muscovy, Sigismund von Herberstein's *Rerum Moscoviticarum commentarii* (1549).¹⁷ The liminal status of Muscovite society is underlined in Edward Brerewood's catalogue of liturgical similarities and differences amongst Christian denominations that is derived from a number of travel works, including Fletcher and Herberstein.¹⁸ It was also reflected in Elizabethan travel narratives that deploy a range of tropes concerning the familiarity and difference of Russian doctrines and liturgies. In recognising familiar and novel practices, travel texts provided grist for two quite different mills. On the one hand, they contributed to contemporary discourses reinforcing officially sanctioned perspectives endorsing the legitimacy of English royal and religious authorities, doctrines and practices. However, they also

¹⁵ Stout, 'Hakluyt and Censorship', pp. 159-61; Andrew Hadfield, *Literature, Travel and Colonial Writing in the English Renaissance, 1545-1625* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1998), pp. 33-9.

¹⁶ On the politically dangerous aspects of travel, see Hadfield, *Literature, Travel and Colonial Writing*, pp. 32-3.

¹⁷ Irena Grudzinska Gross, 'The Tangled Tradition: Custine, Herberstein, Karamzin and the Critique of Russia', *Slavic Review*, 50 (1991), pp. 989-98, (p. 993), on Herberstein's influence more generally, see pp. 991-4; Samuel H. Baron, 'Herberstein's Image of Russia and Its Transmission Through Later Writers', in *Explorations in Muscovite History*, by Samuel H. Baron (Hampshire: Varorium, 1991), pp. 245-72 (pp. 252-6); Samuel H. Baron, 'The Influence in Sixteenth-Century England of Herberstein's *Rerum Moscoviticarum Commentarii*', in *Explorations in Muscovite History*, by Samuel H. Baron (Hampshire: Varorium, 1991), pp. 1-17 (pp. 1, 4-5, 11-12); Robert O. Lindsay, 'Richard Hakluyt and Of the Russe Common Wealth', *Bibliographic Society of America*, 57.3 (1963), pp. 312-27; Richard Pipes and John V. A. Fine Jr., 'Introduction', in *Of the Russe Commonwealth*, ed. by Richard Pipes and John V. A. Fine Jr. (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1966), pp. 181-9.

¹⁸ Edward Brerewood, *Enquiries Touching the Diversity of Languages, and Religions Through the Cheife Parts of the World...* (London, 1622), pp. 136-9, see also pp. 181-3.

tacitly provided evidence for later commentators such as Brerewood who were inclined to suggest that distinctions amongst Christians were merely ritualistic.¹⁹

Both Brerewood and Fletcher derived material from Herberstein, indicating that descriptions of Muscovy crossed Western European confessional and temporal borders.²⁰ In tracing this connection, Gross and Baron focused on Herberstein's political criticisms of Muscovy. In so doing, they perhaps overlooked the potential for his travel report to be used to endorse a more ecumenical view of religious difference. Eastern Christian societies were assessed against both religious and non-religious categories of civility.²¹ Rahul Sapra has suggested that possession of Christian faith was often a fundamental marker of civility for seventeenth-century English travellers.²² Likewise, Stout has asserted that Russia 'could hardly be categorised in the same way as the newly discovered and savage' peoples of the New World since 'it exhibited one of the most fundamental markers of civility, the Christian faith'. Stout cautions that English knowledge of Muscovy in the sixteenth century was 'imperfect' and thus it held a 'certain liminal and ambiguous status, caught between Old and New World assumptions'. Stout overviews Hakluyt's texts about Muscovy and shows how early modern English visitors frequently depicted their Muscovite hosts as 'savage and unintelligible' and were disturbed by the 'distinctly pagan' practices of their subject populations in Western Siberia.²³

In a similar vein, Marshall T. Poe suggests that a radical lack of fit existed between European and Russian political models. Visitors from the former tradition excluded the latter from the category of civilised polities.²⁴ Poe suggests that 'the archetypal Renaissance scientific pursuit' of writing 'ethnographies' indicates the cultural divide between the

¹⁹ Brerewood, *Enquiries*, sig. ¶13r.

²⁰ Gross, 'Tangled Tradition', p. 993, on Herberstein's sources and influence more broadly, see pp. 991-4; Baron, 'Image of Russia', pp. 252-6; Baron, 'Influence of Herberstein', pp. 1, 4-5, 11-12.

²¹ Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 263-5.

²² Rahul Sapra, *The Limits of Orientalism: Seventeenth Century Representations of India* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2011), pp. 29-32.

²³ Stout, 'Hakluyt and Censorship', p. 155. On Lapp religion and rituals, see Chapter 5 below, pp. 152-80.

²⁴ On categories of civility more generally, see Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 263-5.

'courteous' manners, 'liberal arts and sciences' of Western Europe and Russian society and culture. Visitors misunderstood the long heritage of Greek and Russian Orthodox traditions and so 'foreigners... self-servingly exaggerate[d]... their differences with the Russians' in order to 'cast themselves in the best light'.²⁵ To remedy this, Poe seeks to connect travellers' texts with some empirically verifiable 'Russian reality'.²⁶ He claims that travellers' accounts are marred by 'ethnological inaccuracy'. According to Poe, there were three causes of this 'inaccuracy', including the limits placed on ambassadors' ability to witness Russian life and liberal borrowing between European accounts. Poe also blames 'conceptual' issues arising from the 'specifically European mental baggage' that compelled Europeans to 'use alien notions' to describe Muscovite society and institutions 'without regard for what they had truly observed'.²⁷ This assumption does not account for the multiplicity of truths produced by intercultural encounters. There is copious evidence to suggest that our travellers were not simply attempting to uncover the underlying 'truth' of Russian culture and transmit it in an unbiased fashion to domestic audiences.²⁸ Travel texts provided their writers and readers with the opportunity to engage with wider debates, hence the seditious potential of Fletcher's political observations.

Colleen Franklin argues that the inhospitable climate and the strangeness of the customs produced a recognisable discourse of northern otherness in early modern texts.²⁹ By distinguishing northerly peoples from traditional New-Old World binaries, she provided a solution to the impasse concerning Russian civility elucidated by Poe and reinforces the

²⁵ Marshall T. Poe, *A People Born to Slavery: Russia in Early Modern European Ethnography, 1476-1748* (New York: Cornell University Press, 2000), pp. 149-50.

²⁶ Poe, *People Born to Slavery*, pp. 118-20, 121-2, 148-51, 166-7, 197-8, 225-6.

²⁷ Poe, *People Born to Slavery*, pp. 150, 198-9.

²⁸ On the emerging genre conventions of travel writing, see Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', esp. pp. 140-2, 147-58. Stereotypes of Russian despotism can be paralleled with the more prevalent European images of Islam during the period: see Matthew Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet Muhammad in Early Modern English Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), pp. 200-20.

²⁹ Colleen Franklin, "'An Habitation of Devils, a Domicill for Unclean Spirits, and a Den of Goblins': The Marvellous North in Early Modern English Literature", in *The Mysterious and the Foreign in Early Modern England*, ed. by Helen Ostovich, Mary V. Silcox, and Graham Roebuck (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2008), pp. 27-38 (esp. pp. 28-9).

'liminal' aspect of English depictions of Muscovite society.³⁰ Muscovite society provided an uncanny parallel with English society, a point attested to in depictions of their religion.

Over the fifty or so years of English trade with Moscow before the publication of the *Principal Navigations*, depictions of Russian Orthodox church decoration and religious services evolved substantially. The censorship of Fletcher's text indicates that we should not assume that the individual confessional outlooks of particular travellers can be easily reconstructed from Hakluyt's text. However, Hakluyt's texts and his editorial practices can inform us about how emerging Protestant orthodoxies informed depictions of foreign forms of Christianity. With Marian traces excised, the confessional outlook of Hakluyt's sources reflected the new religious sensibilities of the Elizabethan Settlement.³¹ Travellers expressed an aversion to practices that hinted at popery. Thus, depictions of Russian rituals drew on contemporary concerns about Catholicism whilst also acknowledging similarities with England's pre-Reformation church.

The largest part of Hakluyt's Russian materials is taken up by correspondence from Anthony Jenkinson, the English factor who also established overland trading links with Persia via Muscovy in the 1560s. His achievements have also been valorised in a number of subsequent biographical and historiographical studies.³² In line with officially sanctioned anti-Catholic prejudices of the time, Jenkinson criticised the ceremonial excess and idolatrous elements of Russian Orthodox worship, including the 'superstitious' dress of their friars and their veneration of saints and images. Jenkinson's comments reinforced concerns about ceremonial excess and veneration of objects pertinent to the

³⁰ Stout, 'Hakluyt and Censorship', p. 155.

³¹ Carey, 'Hakluyt as Editor', pp. 9-10.

³² Foster Rhea Dulles, *Eastward Ho! The First English Adventures to the Orient: Richard Chancellor, Anthony Jenkinson, James Lancaster, William Adams, Sir Thomas Roe* (Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin, 1931); Margaret B. Graham Morton, *The Jenkinson Story* (Glasgow: William MacLellan, 1962); K. Meshkat, 'The Journey of Master Anthony Jenkinson to Persia (1562)' (unpublished Cand. Philol. Degree, University of Oslo, 2005); Daryl W. Palmer, *Writing Russia in the Age of Shakespeare* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004), pp. 45-69; John H. Appleby, 'Jenkinson, Anthony (1529-1610/11)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2011, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/14736>> [accessed 6 September 2011].

desacralisation of objects at the heart of recent changes to English rituals. Likewise, Fletcher reinforced Reformed prohibitions against extravagant Catholic vestments, noting that the Russian friars' 'apparel... when they shew themselves in their Pontificalibus after their solemnest manner' consists of 'a mitre on their heads, after the Popish fashion'.³³ Fletcher's religious opinions were far less controversial than his political outlook. His criticisms of popish practices and the impropriety of Russian worship survived in Hakluyt's abbreviated edition.³⁴

English visitors during the first decades of Elizabeth's reign also referred to the familiarity of Russian monks' habits and practices. These references remain in Hakluyt's edition of their texts, indicating that disavowal of England's Catholic past was less of a priority than the excising of Elizabeth's half-sister Mary and her Catholic husband.³⁵ That said, Protestant rhetoric was keen to parallel the Reformation with early Christians struggle against paganism and Judaism. By the 1580s when Hakluyt was writing, English authors increasingly labelled themselves as Protestant, indicating their separation from all things foreign and Catholic.³⁶ However, the lack of surviving manuscript versions of these texts makes it difficult to ascertain the degree to which censorship – either unofficially by Hakluyt or from government agencies – may have amended these descriptions. Regardless, they provide an indication of the official view that foreign practices, like past English ones, were commensurably in need of reform. This is clear in the texts of the first two English ambassadors to Muscovy, Thomas Randolph and Richard Chancellor.

³³ Giles Fletcher, *Of the Russe Common Wealth Or Manner of Government by the Russe Emperour (commonly Called the Emperour of Moskovia) with the Manners and Fashions of the People of that Countrey* (London, 1591), p. 201.

³⁴ Lloyd E. Berry, 'Giles Fletcher, the Elder, and Milton's "A Brief History of Moscovia"', *The Review of English Studies*, 11.42 (1960), pp. 150-6 (pp. 152-3). On Fletcher's other publications, see Richard W. Cogley, "'The Most Vile and Barbarous Nation of All the World': Giles Fletcher the Elder's *The Tartars Or, Ten Tribes* (ca. 1610)", *Renaissance Quarterly*, 58.3 (2005), pp. 781-814.

³⁵ Carey, 'Hakluyt as Editor', pp. 9-10.

³⁶ Peter Marshall, 'The Naming of Protestant England', *Past and Present*, 214 (2012), pp. 87-128 (pp. 104-10, 110-14). On theological reflections on this break with the past, see Jonathan Sheehan, 'The Altars of the Idols: Religion, Sacrifice, and the Early Modern Polity', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67 (2006), pp. 649-73 (pp. 651-4).

Chancellor's initial (and largely accidental) voyage to Muscovy was originally published by Clement Adams shortly after Chancellor's death in 1556.³⁷ By examining the features of Orthodox practice that Chancellor found familiar, we can see that he reflected on how Russian and English worship differed, and how unreformed Russian practices provoked reflection on the brave new world of English Protestantism. For instance, Randolph commented that the 'apparel' of the monks of the abbey at St. Nicholas 'is superstitious, in blacke hoods as ours have bene', and their church 'faire, but full of painted images, tapers and candles'.³⁸ Similarly, Chancellor's servant Richard Johnson remarked that the Russians 'hold it not good to worshippe any carved image, yet they will worshippe paynted images on tables or boordes'.³⁹ Chancellor believed this distinction was insufficient since although the Muscovites 'have no graven images in their Churches... to the intent they will not breake the commandement', in reality, 'they use [their painted images with] such idolatrie that the like was never heard of in England'.⁴⁰ Concerns about the inattention of congregations and the deception of priests also figured. Chancellor stated that in spite of their religious services being conducted 'in their mother

³⁷ There are various versions of Chancellor's text. The account excerpted by Hakluyt was jointly authored by Chancellor and Adams, a London-based editor, shortly before the former's death: Robert O. Crummey, and Lloyd E. Berry, eds., *Rude and Barbarous Kingdom: Russia in the Accounts of Sixteenth-Century English Voyagers* (Madison and London: University of Wisconsin Press, 1968), pp. 9-11. For Chancellor's biography, see James McDermott, 'Chancellor, Richard', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.odnb.com/view/article/5099>> [accessed 18 June 2015]. This narrative contained a more extensive description of Russian religion than the version in the *Principal Navigations*. It is worth noting that Hakluyt's edits do not alter Chancellor's observations, rather, he cuts descriptions which were repeated by other travellers. On multiple versions of texts in *The Principal Navigations* and their value for historians, see Fuller, 'His Dark Materials', pp. 238-41.

³⁸ Thomas Randolph, 'The Ambassage of the Right, Worshipfull Master Thomas Randolfe, Esquire, to the Emperour of Russia, in the Yeere 1568, Briefly Written By Himself', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), III, pp. 102-8, (pp. 102-3).

³⁹ Richard Johnson, 'Certaine Notes Unperfectly Written by Richard Johnson, Servant to Master Richard Chancellor, Which was in the Discoverie of Vaigatz and Nova Zembla...' in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), II, pp. 345-9 (p. 346). Johnson travelled with Chancellor on the first diplomatic mission to the Russian Emperor in 1555/6: Carey, 'Hakluyt as Editor', pp. 9-10.

⁴⁰ Richard Chancelour, 'The Booke of the Great and Mighty Emperor of Russia, and Duke of Muscouia, and of the Dominions Orders and Commodities Thereunto Belonging...' in *The Principal Navigations, Voyages, Traffiques and Discoveries of the English Nation*, by Richard Hakluyt, 2014, <<http://ebooks.adelaide.edu.au/h/hakluyt/voyages/v03/chapter5.html>> [accessed 18 March 2014].

tongue' and them 'hav[ing] the olde and newe Testament... daily read among them... their superstition is no lesse' because their priests 'have such tricks in their reading that no man can understand them'. As a result, many are inattentive and 'gagle and ducke like so many geese'.⁴¹ The problem of inattentive worship concerned many within the English church.⁴² Contemporary advisory literature provided a variety of solutions for worshipers who were experiencing difficulties praying. Alec Ryrie has explored how didactic literature was produced in order to guide Reformed worshipers and keep them attentive in their performance of prayer.⁴³ Devout Protestants' concerns about intelligible preaching, attentive congregations and the excising of Catholic elements were all reflected in ambassadorial accounts of Orthodox worship.

The perceived ceremonial excesses of Orthodox Christian worship provoked unflattering comparisons with Catholicism. John Locke, a Protestant pilgrim and Marian exile who travelled across the Mediterranean in 1553, made similar observations concerning Orthodox worship's similarity to Catholicism. Locke was content that he did not see 'in any of their Churches... any graven images'. He did, however, observe that their churches were full of 'painted or portrayed' images of saints, each with 'store of lampes alight, almost for every image one'.⁴⁴ Locke believed that Orthodox services with 'the number of their ceremonious crossings... were too long'. He also observed critically that 'in all their Communion... no one did ever kneele'.⁴⁵ Kneeling to pray was the norm and was supported by 'ample biblical witness and invariable Christian practice' amongst English Puritans and Reformed congregations alike.⁴⁶ Kneeling was integral to English experience of worship regardless of where one fell on the post-Reformation confessional spectrum and was the most

⁴¹ Chancelour, 'The Book of the Great and Mighty Emperor'.

⁴² Christopher Haigh, 'Success and Failure in the English Reformation', *Past and Present*, 173 (2001), pp. 28-49 (pp. 34-41).

⁴³ Alec Ryrie, *Being Protestant in Reformation Britain* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), pp. 102-7.

⁴⁴ John Locke, 'The Voyage of M. John Locke to Jerusalem', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), v, pp. 76-105, (p. 86).

⁴⁵ Locke, 'Voyage', p. 86.

⁴⁶ Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, p. 171.

common posture of prayer in use amongst English worshipers. This is attested to in contemporary didactic literature as well as in diaries recording individuals' experiences of prayer and on funeral monuments representing the deceased at prayer.⁴⁷ Although not kneeling was an option, it had to be justified. Advisory literature across the religious spectrum suggested that it was only permissible to adopt alternative poses should one be physically or spiritually incapable of kneeling.⁴⁸ It was generally believed that a kneeling posture was critical to 'ordering your affections Godward', and Locke perhaps implied that Greek services had substituted tiresome 'ceremonious crossings' (i.e. outward gestures of worship) for proper contemplation and reverence.⁴⁹

In contrast to Locke's criticisms, Hélène Pignot has shown that Sir Paul Rycault and Thomas Smith's early seventeenth-century accounts of Greek religion were more ecumenical. Rycault and Smith judged the vibrancy of Greek Christianity and its apostolic origins were sufficient to provide comfort to Greek Christians living under Turkish rule.⁵⁰ An ecumenical approach to the different practices of foreign Christians was possible, indicating the breadth of responses that contemporary English travellers evinced. A surprising further example of early ecumenism comes from the unlikely pen of William Biddulph, who served as a minister to the Levant Company's Aleppo trading post.⁵¹ Although he reckoned they were 'simple and ignorant people' who 'had no Latine, and little learning in any other language', Biddulph argued that their practice of singing the Psalms in their vernacular language was something that 'is too much neglected in England' and wished that God would grant 'reformation thereof'.⁵² Psalm singing was a popular pastime for many Puritans of Biddulph's ilk, and was

⁴⁷ Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, pp. 170-6, on other gestures at prayer, see pp. 177-87.

⁴⁸ Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, pp. 173-7.

⁴⁹ Locke, 'Voyage', p. 86; Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, p. 186.

⁵⁰ Hélène Pignot, 'A Trip to the Origins of Christianity: Sir Paul Rycault's and Rev. Thomas Smith's Accounts of the Greek Church in the Seventeenth Century', *Studies in Travel Writing*, 13 (2009), pp.193-205.

⁵¹ Biddulph's account of Islam is discussed at length in Chapter 3 below, pp. 78-115.

⁵² William Biddulph, *The Travels of Certain Englishmen into Africa, Asia, Troy, Bythinia, Thracia and to the Black Sea...* (London, 1609), sigs. G3r-G4v; Gerald MacLean, *The Rise of Oriental Travel: English Visitors to the Ottoman Empire, 1580-1720* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), pp. 93-4, 112-13.

one of the more distinctive aspects of domestic Puritan worship. His positive response to Levantine Christian psalm-singing highlights how important such practice was to his own understanding of proper worship.⁵³

Descriptions of other Christians often highlighted both novel and popish features and individual travellers framed these ritual differences in both positive and negative ways. Joan Pau Rubiés has explored how early modern European travel literature developed, and how 'personal travel narratives' drew upon a 'self-sustaining myth of a personal identity in the figure of the scholarly traveller' who 'articulate[d]... England's relationship with other European nations' yet was also indebted to other notions of 'European civility'. Within this genre, set systems for recording and documenting novel foreign practices emerged. The range and extent of that novelty reflected changing domestic norms and values, though travel was also connected with 'morality' and writing about other places and peoples was intertwined with 'identity and cultural forms of the self'.⁵⁴ Hence, the range of reactions depicted here. Though the puritanical Biddulph was impressed by indigenous Christian psalm-singing, Locke was exasperated by long and popish ceremonies full of 'crossings'. In contrast to both these positions, Rycault took the ecumenical view that sufficiently Christian beliefs comforted the Greek population under Turkish occupation.⁵⁵

These diverse responses reflect Ryrie's recent conclusions concerning devotional practices at home. He asserts that a '*broad-based* religious culture' founded on Protestant principles emerged during the latter half of the sixteenth century.⁵⁶ That being said, confessional disputes were prevalent amongst several 'generations of clerics' in spite of the post-

⁵³ Charles E. Hambrick-Stowe, 'Practical Divinity and Spirituality', in *The Cambridge Companion to Puritanism*, ed. by John Coffey and Paul C. H. Lim (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), pp. 191-205 (pp. 200-1); Alexandra Walsham, 'The Godly and Popular Culture', in *The Cambridge Companion to Puritanism*, ed. by John Coffey and Paul C. H. Lim (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), pp. 277-93 (p. 288).

⁵⁴ Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', pp. 172, 174-7.

⁵⁵ For Biddulph and Locke, see n. 52 and 44 above respectively. On Turkish rule, adaptation and opposition in the eastern Mediterranean, see Molly Greene, *A Shared World: Christians and Muslims in the Early Modern Mediterranean* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000), esp. pp. 78-109.

⁵⁶ Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, p. 6; Gayk, 'Early English Orthodoxies', p. 499.

Reformation ‘Calvinist consensus’.⁵⁷ The historiographical assumption that England’s Reformation was exceptional has been critiqued in recent years.⁵⁸ The recycling of Catholic devotional texts for Protestant purposes demonstrates the pan-Christian aspirations of various denominations of English worshipers, as well as their readiness to reshape doctrinally unorthodox material to fit Protestant purposes. With overtly Catholic elements such as Purgatory excised, ‘lengthy meditation[s] on damnation’ were a prominent element of Reformed religious sensibilities.⁵⁹ Seepage between apparently opposing doctrinal positions – and their popular circulation through print and pulpit – was as much a feature of early modern theology as overt confessional conflict. These travel texts reflect this theologically complex reality and show a variety of strategies for embracing or rejecting foreign Christian practices.

These strategies altered over time: later Elizabethan travellers were less likely to make explicit reference to pre-Reformation English practices. By comparing Randolph’s text with those of later travellers, we can also see how status may have affected individual travellers’ account of Orthodox worship. You will recall that both Chancellor and Randolph referred to the clothing of Orthodox monks as ‘superstitious, in blacke hoods as ours have bene’. With Locke, they all complained about the popish images venerated in Orthodox churches, noting similarities with pre-Reformation English practices.⁶⁰ Such comparisons were not available to travellers born during the middle of the sixteenth century after the Elizabethan Settlement had begun to take root in English parish churches.⁶¹ This can be seen in the account of the organ-maker Thomas Dallam. Dallam was despatched to Constantinople to assemble a mechanical organ gifted to Sultan Mehmed III

⁵⁷ Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, pp. 6-7. See also Nicholas Tyacke, *Anti-Calvinists: the Rise of English Arminianism* (Oxford, Clarendon: 1987).

⁵⁸ Patrick Collinson, ‘The Fog in the Channel Clears: The Rediscovery of the Continental Dimension to the British Reformations’, in *The Reception of Continental Reformation in Britain*, ed. by Polly Ha and Patrick Collinson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), pp. xxvii- xxxvii.

⁵⁹ Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, pp. 34-5.

⁶⁰ Randolph, ‘The Ambassage’, pp. 102-3; Locke, ‘Voyage’, p. 86; Johnson, ‘Certain Notes’, p. 346.

⁶¹ Caroline Litzenberger, ‘Defining the Church of England: Religious Change in the 1570s’, in *Belief and Practice in Reformation England: A Tribute to Patrick Collinson from His Students*, ed. by Susan Wabuda and Caroline Litzenberger (Aldershot: Ashgate, 1998), pp. 137-53.

by Elizabeth.⁶² Dallam's manuscript journal is unusual because of his relatively low status and his lively relation of incidents throughout the voyage and at the Sultan's court.⁶³ During a stop on the Greek island of Zakynthos, Dallam inadvertently witnessed Mass in a Greek Orthodox chapel. His observations on the fabric of the building itself convey the novelty of his surroundings.⁶⁴ He observed that the 'chappell was verie curiously painted and garnished round about' in a style which 'as before... I had never seene the lyke'. Like Locke and Randolph, he commented on the number of 'wex candles burning' during the ceremony. However, unlike his higher status predecessors, the Mass ceremony was itself a novel experience for Dallam. This sense of novelty is the defining feature of Dallam's description, attested to in his comment that neither he nor any of his party 'had ever sene any parte of a mass before, nether weare we thinge [sic] the wyser for that'.⁶⁵

Two factors may explain the differences between Dallam and Randolph's responses to the ritual paraphernalia of Orthodox churches. Firstly, Dallam was of a relatively lower social status than many contemporary traveller writers. Secondly, and more importantly, unlike Randolph, he had grown up during a period of Protestant consolidation in

⁶² On the Anglo-Ottoman détente that made these exchanges possible during the later Elizabethan period, see Matthew Dimmock, "'Captive to the Turke": Responses to the Anglo-Ottoman Capitulations of 1580', in *Cultural Encounters Between East and West 1453-1699*, ed. by Matthew Birchwood and Matthew Dimmock (Newcastle-upon-Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Press, 2005), pp. 29-42; Sabine Lucia Müller, 'William Harborne's Embassies: Scripting, Performing and Editing Anglo-Ottoman Diplomacy', in *Early Modern Encounters with the Islamic East: Performing Cultures*, ed. by Sabine Schülting, Sabine Lucia Müller, and Ralf Hertel (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 11-26.

⁶³ Note that Dallam's text was not included in Hakluyt's anthology. Its roughly contemporaneous composition and manuscript circulation provide a useful contrast to the works edited and published by Hakluyt.

⁶⁴ In contrast, Porter claims Dallam's text as 'remarkably secular in tone': Chloe Porter, "'I Satt and Saw": Negotiating the Gaze in the Travel Writings of Anthony Munday and Thomas Dallam', *Journeys*, 14 (2013), pp. 50-68 (pp. 50, 54). See also MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. xv, 1-48.

⁶⁵ Thomas Dallam, 'Thomas Dallam's Diary, 1599-1600', in *Early Voyages and Travels in the Levant*, ed. by James Theodore Bent (London: Hakluyt Society, 1893), pp. 1-98 (pp. 22-3). On Dallam's status, see Lawrence Danson, 'The Sultan's Organ: Presents and Self-Presentation in Thomas Dallam's Diary', *Renaissance Studies*, 23 (2010), pp. 639-58. On Dallam as a clear-sighted and unbiased observer, see Porter, 'Negotiating the Gaze', p. 50; MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, p. 112. Dallam did not publish his account during his lifetime, and it is tempting to speculate on the effect the visual splendour of an Orthodox Mass may have had on a middling status artisan like Dallam.

England. Lawrence Danson examined Dallam's interactions with his social superiors and suggests that the joiner's lower status directly informed how he represented his travels, focusing in particular on his fractious relationship with higher status Englishmen aboard ship and at the Sultan's court.⁶⁶ Danson's insight may extend to Dallam's depiction of local religious practices as well. Dallam's account, stressing the novelty of the Orthodox Mass, is comparable with Johnson's view that to 'worshippe paynted Images on tables or boordes' was somewhat different to venerating graven images per se.⁶⁷ Dallam's account emphasises the novelty of Orthodox Mass, or indeed any kind of Mass, for a man of moderate means born in the 1570s.⁶⁸ Dallam's status may not be a critical factor, however. Earlier accounts by higher status individuals also referred to the features that he identified as novel, including wax candles and curious decorations.

The fifty years between Randolph's (b. 1526) and Dallam's (bap. 1575) births explains more fully the novelty with which the latter approached Orthodox rituals. By the time Dallam was a young man, even the most pessimistic historiographical assessments of the English Reformation suggest that Reformed practices were taking root, especially in London where Dallam had been apprenticed and employed prior to his voyage.⁶⁹ Caroline Litzenberger has shown that English Protestant confessional identity, embodied in the Church of England, became more confident by the later years of Elizabeth's reign.⁷⁰ It is true that Dallam's relatively low status is likely to have constrained his religious education. However, by the 1570s, ecclesiastical authorities were increasing their

⁶⁶ Danson, 'Sultan's Organ', pp. 650-3, 656-8; MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 10-12. For a near-contemporary description of the Ottoman court, see the following: Ottaviano Bon, *The Sultan's Seraglio: An Intimate Portrait of Life at the Ottoman Court*, ed. by Godfrey Goodwin (London: Saqi Books, 1996); Jane Hathaway, *Beshir Agha: Chief Eunuch of the Ottoman Imperial Harem* (Oxford: Oneworld, 2005).

⁶⁷ Johnson, 'Certaine Notes', p. 346.

⁶⁸ Christopher Kent, 'Dallam, Thomas', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/7030>> [accessed 26 October 2012]; Litzenberger, 'Defining the Church', pp. 137-53.

⁶⁹ Peter Marshall, '(Re)defining the English Reformation', *Journal of British Studies*, 48 (2009), pp. 564-86, (pp. 583-4); Marshall, 'Naming of Protestant England', pp. 99-100. On ambiguities and doubt about the role of ceremony and the sacraments in Elizabethan England, see Matthew Millner, *The Senses and the English Reformation* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2011), pp. 283-5.

⁷⁰ Litzenberger, 'Defining the Church', pp. 137-53.

efforts to 'curtail and discipline' recusant practices, even in remote regions like Dallam's native Lancashire. The gradual reformation of religious life in English parishes would have affected the religious fabric of Dallam's early life, removing or alienating him from those Catholic sculptures and other elements of the old religion that were familiar to the generation of travellers before him.⁷¹ In contrast, Randolph experienced a period of semi-exile following the accession of Mary I owing to his 'Protestant contacts and sympathies', although one biographer doubts the extent of his connections.⁷² Locke's family were also Protestant exiles: his travels were undertaken in exile during the early 1550s.⁷³ Although unreformed congregations continued to observe the old religion and recusant groups continued to worship clandestinely, Dallam is less likely than Locke and Randolph to have observed, let alone been intimately familiar with, Catholic rites in England prior to his departure.⁷⁴ Furthermore, Ryrie suggests that the 'lived experience' of seventeenth-century English Protestants was relatively homogenous and the worship experiences of 'puritans and conformists' were similar.⁷⁵

Despite the fact that he came from Lancashire, a theologically conservative part of the country with relatively high recusancy rates, Dallam's theological outlook in his writings is that of an orthodox Protestant. In contrast, Randolph and Chancellor's accounts betray uncertainties about the outcome of the English Reformation, as well as more deep-seated hostility to popish or Catholic rituals. This is perhaps

⁷¹ Eamon Duffy, *Saints, Sacrilege and Sedition: Religion and Conflict in the Tudor Reformations* (London: Bloomsbury, 2012), pp. 33-5, 80-102, 106-7, 128; Natalie Mears, 'Public Worship and Political Participation in Elizabethan England', *Journal of British Studies*, 51.1 (2012), pp. 4-25 (pp. 15-22). On the ending of Catholicism in England more generally, see Eamon Duffy, *The Stripping of the Altars: Traditional Religion in England c. 1400-c. 1580* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1992).

⁷² Julian Lock, 'Randolph, Thomas (1525/6-1590)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/23122>> [accessed 24 July 2012].

⁷³ James McDermott, 'Lok, Sir William', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2008, <<http://www.odnb.com/view/article/16951>> [accessed 18 June 2015]. Locke's family appear to also have had a connection with the Muscovy wool trade, see Stout, 'Hakluyt and Censorship', p. 154, n. 9.

⁷⁴ MacLean notes that the evidence concerning Dallam's family's confessional outlook is inconclusive: MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, p. 249, n. 2, citing Stephan Bicknell, *History of the English Organ* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), p. 72.

⁷⁵ Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, p. 6.

unsurprising given the censorship of ambassadorial publications discussed earlier. Dallam's text was not subject to such oversight: it circulated as a manuscript amongst friends and associates, and was only published in the nineteenth century.⁷⁶

Dallam and Randolph's contrasting descriptions of Orthodox worship demonstrate how religious change at home influenced travellers' representations of other denominations. During the fifty years before the publication of the *Principal Navigations*, England's religious constitution was slowly altered from that of a largely Catholic nation into one which was nationalistically, if not yet wholly theologically, Protestant. Travellers' texts can be used indirectly to reflect on this process. Hakluyt's prominent anthology of travel texts affirmed Reformed doctrine and practice and depicted English travellers who were wholly allied to the Protestant cause.⁷⁷ Consequently, the mediated self-presentation of these individuals served to endorse officially sanctioned Christian doctrine and practice as well as reinforce English national interests.⁷⁸ We have seen how the everyday *experience* of Protestantism was fundamental to travellers' representations of other forms of Christianity.⁷⁹ This reflects Peter Marshall's contention that 'popular confessionalisation preceded, accompanied and sometimes opposed fitful' state drives toward religious reform.⁸⁰ The individual experience of particular travellers is also integral to their reports since many Protestant exiles during the Marian Counter Reformation undertook ambassadorial roles under Elizabeth. Their descriptions of foreign Christians can be contextualised in light of wider discourses of Catholic persecution, as well as (tentatively) their personal experiences of England's aborted Counter Reformation.

⁷⁶ Bent, 'Introduction', pp. i-xx; Danson, 'Sultan's Organ', pp. 642-3.

⁷⁷ On Protestantism in later English travel narratives about continental Europe, see Tony Claydon, *Europe and the Making of England, 1660-1760* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), pp. 13-66.

⁷⁸ Collinson, *Birthpangs*, p. 1. Note that Collinson's sources indicate English insularity and ethnocentrism *prior* to the religious ructions of Reformation.

⁷⁹ Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, pp. 1-9. On medieval attitudes to Asia more generally, see Phillips, *Before Orientalism*, pp. 15-27.

⁸⁰ Marshall, '(Re)defining the English Reformation', pp. 584-5.

All the texts discussed above reflect on foreign forms of Christianity and display different perspectives on religious change at home. In this regard, Tony Claydon's analysis of eighteenth-century English descriptions of Western Europe has been influential. Claydon's lucid discussion of how English travellers inscribed Catholicism as a physical presence in the landscape led me to consider whether other forms of Christianity were similarly inscribed in travellers' descriptions of the sacred spaces that they were perceived to occupy.⁸¹ Claydon identified contrasts between representations of Protestant and Catholic landscapes that are lacking from these earlier sources. However, particular sacred spaces were defined either by their novelty, as in Dallam's analysis, or by the otherness of popishness, as in Locke and Randolph. The tripartite division of Christianity between Reformed, Roman and Orthodox varieties was compressed into a binary model based on nascent English nationalism and associated anti-Catholicism.⁸² Eastern versions of Christianity were mapped onto contemporary ideological dichotomies that pitted English Protestantism against European Catholicism.⁸³ Descriptions of rituals and church fabrics provided an indicator of the orthodoxy of nominal Christians overseas. Travellers' comments on the novelty of certain Orthodox practices betray a variety of reactions towards ostensibly Catholic religious paraphernalia and practice. They also betray the

⁸¹ Claydon, *Europe and the Making of England*, pp. 28-44.

⁸² Greene, *Shared World*, pp. 3-12. On the reality of European and Mediterranean cosmopolitan spaces in which individuals from different denominations and faiths interacted, see Eric R. Dursteler, *Venetians in Constantinople: Nation, Identity and Coexistence in the Early Modern Mediterranean* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2006); Alison Games, *The Web of Empire: English Cosmopolitans in an Age of Expansion, 1560-1660* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008); John-Paul Ghobrial, *The Whispers of Cities: Information Flow in Istanbul, London and Paris in the Age of William Trumbull* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013); Nancy Bisaha, *Creating East and West: Renaissance Humanists and the Ottoman Turks* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004).

⁸³ On representations of other elements of Russian life, see Gross, 'Tangled Tradition', pp. 989-998; Poe, *People Born to Slavery*, pp. 148-9; Baron, 'Image of Russia', pp. 245-78; Baron, 'Influence of Herberstein', pp. 1-17; *Early Exploration of Russia*, ed. by Marshall T. Poe, 12 vols. (London: Routledge Curzon, 2003); Samuel H. Baron, 'The Muscovy Company, the Muscovite Merchants, and the Problem of Reciprocity in Russian Foreign Trade', *Forschungen zur Osteuropäischen Geschichte*, 27 (1980), pp. 133-55; Samuel H. Baron, 'Herberstein and the English "Discovery" Of Muscovy', *Terrae Incognitae*, 18.1 (1986), pp. 43-54; Samuel H. Baron, 'Osip Napea and the Opening of Anglo-Russian Commercial Relations', *Oxford Slavonic Papers*, 11 (1978), pp. 42-63.

ambiguities experienced within domestic religious communities during the first half-century of domestic religious change.

We should not apply later denominational categories too rigidly to early modern religious experience. Whilst the sixteenth century saw violent inter-denominational conflict between rival Christian groups across Europe, confessional identities did not cleave entirely into opposing camps. Both partisan and non-partisan calls for Christian unity made sense in a society in which, as Marshall has recently shown, exclusive denominational labels like 'Protestant' were still relatively recent inventions. Marshall shows how slowly the term 'Protestant' was adopted by sixteenth-century English reformers, further indicating the breadth and flexibility of Reformed English religious identities.⁸⁴ This plurality, combined with the uncertainty of future religious change, influenced representations of nominal Christians abroad. Travellers and domestic religious commentators were keenly aware that foreign forms of Christian worship could be seen as commensurate with domestic practice. Positive and negative depictions had the potential to inform, improve or criticise Protestant practice.⁸⁵

In their reportage of foreign practices, the particular confessional outlook of individual travellers or their editors becomes apparent. Just like the political sensitivities discussed earlier, the rising tide of anti-Catholicism in Elizabethan England undoubtedly informed Hakluyt's editorial of texts composed by operatives appointed by the Marian state.⁸⁶ However, as Randolph's description of the Orthodox monastery attests, some Protestant responses to 'Catholic' features of Orthodox worship were

⁸⁴ Marshall, 'Naming of Protestant England', pp. 87-9, 100-11; Marshall, '(Re)defining the English Reformation', pp. 564-86. On later uses of distinctions between Lutheran and Calvinist forms of Christianity in depictions of continental Europe, see Claydon, *Europe and the Making of England*, pp. 45-6.

⁸⁵ Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, pp. 34-5, 113.

⁸⁶ Stout, 'Hakluyt and Censorship', pp. 157-63; Peter Barber, 'Was Elizabeth I Interested in Maps – And Did It Matter?', *Transactions of Royal Historical Society*, 14 (2004), pp. 185-98; David Armitage, 'The Elizabethan Idea of Empire', *Transactions of Royal Historical Society*, 14 (2004), pp. 269-77; Lesley B. Cormack, 'Britannia Rules the Waves?: Images of Empire in Elizabethan England', in *Literature, Mapping and the Politics of Space in Early Modern Britain*, ed. by Andrew Gordon and Bernhard Klein (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), pp. 45-68.

complicated by their very familiarity. In contrast, Dallam's text betrays little awareness of the shared history of Christian denominations before the schisms of the Reformation. Dallam's depiction of the Mass as an entirely novel experience indicates that he associated it with the alien and the foreign in a way that previous generations did not, attesting to the influence of nationalistic deployments of Protestantism at parish level in response to national crises during Elizabeth's reign.⁸⁷

We can find further evidence for the influence of anti-Catholic sentiments in Lawrence Aldersey's contribution to the *Principal Navigations*. He digresses from recounting his storm-tossed Mediterranean crossing to detail how the author got into an argument with a group of fellow passengers who were Catholic friars. Aldersey reports that he caused 'great stirre' when he refused to venerate a Catholic image. He informed an Italian gentleman that, by praying to intercessors, Catholics 'robbed God of his honour and wrought their own destructions'. Discussion became heated, It took the intervention of 'two of the friers that were of the greatest authoritie' to make 'all welle againe' amongst the passengers.⁸⁸ This performance of resistance to Catholic traditions shows a contrast between Aldersey and Dallam's religious backgrounds. Whereas Dallam asserts ignorance toward foreign Christian rituals and wonders at their otherness, Aldersey seems more conscious of the anticipated conduct of a Protestant traveller.

This does not mean that we should assume Dallam's testimony is more authentic or straightforward.⁸⁹ Distrust of Europeans was also included in the advice given to ambassadors, as the letter of direction given to Richard Forster, the recently appointed first English Consul at Tripolis in Syria attests. William Harborne, ambassador to the Porte, advised Forster that he should be mindful of his demeanour since

⁸⁷ Mears, 'Public Worship and Political Participation', pp. 5, 8, 22, 24.

⁸⁸ Lawrence Aldersey, 'The First Voyage or Journey, Made by Master Laurence Aldersey, Marchant of London, to the Cities of Jerusalem, and Tripolis, &c in the Yeere 1581...', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), v, pp. 202-14 (p. 206). For Aldersey's biography, see R. C. D. Baldwin, 'Aldersey, Laurence', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2012, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/302>> [accessed 24 January 2012].

⁸⁹ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 71, 73, 112-13.

both French and Venetians will have an envious eye on you... if they shall perceive any insufficiencie in you, they will not omit... any occasion to harme you. They are subtile, malicious, and dissembling people, wherefore you must always have their doings for suspected, and warily walke in all your actions: wherein if you call for God's divine assistance, as doth become every faithfull good Christian, the same shall in such sort direct you as he shall be glorified, your selfe preserved, your doings blessed, and your enemies confounded.⁹⁰

English trading interests were underlined by nationalistic and religious rivalries with other Europeans. This would be a constant refrain in early modern English travel literature, attested to in Sapra's analysis of seventeenth- and eighteenth-century denigrations of Portuguese-controlled territories in India.⁹¹ Travellers' descriptions of other religious practices allowed for different performances of the rhetoric of alterity. Both Dallam's description of the novelty of Orthodox Mass and Aldersey's combative stance serve to represent their authors in particular ways that served to highlight their allegiance to English Protestantism.

These texts all drew upon and are connected to wider domestic ideas and debates. The evolution of English Protestantism is imprinted on the different reactions to Orthodox rituals already discussed. However, English and/or Protestant exceptionalism were not the only ideas underpinning these representations of others. The tensions between reinforcing tenets of the Reformed faith and providing guidance to travellers in a cosmopolitan multi-faith environment is exemplified in Aldersey's account, in which confessional disagreement is mooted, then patched up (interestingly, by the magnanimity of senior friars). All these texts, whether edited by Hakluyt or not, demonstrate the explicitly constructed nature of the reality presented by travel writers. Conflict with Catholics, denigrations of Orthodox practice or comments on the novelty of their rituals all served distinct rhetorical purposes, though it would be a

⁹⁰ William Harborne, 'A Letter of Directions of the English Ambassadour to M. Richard Forster, Appointed the First English Consul at Tripolis in Syria', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), v, pp. 261-3 (p. 262). For a detailed study of English relations with Ottoman and other European powers, see Ghobrial, *Whispers of Cities*, pp. 88-94.

⁹¹ Sapra, *Limits of Orientalism*, pp. 46-9. On representations of other Protestant denominations, see Claydon, *Europe and the Making of England*, pp. 48-50.

mistake to exaggerate the proto-colonialist aspects of early modern travel texts.⁹² Travel works contributed to a multipolar religious landscape. This view is reinforced when we look at how later generations reinterpreted Hakluyt's compendium. In the next section, we consider the political and religious crises of the later seventeenth century and look at how Hakluyt's compendium could be reused by later writers.

Rewriting: Reinterpreting Hakluyt in the Late Seventeenth Century

When seventeenth-century Protestants wrote about the dangers of idolatry, they reinforced Protestant orthodoxies by citing ethnographic descriptions from travel texts alongside historical and biblical narratives.⁹³ They drew upon ethnographic texts from travellers and repurposed them in order to justify their own view of the past. The historiography on the long Reformation has influenced my approach to these texts. Protestant confidence, and popular identification with Reformed beliefs, developed gradually over the seventeenth century. This was coupled with a growing awareness of, and desire to catalogue, foreign religious cultures.⁹⁴ As a result, we can see how foreign beliefs and practices became increasingly germane to domestic religious concerns. That said, we should be wary of simply mapping simplistic Protestant-Catholic dichotomies onto the century following the break from Rome.⁹⁵ By examining how religious writers concerned with toleration and the nature of idolatrous worship

⁹² Schleck, 'Plain Broad Hakluyt', pp. 768-71.

⁹³ Jonathan Sheehan, 'Introduction: Thinking about Idols in Early Modern Europe', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67 (2006), pp. 561-69; Carina L. Johnson, 'Idolatrous Cultures and the Practice of Religion', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67 (2006), pp. 597-621; Dmitri Levitin, 'From Sacred History to the History of Religion: Paganism, Judaism, and Christianity in European Historiography from Reformation to "Enlightenment"', *The Historical Journal*, 55 (2012), pp. 1117-60 (pp. 1135-6). On the link between antiquarian studies and contemporary theological debates, see Jonathan Sheehan, 'Sacred and Profane: Idolatry, Antiquarianism and the Polemics of Distinction in the Seventeenth Century', *Past and Present*, 192 (2006), pp. 35-67 (pp. 37-8).

⁹⁴ Levitin, 'From Sacred History', p. 1132; Scott Sowerby, 'Opposition to Anti-Popery in Restoration England', *Journal of British Studies*, 51.1 (2012), pp. 26-49; Colin Haydon, 'Parliament and Popery in England, 1700-1780', *Parliamentary History*, 19.1 (2000), pp. 49-63; Jessica L. Harland-Jacobs, 'Incorporating the King's New Subjects: Accommodation and Anti-Catholicism in the British Empire, 1763-1815', *Journal of Religious History*, 39.2 (2014), pp. 1-21.

⁹⁵ Claydon, *Europe and the Making of England*, pp. 13-66.

reused material from Hakluyt's *Principal Navigations*, the continued relevance of Elizabethan travellers' writings to religious debates a century later becomes apparent.

The half-century or so following the Restoration saw the high water mark for legal restrictions on English Catholics. Yet, by the beginning of the eighteenth century, arguments for religious toleration for Protestant non-conformists and Catholics alike were being advanced.⁹⁶ Nearly a century after its publication, Hakluyt's compendium was pressed into service in the cause of quasi-official calls for limited toleration by the moderate future Archbishop of Canterbury, Thomas Tenison.⁹⁷ Tenison's *Of Idolatry* (1678) contributed to debates about the emergence of idolatry in post-Biblical history and to a tradition of ecumenical writings about Christian denominational differences that had its roots in pre-Civil War texts.⁹⁸ From his engagement in debates surrounding the end pre-publication censorship, we know that Tenison disapproved of harsh sanctions against religious dissidents of various kinds.⁹⁹ In a rather inclusive text, which devotes many of its pages to proving that idolatry was principally a pagan or extra-Christian sin, Tenison drew upon a wide range of contemporary historical and biblical readings, as well as extensive quotes and citations from ethnographic and travel texts. To trace the influence of travel works on Tenison, we must consider the construction and afterlife of travel texts.

Tenison's use of travel works, including Hakluyt's compendium, indicates the heteroglossic potential of such texts to inform multiple and competing religious positions at different points in time. In this respect, my examination of Tenison's text has been influenced by Linda McJannet's reappraisal of the role of polyphony in early seventeenth-century drama.

⁹⁶ Gary S. De Krey, 'Between Revolutions: Re-Appraising the Restoration in Britain', *History Compass*, 6/3 (2008), pp. 738-73. See also the outline of English religious history in Chapter 1 above, pp. 17-24.

⁹⁷ Thomas Tenison, *Of Idolatry: A Discourse in Which Is Endeavoured A Declaration Of its Distinction from Superstition...* (London, 1678). For a biography of Tenison, see Edward Carpenter, *Thomas Tenison, Archbishop of Canterbury His Life and Times* (London: SPCK, 1949).

⁹⁸ Levitin, 'From Sacred History', pp. 1132-8.

⁹⁹ Alex Barber, "'Why don't those Lazy Priests Answer the Book?' Matthew Tindal, Censorship, Freedom of the Press and Religious Debate in Early Eighteenth-Century England', *History*, 98 (2013), pp. 680-707 (pp. 693-702, esp. pp. 693-9).

McJannet rejects Mikhail Bakhtin's claim that 'polyphony' is 'the distinguishing feature of the modern novel and genres influenced by it'.¹⁰⁰ The last few years have seen a growing number of scholars argue that polyphonic texts can be found across the corpus of early modern writing. For example, Patricia Palmer seeks to recover the 'polyphony and incipient hybridity' of early modern English encounters with – and representations of – Ireland, its language and population.¹⁰¹ Additionally, Carey and McJannet have respectively shown how Hakluyt and Purchas reconfigured their source materials for political, ideological or religious reasons.¹⁰²

McJannet's work on Purchas is just one example of the recent proliferation of articles considering the multiple, contested and incomplete aspects of the stories told by travellers. Schleck has argued that intervening generations assumed the *Principal Navigations* to be empirically true and mined Hakluyt's collection for descriptive nuggets to reinforce various ideological positions.¹⁰³ From the Civil War to postcolonialism, Hakluyt's text has been seen as factual and unproblematic. An early example of this is John Milton's deployment of extracts from Hakluyt's edition of Fletcher's *Of the Russe Common Wealth* to substantiate Milton's own doubts concerning royal government and the totalitarian implications of the royal prerogative.¹⁰⁴ In Philip S. Palmer's view, historians have been slow to acknowledge the heteroglossic potential of early modern compendiums of travel writing.¹⁰⁵

All this historiography has, however, been squarely focused on texts by those who travelled, or who edited their texts. Was this the end of the

¹⁰⁰ Linda McJannet, *The Sultan Speaks: Dialogue in English Plays and Histories about the Ottoman Turks* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006), pp. 7-12.

¹⁰¹ Patricia Palmer, *Language and Conquest in Early Modern Ireland: English Renaissance Literature and Elizabethan Imperial Expansion* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), pp. 4-7.

¹⁰² Carey, 'Hakluyt as Editor', pp. 1-28; McJannet, 'Purchas His Pruning', pp. 219-42.

¹⁰³ Schleck, 'Plain Broad Hakluyt', p. 769.

¹⁰⁴ Lucy Munro, 'Fletcher, Giles, the Elder', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2008, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/9726>> [accessed 12 February 2014]; Berry, 'Fletcher and Milton', pp. 150-1; Poe, *People Born to Slavery*, pp. 117-18. See also *Rude and Barbarous Kingdom: Russia in the Accounts of Sixteenth-Century English Voyagers*, ed. by Robert O. Crummey and Lloyd E. Berry (London: University of Wisconsin Press, 1968).

¹⁰⁵ Philip S. Palmer, "'All Suche Matters as Passed on This Vyage": Early English Travel Anthologies and the Case of John Sarracoll's Maritime Journal (1586-87)', *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 76 (2013), pp. 325-44.

story? I think not. Nabil Matar's investigation into the symbolic function of Muslims in early modern English society shows that diverse foreign and historical peoples had a symbolic role to play in wider early modern political and religious debates.¹⁰⁶ Matthew Dimmock has reinforced this conclusion in his analysis of European depictions of the Prophet Muhammad. He suggests that 'Mahomet', a European construction emerging from medieval traditions denigrating Muslims, had a number of religious, political and dramatic popular associations within early modern society, many of which were incompatible with contemporary Islamic beliefs and practice.¹⁰⁷ Moreover, public responses to Elizabethan diplomatic moves towards the Moroccan Sultanate reflected negative stereotypes of Turkish religious and moral laxity found in both contemporary drama and antiquarian and political discourses.¹⁰⁸ This discussion set me thinking about those religious texts that relied upon ethnographic information about foreign peoples yet were not themselves the direct product of intercultural encounters. In so doing, I scratched the surface of a diverse body of texts, including theological, political and moral treatises, which synthesised ethnography and travel writing into histories and genealogies of differing religious practices around the globe. In this wider literature, the ideological emphasis of individual travellers' accounts could be altered. As such, Tenison's interpretation of Hakluyt's Arctic materials shift the emphasis from practical advice to future travellers towards religious rhetoric.

In so doing, Tenison's account was in keeping with dominant models of idolatry in circulation in the period. Rubiés has argued that 'the classification of types of idolatry involved a combination of ethnography

¹⁰⁶ Nabil Matar, *Turks, Moors, and Englishmen in the Age of Discovery* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), p. 107.

¹⁰⁷ Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, pp. 1-23, 64-77, 101-111. This European construction of Mahomet is discussed in Chapter 3 below, esp. p. 87.

¹⁰⁸ Dimmock, 'Captive to the Turke', pp. 29-42. On related discourses, see Nabil Matar, *Britain and Barbary, 1589-1689* (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2005); Daniel J. Viktus, *Turning Turk: English Theater And The Multicultural Mediterranean, 1570-1630* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003); Richard Barbour, *Before Orientalism: London's Theatre of the East 1576-1626* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003).

and theology'.¹⁰⁹ Protestant writers sought to prove the insufficiency of Catholic sacraments by asserting their similarity with biblical examples of pagan idolatry and modern ethnological depictions of non-Christian peoples.¹¹⁰ These texts were influenced by the prevailing anti-Catholic mood, especially during the exclusion crises and pamphlet wars of the 1670s and 1680s. Jonathan Sheehan suggests that early modern Protestants saw idolatry as a 'crime... of practice' not 'of belief'. It was widely held that 'imitation of pagan worship breaks the ties that bind you to God'.¹¹¹

These anti-Catholic ideologies inspired a range of polemical texts that sought to connect host-worshipping Europeans with both biblical image-worshipping pagans and contemporary heathens abroad. Protestant struggles against Catholicism revived stories of ancient Christians' persecution by pagan Roman authorities.¹¹² To understand the rhetorical and moral value of these criticisms of Catholicism, we must consider how the Bible was read and used in early modern culture. Kevin Killeen has shown how readings of the Old Testament alert us to 'typologies and political parallelism' between seventeenth-century readings of the Old Testament and the political theory of the time.¹¹³ Obscure Old Testament genealogies of kings could be interpreted in a range of ways, dependent on the political persuasions of the author, from conventional scholarship to

¹⁰⁹ Joan-Pau Rubiés, 'Theology, Ethnography and the Historicization of Idolatry', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67 (2006), pp. 571-96 (pp. 573-4).

¹¹⁰ Sheehan, 'Altars of the Idols', pp. 642-61; Rubiés, 'Theology, Ethnography', pp. 572-4; Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 263-7.

¹¹¹ Sheehan, 'Altars of the Idols', p. 651; Tenison, *Of Idolatry*, pp. 21-2.

¹¹² Sheehan, 'Altars of the Idols', p. 651.

¹¹³ Kevin Killeen, 'Chastising with Scorpions: Reading the Old Testament in Early Modern England', *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 73 (2010), pp. 491-506 (p. 492). On early modern reading practices and Scripture more generally, see Peter Stallybrass, 'Books and Scrolls: Navigating the Bible', in *Books and Readers in Early Modern England*, ed. by Jennifer Andersen and Elizabeth Sauer (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2002), pp. 42-79; Deborah Schuger, *The Renaissance Bible: Scholarship, Sacrifice, and Subjectivity* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1994). On Puritan and other 'radical' groups and their reading practices, see Thomas Luxon, *Literal Figures, Puritan Allegory and the Reformation Crisis in Identity* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995), p. 26. On contemporary biblical exegesis and Renaissance science, see James Dougal Fleming, 'Making Sense of Science and the Literal: Modern Semantics and Early Modern Hermeneutics', in *The Word and the World: Biblical Exegesis and Early Modern Science*, ed. by Kevin Killeen and Peter J. Forshaw (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007), pp. 26-45.

‘the outer reaches of radicalism’. He argues that ‘the hermeneutics by which Old Testament figures are transposed typologically onto both the New Testament and contemporary politics are intricate yet widespread’ and can be found at all social levels and in a variety of contexts.¹¹⁴ Equally pertinent to the current discussion is Killeen’s claim that ‘the Bible demanded of early modern readers a sense of omnipresent history’, suggesting that early modern interpretations rested on the assumption that ‘God speaks to the political moment via a stock of elementary prefigurations, which interpreters must map onto their own immediate circumstances’.¹¹⁵ Despite lacking the authoritative capacity of Scripture, early modern reuses of travel texts appear to have been the product of similar reading strategies and typologies.

Biblical pagans and present-day idolaters intermingle in Tenison’s *Of Idolatry*. The religious practices of ancient Egyptians, Germanic pagans, near-contemporary pre-Columbian Mesoamericans and contemporary Chinese are all described as idolatrous. There are important differences in the degree of idolatry, however. Although Tenison derived all of these diverse practices from the originary myths of the Bible, he also distinguished between these diverse practices. Tenison highlighted the variety, but also the shared origins, of idolatrous traditions. For example, whilst Germanic gods were utterly powerless, he suggested that the Aztecs may have acknowledged a single deity (though Tenison remains open to the prospect that they may have been venerating a demon instead).¹¹⁶

¹¹⁴ Killeen, ‘Chastising with Scorpions’, pp. 492-3. Killeen makes a parallel point concerning the Judaic content of the Old Testament: ‘the Old Testament simply made no sense for early modern Christians in its own Judaic terms’ and could only be viewed through ‘the lens of [subsequent] Christian theology’. (p. 493) See also Kate Narveson, *Bible Readers and Lay Writers in Early Modern England: Genre and Self-Definition in an Emergent Writing Culture* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), esp. pp. 1-19; Norman Jones, *The English Reformation: Religion and Cultural Adaptation* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2002), p. 185. On identity and otherness more generally, see Jesús López-Peláez Casellas, ‘“Menne of Straunge Borders”: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis. An Introduction’, in *The Construction of the Other in Early Modern Britain: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis*, ed. by Rüdiger Ahrens (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter, 2013), pp. 1-12; Jüri Talvet, ‘“Self” and “Other.” Thinking with Montaigne, Liiv and Lotman’, in *The Construction of the Other in Early Modern Britain: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis*, ed. by Rüdiger Ahrens (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter, 2013), pp. 13-26.

¹¹⁵ Killeen, ‘Chastising with Scorpions’, p. 493. Providential discourses are related to similar typologies, see Chapter 3 below, p. 99-100.

¹¹⁶ Tenison, *Of Idolatry*, pp. 14-20.

Through castigating these various polytheisms to a greater or lesser extent, Tenison uses diverse foreign practices to show the nature and evolution of different forms of idolatry. Similarly, the Swedish Protestant ethnographer, Johann Scheffer, produced an elaborate history which showed how indigenous Lapp rituals deviated from their biblical inheritance through Classical idolatry and into their present form.¹¹⁷ Classifications and genealogies of religious difference were used to highlight contemporary theological debates and issues. These typologies served to categorise polytheistic belief systems and delineate their relationship with the monogenetic origin myths of Judeo-Christian tradition set out in the Bible.¹¹⁸

Tenison's history of idolatry also shows how earlier accounts of religious deviance abroad were being understood. This is apparent in his use of John Davies' Arctic journal, one of several ephemeral texts relating to the Muscovy trade preserved in the first edition of the *Principal Navigations*. Sheehan has examined how Tenison uses this Elizabethan travel narrative to highlight the dangers of idolatry. However, he overlooks the extent to which Tenison's gloss is imposed upon original testimony that had already been edited by Hakluyt a century or so beforehand. Before examining the multiple editions of the text, it is worth noting two things. Firstly, Tenison's gloss indicates how Reformed outlooks had changed and fragmented as a consequence of the confessional conflict of the seventeenth century. Secondly, Tenison's reinterpretation suggests that the reading practices outlined by Killeen were brought to bear on non-Scriptural texts such as travel reports.

Tenison describes an encounter between a small group of Elizabethan mariners, headed by Davies, and the inhabitants of a remote island in the Barents Sea. Amongst 'that small herd of barbarous people,

¹¹⁷ Johann Scheffer, *The History of Lapland Wherein Are Shewed the Original Manners, Habits, Marriages, Conjurations, &c. of That People...* (Oxford, 1674), pp. 15, 22, 36, 41, 45. Scheffer is discussed in Chapter 5 below, pp. 152-80.

¹¹⁸ Although critical of image worship, Tenison argued that it was inevitable in all forms of 'primitive' religion, but that veneration of images could aid 'wiser Pagans' in their devotions. Tenison, *Of Idolatry*, p. 24, see also pp. 19-39. On the single origin of 'idolatrous' traditions, see Urs App, *The Cult of Emptiness: The Western Discovery of Buddhist Thought and the Invention of Oriental Philosophy* (Kyoto: University Media, 2012), pp. 119-21.

one pointed first upward with his hand to the Sun, and then smote his breast'. In response, the mariners 'aptly interpreting this sign as an acknowledgement of the deity of the sun, and an oath by that idol of fidelity and peace used the same sign themselves' and 'gain[ed] thereby the friendship and traffick with a few salvage people'. However, Tenison noted that this was at a great price, namely 'the expense of the most valuable thing: the honour of God'.¹¹⁹ Thus, as Sheehan has shown, an incidental detail in one of Hakluyt's travel narratives provided Tenison with the opportunity to condemn a group of Elizabethan sailors for idolatry as they inadvertently partook in the sacrilegious sun-worship of the indigenous population. Tenison criticised the English travellers for committing idolatry and apostasy by partaking in the idolatrous rites of non-Christians.¹²⁰

There are three versions of this brief encounter of the idolatrous kind, each of which reflect the competing intentions of the different authors, editors and commentators. Firstly, and tacit in Hakluyt's edited edition since the original has not survived, we have the original sailors' account. This hypotext was, in all likelihood, either an official record of the voyage or composed as a personal memento during the voyage or following Davies' return to London. Hakluyt collated both types of text in the *Principal Navigations*. Instances of official correspondence include Anthony Jenkinson's prolific correspondence from Moscow, Bukhara and Qazvin, as well as various Muscovite traders' reports.¹²¹ Diaries and personal correspondence also figure prominently in Hakluyt's anthology,

¹¹⁹ Tenison, *Of Idolatry*, p. 21; John James Marchant, 'The First Voyage of Master John Davis, undertaken in June 1585, for the Discoverie of the Northwest Passage', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London, 1589), pp. 776-80, (p. 778).

¹²⁰ Sheehan, 'Altars of the Idols', pp. 650-1, 657-9. On the north, and its more literally diabolic connotations, see Franklin, 'Habitation of Devils', pp. 27-38.

¹²¹ See, for example, Anthonie Jenkinson, 'The Voyage of Master Anthony Jenkinson, Made from the Citie of Mosco in Russia, to the City of Boghar [Bukhara] in Bactria, in the Yeere 1558: Written by Himself to the Merchants of London of the Moscovie Company' in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt, II, pp. 449-79; Richard Willes, 'Notes Concerning This Fourth Voyage into Persia, Begun in the Moneth of July 1568, gathered by M. Richard Willes, from the Mouth of Master Arthur Edwards, Which Was Agent in the Same', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt, II, pp. 143-9. Besides the aforementioned texts, two other accounts by Jenkinson are included in the *Principal Navigations* that give further details of his various embassies, travels and negotiations.

including Hugh Willoughby's diary of his ill-fated expedition to an early death on the shores of the White Sea and John Saracoll's aforementioned diary of his visit to Senegambia.¹²² Recent analysis of the latter text also informs us of the extent of Hakluyt's editorial interventions. Hakluyt's edition of Saracoll's text intermingles elements of Saracoll's personal diary with material from the official ship's log.¹²³ We cannot be sure whether Davies' text was composed during the voyage, or written up or amended following his return either with an eye to publication or for circulation amongst friends, or precisely how it – or the source materials that made it up – came into Hakluyt's hands.¹²⁴

The second version of Davies' idolatrous encounter is the earliest extant edition, namely Hakluyt's published version. As this text is accompanied by useful guidance on navigation and information on indigenous religious practices, Hakluyt clearly intended it to assist future English mariners. Thus, in providing detail of indigenous sun worship, Hakluyt is providing guidance for future Arctic travellers on how to gain the assistance of the native population and to facilitate trade with them. Although there is a marginal note indicating that 'we judge them to be Idolaters' who 'worship the Sun'. It goes on to observe that they are 'a very tractable people' who would be 'easy brought to any civility'.¹²⁵ In Hakluyt's version, the islanders' religious practices are described yet not subject to significant moral censure. This ecumenical approach underlined the broader purpose of Hakluyt's compendium in providing useful information and guidance to assist future travellers.

¹²² On Willoughby, see Hugh Willoughby, 'The True Copie of a Note Found Written in One of the Two Ships, to Whit, the Speranza, Which Wintred in Lappia, Where Sir Hugh Willoughby and All His Companie Died, Being Frozen to Death. Anno 1553' in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt, II, pp. 212-24; James McDermott, 'Willoughby, Sir Hugh', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/29599>> [accessed 18 October 2011]. On Saracoll, see Palmer, 'All Suche Matters', pp. 325-44.

¹²³ Palmer, 'All Suche Matters', p. 328.

¹²⁴ On multiple texts and editions within the *Principal Navigations*, see Fuller, 'His Dark Materials', pp. 231-43. Dallam's account, discussed earlier, is a good example of a text prepared for manuscript circulation amongst friends: Danson, 'Sultan's Organ', pp. 642-3; MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 4-6.

¹²⁵ Sheehan, 'Altars of the Idols', p. 650, citing Richard Hakluyt, *Principal Navigations* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1965), p. 778.

Finally, we have Tenison's interpretation that uses the incident to depict a wider moral point about the dangers of engaging with idolatrous practices. Tenison's text was produced in a very different religious and social context to the late Elizabethan era of Davies and Hakluyt. The future Archbishop's principal aim in excerpting Davies' journal is to properly delineate the sin of idolatry in line with ancient Christian objections to Judaic and pagan practices.¹²⁶ He argued that by participating in this idolatrous ritual, the Englishmen had become 'modern-day *sacrificati*... in the name of utility'. As Sheehan observes, 'Tenison was less pleased' that the Elizabethan mariners had 'gained their loot "at the expense of the most valuable thing, the Honour of God"'. Tenison displayed a 'fascination' with 'the altars and idols of antiquity' that was 'ubiquitous' amongst early modern antiquarians.¹²⁷ Tenison's reading drew on parallels between Scriptural or historical idolatry and used an example from the recent past to reinforce a prescient present theological concern.

Dmitri Levitin has shown that 'mid-seventeenth-century "orthodox" approaches' to the antiquarian or contextual study of Scripture were not 'stale' or 'defensive'. Rather, by adding 'another textual layer to the contextualisation of the biblical near east', this antiquarian scholarship produced earlier versions of the kinds of 'diffusionist histories of idolatry that would become so influential through the works of [G. J.] Vossius and [Samuel] Bochart', founding figures of the kind of 'history of idolatry' that Tenison produced.¹²⁸ An early English example of this catalogue of idolatry by Brerewood, the Oxford divine and antiquarian, draws upon travel texts as well as Old Testament hermeneutics. In a more forthright manner than Tenison, it makes the case for unity amongst all Christian peoples.¹²⁹

¹²⁶ Sheehan, 'Altars of the Idols', p. 651.

¹²⁷ Sheehan, 'Altars of the Idols', pp. 650-1; Tenison, *Of Idolatry*, pp. 21, 22.

¹²⁸ Levitin, 'Sacred History', pp. 1132-3. On English Protestantism and the history of the church more generally, see Rosamund Oates, 'Elizabethan Histories of English Christian Origins', in *Sacred History: Uses of the Christian Past in the Renaissance World*, ed. by Simon Ditchfield, Katherine van Liere, and Howard Louthan (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), pp. 165-85.

¹²⁹ The scope of Brerewood's work has been touched upon by a variety of scholars. Guy G. Stroumsa notes that Brerewood identified the importance of ritual practice alongside religious doctrine in assessing non-Judeo-Christian religions. Stroumsa, Jonathan Sheehan and Michael T. Ryan all have acknowledged Brerewood's division of the world into Christians, Jews, Muslims and Idolaters, a practice that the former claims Brerewood derived from Samuel

Published posthumously, Brerewood's *Enquiries* (1624) catalogued various linguistic and beliefs found around the world. Unlike Tenison, he does not assemble a genealogy of idolatry. Rather, he catalogues ritual practices and distinguishes sharply between Christian and non-Christian traditions. By comparing Eastern Orthodox denominations with Catholicism, Brerewood stressed the fact that, like Protestants, they had 'no subordination unto the Papall hierarchie'.¹³⁰ Brerewood thereby adopted a conciliatory approach to intra-Christian disputes. He described how 'professours of the gospell in the kingdome of Polonia' have established 'an everlasting bond of concord' between different Protestant denominations. He argues that 'Christian princes' across the continent should imitate this show of toleration and unity. Brerewood goes on to claim that Catholic and Protestant disagreement over the physical 'presence of Christ in the sacred Eucharist' was insufficient reason to dissolve 'the sacred union and fellowship of Churches'. For Brerewood, this 'chiefe point of difference' between Reformed and Papal churches merely related to 'the manner of communication' since both sides believed in 'the true communication of the true bodie and bloud of our Lord Jesus Christ' and that 'holy Symboles, or signes, are not *inanes significationes*... but what by divine institution they represent and testifie unto our soules'.¹³¹

This ecumenical perspective informed Brerewood's subsequent catalogue of ceremonial and liturgical differences amongst Christians and

Purchas' famous anthology of travel writing. In a different vein, Gordon G. Schochet discusses Brerewood's moderate views concerning working on the Sabbath, and Albert M. Hyamson and Joan-Pau Rubiés have discussed Brerewood's account of language and religion in the context of the return of the Jews to England and the peopling of America respectively. Albert M. Hyamson, 'The Lost Tribes, and the Influence of the Search for Them on the Return of the Jews to England', *The Jewish Quarterly Review*, 15 (1903), pp. 640-76 (pp. 651-3); Joan-Pau Rubiés, 'Hugo Grotius's Dissertation on the Origin of the American Peoples and the Use of Comparative Methods', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 52 (1991), pp. 221-44 (p. 226); Michael T. Ryan, 'Assimilating New Worlds in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 23 (1981), pp. 519-38 (p. 537); Gordon J. Schochet, 'Patriarchalism, Politics and Mass Attitudes in Stuart England', *The Historical Journal*, 12 (1969), pp. 413-41 (p. 420); Jonathan Sheehan, 'Sacred and Profane', p. 52; Guy G. Stroumsa, 'John Spenser and the Roots of Idolatry', *History of Religions*, 41 (2001), pp. 1-23 (pp. 6-7). Finally, his academic career is briefly handled in H. F. Kearney, 'Puritanism, Capitalism and the Scientific Revolution', *Past and Present*, 28 (1964), pp. 81-101 (p. 87).

¹³⁰ Brerewood, *Enquiries*, sig. ¶12v.

¹³¹ Brerewood, *Enquiries*, sig. ¶13r.

non-Christians alike.¹³² Brerewood catalogues specific doctrinal differences, concerning the role of the Host, the form of the Eucharist, and the nature of their rituals. Like Tenison, he derives his observations from travel narratives, including those of Fletcher and Herberstein, the fifteenth-century Habsburg diplomat whose account of Muscovite life was plundered by several generations of early modern travel writers and anthologists.¹³³ Brerewood's account is also similar to that of Ephraim Pagitt whose *Christianography* (1636) was published in the same year as a reissue of Brerewood's work. Although Pagitt's focus is only on the Christian world and is indebted to anti-Catholic polemics, both subdivide the globe into fractions belonging to different sects or religions.¹³⁴ Tension thus builds upon earlier religious texts that used travel texts to justify an ecumenical or less ecumenical view of divisions within Christianity.¹³⁵

Seventeenth-century travel texts and religious writing about other denominations were diverse. Inclusive and exclusionist views of other denominations circulated within these genres, and travel narratives could provide the raw material for a range of interpretations. Further research

¹³² Brerewood, *Enquiries*, pp. 127-8, 142-3.

¹³³ Brerewood, *Enquiries*, p. 136-9, see also pp. 181-3; Fletcher, *Of the Russe Common Wealth*, pp. 186-94; Baron, 'Image of Russia', pp. 245-72. See also Gross, 'Tangled Tradition', pp. 989-98. He also catalogues features of denominations worship and doctrine, including their views on the Trinity, their ceremonies for specific points in life (baptisms, confirmation etc.), whether they allow their priests to marry, decoration of their churches, the manner in which they distribute the Eucharist, as well as the historical relations between different denominations.

¹³⁴ Ephraim Pagitt, *Christianography, or The Description of the multitude and sundry sorts of Christians in the world, not subject to the Pope* (London, 1640). A later owner of one copy of Pagitt's map colour-coded it, demonstrating one way in which early modern readers sought to make sense of the geographical distribution of religious difference: Stuart Morrison, 'Mapping the Religious Landscape of Early Modern Europe', *Canterbury Cathedral Library*, 2015, <<http://www.canterbury-cathedral.org/2015/07/01/mapping-the-religious-landscape-of-early-modern-europe>> [accessed 4 July 2015]. For Brerewood's subdivisions, see Brerewood, *Enquiries*, pp. 118-26. For an example of much later text of comparative religion which follows the structure and approach of Brerewood and Pagitt, see Robert Adam, *The Religious World Displayed: Or, a View of the Four Grand Systems of Religion, Judaism, Paganism, Christianity, and Mohammedism...* (London: L. B. Seeley, 1823).

¹³⁵ Calls for Christian unity also informed, in a very different way, Catholic condemnations of Elizabethan England's diplomatic and military flirtations with the Ottoman Empire. This was hardly surprising, given the largely hostile depictions of Turkish religion prevalent throughout early modern popular culture, reinforced by travel texts and theatrical representations. Dimmock, 'Captive to the Turke', pp. 55-6; Müller 'Harborne's Embassies', pp. 11-26; Christine Woodhead, 'Harborne, William', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2008, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/12234>> [accessed 24 August 2012]; McJannet, *Sultan Speaks*, pp. 33-61.

will surely highlight further intertextual connections between incidents in travel writing anthologies and motifs both in religious writing and wider early modern culture. The use of travellers' reports to make a religious point emphasises the heteroglossic potential of such literature. Their use in formulaic typologies of foreign idolatry indicates wider applications of the biblical reading practices identified by Killeen. Scripture and ephemeral travel texts were subjected to readings framed by 'a sense of omnipresent history' that stressed the potential risks of violating divine commandments. Tenison also drew on biblical and Classical sources to demonstrate the moral dangers of idolatry.¹³⁶ His use of Davies' account alludes to the 'omnipresent' sense of moral danger that late seventeenth-century Protestantism associated with idolatry and the worship of material things.¹³⁷ Tenison's censure of Christians who behave like pagans, coupled with his later advocacy of limited toleration of Catholics, also shows that the religious debates about Christian ritual obligations awakened during the Reformation were alive and well in the early Enlightenment.¹³⁸

Conclusion

Descriptions of other religions beliefs and practices were not only written in a specific theological context but could also be reinterpreted by subsequent generations. As Tenison's gloss of Davies' Arctic journal suggests, contemporary and historical idolaters provided the raw materials for religious writers to justify and edify English Protestantism. Tenison's reuse of material from the *Principal Navigations* indicates one way in which ethnography was pressed into the service of theological polemic. Like Classical texts and Scripture, travel texts were pressed into service for diverse theological ends by religious writers across the spectrum, including Arthur Young, a Church of England cleric interested in defending Judeo-Christian exceptionalism; John Owen, the Nonconformist; and Henry More, the prolific philosopher, apologist for Christianity and critic of

¹³⁶ Killeen, 'Chastising with Scorpions', p. 493; Tenison, *Of Idolatry*, pp. 14-20.

¹³⁷ Killeen, 'Chastising with Scorpions', pp. 493-4.

¹³⁸ Sheehan, 'Altars of the Idols', pp. 650-1.

Cartesianism.¹³⁹ This reinforces Rubiés' view that the genre of travel writing had developed set rules and forms by the end of the sixteenth century. The standardised generic features of travel writing facilitated the reuse of travel reports by religious writers.¹⁴⁰

Travellers' various responses to foreign Christian practices also demonstrate the liminal status of foreign forms of Christianity in the eyes of English travellers.¹⁴¹ The frames of reference of individual travellers often directly related to their own formative religious experiences, as in the case of Randolph and Locke. Likewise, subsequent editors and other writers could impose different emphases on these texts, indicating their connections with domestic religious debates. Descriptions of other belief systems provoked a variety of responses, as demonstrated by Tenison's opinions on various forms of foreign and historical idolatry. Travellers' and others had different responses to Protestant consolidation in the Elizabethan era and to emergent debates about toleration in the decades around the so-called Glorious Revolution. These contrary responses are a further symptom of the fluidity of labels like 'Protestant' and 'Christian' in early modern discourse.¹⁴²

In an era when global power relations were a long way from allowing the West to dominate the Orient (however we wish to define this term),¹⁴³ discussion of and descriptions of foreign forms of worship were articulated in terms at once familiar and strange.¹⁴⁴ Travel texts, and subsequent citations of them, had resonances for the wider English Protestant community because they contributed in meaningful ways to

¹³⁹ Compare the uses of Scriptural and Classical examples found in the following with Tenison's use of travel texts: Henry More, *An Exposition of the Seven Epistles to the Seven Churches; Together With a Brief Discourse of Idolatry...* (London, 1669), pp. 27-34; James Owen, *The History of Images, and Of Image Worship. Shewing, the Original and Progress of Idolatry among Pagans, Jews, and Christians...* (London, 1709), pp. 24-5; Arthur Young, *An Historical Dissertation on Idolatrous Corruptions in Religion From the Beginning of the World; And on the Methods Taken by Divine Providence of Reforming Them*, 2 vols. (London, 1734), I, pp. 103, 108-9.

¹⁴⁰ Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', esp. pp. 140-2, 147-58.

¹⁴¹ Stout, 'Hakluyt and Censorship', p. 155.

¹⁴² Claydon, *Europe and the Making of England*, pp. 61-6.

¹⁴³ Matar, *Islam in Britain*, pp. 11-12. On identifications of Russia with the Orient, see Gross, 'Tangled Tradition', p. 992.

¹⁴⁴ Rubiés, 'Theology, Ethnography', pp. 571-2.

wider religious discourses. Although difference was a persistent element of depictions of other societies, it could be expressed in diverse ways, as Dallam and Aldersey's variant reactions attest. It could draw on the presence or absence of familiar elements of worship, as in Locke's complaint that Greek Orthodox congregants did not kneel, or Randolph and Fletcher's condemnation of Russian worship for its unreformed, Catholic familiarity.

Despite the best efforts of the state to dictate correct forms of worship, individual beliefs and practices could be substantially at variance with contemporary orthodoxy. Ulterior positions could be implied through travel texts and we should not assume that non-Protestant worship was criticised merely for its similarity to continental Catholicism.

Commentators on contemporary travel narratives varied significantly in their depiction of foreign rituals, and the level of their engagement with ideas of English Protestant exceptionalism. We have seen how discourses of familiarity and unfamiliarity developed in representations of Orthodox Christianity and how these texts tacitly reinforced Reformed orthodoxies at home. Tenison's reuse of Davies' journal, like Brerewood's catalogue, indicate a more confident opinion on the stability of Protestant religious and political authority, and thus the tolerability of toleration of other Christians. In contrast, editors like Hakluyt deliberately omitted Fletcher's potentially seditious political opinions. Later editors and religious writers like Tenison also reinterpreted travel texts to support their own conclusions. By highlighting the deviance of foreign societies, these interventions reflected on the state of domestic religion, just as Fletcher had attempted to reflect on the late Elizabethan polity. We return to both dissidents and deviants in different contexts in subsequent chapters. Before that, the next chapter explores the relationship between providentialism and depictions of Mahomet in seventeenth-century travel texts, developing our understanding of contemporary religious thought and how it affected travellers' representations.

Chapter 3

'Coining a New Kind of Doctrine and Religion': Mahomet and Providence in William Biddulph's Travels (1609) and Henry Blount's Journey (1636)

This chapter focuses on two contrasting early seventeenth-century Levantine travel texts, one by the clergyman William Biddulph and the other by the humanist scholar Henry Blount.¹ I examine their respective representations of Islam and how these reflected wider ideas about Islam, Christianity and providence in early modern England. During this period, Islam and Muhammad, or rather Mahometanism and Mahomet were 'routinely rejected, reclaimed, defamed, defended and used as a polemical tool'. Mahomet's faith could be a 'mutually reinforcing monotheism', a hotchpotch of Christian doctrines and gentile idolatry or even, for some early Enlightenment thinkers, 'as... authentic' a belief system as Christianity itself. Much early modern English writing about Mahomet stubbornly refuses to conform to simplistic binaries of East and West, Islam and Christianity, Orient and Occident.² Suzanne Marchand has advocated a new 'synthetic and critical history' of German Orientalism in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries that is sensitive to the 'specific roles played by Orientalist scholarship in the cultural histories of Europe's diverse states'.³ Following Matthew Dimmock's work on the construction of Mahomet in early modern England, this chapter explores how European constructions of Mahomet influenced travellers' representations of encounters with actual Muslims. We shall also see how religious debates

¹ William Biddulph, *The Travels of Certain Englishmen into Africa, Asia, Troy, Bythinia, Thracia and to the Black Sea...* (London, 1609), p. 41 (for quote used in title to this chapter); Henry Blount, *A Voyage into the Levant: A Breife Relation of a Journey, Lately Performed by Master H. B. Gentleman...* 2nd edn (London, 1636).

² Matthew Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet Muhammad in Early Modern English Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), pp. 1, 101-11.

³ Suzanne L. Marchand, *German Orientalism in the Age of Empire: Religion, Race and Scholarship* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), p. xx.

within seventeenth-century Protestantism contributed to these representations of Islamic history.⁴

I shall explore English traveller's representations of Mahometanism in light of the rise of the Ottoman Empire as a territorially and militarily successful power, specifically focusing on how contemporaries' understanding of this history relied upon providentialist ideas. Providential thinking abounded in the seventeenth century: God's intervention in the lives of His people could show both His care and guidance for the faithful but also allowed traumas to be rationalised as judgements on individual or collective sinfulness, or as tests of individual or collective faithfulness. In her ground breaking treatment of the subject, Alexandra Walsham demonstrated that providential discourses manifested themselves within the body politic of early modern England across the confessional spectrum, taking in Puritans, Calvinists, Protestants and the less-reformed.⁵ More 'zealous' Protestants preached of 'God's terrible judgements', feeding into wider appetites for 'sensational but moralistic newsprint'. Such providentialism also informed appetites for popular print,

⁴ Much has been written about early modern representations of Islam. See, for example, Gerald MacLean, *The Rise of Oriental Travel: English Visitors to the Ottoman Empire, 1580-1720* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004); Gerald MacLean, 'Ottomanism before Orientalism? Bishop Henry King Praises Henry Blount, Passenger', in *Travel Knowledge: European 'Discoveries' in the Early Modern Period*, ed. by Ivo Kamps and Jyotsna G. Singh (New York: Palgrave, 2001), pp. 75-96; Nabil Matar, 'Britons and Muslims in the Early Modern Period: From Prejudice to (a Theory Of) Toleration', in *Anti-Muslim Prejudice: Past and Present*, ed. by Maleiha Malik (London and New York: Routledge, 2010), pp. 7-25; Nabil Matar, *Islam in Britain 1558-1665* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998); Richard Barbour, *Before Orientalism: London's Theatre of the East 1576-1626* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003); Billie Melman, *Women's Orients: English Women and the Middle East, 1718-1918: Sexuality, Religion and Work* (London: Macmillan, 1995); Peter C. Mancall, 'What Fynes Morrison Knew', in *Bringing the World to Early Modern Europe: Travel Accounts and Their Audiences*, ed. by Peter C. Mancall (Leiden: Brill, 2007), pp. 1-10. For one of the founding texts of early modern Anglo-Ottoman interactions, see Samuel Chew, *The Crescent and the Rose: Islam and England during the Renaissance* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1937). On theories of representation, see Partha Mitter, 'Can We Ever Understand Alien Cultures? Some Epistemological Concerns Relating to the Perception And Understanding of the Other', *Comparative Criticism*, 9 (1987), pp. 3-34.

⁵ Alexandra Walsham, *Providence in Early Modern England* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), pp. 20-1, citing John Calvin, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, trans. John Allen, (Philadelphia, 1936), I, ch. 16, §2; John Carpenter, *Preparative to Contention...* (1597), p. 279; Bezaleel Carter, *A Sermon of Gods Omnipotence and Providence...* (1615), p. 13; Andreas Gerardus, *Speciall Treatise of Gods Providence...* (1588?) sig. H7v; William Gouge, *The extent of God's Providence*, bound with *Gods three arrows...* (1631), p. 380; Ralph Walker, *A Learned and Profitable Treatise of Gods Providence...* (1608), p. 261.

and marketplace moralising was never entirely divorced from the austere and bookish introspection of contemporary Calvinism.⁶

Providential logic underpinned political crises such as wars, rebellions and natural calamities, which were characterised as punishments for national or regional sinfulness. Natural and man-made crises could be interpreted as validations of, or challenges to, both individual and national faith.⁷ Blair Worden notes that the ubiquity of providential beliefs may blind historians to their significance for contemporaries: 'seventeenth-century Englishmen knew that God intervenes continually and continuously in the world He has made'. Providentialism was 'at the centre of seventeenth-century political argument' and could inform 'every change of weather or the wind... every good crop and every bad one... every sickness and recovery' and 'every misadventure of the traveller and his every safe return'. 'Conventional providentialism' was closely linked to 'conventional piety' and should not be mistaken for 'mere literary decoration'.⁸ Providentialism was not the sole preserve of Puritans either: it allowed a variety of theological positions to be articulated and was closely allied with popular culture.⁹

Travel writers drew upon providential ideas and perpetuated them through descriptions of other societies and accounts of their histories. These representations often reinforced the nationalistic and Protestant tone of many early modern English travel texts.¹⁰ Broadly speaking, the rise of the Ottoman Empire assuaged any lingering doubts amongst Protestants about the propriety of the Reformation as other denominations

⁶ Walsham, *Providence*, p. 325.

⁷ Walsham, *Providence*, pp. 1-5, 22-3, 124-5, 172-4.

⁸ Blair Worden, 'Providence and Politics in Cromwellian England', *Past and Present*, 109 (1985), pp. 55-99 (p. 55). On nautical accidents, travel writing and providence, see Julie Sievers, 'Drowned Pens and Shaking Hands: Sea Providence Narratives in Seventeenth-Century New England', *William and Mary Quarterly*, 63.4 (2006), pp. 743-76.

⁹ Alexandra Walsham, 'The Godly and Popular Culture', in *The Cambridge Companion to Puritanism*, ed. by John Coffey and Paul C. H. Lim (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), pp. 277-93 (pp. 282-6).

¹⁰ Kim Phillips, *Before Orientalism: Asian People and Cultures in European Travel Writing, 1245-1510* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013), pp. 63-4.

suffered at the hands of Turkish expansionism.¹¹ Carina L. Johnson has explored how interdenominational conflict between Protestants and Catholics influenced depictions of other peoples' beliefs and practices in the Levant and the New World.¹² This chapter explores how omnipresent but 'polymorphous' theories of providential causation interacted with different Protestant perspectives on Islam, and the theological difference that it represented.¹³ Both providence and scepticism concerning the active intervention of the Christian deity in His creation influenced travel texts concerned with the rise of Islam. These providential elements will be contextualised in light of wider debates in English intellectual culture about Mahometanism and its falsity or otherwise.¹⁴ By highlighting how these debates played out in contemporary travel texts, I draw upon John-Paul Ghobrial's conclusion that Europe and the Ottoman Empire were fundamentally 'connected' through 'trade, diplomacy or confessional change'.¹⁵ Mahomet and his religion were closely linked to the wider economic, political and diplomatic relationships between England and the Ottoman Empire, though this did not mean that commercial considerations overrode religious ones.

My analysis is split into four sections. First, I briefly outline Biddulph and Blount's biographies in order to understand a little more about their differing confessional outlooks. The second section explores histories of Islam, or Mahometanism, and how Biddulph and Blount's

¹¹ David R. Blanks, 'Western Views of Islam in the Premodern Period: A Brief History of Past Approaches', in *Western Views of Islam in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Perception of Other*, ed. by Michael Frassetto and David R. Blanks (New York: St Martin's Press, 1999), pp. 1-54. On early modern European attitudes to Islam more generally, see Frederick Quinn, *The Sum of All Heresies: The Image of Islam in Western Thought* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007), chap. 2.

¹² Carina L. Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy in Sixteenth-Century Europe: The Ottomans and Mexicans* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), pp. 21-56, 262-9.

¹³ Walsham, *Providence*, p. 3.

¹⁴ On conceptions of Islam, see Ziad Elmarsafy, *The Enlightenment Qur'an: The Politics of Translation and the Construction of Islam* (Oxford: Oneworld, 2009), pp. 37-63; Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, pp. 1-23.

¹⁵ John-Paul Ghobrial, *The Whispers of Cities: Information Flow in Istanbul, London and Paris in the Age of William Trumbull* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), pp. 7, 10; Sanjay Subrahmanyam, *Three Ways to Be Alien: Travails and Encounters in the Early Modern World* (Waltham: Brandeis University Press, 2011), pp. 98-9, 123-4.

depictions of Mahomet contributed to existing European views of the Prophet. The third part turns to the recent expansion of the Ottoman Empire. Using Biddulph and Blount's depictions of the 1453 capture of the Byzantine capital, Constantinople, by Sultan Mehmed II's troops as a touchstone, I shall show how different theories of providential causation related to wider debates about the nature of Mahometan beliefs. A fourth, concluding section ties together competing views of Islamic religious difference with contemporary debates about providence.

Contrasting Accounts: Biddulph and Blount

The discussion below examines travel texts by the clergyman Biddulph and the antiquarian Blount. In Ghobrial's most recent work on the seventeenth-century diplomat William Trumball, he reconstructs Trumball's place within 'the mechanics of global connections' 'from the inside out'.¹⁶

Similarly, Gerald MacLean's historically aware literary criticism has used extant sources to pick holes in the self-representation of both men by situating their travel experiences in their individual biographies. For instance, Biddulph's 'self-representations as a pious, upright and venerated member of the Church of England' concealed his Levant Company employers' concern about his public reputation as a 'Bed-woolfe, or rather a woolfe-in-bed' and drunkard.¹⁷ The *Travels* are Biddulph's only publication, yet as we shall see, they give plenty of opportunity for us to explore his religious beliefs and preferred self-image as a god-fearing Puritan. Concerning Blount, we know that his text received praise from the king, Charles I, and that he held a range of administrative roles before the Civil Wars, throughout the Interregnum and during the Restoration. His son, Charles, would go on to pen a number of early deist texts, and both father and son held a reputation for freethinking. MacLean is sceptical that

¹⁶ Ghobrial, *Whispers of Cities*, p. 11. The best summary of both men's biographies can be found in MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 51-6, 117-21. For a very different but ground-breaking example of historical reconstruction of the confessional outlook of an otherwise obscure historical individual, see Carlo Ginzburg, *The Cheese and the Worms: The Cosmos of a Sixteenth-Century Miller* (London: Routledge and Keegan Paul, 1980).

¹⁷ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, p. 114, citing Kitely to Sanderson, 6 May 1609; BL MS Lansdowne 241, f. 409v.

Blount's *Journey* necessarily achieves its author's goal of escaping from his own biases concerning the history of nations or from contemporary European imperial envy toward Ottoman military power.¹⁸ There are a number of similarities and differences between these two texts, which I shall outline before examining their relationships with wider European views of Mahomet and providence.

Both men used Classical and Scriptural sources as guides to their journeys.¹⁹ Biddulph's account of his visits to biblical sites may be read in light of wider confessional debates. Forms of Scriptural literalism that were particularly prominent amongst English Puritans inform his text.²⁰ Meanwhile, Blount's interest in the civil foundations of Turkish religion encapsulated his wider interests in the history and politics of nations and empires, also encapsulated in his desire to uncover the nature and extent of Turkish military power. Unlike Biddulph, he took a sceptical view of religious hierarchies of all kinds.²¹ Purely on these grounds, if they had ever met and discussed religious matters, Biddulph and Blount would likely have disagreed profoundly. Biddulph tended towards a hotter, more literalist reading of his Bible that may have irked the Baconian Blount, whilst Blount's criticisms of religious ceremony and priestcraft would have doubtless been offensive to the pious clergyman.²²

¹⁸ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 168-9, 174-5, 176; MacLean, 'Ottomanism before Orientalism', pp. 75-96; Wayne Hudson, *The English Deists: Studies in Early Enlightenment* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2009), pp. 57-78. Blount's domestic career, and the place of the *Journey* within it, are sketched in Nabil Matar, 'Blount, Sir Henry', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/2687>> [accessed 21 September 2012].

¹⁹ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. xiii, 69, 81, 86, 88, 93, 96, 112, 154-5; Biddulph, *Travels*, sigs. A4v, G3v-G4. On English travel accounts of the Levant more generally, see Linda McJannet, 'Purchas His Pruning: Refashioning the Ottomans in Seventeenth-Century Travel Narratives', *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 74 (2011), pp. 219-42.

²⁰ Walsham, 'Godly and Popular Culture', pp. 277-93. See also Thomas Luxon, *Literal Figures, Puritan Allegory and the Reformation Crisis in Identity* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995); Patrick Collinson, *Godly People: Essays on English Protestantism and Puritanism* (London: Hambledon, 1983).

²¹ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 157-67.

²² Biddulph may have concurred with Blount on Baconian method, if not the conclusions he derived from it. On Puritan uses of Bacon's philosophical methods, see Zachary McLeod Hutchins, 'Building Bensalem at Massachusetts Bay: Francis Bacon and the Wisdom of Eden in Early Modern New England', *The New England Quarterly*, 83.4 (2010), pp. 577-606 (pp. 581-2).

Despite these differences in outlook, their travel narratives are broadly comparable. Both texts concern their author's travels through the Levant and reflect on the increasing confessional polarisation apparent in the decades leading up to the English Civil War. They belong to a similar historical moment in the development of English travel writing, though they each foresee different futures for that genre. Both authors draw upon a 'self-sustaining myth of a personal identity in the figure of the scholarly traveller'.²³ Like their near contemporary George Sandys, both pepper personal recollections with historical and antiquarian anecdotes.²⁴ However, the two men approach their self-confessed English, Protestant identities very differently. Biddulph is keen to be identified as an Englishman and a man of the cloth throughout his text and reinforces this when recounting interactions with both Levantine communities and English merchants. In contrast, Blount eschewed that identification and sought to travel incognito in order to observe the Ottoman Empire from within.²⁵ In this sense, they demonstrate the heterogeneous diversity of the self-consciously nationalistic programme for English travel writing first set out by Richard Hakluyt.

Their personal styles and travel experiences also differ. Biddulph's travels were published in 1612, following his return from Aleppo where he had served as minister to the English factors stationed there. He participated in a form of Protestant pilgrimage whilst 'insisting that he was not himself a pilgrim' and sought to ensure that his 'reputation was free from any suspicion of superstition'. In his pseudonymous preface, he praised the benefits of English political and religious authorities, including 'exemplary, loving church ministers' and a 'good and gracious king'.²⁶ Blount's travels may initially seem more peripatetic: he travelled

²³ Joan Pau Rubiés, 'Instructions for Travellers: Teaching the Eye to See', *History and Anthropology*, 9.2-3 (1996), pp. 139-91 (pp. 172-4).

²⁴ Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', p. 172.

²⁵ Biddulph, *Travels*, sig. Bv-B3r; Blount, *Journey*, pp. 15-16; MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 112-13, 139-41, 152-3. For an account of another contemporary travellers' self-presentation, see Clifford Edmund Bosworth, *An Intrepid Scot: William Lithgow of Lanark's Travels in the Ottoman Lands, North Africa and Central Europe, 1609-21* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2006).

²⁶ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 52-4, 101-3; Biddulph, *Travels*, sigs. A2-A2v.

voluntarily and claimed to be explicitly motivated by his curiosity about foreign, specifically Ottoman, society. That said, both writers espouse the benefits of personal, direct observation of other societies' customs in their respective prefaces.²⁷ Joan-Pau Rubiés highlights 'differences' in the 'self-fashioning' of contemporary travellers based on their status, showing how the structure and rhetoric of Fynes Morison and Thomas Coryat's texts differed as a consequence of the 'nobility' or otherwise of their respective authors. In Blount and Biddulph's case, there seems to be little separating the minor gentleman from the educated middling status preacher, reinforcing the 'consolidation of the traveller as a socio-cultural type' within learned Renaissance society.²⁸

Both travellers wrote within a tradition of renaissance humanism, underscored by their shared commitment to the genre conventions of travel, and their mutual appreciation of the benefits of eyewitness observation.²⁹ They also shared concerns about the military might of the Ottoman Empire, and sought to explain (albeit in different ways) why that reputedly despotic empire had enforced itself so boldly on the European, Christian world.³⁰ These explanations are historically specific and informed by theological arguments. Biddulph and Blount differ substantially in their explanation of the rise of the Great Turk and his religion. In so doing, they drew upon a range of religious ideas found in wider English and European religious thought. Profound differences in their respective theological outlooks influenced how they wrote about Islam and its relationship with Christianity.³¹ That said, there are

²⁷ Biddulph, *Travels*, sigs. A3r-A4v; Blount, *Journey*, pp. 1-4.

²⁸ Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', pp. 173-4.

²⁹ Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', pp. 140-2, 147-8, 165-7, 171-4; Biddulph, *Travels*, sigs. A3r-A4v; Blount, *Journey*, pp. 1-4.

³⁰ On Turkish despotism, see Thomas Kaiser, 'The Evil Empire? The Debate on Turkish Despotism in Eighteenth-Century French Political Culture', in *Early Modern Europe: Issues and Interpretations*, ed. by James B. Collins and Karen L. Taylor (Oxford: Blackwell, 2006), pp. 69-81; Lucette Valensi, 'The Making of A Political Paradigm: The Ottoman State and Oriental Despotism', in *The Transmission of Culture in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Anthony Grafton and Ann Blair (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1990), pp. 173-203.

³¹ On the relationship between the two faiths through the lens of contemporary Qur'anic translation, see Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, pp. 64-80.

important areas of common ground between their texts, as we shall see below when we examine their respective accounts of Mahomet.³²

Multiple Mahomets: Biddulph and Blount's Histories of the Prophet

Linda McJannet has shown that English travellers often wrote of their positive relations with fellow travellers and other people they encountered. However, she notes that in Biddulph's account, 'genuine moment[s] of cross-cultural identification' recognisable to a 'modern' reader are rare.³³ Although these observations illuminate the depth and prevalence of hostility to Islam amongst English travellers, they are less valuable if we wish to explain *why* Turkish religion was so offensive to an ardent seventeenth-century Protestant like Biddulph. More importantly, it may be difficult for a modern reader to appreciate the benefits of some of the things that Biddulph appreciated about the Ottoman Empire, including the starving of beggars, strict household gender norms, violent punishment of prostitutes and using military might to maintain social order.³⁴ Submissive poverty, stringently enforced patriarchal norms and military discipline merited praise from either or both travellers. More generally, depictions of actual encounters with Muslims could contribute to or contradict existing ideas about Ottoman society.³⁵ By paying attention to the religious preoccupations of both writers, we can see how their confessional identity influenced their descriptions of Ottoman beliefs and practices.

This can be seen in their respective depiction of Islam, or more properly 'Mohametanism'. Dimmock makes an important distinction between Mahomet, the idol/God/prophet found in Western representations of Islam from the medieval period onwards, and Muhammad, the principal "comforter, friend, intercessor" and "family

³² MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 64, 79-80, 168-9.

³³ McJannet, 'Purchas his Pruning', p. 236. She also considers how Biddulph's work was edited by Purchas.

³⁴ Biddulph, *Travels*, pp. 46, 55-6; Blount, *Journey*, pp. 84, 85, 87; McJannet, 'Purchas his Pruning', pp. 235-40; MacLean, *Oriental Travel*, pp. 71, 73, 81-2.

³⁵ Thomas S. Kidd, "Is It Worse to Follow Mahomet than the Devil?" Early American Uses of Islam', *Church History*, 72.4 (2003), pp. 766-90 (p. 767).

member”” venerated by Muslims.³⁶ This tradition saw Mahomet crop up in a range of different cultural forms and media, including traditional religious drama cycles in cities such as York, Catholic invectives against Protestantism (and vice-versa), biblical and secular histories, mythologies connected to the Crusades and reports on recent geopolitical events.³⁷ These versions of Mahomet were ‘shaped by’ didactic, rhetorical and real ‘Mahometan engagements’. In particular, they were driven by two ‘polemically entwined events’, namely ‘Turkish military expansion’ over the course of the previous two centuries and ‘the Reformation’.³⁸ The discussion that follows explores English travel writing within this context, showing how travel experiences were framed within this interlocking series of discourses about Mahomet and his religion.

Biddulph is more explicitly indebted to the medieval tradition of denigrating Mahomet than Blount, who insists that he is free from the inherited biases that he claimed blighted contemporary travel writing.³⁹ MacLean has shown that Biddulph’s text owes a hefty debt to the English translation of Nicholas de Nicolay’s *Navigations* (1587). Indeed, when describing the founding of Islam, Biddulph reiterates much of Nicolay’s description, situating himself within a long tradition of European writers documenting Ottoman ‘massacres’ and brutality.⁴⁰ Thus, Biddulph’s

³⁶ Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, p. xii, citing Tariq Ramadan, *The Messenger: The Meaning and Life of Muhammad* (London: Allen Lane, 2007), p. x. For a medieval description of Mahomet, see John Mandeville, *The Travels of Sir John Mandeville*, ed. & trans. by C. W. R. D. Moseley, (London: Penguin Classics, 1983), pp. 104-10.

³⁷ Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, pp. 12-18; Linda McJannet, *The Sultan Speaks: Dialogue in English Plays and Histories about the Ottoman Turks* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006), p. 184.

³⁸ Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, p. 19.

³⁹ Blount, *Journey*, pp. 1-2.

⁴⁰ José Ruiz Mas, ‘Another Brick in the Wall of the Turkish Black Legend: The Fall of Nicosia and Its Impact in English Literature’, in *The Construction of the Other in Early Modern Britain: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis*, ed. by Rüdiger Ahrens (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter, 2013), pp. 189-204 (p. 190); MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 73, 76, 112. On Nicolay’s expedition, see Nancy Bisaha, *Creating East and West: Renaissance Humanists and the Ottoman Turks* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004), p. 181. On conflict with the Ottomans and its dissemination into English literature, see José Ruiz Mas, ‘The Image of the Great Turk after the Ottoman Conquest of Famagusta and Marc Antonio Bragadino’s Martyrdom: From Its Genesis in the Anti-Turkish Propaganda of Venetian Narratives and Chronicles to Its Impact in English Literature’, in *Strangers in Early Modern English Texts*, ed. by Jesús López-Peláez Casellas (Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, 2011), pp. 171-90.

account can be tied into broader Protestant concerns about Islam, including his claim that 'the first author' of the Turkish religion was 'no doubt... the Devil'. Like Nicolay and several earlier writers, Biddulph claimed that Mahomet was a 'false prophet' who sought to 'rise in honour and estimation' by 'coin[ing] a new kind of doctrine and religion' at the instigation of the Devil. Since the true (Christian) faith 'wax[ed] cold and neglected', this new faith drew many followers, especially as the people were 'full of simplicity and ignorance' and the true, Christian religion was 'waxing cold and neglected'.⁴¹ Biddulph drew upon a view of Islam that was familiar to both Protestant and Catholic writers – namely, that it was a heretical sect.⁴² He argued that Mahomet and his Jewish and Nestorian collaborators 'fram[ed] their opinions according to their own corrupt and wicked affections', producing 'a monstrous and most devilish religion'. Biddulph declared that they deliberately stole rites and liturgies from other sects, creating a 'patched up and partial doctrine... out of the Old and New Testaments, depraving the sense of both of them'. Biddulph suggested that Mahomet took 'penitence' from the heretical Arian sect, 'from the Jew[s] circumcision; from the Christians sundry washings, as it were, baptisms', and 'with Sergius', the Arian monk who various medieval Christian writers had claimed was Mahomet's collaborator, 'he denied the divinitie of Christ'.⁴³

It would be a mistake to assume that this description simply served to paint Muslims and their faith as the binary opposition of Christian Europe. To do so overlooks the diverse religious contexts in which these beliefs were deployed. Emerging from the religious ructions of the Reformation, variations on Biddulph's defamation of Islam can be found throughout the seventeenth and eighteenth century. These criticisms were

⁴¹ Biddulph, *Travels*, pp. 41, 47.

⁴² Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 29, 57-8, 60-7; Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, pp. 1-23. See also Timothy Hampton, 'Turkish Dogs, Rabelais, Erasmus and the Rhetoric of Alterity', *Representations*, 41 (1993), pp. 58-82.

⁴³ Biddulph, *Travels*, pp. 41-6; Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, pp. 36, 58-9, 93-5, 166-7, 170, 190-1. On Enlightenment counter-descriptions in the Muhammad as lawgiver tradition, see Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, pp. 21, 24. On Sergius, Mahomet's alleged Nestorian collaborator, see Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, pp. 29, 36, 58-9, 94-5, 166-7, 191.

deployed by William Okeley in his 1675 'Anglo-American Barbary captivity narrative'. Writing himself as the protagonist, Okeley 'faced down his Muslim captors', insisting that Mahomet had 'patch'd up a cento of Jewish and monkish fopperies which was now their religion'. Unlike Biddulph, but like numerous other early modern commentators, Okeley deploys Catholicism rather than the more obscure heresies of the Arians and Nestorians in his debunking of Turkish religion.⁴⁴ Islam was good to think with and its alterity could serve a variety of polemical ends both in contemporary religious writing and popular print.

A further modification of Islam's rhetorical alterity can be found in its use by Humphrey Prideaux, the orthodox Anglican theologian. Prideaux used Mahomet as a 'case study in religious imposture' in opposition to the 'authentic miracles' of the Christian (Protestant) church. Writing in 1698, Prideaux sought to defend the Church of England from deist accusations that Christian miracles were as fraudulent as Mahometan ones. For Prideaux, the Almighty engineered Mahomet's rise in order to punish Christian disunity and doubt. Prideaux wished to use Islam as a 'counterexample to highlight Christianity's legitimacy'.⁴⁵ The notion that Islam was deliberately founded on fraudulent grounds served a variety of rhetorical functions within early modern Christianity, and the identification of other Christians (Catholics, ancient heretics) with the alterity of Islam served an important function for both Biddulph and Okeley. Similarly, Biddulph and Prideaux both sought to defend the legitimacy of the Christian tradition against the rival monotheism of Islam. In this regard, they respectively pre- and post-dated the Catholic priest Ludovico Marracci's Latin translation of the Qur'an, which devoted great effort to 'proving' that Islamic beliefs and doctrine were illegitimate.⁴⁶ All these texts tacitly addressed heterodoxy and disunity within Christianity

⁴⁴ Kidd, 'Worse to Follow Mahomet', p. 768, citing William Okeley, *Eben-ezer, or, a Small Monument of Great Mercy*, 2nd ed. (London, 1676), p. 13. For a further example of a slavery narrative that compares Islam and Catholicism, see the discussion of Joseph Pitts in Chapter 4 below at pp. 129-32.

⁴⁵ Humphrey Prideaux, *The True Nature of Imposture Displayed in the Life of Mahomet* (London, 1698), pp. iv-v; Kidd, 'Worse to Follow Mahomet', pp. 773-4.

⁴⁶ Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, pp. 37-9.

and were concerned with reinforcing the legitimacy of one denomination or another. In so doing, they expanded upon a tradition in Christian writings about Mahometanism that acknowledged Islamic monotheism but considered Mahomet to be 'a carnal, manipulative, mortal man'.⁴⁷

Biddulph's descriptions of Christians in the Holy Land also betray his concern about heterodox Christian beliefs. MacLean contends that Biddulph's 'learned baggage, including all the presuppositions of his clerical office', curtailed his 'interest in other religions, especially eastern varieties of Christianity'. However, there is evidence that Biddulph found elements of foreign Christian worship preferable to those of his fellow Englishmen.⁴⁸ His evangelical zeal for psalm singing caused him to praise Syrian Christians' vernacular psalm singing. He argued that their habit of singing the psalms in their vernacular language was 'too much neglected in England' and wished that God would grant 'reformation thereof'.⁴⁹ Vernacular worship had been central to the early stages of the English Reformation. From its earliest days, English reformers had sought to build a consensus behind claims that 'plain English' was an 'appropriate medium for religious expression', as reinforced through Thomas Cranmer's *Book of Common Prayer* (1549) and the Elizabethan Acts of Uniformity. For English Protestants, the shift into the vernacular represented the fulfilment of long-standing desires for 'a natural, truly vernacular English' to allow 'religion to be enjoyed and expressed in... accessible terms'.⁵⁰ Despite these

⁴⁷ Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, p. 110, see also pp. 76, 87, 100, 110-17, 133, 144-190.

⁴⁸ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 80-1; Biddulph, *Travels*, sig. G3r-G4v.

⁴⁹ Biddulph, *Travels*, sigs. G3r-G4v; MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 112-13. On growing scholarly interest in Asian forms of Christianity, see Bernard Heyberger, 'Eastern Christians, Islam, and the West: A Connected History', *International Journal of Middle Eastern Studies*, 42 (2010), pp. 475-8. Biddulph's comments on Syrian Christians' rituals are also discussed in Chapter 2 above at pp. 52-3.

⁵⁰ Peter Marshall, '(Re)defining the English Reformation', *Journal of British Studies*, 48.3 (2009), pp. 564-86 (pp. 579-81); Patrick Collinson, 'English Reformations', in *A Companion to English Renaissance Literature and Culture*, ed. by Michael Hattaway (Oxford: Blackwell, 2002), pp. 27-43; Ronald Hutton, 'The Local Impact of the Tudor Reformations', in *The English Reformation Revised*, ed. by Christopher Haigh (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987), pp. 114-38 (pp. 134-5). On the role of Latin in the early English Reformation, see Bruce Gordon, 'The Authority of Antiquity: England and the Protestant Latin Bible', in *The Reception of Continental Reformation in Britain*, ed. by Polly Ha and Patrick Collinson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), pp. 1-22.

goals being achieved prior to the accession of the Stuarts, Biddulph clearly did not consider English Protestantism to be the epitome of proper religious practice. Whereas Blount attributed the ignorance of Christians in Muslim territories to the poverty and oppression of Ottoman government,⁵¹ Biddulph believed that plain singing of psalms could improve negligent practices at home.

Biddulph's evangelical Protestantism was more than a symptom of his 'early Orientalism', since his spiritual vocation led him to condemn his fellow countrymen as strongly as the inhabitants of the Middle East.⁵² His denigration of Muslims was not separate from his critique of his own countrymen's lax religious observances. Syrian Christians' rituals were different and foreign and yet they provoked Biddulph to reflect upon those elements of English practice that dissatisfied him. Jesús López-Peláez Casellas shows how 'the construction of otherness in early modern texts does not conform to the stereotyping and prejudicial simplification that has been wrongly taken as representative of the structure of feeling in the period'.⁵³ Likewise, Matar has argued that English relations with the various Muslim empires 'cannot be approached from the misconception of English colonial aspirations' since 'seventeenth-century Ottomans, Persians or Moroccans were as powerful' as the English and other European powers.⁵⁴ Rather, we must 'take... into consideration the conflictive, fragmentary and discontinuous (re)production' of othering of various kinds. López-Peláez Casellas argues that various 'others' may be 'simultaneously... absorbed and expelled, attracted and rejected on account of their paradoxical relation with the early modern English'. English

⁵¹ Blount, *Journey*, p. 28.

⁵² MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, p. 69-70; Biddulph, *Travels*, p. 62; Alison Games, *The Web of Empire: English Cosmopolitans in an Age of Expansion, 1560-1660* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), p. 226. As noted in Chapter 1 (pp. 4-5), Biddulph's employers and his congregation of English factors at Aleppo were not hugely welcoming of his puritan leanings or other, more scandalous, behaviour.

⁵³ Jesús López-Peláez Casellas, "'Menne of Straunge Borders': Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis. An Introduction', in *The Construction of the Other in Early Modern Britain: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis*, ed. by Rüdiger Ahrens (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter, 2013), pp. 1-12 (p. 4).

⁵⁴ Matar, *Islam in Britain*, p. 20. See also Jonathan Burton, *Traffic and Turning: Islam and English Drama, 1579-1624* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2005), p. 11.

discourses about foreign individuals and societies were multifaceted: praise of Muslim efficiency and military strength rubbed against concerns about 'alleged Muslim paganism', whilst Spanish 'political centrality' was praised despite criticisms of 'Spanish miscegenation and hybridism'.⁵⁵ Similarly, Biddulph's awareness of Muslim military strength and Ottoman political authority led him to denigrate Islam on religious grounds. Despite his negative assessment of Turkish religion, he also praised indigenous Christian practices, such as psalm-singing, and Muslim norms, such as the harsh punishment of beggars and prostitutes.⁵⁶

Blount was less convinced that rituals or 'outward solemnities' were significant in Mahomet's formulation of Islam, yet similar contradictions are evident in his depiction of Islam. Like Biddulph, he affirmed the long-standing Christian view that Mahomet's religion was fraudulent and explicitly constructed to appeal to the 'baser' urges of mankind.⁵⁷ Whereas Biddulph argued that Islam was constructed from a hotchpotch of heterodox Christian and Jewish rituals, Blount believed that Mahomet judged both Christian and gentile liturgical practices to be 'effeminate'. Blount declared that Mahomet had little time for the rituals and accoutrements traditionally associated with religious worship. Blount's Mahomet denied the value of 'daintie pictures, and musicke in churches, those strange vestures, and processions', as well as the 'stately sacrifices, and other solemnities of the heathen'. Consequently, Mahomet resolved to 'build the Sect' not on 'miracles, whose credit frequent Imposters had rendered suspect to the world; but rather chose to build it upon the sword'.⁵⁸

⁵⁵ López-Peláez Casellas, 'Menne of Straunge Borders', pp. 4-5; Daniel J. Viktus, *Turning Turk: English Theater And The Multicultural Mediterranean, 1570-1630* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003), p. 12. On the Black Legend of Spanish cruelty more generally, see Rafael Veléz, 'Imperial Moments: The Cromwellian Black Legend', in *The Construction of the Other in Early Modern Britain: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis*, ed. by Rüdiger Ahrens (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter, 2013), pp. 205-15; William S. Maltby, *The Black Legend in England: The Development of Anti-Spanish Sentiment, 1558-1660* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1971).

⁵⁶ See the present chapter above at p. 86.

⁵⁷ Blount, *Journey*, p. 87; MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, p. 170.

⁵⁸ Blount, *Journey*, p. 77, also pp. 2, 82, 110.

MacLean links Blount's beliefs to the radical deism propounded by his son, Charles. There is much to be said in support of this view: Blount senior's account of the Muslim faith can be read as criticisms not just of Islam but also of religious ceremonies *per se*. Blount was more interested in civil institutions than religious doctrine. MacLean notes that 'in the late 1630s... readers of Blount's deft observations on Islam may have also found themselves considering general questions of state religion pertinent to the Church of England'. Blount's handling of Ottoman religion 'implied such questions as: were bishops mere mouthpieces of the king?' and 'was the Bible interpreted simply to serve a contemporary political agenda?' Blount's criticisms of 'state religion could apply just as easily to the Caroline Church of England'.⁵⁹

However, MacLean's conclusion that Blount was so 'clear of religious bias that he shows no special affinity for Protestant Christianity' requires some caveats. There is a substantial difference between an account of another religion that raises questions pertinent to domestic religious authority and one that 'shows no special affinity' for the author's own faith.⁶⁰ Blount's scepticism should not be read as a disregard for the state of Christianity in the Levant. For instance, he was concerned that the conversion of Christian churches into '*meskeetoos*' had meant that 'many who professe themselves Christians, scarce know what they meane by being so'. Unlike Biddulph, who believed that more psalm-singing and better-educated preachers would improve the lot of Levantine Christians, Blount bemoaned the fact that many Christians were forced by poverty to commit apostasy and convert to Islam. Blount also criticised the Turks for their treatment of their Christian subjects. He argued that an ancient prophecy motivated the Turks to 'use the Christians as their future destroyers with much hostility'. Their treatment of Christians within their territories is consequently 'more pernicious than that of Heathen Emperours'. He nonetheless conceded, alongside various other writers, including the Istanbul-based clergyman Henry Forde, and the religious

⁵⁹ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 168-9.

⁶⁰ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 168-9.

anthologist Edward Brerewood, that they ‘put none to death for religion’.⁶¹ This evidence suggests that Blount shows some ‘special affinity for Protestant Christianity’.⁶² Although elements of Blount’s account can be read in a more ecumenical manner, he is indebted to Christian concerns and dominant tropes concerning fraudulent Mahometan beliefs.

This point is reinforced by his criticisms of Islamic learning during his visit to Cairo. Blount set out to discover whether Cairo still deserved its ancient reputation as the ‘fountain of all science, and arts civill’ and whether ‘some spark of those cinders [was] not yet put out’. However, he concluded that the Egyptian priests he encountered were ‘utterly ignorant of all things not Mahometan’ following the rise of Islam and the absorption of Egypt into the Ottoman Empire.⁶³ Blount was unable to shake off either Protestant identity or his humanistic concerns, the latter of which were indebted to Western European notions of civility and learning.⁶⁴ He also believed that Mahometanism was designed to appeal to mankind’s basest desires. Blount believed that Catholics and Muslims alike risked being deceived by their priests since ‘all *heathenish Gods* are used like *puppets*’. Warming to his concern about the dangers inherent in giving priests too much power, Blount claimed that amongst the ‘foure different sects of Mahometans’, religious leaders had the power to ‘animate the souldiers... with divine authoritie and to decide controversies’. Since ‘all set texts are obnoxious to several expositions, thence growes distraction’ and

⁶¹ Blount, *Journey*, pp. 2, 82, 110; William Forde, *A Sermon Preached at Constantinople in the Vines of Perah, at the Funerall of the Vertuous and Admired Lady Anne Glouer...* (London, 1616), pp. 70-1; Edward Brerewood, *Enquiries Touching the Diversity of Languages, and Religions Through the Cheife Parts of the World...* (London, 1622), pp. 85-6. On Brerewood, see also Chapter 2 above at pp. 73-4.

⁶² MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, p. 168.

⁶³ Blount, *Journey*, pp. 3, 49, 80, 92-4. Blount does not distinguish between these two events: Islam had spread quickly over Egypt in the centuries after the death of Muhammad but was not absorbed into the Ottoman Empire until the early sixteenth century: Ira M. Lapidus, *A History of Islamic Societies* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 46-7.

⁶⁴ Marshall T. Poe, *A People Born to Slavery: Russia in Early Modern European Ethnography, 1476-1748* (New York: Cornell University Press, 2000), p. 149. On the influence of European notions of learning and civility, see Chapter 2 above at pp. 46-7.

corruption since 'it is prohibited to... translate' the Qur'an. Not only did this 'preserve... the Arabick tongue', but it also 'conceale[d] religion'.⁶⁵

MacLean is correct that Blount's criticisms of Islam could equally apply to Catholic worship in Latin or to the growing factional disputes between Arminians and Presbyterians within the English church in the 1630s.⁶⁶ Blount's comments can also be connected with the writings of Blount's deist son. Like many later deist writers, Charles' *Great is Diana of the Ephesians* (1680) possessed a strongly anti-clerical strain, including criticisms of the dissimulation of priests through miracles and their divisive interpretations of Scripture.⁶⁷ In Wayne Hudson's view, these elements of Charles' philosophy demonstrate his social role and make it difficult to extricate his philosophy from contemporary Protestantism.⁶⁸

His father's account of Mahomet is similarly entangled in contemporary Protestantism. This is made explicit in his conclusion that Muslim charitable institutions 'seemed to mee like daintie fruit growing out of a dung-hill' since 'the vertues of vulgar minds are of so base a nature' and 'must be manured with foolish hopes and feares' rather than the 'finer nutriment of reason'.⁶⁹ This criticism can also be found in descriptions of Russian Christians. Giles Fletcher, Elizabeth I's ambassador to Muscovy, observed that Russians were 'voyde of all manner of learning' and so 'fearing to have their ignorance and ungodlinesse discovered' they prevent and suppress any 'noveltie of learning' and maintain a 'tyrannicall

⁶⁵ Blount, *Journey*, pp. 79-80.

⁶⁶ Marshall, '(Re)defining the English Reformation', pp. 579-81.

⁶⁷ Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, p. 21; Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, pp. 21-2. On anticlericalism within deist writing more generally, see Alex Barber, "'Why don't those Lazy Priests Answer the Book?'" Matthew Tindal, Censorship, Freedom of the Press and Religious Debate in Early Eighteenth-Century England', *History*, 98 (2013), pp. 680-707 (pp. 686-8); W. R. Sorley, 'Berkeley and Contemporary Philosophy', in *The Cambridge History of English and American Literature: An Encyclopedia*, ed. by A. W. Ward and A. R. Waller, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1907), ix, pt. 2; section 10, <<http://www.bartleby.com/219/>> [accessed 23 September 2015].

⁶⁸ Hudson, *English Deists*, p. 17.

⁶⁹ Blount, *Journey*, p. 87. For further discussion of these remarks and their place within Blount's narrative, see MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, p. 170.

government'.⁷⁰ Later in the century, the East India Company chaplain, John Ovington, bemoaned the obfuscating Latin and exploitative indulgences used by Catholic priests on the Portuguese island of Madeira.⁷¹ These parallels show similarities between Blount and other travellers who were keen to defend the rectitude of English religious practices.

In his comments on the dissimulation and ignorance of Mahometan priests and the immoral foundations of their charity, Blount invokes his Protestant Christian heritage. Whilst he devoted less space to negative stereotypes and avoided prolonged moral censure of Turkish practices, his account is as involved in contemporary Christian discourses as Biddulph's. Although he rejected as 'nonsense' popular stereotypes of Turks 'indulging excessively in a variety of ungodly sexual practices',⁷² he concurs with the religious cataloguer Brerewood that Islam was designed to appeal to the carnal lusts of a people 'full of simplicity and ignorance'.⁷³ Blount argued that 'Mahomet, knowing he had not to deale with a scholastique and speculative generation, but with a people rude and sensuall' ensured that 'his paradise' did not 'consist in visions and hallelujahs; but in delicious fare, pleasant gardens, and wenches with great eyes who were ever peculiarly affected in the Levant'. Thus, those who 'dye in wars for the Mahometan faith' were promised 'young lusty bodies' with which to 'eternally... enjoy those pleasures, notwithstanding any former sinnes'. Blount despaired that 'it is scarce credible, what numbers these hopes bring in'.⁷⁴ Blount viewed priestcraft in general as the root cause of Mahometanism's problems, and speculated whether these problems also afflicted monotheism more generally.

Hudson argues that the public identities and social roles of eighteenth-century religious radicals led many, including Blount's son

⁷⁰ Giles Fletcher, *Of the Russe Common Wealth Or Manner of Government by the Russe Emperour...* (London, 1591), p. 111; Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, pp. 2-7. On Fletcher's controversial career and religious orthodoxy, see Chapter 2 above at pp. 43-5.

⁷¹ John Ovington, *A Voyage to Suratt in the Year 1689...* (London, 1696), pp. 22-3, 30-5.

⁷² MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, p. 148.

⁷³ Brerewood, *Enquiries*, pp. 85-6; Biddulph, *Travels*, p. 47.

⁷⁴ Blount, *Journey*, pp. 67-8.

Charles, to conceal their more radical opinions in their published works.⁷⁵ A disparity between Blount senior's public and private religious identities may explain some of the contrasts in his account of Mahomet and his faith.⁷⁶ His rejection of many of the standard accoutrements of religious worship indicates his sceptical outlook. Indeed, Blount expressed exactly the kinds of views that Prideaux sought to refute.⁷⁷ A useful parallel may be with George Sale, the early eighteenth-century English translator of the Qur'an, who argued that both Christianity and Islam were translatable forms of monotheism. By rejecting readings of Scripture that claimed that the Christian Gospels superseded Judaic law, Sale advocated a reading anchored in prophetic discourses in which the later tradition augmented, complemented and enhanced the previous one.⁷⁸ Despite being criticised by some contemporaries for his perceived affection for Islam, Sale retained a public reputation as a supporter of Christian evangelical causes, including the Anglican missionary organisation the Society for the Propagation of Christian Knowledge.⁷⁹ Sale's assertion that Muslim beliefs and doctrine could be of equal legitimacy to Christian ones prefigured the more radical equivalences found in the deist John Toland's *Nazarenus, or Jewish, Gentile, and Mahometan Christianity* (1718).⁸⁰ Blount's *Journey* predates both, as it tacitly highlights equivalences between Christianity and Islam but does not advocate parity between the two faiths. His interpretation of the relationship between religious and political authority is cynical in the sense that it sees the Mahometan faith as necessary to maintain Ottoman political authority. Unlike later radicals such as Toland who advocated

⁷⁵ Hudson, *English Deists*, pp. 17, 57-77. See also Matthew Lalor, *Matthew Tindal, Freethinker: An Eighteenth Century Assault on Religion* (London: Continuum, 2006).

⁷⁶ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 168-9.

⁷⁷ Kidd, 'Worse to Follow Mahomet', p. 774.

⁷⁸ Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, pp. 6-7, 23-8.

⁷⁹ Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, p. 22. Sale was criticised by one contemporary for being 'half mussulman', though Netton doubts whether Sale ever 'contemplated relinquishing his Christian faith': Ian Richard Netton, 'The Mysteries of Islam', in *Exoticism in the Enlightenment*, ed. by George Sebastian Rousseau and Roy Porter (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1990), pp. 23-45 (p. 30). See also David Arthur Pailin, *Attitudes to Other Religions: Comparative Religion in Seventeenth and Eighteenth Century Britain* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1984), p. 83.

⁸⁰ Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, p. 21.

‘good moral conduct’ over ‘theological niceties’, Blount was unconcerned by either issue.⁸¹ Unlike his deistic son, Blount senior appears to wish to defend Christian Scripture against Islamic imposture. For him, Islamic charitable institutions and other good works are not worthy of merit, since they emerged from the corruption of the Turkish Empire. Contemporary Christian apologetics informed his anti-Islamic biases. Blount’s account of his travels was informed by wider concerns within contemporary Protestantism. In particular, his depiction of Mahomet as a demagogue is influenced by existing stereotypes.

Blount dissects Ottoman religious institutions in order to explain Ottoman military successes. He concluded that their religion must be based on conquest in order to ensure civil unity.⁸² His view that Islam specifically was a manufactured and false religion demonstrates the gulf that separates him from later, more radical deist critiques. Indeed, in this respect, there is substantial overlap between his conclusions and those of Biddulph. Both produce accounts that demonstrate the ‘conflictive, fragmentary and discontinuous’ nature of early modern English discourses of othering.⁸³ Blount begins his investigation into Mahometan monotheism with the civil institutions of the Turkish Empire. In contrast, Biddulph’s starting point is its erroneous religious doctrines. Regardless, both travellers concurred that Islam was an improper and sacrilegious religion and attributed this largely to the figure of Mahomet. Both wrote within a tradition of European depictions of Mahomet that emphasised that Mahomet was not ‘a god [or] an idol’ but instead a ‘violent, debauched... heresiarch’.⁸⁴ Oriental despotism, embodied in the apparently absolute power of Ottoman Sultans derived from Mahomet, was a common trope in seventeenth-century European writing about the Ottomans and can be found in both

⁸¹ Lynn Hunt, Margaret Jacob and Wijnand Mijnhart, *The Book That Changed Europe: Picart and Bernard’s Religious Ceremonies of the World* (Cambridge, MA and London: Harvard University Press, 2010), p. 248.

⁸² Biddulph, *Travels*, pp. 38-9; Blount, *Journey*, sig. A2r, pp. 2, 24-5.

⁸³ López-Peláez Casellas, ‘Menne of Straunge Borders’, pp. 4-5, also pp. 2-3.

⁸⁴ Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, p. 110.

narratives.⁸⁵ Although both accounts are tied up in biblically derived historical writing, there are important differences in emphasis. Biddulph sees Islam as a deviation from proper Christian practice, and is able to explicate this in terms of other biblical heresies (Nestorianism, Judaism) with just a dash of foundational diabolical influence.⁸⁶ In contrast, Blount's circumspect account of religious rituals draws upon contemporary anticlericalism and anticipates the equivocal views of Islam propounded by later scholars of comparative religion and deist writers. These contrasts highlight the differing religious perspectives of the two men. Blount sees religion as a political tool, something that can be used strategically by rulers to ensure obedience. In contrast, Biddulph identified Islam with prophesied evils found in Christian Scripture. In the next section, we shall examine their contrasting views of Scriptural and Mahometan prophecies, and draw out their differing opinions of divine providence.

Providence, Mahomet and the fall of Constantinople

Early modern Bible readers tended to parallel contemporary political crises with examples set out in Scripture. Kevin Killeen has observed that Scripture served as 'a political thesaurus and mirror of the present' through which God spoke 'to the political moment via a stock of exemplary prefigurations'. These reading practices allowed individuals to draw moral lessons from Scripture. Contemporary political events were explicated with reference to Old Testament precedents.⁸⁷ Providential logic could also be found outside the arcane operations of statecraft. Indeed, in the early seventeenth century, the belief that God intervened in terrestrial affairs found popular support across the confessional spectrum. Providential beliefs were ubiquitous in early modern England, and prophetic

⁸⁵ Valensi, 'Making of a Political Paradigm', pp. 173-203; Kaiser, 'The Evil Empire?', pp. 69-81. On religious language in representations of war against Muslims, see Nabil Matar, *Turks, Moors, and Englishmen in the Age of Discovery* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), pp. 139-65.

⁸⁶ Biddulph, *Travels*, p. 47.

⁸⁷ Kevin Killeen, 'Chastising with Scorpions: Reading the Old Testament in Early Modern England', *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 73 (2010), pp. 491-506, pp. 491-3. I discuss these reading practices in more detail in Chapter 2 above at pp. 67-8.

proselytising could have an 'electrifying and intoxicating effect' on congregations. Walsham suggests that some people may have taken a 'perverse pleasure in the recurrent threat that God was about to annihilate England', whilst Susan Brigden observes that popular prophetic preachers constituted a 'popular spectator sport'.⁸⁸

Closely linked to popular appetites for sensationalist literature, providential thinking also underpinned political and religious debates. 'Petitionary prayers and services seeking divine intervention in earthly events' were regularly deployed by the English state, with thirty-two alone issued during Elizabeth's reign. This 'special worship' in times of national crisis served not only to 'disseminate news' but also to enable parishioners to 'pray and fast for the well-being of the realm'. Thus, national events, from wars to natural disasters, were understood in light of 'ideas of causation' that were predicated on the assumption that 'divine aid' could be motivated by religious action.⁸⁹ Opposition to these prayers rarely questioned the efficacy of such activity, with debate instead focusing on whether the objectives of one petitionary prayer or another was legitimate.⁹⁰

In Walsham's words, providential thinking was '*the* theory of causation in the sixteenth century'. Contemporaries understood that 'God ruled a moral universe' and that human actions could affect both the human and natural world, as God used man-made and natural correctives

⁸⁸ Walsham, *Providence*, pp. 324-5; Susan Brigden, 'Youth and the English Reformation', *Past and Present*, 95.1 (1982), pp. 37-67. On the pan-Christian appeal of doctrines of grace and predestination in early modern Europe, see Sean F. Hughes, '"The Problem of Calvinism": English Theologies of Predestination c. 1580-1630', in *Belief and Practice in Reformation England: A Tribute to Patrick Collinson from His Students*, ed. by Susan Wabuda and Caroline Litzenberger (Aldershot: Ashgate, 1998), pp. 229-49 (pp. 232-3).

⁸⁹ Natalie Mears, 'Public Worship and Political Participation in Elizabethan England', *Journal of British Studies*, 51 (2012), pp. 4-25 (pp. 6-7).

⁹⁰ Mears, 'Public Worship and Political Participation', p. 23. In this sense, collective petitionary prayer and individual prophetic claims operated in a comparable manner. The reputations of individual prophets could be made or unmade dependent on the veracity of their predictions, with some 'eminent clerics' gaining a 'reputation for prophesying' major future events, including James Ussher's foretelling of the English Civil Wars and John Foxe's prognostications concerning the destruction of the Spanish Armada: Walsham, *Providence*, p. 322, citing Thomas Fuller, *Abel Redivivus or the Dead yet Speaking* (1651), pp. 381-2; William Turner, *A Compleat History of the most Remarkable Providences...* (n. p., 1697), pt.1, p. 66 for Foxe and Ussher respectively.

against sin.⁹¹ Consequently, both minor and major events were the result of His ineffable will. Travellers and other commentators interpreted Ottoman military victories in light of providential and Scriptural precedents. I shall examine the role providence played in Biddulph and Blount's account of the 1453 Ottoman conquest of Constantinople, formerly the capital of the Orthodox Christian Byzantine Empire. By the later seventeenth century, providential reasoning was challenged by rival ways of thinking which limited God's interventions in terrestrial affairs. These debates also reflected different perceptions of the relationship between Islam and Christianity.⁹² Therefore, I shall also evaluate these travel texts in light of shifting attitudes to Islam during the later part of the seventeenth century.

The Reformation produced a major shift in how Christian writers depicted the 1453 defeat of the eastern Orthodox Byzantine Empire by the Ottoman Sultan Mehmed II.⁹³ Previously, fifteenth-century Catholic writers had ascribed positive characteristics to Islam's judicial system and praised the piety and charity of Islamic moral codes. During the sixteenth century, these 'inclusionary' elements were often excised in Protestant editions of their texts.⁹⁴ Unlike other European nations, England was not directly threatened by Ottoman expansion. Under Elizabeth, the English state even proposed a naval alliance with the Ottomans against the Catholic Habsburgs, though these attempts came to nothing.⁹⁵ Although the advent of the Stuarts reduced somewhat the hostility between England and

⁹¹ Mears, 'Public Worship and Political Participation', p. 17. *Emphases* in original.

⁹² Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 263-8.

⁹³ On the conquest in context of intra-Christian debates, see Eleanor H. Tejirian and Reeva Spector Simon, *Conflict, Conquest, and Conversion: Two Thousand Years of Christian Missions in the Middle East* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2014), pp. 46-50.

⁹⁴ Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 266-7.

⁹⁵ Sabine Lucia Müller, 'William Harborne's Embassies: Scripting, Performing and Editing Anglo-Ottoman Diplomacy', in *Early Modern Encounters with the Islamic East: Performing Cultures*, ed. by Sabine Schülting, Sabine Lucia Müller, and Ralf Hertel (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 11-26. On Harborne's diplomatic career, see Susan A. Skilliter, *William Harborne and the Trade with Turkey, 1578-1582: A Documentary Study of the First Anglo-Ottoman Relations* (London: Oxford University Press, 1977); Paul Wittek, 'The Turkish Documents in Hakluyt's Voyages', *Historical Research*, 19.57 (1942), pp. 121-39. For Harborne's biography, see Christine Woodhead, 'Harborne, William', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2008, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/12234>> [accessed 24 August 2012].

continental European powers, friendly diplomatic relations with the Ottomans continued. Meanwhile, in antiquarian works, a range of inclusionary and exclusionary responses to Ottoman politics, religion and culture circulated in England.⁹⁶ Early Protestant writing about Islam was not homogenous and commentators' perspectives adapted in response to geopolitical developments. For instance, Martin Luther only endorsed military resistance by Christian polities when the Ottomans threatened Vienna in 1529. More generally, Protestant reformers argued that Ottoman military victories over Catholic and Orthodox opponents proved the lapsed nature of other Christians' doctrines and beliefs: Constantinople's fall had been ordained by God as a punishment for the sins of Rome and the heterodoxy of earlier Christian traditions.⁹⁷

Mahomet's religion was multifaceted and served a variety of rhetorical purposes that changed over time.⁹⁸ The growing accuracy of later seventeenth-century European Qur'anic translations occasioned a shift in Christian depictions of Islam during the latter part of the seventeenth century. Ziad Elmarsafy identifies two contrasting reactions; one emphasising Christian exclusivism and the other tending towards the nascent discipline of comparative religions. Elmarsafy's comparison of Sale and Marracci's respective translations demonstrates that subsequent editions fluctuated between, respectively, analytical and critical approaches to Islam. Sale's ecumenical vision can be traced through André

⁹⁶ Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 253-9; Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an* pp. 7-8; Matar, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen*, pp. 8-10, see also pp. 19-42. Matthew Dimmock, "'Captive to the Turke': Responses to the Anglo-Ottoman Capitulations of 1580", in *Cultural Encounters Between East and West 1453-1699* ed. by Matthew Birchwood and Matthew Dimmock (Newcastle-upon-Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Press, 2005), pp. 29-42. On the developing political relationship between England and the Ottoman Empire and its representation, see Stephen Schmuck, 'Politics of Anxiety: The Imago Turci in Early Modern English Prose c. 1550-1620' (unpublished PhD thesis, University of Wales, Aberystwyth, 2007), <<http://hdl.handle.net/2160/1938>> [accessed 31 October 2012]. On relations between the Ottomans and the Moroccan Sultanate, see Michael Brett, 'Morocco and the Ottomans: The Sixteenth Century in North Africa', *Journal of African History*, 25 (1984), pp. 331-41.

⁹⁷ Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 56-65, esp. pp. 62-4; Blanks, 'Western Views of Islam', p. 22; Robert Irwin, *For Lust of Knowing: The Orientalists and Their Enemies* (London: Penguin, 2006), pp. 72-3; Christopher Elwood, 'A Singular Example of the Wrath of God: The Use of Sodom in Sixteenth-Century Exegesis', *The Harvard Theological Review*, 98.1 (2005), pp. 67-93 (p. 92).

⁹⁸ Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 26, 31, 63, 263-8.

du Ryer's 1647 French translation of the Qur'an and Edward Pococke's early Orientalist works, which instituted a shift towards a 'compendious rather than critical' approach to Islamic religious difference.⁹⁹

Translators of the Qur'an disagreed as significantly as those travellers who both facilitated their studies by bringing Arabic and Persian texts into Europe and provided contextual observations of contemporary Islamic life.¹⁰⁰ Elmarsafy suggests that the Qur'an was seen as both 'desired and dangerous': it was the 'Arabic text par excellence' yet reading it could risk introducing heterodox ideas, or worse, convert the reader.¹⁰¹ During the later part of the century, new debates began to reshape European perceptions of Islamic traditions. Deists and other sceptics drew as much on the Qur'an as on contemporary rationalist and materialist philosophies. In their monumental work of comparative religion, the French Protestant exiles Bernard Picart and Jean Frederic Bernard argued that Islam was a suitable test case for monotheism more generally. This tradition built upon sceptical and rationalist works by earlier deists, including Charles Blount, and contemporary radicals such as Toland.¹⁰² Opposing this ecumenical view were works like Prideaux's *True Nature of Imposture... In the Life of Mahomet* (1698) with its 'self-explanatory' title. Prideaux sought to 'protect the Christian reader' from the dangers posed by a 'multiplicity of sects and schisms', the same dangers which had sown the seeds for the invasion and occupation of Eastern Orthodox parts of Europe by Ottoman forces.¹⁰³ Though Socinianism and Unitarianism were Prideaux's principle targets, his criticisms unintentionally repeated sixteenth-century Catholic

⁹⁹ Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, pp. 10, 12-14, 20-6, 29-32, 37-63.

¹⁰⁰ Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, pp. 7-8, 195: Elmarsafy suggests that the Qur'an had become somewhat ubiquitous, citing Dimmock's as yet unpublished calculation that forty printed copies of Theodor Bibliander's 1543 edition could be found in ecclesiastical and university libraries across Britain. However, unlike Sale and Marracci's later translations, this version was somewhat 'distant from the Arabic text'. Regardless, on the founding of the Laudian Chair of Arabic at Oxford University, its inaugurator obtained 'a royal letter requiring each Levant Company ship to bring back one Arabic or Persian manuscript', explicitly requesting that traders not bring back further copies of the Qur'an.

¹⁰¹ Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, pp. 7-8, 195. On Arabic scholarship in England more generally, see G. J. Toomer, *Eastern Wisdom and Learning: The Study of Arabic in Seventeenth-Century England* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1996), pp. 108-15.

¹⁰² Hunt et al, *Book that Changed Europe*, pp. 247-8, 252-6.

¹⁰³ Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, pp. 19-20.

criticisms that had compared Protestant schismatics with the heresies of Mahomet.¹⁰⁴ This comparison also echoed Blount's reflections on Caroline religious authority, albeit with an emphasis on protecting singular, Christian religious truth that is largely absent from Blount's text.¹⁰⁵

Thus, Biddulph and Blount travelled during a transitional period in which nascent comparative religious scholarship was beginning to reshape how Europeans thought about Islam. Providentialism was implicated in these multiple and shifting perspectives on the rise of Mahomet's empire. The paradigmatic authority of Christian tradition, and the role of its foundational myths in justifying contemporary political and religious hierarchies made it impossible to reduce entirely the distance between Christianity and Islam, and neither of our travellers attempted this. Later works like Sale's translation of the Qur'an emphasised the 'interchangeability of the two creeds' and minimised 'the differences between them'. In contrast, contemporaries such as Du Ryer were required to include 'openly derogatory' condemnations of Islam in order to conceal the writer's 'sympathy with the Muslims and wide circle of Muslim friends'.¹⁰⁶

Similar ambiguities can be found in Biddulph and Blount's texts. We noted previously that Biddulph concurred with Marracci's and Prideaux's general conception of Islam: a heretical sect that exploited the weakness and division of Christian princes. Hence, Biddulph described the conquest of Constantinople in lurid and violent terms, reporting that 'during the time of the sacking... was no kind of fornication, sodometry, sacrilege, nor cruelty by them left unexecuted'.¹⁰⁷ MacLean argues that Biddulph is typical of exclusionary Protestant writers in his desire to 'reduce... the

¹⁰⁴ Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, pp. 6-7, 11. On the use of 'Islamic paganism' in attacks on Unitarianism or Socinianism, see J. A. I. Champion, *The Pillars of Priestcraft Shaken: The Church of England and Its Enemies, 1660-1730* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), pp. 102-16.

¹⁰⁵ Blount, *Journey*, p. 77, see also pp. 2, 82, 110.

¹⁰⁶ Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, pp. 8, 11-13, 64-5, citing André Du Ryer, *L'Alcoran de Mahomet*, (n.p., 1647).

¹⁰⁷ Biddulph, *Travels*, p. 22.

history of Arabic civilisation to military conquest'.¹⁰⁸ In contrast, Blount anticipated Sale and Du Ryer's perspective and did not censure the Turkish conquest. He merely observed that 'in this losse' the city of Constantinople 'may be said to gaine' since, following the conquest, the city gained 'an higher glory than it had before, being made head of a farre greater Empire'. He observed that previously the city was 'baited by the Thracians on the one side and Grecians on the other', but 'now it commands over both'. Blount was also impressed by the 'infinite swarme of officers and attendants' whose 'silence, and reverence so wonderfull' showed the 'awe' that 'their soveraigne' inspires.¹⁰⁹ Blount's admiration of the Ottoman Sultan's military authority reflected a broader strand of European writing about Mahomet that saw him as a great lawgiver rather than merely a heretic.¹¹⁰ Blount was reputed to have been a 'traveller of independent mind', and we can find further evidence for his scepticism in his descriptions of alleged Turkish prophecies. Blount is doubtful of the reality of prophetic traditions and seeks to uncover their underlying political motivations.¹¹¹ Whereas Blount emphasised the political authority of the Ottoman state, Biddulph focused on the violence of the Mahometan conquerors, emphasising their otherness.¹¹² Biddulph's account of the fall of the Byzantine Empire draws upon a notion of special providence in

¹⁰⁸ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 85-6, 87, citing Kenneth Meyer Setton, *Western Hostility to Islam and Prophecies of Turkish Doom* (Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1992), p. 4; Matar, *Islam in Britain*, pp. 153-83. The conquest of Constantinople was not unique in English reports of Turkish violent conquest. See the following account of the Turkish invasion of Rhodes extracted in Hakluyt's *Principal Navigations*: Anon, 'A Brief Relation of the Siege and Taking of the Citie of Rhodes, by Sultan Soliman the Great Turke, Translated Out of French into English at the Motion of the Reverend Lord Thomas Dockwray, Great Prior of the Order of Jerusalem in England, in the Yeere 1524', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), v, pp. 1-60 (pp. 59-60).

¹⁰⁹ Blount, *Journey*, sig. A2r, pp. 2, 24-5. For a similar account in which the barbarity of fratricide between rival Sultans is contrasted with descriptions of the beauty of the church of St Sophia (with no mention of the massacre described by Biddulph/Nicolay, see William Harborne, 'The Voyage of the Susan of London to Constantinople, Wherein the Worshipfull M. William Harborne was Sent First Ambassadour unto Sultan Murad Can...' in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt, v, pp. 243-58 (p. 253).

¹¹⁰ Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, pp. 24-26, 30, 41-2, 85-6, 95, 122, 138.

¹¹¹ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 165, 168-9; J. A. Redwood, 'Charles Blount (1654-93), Deism, and English Free Thought', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 35.3 (1974), pp. 490-8 (p. 491); Blount, *Journey*, sig. A2r, p. 77; MacLean, 'Ottomanism before Orientalism', pp. 75-96. On Ottoman military discipline, see Blount, *Journey*, pp. 62-76.

¹¹² MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 73-7.

which the Christian God's favour must be earned within a broader conception of general providence that seeks to reassure readers of an inevitable Christian victory.

Regardless of the particular confessional perspective being articulated, the mechanisms of providence were necessarily obscure and particular events could be obnoxious to multiple interpretations. It was plausible to argue that national and personal defeats and misfortunes were the providential testing of oneself or one's opponents. Equally, personal or national successes may be a manifestation of divine providence, as in Hakluyt's interpretation of English victories over the Spanish Armada and the sacking of Cadiz in 1596.¹¹³ For Hakluyt, history was 'an instructive medium' and the 'moral value' of divine judgement against Spain demonstrated that correct 'faith' was integral to the operation of providence. Hakluyt framed historical texts 'within a Christian economy' rather 'than a secular one', though the operation of providence was always morally ambiguous. One interpretation suggested that Spain's 'divinely ordained defeat' was 'less [a] satisfaction of English pride than... an admonishment to how England ought to conduct itself' in order to remain worthy of providential favour. In the context of Elizabethan Anglo-Spanish rivalry, 'claims of God's favour and protection' operated as both 'an encouragement and a corrective to national [colonial] endeavour'. Contemporary providential interpretations of recent geopolitical events were more than simply 'triumphalist rhetoric': the 'censure of others' was effectively a 'double-edged sword that reminded any who would listen that God's providence is not without its conditions'.¹¹⁴

For Biddulph, the Ottoman capture of Constantinople was the fulfilment of biblical prophecy and was intimately tied to the future collapse of the Great Turk's empire. In MacLean's view, Biddulph used 'millenarian prophecies' found in the biblical Book of Daniel to prove that

¹¹³ David A. Boruchoff, 'Piety, Patriotism and Empire: Lessons for England, Spain and the New World in the Works of Richard Hakluyt', *Renaissance Quarterly*, 62.3 (2009), pp. 809-58 (pp. 830-1).

¹¹⁴ Boruchoff, 'Piety, Patriotism', pp. 814-15, 830-5.

the collapse of the Ottoman Empire and religion was imminent. The prophecies in the Book of Daniel that informed Biddulph's analysis predicted that five empires would rise and fall, and Biddulph identified the Ottomans with the fourth such empire. The final empire was ordained by God to be the true, Christian faith and would last forever. Biddulph provided further evidence for these claims, maintaining that 'Mahomet himself had prophesied that Islam would last only 1,000 years' and so would shortly be vanquished.¹¹⁵

In MacLean's postcolonial analysis, Biddulph's opinions fit neatly into a 'wilful' tradition of anti-Islamic bigotry perpetrated by Protestant writers from Luther onwards. MacLean argues that this 'demonisation of the Muslims' was known 'to be nonsense' by 'scholarly Arabists of the time', such as the translator of the Qur'an William Bedwell. In MacLean's reading, this was irrelevant to writers like Biddulph, who 'had no desire to understand Islam, he wanted merely to refute it'.¹¹⁶ It is worth noting that, despite being credited with a shift in Arabic studies in England from 'missionary to diplomatic, economic and scientific uses', Bedwell's most famous work was entitled *A Discovery of the Impostures of Mahomet and of the Koran* (1615). Additionally, Elmarsafy's analysis of European Qur'anic translations shows that Sale's comparativist edition repeatedly cites Marracci's hostile translation.¹¹⁷ There was less of a distinction between 'understanding' and 'refuting' Islam than MacLean suggests. Islam signified multiple and competing things in the context of post-Reformation Christianity, and borrowing between opposing accounts was common.¹¹⁸

¹¹⁵ Biddulph, *Travels*, pp. 85-7. On the composition, translation and reception of the Book of Daniel, see Daniel DiMassa, 'The Politics of Translation and the German Reception of Dante: Johannes Herold's Monarchy', in *Translation and the Book Trade in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by José María Pérez Fernández and Edward Wilson-Lee (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), pp. 119-20; Arthur H. Williamson, 'An Empire to End Empire: The Dynamic of Early Modern British Expansion', *Huntington Library Quarterly*, 68.1-2 (2005), pp. 227-56 (pp.227-8, 230-9).

¹¹⁶ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 85-7; Blanks, 'Western Views of Islam', p. 22; Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 56-65;

¹¹⁷ Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, pp. 38-9, 47-8. Further discussion of Bedwell can be found in Mordechai Feingold, "'The Turkish Alcoran': New Light on the 1649 English Translation of the Koran", *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 75.4 (2012), pp. 475-501.

¹¹⁸ Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 262-9; Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, p. 46.

Biddulph's moral loading of the prophecies contained in the Book of Daniel was also more equivocal than the conventional postcolonial interpretation allows. Biddulph claimed that the establishment of Constantinople in 324 AD resulted from the direct intervention of the Christian deity. He also claimed that the departure of the Roman emperor Constantine to Constantinople was the result of a direct, divine revelation to the emperor Constantine himself.¹¹⁹ Biddulph also noted that this providential intervention was merely the playing out of God's preordained 'general' providence, in line with the common belief that 'at the time of Creation, God had mapped out all events that would happen on earth'. In contrast, 'special' or 'particular' providence indicated 'God's intervention in, and disruptions to, everyday life in response to the realm's collective godliness or sin'.¹²⁰ Debate persisted about the nature and extent of such interventions into the natural order, with the majority of English divines insisting that 'God usually worked mediately' through 'inferior instruments and forces'. However, He could not be restricted to 'second causes' and was 'quite capable of bringing about His objectives immediately... without the assistance of any such agents or tools', as in the direct revelation to Constantine.¹²¹

Biddulph claimed that the fall of Constantinople was set out in 'the prophecies of the Apostle Paul' as told in 2 Thessalonians 2.7. Biddulph subscribed to the view that divine favour 'was not without its conditions'. He wrote that the fall of Constantinople 'after it had remained under the dominion of the Christians 1198 yeares' was the result of 'God purposing to punish the people for their sins' and thus 'stirred up Mahomet... [Sultan Mehmed II] with an earnest desire to bring the Christians unto decay, and thereby augment his empire'.¹²² Biddulph thus deployed providential reasoning to show that the rise and fall of the Byzantine and Ottoman

¹¹⁹ Biddulph, *Travels*, pp. 19-23.

¹²⁰ Walsham, *Providence*, p. 12; Mears, 'Public Worship and Political Participation', pp. 6-7.

¹²¹ Walsham, *Providence*, p. 12. On the role of Scriptural miracles in validating contemporary prodigious events, see Lorraine Daston, 'Marvellous Facts and Miraculous Evidence in Early Modern Europe', *Critical Inquiry*, 18 (1991), pp. 93-124 (pp. 106, 113, 122-3).

¹²² Boruchoff, 'Piety, Patriotism', p. 815; Biddulph, *Travels*, pp. 19-23.

empires were in keeping with God's 'programme for history' and were not 'hasty improvisations' but merely indications of His 'secret' will which went beyond human understanding or that which had been 'revealed' in Scripture.¹²³

Special providence – embodied in the sacking – demonstrated the active presence of the Christian deity in terrestrial affairs, affirming that Protestants should not count their chickens before they have hatched. Biddulph's use of general providence, in the claims that Christians would one day topple the Ottoman Empire, reinforced their divinely favoured status. Just as the Christian Byzantines had risen and fallen, so would their Muslim successors. Biddulph is confident of this since 'hitherto' Daniel's prophecy 'had proved to be true'.¹²⁴ Biddulph's reading of history relies upon prophetic traditions from Scripture, demonstrating his belief in the literal truth of the Bible both as history and prophecy. Such providential reasoning was, Walsham suggests, an important area of 'intersection and contact' between Puritan and non-Puritan culture.¹²⁵

Biddulph's history of the rise and fall of Christian Constantinople thus engages with widespread discourses about Scripture and prophecy in early modern England. He uses providential logic to situate the Ottoman Empire within a divinely ordained history that presaged the eventual victory of Christianity.¹²⁶ Drawing on providential discourses that were familiar to contemporaries, Biddulph saw 'the emergence of Islam as part of a divinely ordained, apocalyptic scheme of history'. Matar has suggested that there is evidence that Biddulph employed 'Muslim eschatology [to] secure... the victory of Christ over Muhammad'. Within this historical scheme, both MacLean and Matar claim, 'is an emergent ideology of progress in which the story of the past merely confirmed Anglo-Protestants in the sense of their own godly superiority: pro-Israelite, but

¹²³ Walsham, *Providence*, pp. 12-13.

¹²⁴ Biddulph, *Travels*, p. 47.

¹²⁵ Walsham, 'Godly and Popular Culture', pp. 282-6, esp. p. 282.

¹²⁶ Biddulph, *Travels*, sigs. G3r-G4v; MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 112-13.

anti-Jewish, pro-Arab but anti-Saracen, pro-Roman but anti-Catholic'.¹²⁷

This is a compelling claim yet it overlooks Biddulph's observation that past Christian defeats were equally the result of the Christian God's judgement. Biddulph invoked a moral deity who ensured that the moral laxity of Eastern Orthodox Christianity was punished, within a Protestant paradigm that was confident that a cleaned-up version of Protestantism would eventually triumph. Biddulph's uses of general and special providence are less triumphalist than they may at first appear. After all, he argues that the rise of the Ottoman Empire was a result of the Christian God punishing the flawed beliefs and sinful nature of the previous Orthodox Christian regime, emphasising that Christians must earn divine favour if they wished to ensure fulfilment of the prophecy and overthrow the Ottoman Empire.

In both travellers' accounts, these rises and falls appear to be cyclical. Both texts reference an alleged Turkish prophecy that claimed that their 'Empire' had been 'gotten by Mahomet [Mehmed II], so by another of that name Mahomet it shall be lost againe'. Biddulph noted that a similar pattern was discernible in the 'lamentable losse' of the city to the Turks. Biddulph records that Constantinople was 'set up by Constantine, the sonne of St. Helene (whom some report to have beene an Englishwoman borne at Cholchester)' then was 'by another Constantine, sonne of another Helene, taken, sacked, and brought into the hands of the Turks'.¹²⁸ Blount provided a very similar narrative, though his interpretation of prophetic discourses was diametrically opposed to Biddulph's.¹²⁹

Blount wrote about Islam from a very different religious perspective and claimed to advocate a more neutral 'understanding' of Islam. Yet Blount's account is as tied up with English Protestant debates as Biddulph's. This is apparent in his reading of an alleged Ottoman prophecy concerning the future fall of Islam. Blount recounts an 'old prophecy' attributed to Mahomet claiming that 'their Emperour should winne the red

¹²⁷ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 55-6; Matar, *Islam in Britain*, pp. 154-5.

¹²⁸ Biddulph, *Travels*, pp. 23-4; Blount, *Journey*, pp. 81-2; MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, p. 76.

¹²⁹ Blount, *Journey*, pp. 1-4.

apple, and in the seventh year after, if they did not defend themselves bravely, the Christians should overcome them'. Blount attributed this legend to a Turkish priest, who helpfully went on to explain that 'the red apple... was Constantinople, though some (quoth he) hold it to be Rome'. Blount 'entreat[ed] him to tell me, how much time was contained in those yeares', and was told that some believed that 'each yeare... [was] limited by the age of Mahomet'. Unlike Biddulph, Blount denied the literal truth of the priest's claims. He asserted that 'a State's preservation' partly depends on the perceived 'proximity of danger' as 'apprehension of danger causes vigilance'. Therefore, 'this prophet, to make the Turkes vigilant against the Christian, threatens them' in such a way that their defeat is 'not so inevitable, but that [by] valor [they] may resist'.¹³⁰ Blount doubted the truth of this prophecy and emphasised the political potency of such ideas.

It is true that Blount does not explicitly argue that Christian beliefs are superior: he suggests that 'all religious beliefs' are 'subject to the criticism that they appeal to passionate ignorance rather than rational understanding'.¹³¹ That said, he echoes many elements of Biddulph's history of Constantinople, including the aforementioned prophetic traditions. However, his emphasis is squarely on their strategic value rather than their literal truth.¹³² Like Biddulph, Blount also believed that the Ottoman Empire, just as the Byzantine and Roman before it, would inevitably collapse.¹³³ His sceptical interpretation of the apple prophecy implies a sceptical view of the reality of providential logic, and with it the interventionist Christian deity articulated by Biddulph. In Blount's view, 'all heathenish gods are used like puppets' and allow non-Christian potentates manipulate their peoples with prophecy. These comments were, as we have seen, politically relevant to the growing religious crises of

¹³⁰ Blount, *Journey*, pp. 81-2. For a later prophecy concerning red apples and the end of Ottoman rule in the eastern Mediterranean, see Molly Greene, *A Shared World: Christians and Muslims in the Early Modern Mediterranean* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000), pp. 206-9. Greene documents a Cretan song that anticipates Christian independence from Ottoman rule and uses similar imagery.

¹³¹ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, p. 169.

¹³² Blount, *Journey*, pp. 81-2.

¹³³ Blount, *Journey*, p. 3.

the 1630s in England as secessionist elements within the English church faced off against overbearing monarchical authority.¹³⁴ Blount's cynicism about prophecy again demonstrates the sceptical bent of his analysis, a point reinforced in his son's final work. In *The Oracles of Reason* (1693), Charles published 'the Latin text of 'a Discourse of Sir H. B.'s *De Anima*', which had been composed by his father three years before his death. His son asserted that this 'undigested heap' of his father's thoughts demonstrated that scepticism exceeded all other branches of philosophy.¹³⁵ Scepticism clearly informed Blount's motivations for travel and his criticisms of religious hierarchies. Yet, as we have seen, this scepticism was more complicated than merely a station on the road to the deism and radical sentiments of later generations. Blount's version of Mahomet was sceptical of prophetic traditions, yet this view was not divorced from existing providentially inspired narratives, such as those put forward by Biddulph.

Conclusion

Biddulph and Blount's contrasting confessional outlooks indicate how some of the polarities within English debates about providence played out amongst Levantine travellers. By acknowledging travel writing's contribution to Protestant religious debates, we gain a greater awareness of the religious content and context of such texts. Like many of their contemporaries, both were concerned with Turkish military might. Biddulph tied this into a providential tale, in which God tolerated the rise of Islam to punish the heterodox Christianity of both Byzantines and Catholics. Blount suggested that such prophecies had a Machiavellian function in order to maintain Ottoman political authority. Whereas Biddulph pinned responsibility for the perceived heresy of Islam on the Devil, Blount was more circumspect. He considered Islam to be a false

¹³⁴ Blount, *Journey*, pp. 79-80; MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 168-9.

¹³⁵ Charles Blount, *Great Is Diana of the Ephesians: Or The Original of Idolatry, Together With the Politick Institutions of the Gentiles' Sacrifices* (London, 1680); Redwood, 'Charles Blount', p. 491; MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, p. 83, citing Charles Blount, *The Oracles of Reason...* (London, 1693), pp. 152, 155.

religion that prevented the people from gaining an understanding of Christian truths, yet he did not believe it had diabolical origins. However, he did believe that Islam was fundamentally harmful to the propagation of learning. Blount's concern that worship in Arabic perpetrated the concealment of true religion demonstrates that he had some conception of true religion, likely Protestant in character. Whilst indebted to English Protestant religious norms, Blount also raised questions that were pertinent to the state of religion in England at the time. Blount's confessional identity, which at times hints at sceptical ideas – most particularly his view that Mahomet had deemed miracles and other accoutrements of religious worship unnecessary – is complicated by his concern that Christians are forced to convert, and by his biting remarks about Islamic charity.¹³⁶ His criticisms of religious ceremonies reinforce the anticlerical strain in his writing. Furthermore, Blount's text suggests that, like Du Ryer, he may be occluding opinions that are more controversial.¹³⁷ That said, it would be an exaggeration to suggest Blount explicitly sets out a critique of revealed religion despite his cynical view of providentialism, miracles and religious ceremonies. His wider concerns, including concerns about conversion of churches into mosques and the concealment of true religion, demonstrate that his account of Mahomet's faith was indebted to contemporary Protestant orthodoxies.

Key differences between Biddulph and Blount's accounts can be attributed to their differing religious opinions. Biddulph's relied upon Scriptural understandings of revelation and divine providence and produced an oppositional account of Islam in a style later developed by Prideaux. In Biddulph's view, Christians' favoured status is contingent upon their adherence to biblically sanctioned religious doctrines and practices. Biddulph's literal reading of Scripture necessitates an interventionist deity familiar to mainstream English political and religious

¹³⁶ Biddulph, *Travels*, p. 46; Blount, *Journey*, pp. 28, 77, 87.

¹³⁷ Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qur'an*, pp. 64-5; Hudson, *English Deism*, pp. 57-78; Wayne Hudson, 'Atheism and Deism Demythologized', in *Atheism and Deism Revalued: Heterodox Religious Identities in Britain, 1650-1800*, ed. by Jeffrey R. Wigelsworth, Wayne Hudson, and Diego Lucci (Farnham: Ashgate, 2014), pp. 13-24 (pp. 19-22).

debates. When combined with Biddulph's precisarian reputation, and his interest in the betterment of English morals and religious practices, it is evident that Puritan or radical forms of Protestantism informed his travel writing.¹³⁸ In contrast, Blount articulated a contrary position that identified parallels between the civil and ecclesiastical organisation of Christianity and Islam. Blount's *Journey* is a hybrid work with links to both the thoroughly providential interpretation of Biddulph and later works within the tradition of comparative religion.

Both men drew on eyewitness experiences alongside biblical and Classical sources to explain the rise of the Great Turk and his empire. Likewise, both existed within complex networks of exchange that circulated across cultural, linguistic and religious boundaries.¹³⁹ They made very different choices in how they represented Muslims' beliefs to domestic audiences, yet both fall squarely within the generic conventions of early modern travel writing.¹⁴⁰ Their texts draw upon competing European depictions of Mahomet. By placing their accounts side by side, we have seen how wider religious issues influenced contemporary travel reports. MacLean has suggested that 'theological differences with Islam and the Ottomans' did not define early modern representations.¹⁴¹ Yet, as we have seen, religious issues could be influential. Medieval and early modern English religious culture drew upon a variety of different versions of Mahomet. Undoubtedly, David Blanks' pithy summary that 'representations are representations' is accurate. By unpacking the particular content and context of individual representations, and by placing travel texts in the wider cultural context of their construction, we can gain a deeper understanding of particular early modern English representations of Islam.¹⁴²

The transnational turn has highlighted interconnections across religious and political frontiers, inaugurating a new kind of history that is

¹³⁸ Killeen, 'Chastising with Scorpions', pp. 491-3.

¹³⁹ Ghobrial, *Whispers of Cities*, pp. 87-8.

¹⁴⁰ Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', pp. 171-4.

¹⁴¹ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, p. xiv.

¹⁴² Blanks, 'Western Views of Islam', p. 38; Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 21-9, 56-67, 262-9.

not afraid to acknowledge the complex and contradictory nature of intercultural encounters and their subsequent representations on both sides.¹⁴³ This chapter has shown how inclusionary and exclusionary conceptions of Mahomet's faith were reinforced and challenged by travel experiences and encounters with other societies. These texts were as indebted to Christian constructions of Mahomet as they were to actual encounters with Islam and Muslims. Consequently, Mahomet's faith could be construed in various different ways as similar or different to Christianity. In the next two chapters, we shall see how ideas surrounding apostasy and witchcraft informed travel writing, and how moral censure operated against both the peoples subject to travellers' gaze and traveller writers themselves.

¹⁴³ Nabil Matar, 'The Question of Occidentalism in Early Modern Morocco', in *Postcolonial Moves: Medieval through Modern*, ed. by Patricia Clare Ingham and Michelle R. Warren (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003), pp. 153-72 (pp. 154-5). On Islamic representations of Europe, see Anouar Majid, *Unveiling Traditions: Postcolonial Islam in a Polycentric World* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2000); Mohamad Tavakoli-Targhi, *Refashioning Iran: Orientalism, Occidentalism and Historiography* (Normal: Palgrave Macmillan, 2001), pp. 18-22, 31-4; Ning Wang, 'Orientalism and Occidentalism', *New Literary History*, 28.1 (1997), pp. 57-67; Nabil Matar, 'Arab Views of Europeans, 1578-1727: The Western Mediterranean', in *Re-Orienting the Renaissance: Cultural Exchanges with the East*, ed. by Gerald MacLean (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 126-47; Gerald MacLean and Nabil Matar, *Britain and the Islamic World, 1558-1713* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011).

Chapter 4

Slavery, Apostasy and Conversion: Negotiating Religious Identity in Joseph Pitts' *True and Faithful Account of the Religion and Manners of the Mahometans* (1704)

I was very much concerned for one of our Countrymen who had endur'd many years of slavery, and after he was ransom'd... voluntarily and without the least force used towards him, became a Mahometan.

Joseph Pitts, *Religion and Manners of the Mahometans* (1704), p. 314.

Following his capture by Algerian pirates in 1678, Joseph Pitts was enslaved in Algiers for sixteen years and served three different masters.¹ He was one of the first Englishmen to perform the pilgrimage to Mecca and write at length about his experiences.² He also suffered numerous beatings and was violently compelled to convert to Islam. In so doing, he denied Christ's divinity and committed apostasy, a serious moral offence for a seventeenth-century Protestant.³ In examining how Pitts portrays this act, and his depiction of the Muslim faith with which he became intimately

¹ Joseph Pitts, 'A True and Faithful Account of the Religion and Manners of the Mohametans...' in *Piracy, Slavery and Redemption: Barbary Captivity Narratives from Early Modern England*, ed. by Daniel J. Viktus (New York: Columbia University Press, 2001), pp. 218-340 (p. 314). Pitts' narrative was originally published at Exeter in 1704. On slaves experiences in the Ottoman Empire and elsewhere in the Mediterranean world, see Géza Dávid and Pál Fodor, *Ransom Slavery Along the Ottoman Borders: Early Fifteenth-Early Eighteenth Centuries* (Leiden: Brill, 2007); D. Philips Jr., 'Slavery in the Atlantic Islands and the Early Modern Spanish Atlantic World', in *The Cambridge World History of Slavery*, ed. by David Eltis and Stanley L. Engerman (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2011), III, pp. 325-249; Ehud R. Toledano, 'Enslavement in the Ottoman Empire in the Early Modern Period', in *The Cambridge World History of Slavery*, ed. by David Eltis and Stanley L. Engerman (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2011), III, pp. 25-46; Selim Deringil, *Conversion and Apostasy in the Late Ottoman Empire* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012); Iris Origo, 'The Domestic Enemy: The Eastern Slaves in Tuscany in the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries', *Speculum*, 30 (1955), pp. 321-66.

² Stephen H. Gregg, *Empire and Identity: An Eighteenth Century Sourcebook* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 45-6; Daniel Viktus, *Piracy, Slavery and Redemption: Barbary Captivity Narratives from Early Modern England*, ed. by Daniel J. Viktus, (New York: Columbia University Press, 2001), pp. 218-19. On contemporary captives, cosmopolitanism, the lure and threat of Islam, see Linda Colley, *Captives: Britain, Empire and the World, 1600-1850* (London: Jonathan Cape, 2002), pp. 73-98, 99-134. On eighteenth-century captivity narratives, see Paul Baepler, 'Introduction', in *White Slaves, African Masters: An Anthology of American Barbary Captivity Narratives*, ed. by Paul Baepler (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1999), pp. 1-58.

³ Kenneth Sheppard, 'Atheism, Apostasy, and the Afterlives of Francis Spira in Early Modern England', *The Seventeenth Century*, 27 (2012), pp. 410-34 (p. 415).

familiar, we can learn more about Pitts' personal religious identity and how a relatively humble late seventeenth-century Devonshire mariner understood both his apostasy and the recovery of his Christian faith.

This chapter investigates Pitts' religious identity and examines how he depicts his conversion experience, how he negotiates his status as an apostate, and how he retains his status as an English Christian. Pitts' narrative – of a Muslim convert protagonist living out his days amongst Christians and Muslims in North Africa – provides further evidence of the multicultural Mediterranean world identified in recent scholarship. By focusing on a convert's experiences, it examines religious identities in this multicultural space that are far removed from the social world of the English ambassador to the Ottoman Porte, William Trumbull. John-Paul Ghobrial's latest work charts how Trumbull established his ambassadorial status and negotiated his way through court and public life in Istanbul. Like Trumbull, Pitts was connected to networks of information, trade and exchange across the Mediterranean world. Ghobrial foregrounds everyday interactions and suggests that sociability of various kinds held together 'connected circles of people across the Mediterranean world of the seventeenth century'.⁴

This chapter builds upon Ghobrial and Molly Greene's discussion of the complexity of Mediterranean social, economic and cultural interactions. Ghobrial and Greene have challenged the views of Fernand Braudel and Henri Pirenne's influential models for Mediterranean history. Greene and Ghobrial move beyond either dealing with a pan-Mediterranean world (as in Braudel's version), or exaggerating 'cultural contest and confrontation' between Muslims and Christians (as in Pirenne's). For Ghobrial, information, exchange and everyday sociability connect cities from Cairo and Istanbul to Paris and London. Greene follows Andrew Hess and focuses on a subdivision of the Mediterranean world, emphasising the distinctiveness of the eastern Mediterranean in her study of Ottoman-

⁴ John-Paul Ghobrial, *The Whispers of Cities: Information Flow in Istanbul, London and Paris in the Age of William Trumbull* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), pp. 14-15.

controlled Crete. Greene shows that Ottoman-ruled Christian communities did not replicate the patterns of conflict found in Pirenne's approach.⁵ This chapter, therefore, situates Pitts within the multicultural world of North Africa and explores how he mediates cross-cultural conflict, co-existence and co-operation.

In some respects, the Ottoman Empire and its North African dependencies were 'remarkably integrationist toward converts in comparison to its Christian contemporaries'. Tijana Krstić has observed that converts were often preferred to born Muslims for positions in the Ottoman government.⁶ These opportunities were beyond a domestic slave of Pitts' standing in Algiers, though his fortunes did improve substantially following his manumission. He enlisted in the 'Turkish' army and served in attacks on the Spanish city of Ceuta whilst living 'amicably' with his third master.⁷ For some individuals, post-emancipation life with the sponsorship of a wealthy master or *patroon* was preferable to returning to England.⁸ Nabil Matar has broadened our understanding of the experience of slavery in North Africa, though it should be remembered that the experiences of those English captives who never returned are atypical of English representations of life in Muslim lands. Pitts' extended stay as a free servant in North Africa supports Matar's contention that the

⁵ Ghobrial, *Whispers of Cities*, p. 7, 82-8; Molly Greene, *A Shared World: Christians and Muslims in the Early Modern Mediterranean* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000), pp. 2-3. See also Andrew Hess, *The Forgotten Frontier: A History of the Sixteenth Century Ibero-African Frontier* (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1978), p. 2.

⁶ Tijana Krstić, *Contested Conversion to Islam: Narratives of Religious Change in the Early Modern Ottoman Empire* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2011), pp. 1-2; Tijana Krstić, 'Conversion and Converts to Islam in Ottoman Historiography of the Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries', in *Writing History at the Ottoman Court: Editing the Past, Fashioning the Future*, ed. by H. Erdem Çipa and Emine Fetvacı (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2013), pp. 58-79 (pp. 60-73).

⁷ Anita McConnell, 'Pitts, Joseph', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2010, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/22345>> [accessed 3 December 2013].

⁸ On Ottoman slavery more generally, see Toledano, 'Enslavement in the Ottoman Empire', pp. 25-46. On conversion to Islam in the modern era and comparison with earlier centuries, see Deringil, *Conversion and Apostasy*, pp. 191-6.

Mediterranean offered opportunities to English mariners that were unavailable back home.⁹

Daniel Viktus suggests that in writing his account, Pitts offers his ‘testimony... against Islam’ in recompense for his self-confessed apostasy: Pitts provides new information about Islam in return for reacceptance into the English, Christian community. Viktus asserts that Pitts’ contemporaries in England would see him as ‘contaminated by his intimate and extended contact with the Islamic other’. It is certainly true that Pitts ‘undertook the labour of writing... “to do some good” and desired to “make some manner... of restitution and reparation for my past defection”’. To support this, Viktus identifies certain omissions from Pitt’s reminiscence, particularly concerning his post-emancipation life in Algiers. However, the re-acceptance argument does not easily square with Pitts’ depiction of his own agency. To say that Pitts merely offers information on Islam in ‘recompense’ for his apostasy overlooks the significance of this crime in Pitts’ text.¹⁰ Pitts’ avowed desire to return home and his decision to write extensively about his experiences – and to combine ethnography and personal recollection in recounting his apostasy – suggest that Pitts’ Christian beliefs remained a significant part of his identity. In this chapter, therefore, I situate Pitts’ confessional text in the wider context of early modern writing about apostasy, atheism, conversion and religious faith more generally.

The epigraph that opened this chapter attests to contemporary concern about the immortal souls of those Englishmen who freely converted. Matar has done valuable work in revealing these hidden stories against a background of polemical anti-Islamic writing.¹¹ That said, there

⁹ Nabil Matar, *Turks, Moors, and Englishmen in the Age of Discovery* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), pp. 40, 43, 47-8, 52, 55-63, 77-81, 85, 88-93, 95.

¹⁰ Viktus, *Piracy, Slavery and Redemption*, pp. 218-19; Pitts, ‘Religion and Manners of the Mohammedans’, pp. 220-4, 307.

¹¹ Nabil Matar, *Islam in Britain 1558-1665* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998); Nabil Matar, *Britain and Barbary, 1589-1689* (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2005); Nabil Matar, ‘Arab Views of Europeans, 1578-1727: The Western Mediterranean’, in *Re-Orienting the Renaissance: Cultural Exchanges with the East*, ed. by Gerald MacLean (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 126-47; Nabil Matar, ‘Britons and Muslims in the Early Modern Period: From Prejudice to (a Theory Of) Toleration’, in *Anti-Muslim Prejudice:*

were no published Anglophone accounts of the opportunities available to Barbary captives and those who reneged and never returned were principally represented as traitors or apostates.¹² If we wish to understand the range of English representations of Islam and Muslims, we must not privilege these minority sources over popular slavery narratives that painted a far less positive picture of life in North Africa.¹³ Pitts' account explores the moral quandary that some converts experienced between their religious obligations as Christians and temporal betterment. Pitts negotiates these competing pressures whilst also reinforcing a recurring trope in repatriated slaves' narratives by motivating his readers to be deeply concerned for the souls of those captives who converted.¹⁴

What follows is divided into two parts. Part one examines how Pitts represents his conversion and the ways in which he separates his Christian self from his performance of apostasy. Pitts' text, which combines biographical, ethnographic and religious elements, provides some insight into his self-presentation and confessional identity. Part two explores contemporary conversion literature and writing about apostasy, irreligion and atheism. By connecting Pitt's experiences with a nexus of beliefs around religious conversion, unbelief and apostasy, the wider context of Pitt's crime becomes apparent. By unpacking the ambiguities of Pitts' writing about his experiences, we can come to a fuller understanding of how conversion to Islam figured in wider debates about religious offences.

Joseph Pitts and 'the Apostate'

Pitts drew upon narratives of suffering found in contemporary literature

Past and Present, ed. by Maleiha Malik (London and New York: Routledge, 2010), pp. 7-25; Nabil Matar, 'Introduction', in *Piracy, Slavery and Redemption: Barbary Captivity Narratives from Early Modern England*, by Daniel J. Viktus (New York: Columbia University Press, 2001), pp. 1-52.

¹² Gerald MacLean and Nabil Matar, *Britain and the Islamic World, 1558-1713* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), pp. 1-12. I am grateful to attendees at the panel on Intercultural Encounters: Money, Religion and Empire during the Social History Society Conference at Leeds University 2013, in which a number of papers focused on the untapped potential of Ottoman archives.

¹³ Matar, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen*, pp. 71-82.

¹⁴ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', pp. 314, 346.

about how the Almighty tested the faith of his subjects.¹⁵ He also sought to separate himself from the Muslim community in which he became integrated. However, in so doing, he acknowledged intimate contact with the Islamic other and confessed to having performed apostasy by converting to Islam and participating in a number of Muslim rites, including the Hajj. Pitts' narrative is a late example of a popular form of writing by returned captives, which generally documented their suffering, resistance to efforts to convert them and providential delivery back to England. Matar catalogues 22 such texts, all of which share some or most of these features.¹⁶ In Matar's analysis, these texts demonstrate a prevalent 'anxiety about returning captives' since being 'among Muslims' meant that 'the English/British/ Christian identity' had been violated because captives sacrificed their immortal souls for temporal betterment.¹⁷

Religion was a key marker of individual identity in the early modern period, though Christian and Muslim societies responded to other religious identities in markedly different ways.¹⁸ Greene observes that, up until the early eighteenth century, many Ottoman territories in the eastern Mediterranean were not 'polarised along religious lines'.¹⁹ Conversion between Christian and Muslim faiths was common. Both Christian states and the Ottoman Empire had specific legal and ritual processes marked these personal confessional transformations. Natalie Rothman has

¹⁵ Alec Ryrie, *Being Protestant in Reformation Britain* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), pp. 33-9, 40-2.

¹⁶ Matar, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen*, pp. 181-3.

¹⁷ Matar, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen*, pp. 72-3.

¹⁸ Eric R. Dursteler, *Venetians in Constantinople: Nation, Identity and Coexistence in the Early Modern Mediterranean* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2006), pp. 104-5.

¹⁹ Greene, *Shared World*, pp. 7, 11; Deringli, *Conversion and Apostasy*, pp. 1-4, citing Paschalis Kitromilides, "'Imagined Communities' and the Origin of the National Question in the Balkans", in *Enlightenment, Nationalism, Orthodoxy: Studies in the Culture and Political Thought of South-Eastern Europe*, ed. by Paschalis Kitromilides (Aldershot: Ashgate, 1994), pp. 149-52; Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (London and New York: Verso, 1983); Eric Hobsbawm, *Nations and Nationalism since 1780*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990). On travel writing and central European borders and identities, see Larry Wolff, 'The Traveller's View of Central Europe: Gradual Transitions and Degrees of Difference in European Borderlands', in *Shatterzone of Empires: Coexistence and Violence in the German, Habsburg, Russian and Ottoman Borderlands*, ed. by Omar Bartov and Eric D. Weitz (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2013), pp. 23-42 (pp. 25-32).

examined how inquisitorial expectations informed depositions by repatriated Islamic converts who wished to return to Christianity.²⁰ Converts and their local patrons 'operated within specific institutional constraints that shaped their social relations, subjectivities, and, indeed, the very category of "convert"'. 'Localised assumptions about juridical subjecthood and its transformative potential' limited individual converts' 'ability to renegotiate' their inclusion or exclusion from the Venetian, Catholic polity.²¹

England did not have comparable institutions policing returnees' confessional outlook. Unlike Venice, England did not share substantial land or sea borders with the Ottoman Empire. Although sailors and captives of other faiths became commonplace in the largest ports, the oceanic border between England and North Africa was significantly less porous. Venetian institutions existed to police conversions and prevent repeat conversions, a problem which English authorities did not seem to face.²² This can be contrasted with the anxieties about recusancy and conversion to Catholicism, which quickly became an integral part of Protestant travel writing about mainland Europe.²³ Protestantism, the Black Legend of inquisitorial cruelty, and also perhaps England's adversarial rather than inquisitorial legal system are all possible factors that militated against the evolution of similar institutional attempts to police repatriated individuals' confessional identities.²⁴ Depositions were taken, but these related less to

²⁰ E. Natalie Rothman, *Brokering Empire: Trans-Imperial Subjects between Venice and Istanbul* (New York: Cornell University Press, 2012), pp. 30-2, 109-13.

²¹ Rothman, *Brokering Empire*, pp. 122-3.

²² On Venetian strategies against repeated conversion, see Rothman, *Brokering Empire*, p. 114.

²³ Alison Shell, *Catholicism, Controversy and the English Literary Imagination, 1558-1660* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), p. 173.

²⁴ On the Black Legend of Spanish depravity and English criticisms of the Inquisition, see Rafael Veléz, 'Imperial Moments: The Cromwellian Black Legend', in *The Construction of the Other in Early Modern Britain: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis*, ed. by Rüdiger Ahrens (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter, 2013), pp. 205-15; William S. Maltby, *The Black Legend in England: The Development of Anti-Spanish Sentiment, 1558-1660* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1971); Andrew Hadfield, *Literature, Travel and Colonial Writing In The English Renaissance, 1545-1625* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1998), esp. p. 70; Francisco J. Borge, "'We (upon Peril of My Life) Shall Make the Spaniard Ridiculous to All Europe": Richard Hakluyt's "Discourse" of Spain', in *Richard Hakluyt and Travel Writing in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 167-76. On strangers and non-Christian converts in

‘the captive’s personal experience’ and instead served to ‘document the number and whereabouts of other captives’, and provide naval or military intelligence on North African fortifications.²⁵ Therefore, our principal source material for English returnees are the published narratives of those who chose to publicise their experiences on their return. Though England had fewer formal processes for dealing with returned captives, concern about captives spiritual wellbeing persisted throughout the seventeenth century.²⁶

Published narratives by returned Barbary slaves generally described stoic ‘hardened Britons who had endured years of slavery’, deprivation and ill-treatment. Such narratives were spread both orally and via published texts. They also informed petitioners who argued for the Crown to intervene on behalf of English captives.²⁷ In some respects, published narratives were as standardised as the Venetian inquisitorial records since they served to tell a particular story about the author’s experiences whilst justifying the ransomed or escaped slave’s place within the religious norms of English, Protestant society. Pitts’ text is interesting because, unlike all previous English captivity narratives, he appears to confess to having converted to Islam. Pitts’ representation of his Muslim persona can tell us much about how Pitts wished to represent his own religious identity, and how he believed his Christian faith had been challenged through the ordeal of captivity.

In order to justify the significant lapse of his Christian faith, Pitts seeks to demonstrate that his Muslim identity was aberrant: a public performance that concealed his maintenance of Christianity. Through providential reasoning, theological arguments, appeals to Protestant religious authority and the testimony of English merchants who knew him in Algiers, Pitts is able to admit his apparent conversion but also minimise

the English capital, see Jacob Selwood, *Diversity and Difference in Early Modern London* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2010), pp. 87-188.

²⁵ Matar, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen*, p. 74.

²⁶ Matar, ‘Introduction’, pp. 4-6, 12-23, 32-40.

²⁷ Nabil Matar, ‘Wives, Captive Husbands and Turks: The First Women Petitioners in Caroline England’, *Explorations in Renaissance Culture*, 23 (1997), pp. 111-29.

his culpability for his apostasy. Below, I explore each of these methods in more detail and show how Pitts' potentially transgressive Muslim identity is contained and denied. We first examine the manner in which providential thinking informs Pitts' reportage of his enslavement. Secondly, I show how Pitts engaged with Christian theology in order to affirm his Protestant beliefs. Thirdly, we explore how he describes his forced conversion in order to demonstrate that he did not abandon Christ willingly. Finally, I show how Pitts deployed the testimony of various respected authorities to show the insincerity of his Muslim beliefs and his private Christian identity.

I: Providentialism in Slavery Texts

Appeals to divine providence were common in early modern captivity narratives. Indeed, Pitts makes less use of providentialism than earlier returned slaves. This is apparent when we look at the accounts of Thomas Saunders and Edward Webbe. Saunders' pamphlet account of his enslavement in Tangiers in 1584 describes how the Christian God protected the faithful Saunders by rescuing him from 'wilde Moores' when lost in the desert.²⁸ Additionally, a significant part of Saunders' narrative concerns an altercation with a *renegado* [former Christian] who repeatedly stole a Bible belonging to the shipmaster's mate. Since Saunders was proficient in the local language, he went to intercede with the king's treasurer. The official informed him that it was 'the will of God' that they had captured the English ship.²⁹ Saunders makes no comment on the Muslim treasurer's assertion that God was responsible for their capture,

²⁸ Thomas Saunders, 'Voyage made to Tripolis in Barbarie in the Yeere 1583...' in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), v, pp. 292-311 (pp. 298-9, 303). On Saunders' text and Hakluyt's editorial, see Julia Schleck, 'Forming the Captivity of Thomas Saunders: Hakluyt's Editorial Practices and Their Ideological Effects', in *Richard Hakluyt and Travel Writing in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 129-38.

²⁹ Saunders, 'Voyage made to Tripolis', p. 298.

indicating the pervasive belief in specific providence, the view that God intervened in everyday affairs.³⁰

Saunders also claimed that other *renegadoes* who stole from the ship were subject to divine punishment. When the Bible-pilfering *renegado* protested that he had not had ‘the value of a pin of the spoyle of the ship’, Saunders reports that this ‘was the better for him’ since ‘there was none, neither Christian, nor Turke that tooke the value of a peniworth of our goods from us, but perished both bodie and goods within seventeen months following’.³¹ This divinely ordained punishment reinforced the Christian God’s protection of his subjects in adversity, and the perils of theft and conversion alike. Saunders asserted that all events, from the capture of the ship (as suggested by the kings’ treasurer) to the deaths of all those who stole from the English ship, were divinely appointed. Both positive and negative events are, in Saunders’ eyes, accorded an equal providential status and derive from divine will. As Darren Oldridge has noted, ‘the obscure mechanism of providence’ often meant that ‘apparently dreadful events’ – such as Saunders’ capture – had ‘benevolent purposes’ in the divinely ordained plan.³² Saunders exults at the fact that ‘the wonderfull workes of God’ have been shown to punish ‘such infidels, blasphemers, whoremasters and renegade Christians’: the implication being that his faith was strengthened by these deliverances. His narrative serves to demonstrate that God’s judgement applies equally to Christians and Muslims.³³ The manner in which the Christian deity’s beneficence is known to Saunders reflects Arthur Dent’s description of ‘God’s dealings with His servants’. The Elizabethan populariser of Protestant doctrine explained the ‘counter-intuitive operation of providence’ as part of God’s

³⁰ For a more expansive discussion of contemporary providential beliefs, see Chapter 3 above at pp. 99-101.

³¹ Saunders, ‘Voyage made to Tripolis’, pp. 298-9, 304-11.

³² Darren Oldridge, ‘Light from Darkness: The Problem of Evil in Early Modern England’, *The Seventeenth Century*, 27 (2012), pp. 389-409 (p. 392).

³³ Saunders, ‘Voyage made to Tripolis’, pp. 298, 300, 301.

hidden plan for His people: 'in every painful experience... there were two elements: the immediate distress and a concealed but greater benefit'.³⁴

Providential protection was also invoked by those threatened by conversion to Islam, as in the somewhat romanticised narrative of Edward Webbe. Webbe claimed that conversion was a way to alleviate the suffering of captivity, albeit at a high cost for the soul. He reported that 'the Turke by all meanes possible' sought to 'perswade me and other my fellow Christians... to forsake Christ, to deny him, and to believe in their God Mahomet'. Webbe believed that, if he had converted, he would have received 'wonderfull preferment... and have lived in as great felicitie as any lord in that countrie'. However, he stoutly refused to commit apostasy, saying that 'I utterly denied their request' despite being 'grievously beaten naked for my labour, and reviled in most detestable sort'. Indeed, he claims that all Christian prisoners suffered 'torment of conscience' which 'grieved me and all true Christians to the very soule'. In a passage reminiscent of Saunders' predestinarian narrative, Webbe thanks God for 'he gave me strength to abide with patience these crosses'.³⁵ Both these narratives tropes are found in contemporary providential literature. They suggest that the Christian deity's love and benevolence for the faithful manifested itself in those occasions where He permitted temporary triumphs of their adversities.³⁶ These slavery narratives recounted how providential protection was extended to Christian prisoners subject to physical suffering and spiritual temptation. Physically, Saunders is deprived of

³⁴ Oldridge, 'Problem of Evil', pp. 392-3; Arthur Dent, *The Plaine Mans Path-Way to Heaven...* (London, 1601), pp. 117-18.

³⁵ Edward Webbe, *The Rare and Most Wonderful Things Which Edw. Webbe an Englishman Borne, Hath Seene and Passed in His Troublesome Travailes...* (London, 1590), sig. C3v. See also Matar, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen*, pp. 75-6; Jonathan P. A. Sell, *Rhetoric and Wonder in English Travel Writing, 1560-1613* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2006), pp. 1-2. On other romanticised slavery narratives, see Gerald MacLean, *The Rise of Oriental Travel: English Visitors to the Ottoman Empire, 1580-1720* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), pp. 177-220; Viktus, *Piracy, Slavery and Redemption*, p. 97; John Rawlins, *The Famous and Wonderfull Recoverie of a Ship of Bristoll, Called the Exchange, from the Turkish Pirates of Argier...* (London, 1622).

³⁶ Oldridge, 'Problem of Evil', pp. 294-6.

liberty and forced to labour. Spiritually, Webbe is tempted by promises of 'wonderfull preferment' should he renounce his Christianity.³⁷

These two earlier narratives provide an interesting contrast to Pitts' experience. After all, Pitts' apostasy took him beyond temptation: he converted to Islam and denied the divinity of Christ by 'holding up the forefinger of the right hand and pronouncing these words: "*La illahi ill alla Mahomet resullallah*"'.³⁸ Pitts' text contradicted Webbe's claim that converts received great 'preferment' and reinforces Saunders' depiction of the harsh punishment of *renegadoes* suspected of reverting to Christianity. In the latter narrative, the Bible-pilfering *renegado* received 'an hundred bastonadoes' as punishment for the repeated theft of the Bible and the king's treasurer reviled him, stating 'thou villaine, wilt thou turn to Christianitie again?'³⁹

Unlike the unnamed *renegado*, Pitts did 'turn to Christianitie' again and wrote about his experiences. He is thus able to assert that the 'principal' purpose of his book's 'publication [was] giving glory to God' since His 'gracious providence' released him from his slavery and brought him back to his native country. Pitts' continued captivity was tacitly in the hands of the Almighty also. This is apparent in Pitts' account of several failed attempts to release him, including an attempt by English consul at Tunis to purchase Pitts from his second *patroon* before he converted. When his master rejected the consul's offer, Pitts 'burst into tears' and gave 'a thousand thanks for' his 'generous goodwill' in offering the equivalent of 'sixty pounds sterling'. Advising Pitts, the consul 'laid his hand on my head and bid me serve God' and 'have patience... [until] providence might work some other way'.⁴⁰ In this way, Pitts' imprisonment and eventual release are tied into a providential narrative.

³⁷ Webbe, *Rare and Most Wonderful Things*, sig. C3v.

³⁸ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', p. 312. Pitts writes elsewhere that his spelling of Arabic is 'aimed at the vulgar sound of the word' rather than at correct spelling and that he 'can't pretend to a perfection in the Arabic language' (pp. 221-2).

³⁹ Saunders, 'Voyage made to Tripolis', p. 298.

⁴⁰ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', pp. 309-10. The consul, Thomas Baker, also promised Pitts that 'as soon as he returned to England he would prefer a petition to the

Pitts' use of providential narratives is relatively limited compared with Saunders or Webbe's accounts. Indeed, in admitting his conversion, Pitts is at pains to evade the charge of voluntarily apostatising. He reports that, on several occasions, despite 'large offers', he refused to convert, claiming that 'I can truly appeal to Almighty God that it was not out of choice, or inclination, or persuasion, or any temporal advantage that I became a Mahometan, for I abhorred the thoughts of such an apostasy'.⁴¹ Pitts implores his countrymen 'to take a view of the zeal of those poor blind Mahometans' since 'they are so strict in their false worship, it must needs be to reprimand to Christians who are so remiss in the true'.⁴² Pitts became a more fervent Christian since his experiences as a convert compelled him to reflect on his lax faith before his apostasy. This informs his practical suggestion to parents who want their children to avoid Pitts' fate – he ran away to see the world at the age of fourteen – to 'instruct them well in the principles of Christianity' 'in their 'tender years'.⁴³ Here, Pitts uses his apostasy as a warning to others, an interesting intervention given that many early modern Christian apologists, including Francis Bacon, John Child and Richard Sault, claimed the moral character of the apostate was a key motivating force behind their rejection of Christianity.⁴⁴ In this regard, whilst Pitts is not saying – as Bernard Mandeville would some twenty years later – that an atheist might be 'a moral Man', he is at least suggesting that someone who had *apparently* committed apostasy might have moral insight into the importance of solid Christian instruction.⁴⁵ Most

king for me'. On petitions for Barbary slaves, see Matar, 'Wives, Captive Husbands and Turks', pp. 111-29.

⁴¹ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', p. 310.

⁴² Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 223.

⁴³ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 224. For discussion of youthful Turkish captives in contemporary drama and the emotional consequences of their capture, see Chantelle Thauvette, 'Masculinity and Turkish Captivity in Swetnam, the Woman-Hater', *Studies in English Literature 1500-1900*, 52 (2012), pp. 425-45 (pp. 428-32); Matar, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen*, pp. 73-4.

⁴⁴ Sheppard, 'Atheism, Apostasy', pp. 412-13, 415, 418-19, 424, 426.

⁴⁵ Sheppard, 'Atheism, Apostasy', p. 413, citing Bernard Mandeville, *Free Thoughts on Religion, the Church and National Happiness* (London, 1720), p. 4; Pierre Bayle, *Pensées diverses sur la comète de 1680* (Rotterdam, 1683), I, p. 435.

pertinently for Pitts' disavowal of his apostasy, he makes this claim within a providential – and religiously mainstream – narrative.⁴⁶

II: Pitts' Knowledge of Christianity

The second way in which Pitts affirms his Christian identity is through discussion of Islamic and Christian doctrines, for instance in his comparison of Turkish faithfulness and Christian laxity. Pitts contends that the Turkish religion should serve to have a 'direful influence on us' so 'that all professing Christianity' should 'entirely believe the doctrine of our blessed Saviour and sincerely conform their practice to their belief'.⁴⁷ His comparison is reminiscent of the words of Devereux Spratt, an English cleric who was enslaved at Algiers in the early 1640s. Spratt found his fellow Christian captives unresponsive to his preaching and found comfort when his *patroon* 'uttered these comfortable words, "God is great!"' Spratt recalled later that it 'strengthened [his] faith in God' to have 'this Turkish Mahometan teach me, who am a Christian, my duty of faith and dependence upon God'.⁴⁸ This ecumenical view only went so far though: Spratt and Pitts concurred that the Turks' worship was incorrect. However, this did not stop them from deriving spiritual lessons from conversations with individual Muslims. Whilst Spratt's faith is validated by his exchange with his master, Pitts recounts his own experience in part as a cautionary example to others.

This moral imperative undermines Viktus' view that Pitts simply wishes to offer 'intelligence' as a 'form of compensation' for his apostasy.⁴⁹ Rather, what Pitts is doing is demonstrating his Christian knowledge in order to escape the charge of voluntarily apostatising. This is apparent as elements of his ethnographic description of Islam drew explicit comparisons with Catholicism, thereby allowing Pitts to assert his

⁴⁶ Alexandra Walsham, *Providence in Early Modern England* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), pp. 1-5, 22-3, 124-5, 172-4, 325.

⁴⁷ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 224.

⁴⁸ Matar, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen*, p. 80, citing T. A. B. Spratt, *Travels and Researches in Crete* 2 vols. (Amsterdam: Adolf M. Hakkert, 1865, 1984), I, p. 386.

⁴⁹ Viktus, *Piracy Slavery and Redemption*, p. 219.

Protestant identity. These ideas can be traced back to Martin Luther through many subsequent generations of Protestant writers.⁵⁰ Pitts draws a comparison 'between the papacy and the Turk... and their [respective] tyrannies'.⁵¹ Pitts' anti-Catholic rhetoric may have also had resonances for English religious affairs as well. Pitts returned to England during the 1690s. At the same time, William III's regime was establishing the limits of religious toleration, restricting the political and religious autonomy of Catholics who were depicted as traitors ensnared by a hostile, foreign power.⁵²

Pitts' criticisms of Catholicism aligned him with the post-Glorious Revolution political and religious mainstream by conflating his observations of Islamic doctrine with that of the equally foreign Catholic church. For example, Pitts claimed that 'the great and fundamental article... which chiefly makes them Mussulmans or believers' consists of the saying of a certain phrase 'but once in a man's whole life'. After which, 'all his debaucheries and sins (they say) shall be forgiven, and he shall assuredly get to Heaven, though for some time he may lie in hell till his sins are burnt away'. Pitts remarked that 'this is very much like the Romish Purgatory', and goes on to suggest that it 'is an invention to get money' and 'a plain cheat, to any observing man'. However, he noted that 'the Turks [don't] make the use the Papists do of it'.⁵³ Similarly, during his description of the Hajj, Pitts claimed that the pilgrims' 'superstitiously esteem' their 'holy

⁵⁰ Carina L. Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy in Sixteenth-Century Europe: The Ottomans and Mexicans* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), pp. 62, 64-5. On other negative stereotypes, see Christopher Elwood, 'A Singular Example of the Wrath of God: The Use of Sodom in Sixteenth-Century Exegesis', *The Harvard Theological Review*, 98 (2005), pp. 67-93 (p. 92); Thomas S. Kidd, '"Is It Worse to Follow Mahomet than the Devil?" Early American Uses of Islam', *Church History*, 72 (2003), pp. 766-90 (pp. 766-7).

⁵¹ Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, p. 65.

⁵² Colin Haydon, 'Parliament and Popery in England, 1700-1780', *Parliamentary History*, 19 (2000), pp. 49-63 (pp. 49-51). Scott Sowerby, 'Opposition to Anti-Popery in Restoration England', *Journal of British Studies*, 51 (2012), pp. 26-49 (pp. 46-8); Leticia Álvarez Recio, 'The Politicization of the Pulpit in Seventeenth-Century England: Thanksgiving Sermons after the Duke of Monmouth's Rebellion', *Miscelánea*, 40 (2009), pp. 13-23 (pp. 13-14); Scott Sowerby, 'Forgetting the Repealers: Religious Toleration and Historical Amnesia in Late Stuart England', *Past and Present*, 215 (2012), pp. 85-123 (pp. 85-91). On the long afterlife of anti-popery, see Edmund Rogers, '1688 and 1888: Victorian Society and the Bicentenary of the Glorious Revolution', *Journal of British Studies*, 50 (2012), pp. 892-916.

⁵³ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 257.

water... as the papists do'.⁵⁴ For Pitts, Islamic and Catholic practices in these regards were equally reprehensible. However, he contended that the Catholic custom of requiring indulgences for the souls of the dead was less fair than equivalent Islamic donations for the deceased. By asserting that there is not 'one place of Scripture which in the sense of any rational man can be supposed to prove it',⁵⁵ Pitts reassured readers that he is a well-informed Protestant man who has read and understood his Bible correctly.⁵⁶

This is reinforced when he describes how his Muslim neighbours viewed Christians. He notes that they thought that non-Muslims would not be saved as 'without believing in Mohamet there is no salvation'.⁵⁷ Like English travellers dating back to before Richard Hakluyt, Pitts reported that Muslims held anti-Trinitarian views that were considered heretical.⁵⁸ Pitts notes that they consider the 'doctrine of the blessed Trinity to be the greatest blasphemy imaginable' and proceeded to take other, unnamed travellers and accounts of Turkish religion to task since 'some have asserted that they believe the Old and the New Testament, the Law and the Gospel'. Pitts repudiates this view, claiming that although 'tis true they do pick some things out of it [the Law] but yet not in any due order or as it is there set down'.⁵⁹ Pitts claimed that the Turks received a corrupted version of biblical texts that they used to justify their erroneous doctrines.⁶⁰

Pitts' view of Islamic doctrine served to highlight his own confessional orthodoxy, whilst also tacitly conflating Muslim and Catholic

⁵⁴ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', p. 283.

⁵⁵ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 257. On indulgences and the formation of Protestant doctrine, see David C. Fink, 'Was There a "Reformation Doctrine of Justification"?', *Harvard Theological Review*, 103.2 (2010), pp. 205-35.

⁵⁶ Pitts' Bible-reading during his captivity is explored in the present chapter below at pp. 136-40.

⁵⁷ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', pp. 257-8.

⁵⁸ On this tradition in late medieval and early modern travel writing, see Theresa Tinkle, 'God's Chosen Peoples: Christians and Jews in the Book of John Mandeville', *The Journal of English and Germanic Philology*, 113 (2014), pp. 443-71; David R. Blanks, 'Western Views of Islam in the Premodern Period: A Brief History of Past Approaches', in *Western Views of Islam in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Perception of Other*, ed. by Michael Frassetto and David R. Blanks (New York: St Martin's Press, 1999), pp. 1-54.

⁵⁹ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 258.

⁶⁰ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', pp. 259-61.

errors.⁶¹ Like Spratt, he used the fervour of his Muslim neighbours to encourage greater devotion in his Christian readers. For Pitts, Muslims' zealous yet false faith served as a warning to lax Christians. By discussing his own apostasy, Pitts sets himself up as a recovering sinner and, therefore, also as a moral exemplar to his readers.⁶² Thus, whilst his prefatory comments applaud the diligence of Turkish worship, his ethnographic observations of Muslim perceptions provide an opportunity for him to demonstrate his Protestant orthodoxy. Exposure to Muslim practices reaffirmed and strengthened his appreciation and understanding of the Protestant faith he had been forced to reject. This theological wrangling aside, by his own admission, Pitts had converted to Islam, albeit under duress, which brings us to the third way in which Pitts asserts his Protestant identity.

III: Coercive Conversion

By admitting to having committed apostasy, Pitts' ethnographic descriptions of life in Algiers are given added weight. In his depiction of that act, and of his subsequent life as a Muslim, Pitts avers that he remained privately a Christian. By establishing a distinction between the violence of his own forced conversion and the ease with which some of his countrymen 'voluntarily' converted, he reinforces the veracity of his own account both in spite and because of the violence he suffered. In so doing, he distinguishes himself from those lax Christians whose faith was weak and denied Christ 'without the least force' being applied to them.⁶³ Thus, Pitts sets out to show that he did not convert for temporal gains.

⁶¹ On positive and negative comparisons by Muslim and Christian authors, see Matar, 'Britons and Muslims in the Early Modern Period', pp. 7-25; Matar, *Britain and Barbary*, pp. 13-15, 26-7, 34-7; Caroline Finkel, "'The Treacherous Cleverness of Hindsight': Myths of Ottoman Decay", in *Re-Orienting the Renaissance: Cultural Exchanges with the East*, ed. by Gerald MacLean (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 148-74; Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 262-9.

⁶² Helen Smith, 'Metaphor, Cure and Conversion in Early Modern England', *Renaissance Quarterly*, 67.2 (2014), pp. 472-502 (pp. 477, 487-91); Oldridge, 'Problem of Evil', pp. 397-404.

⁶³ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 314.

Like Webbe, the Elizabethan galley slave, Pitts details 'the barbarous cruelties and tortures [that] he suffered' before he converted. However, he asserts that his life was not greatly bettered by conversion: he still lived a 'miserable life' and endured 'beatings' since his *patroon* suspected he was 'no true Mussulman' and was 'far from zealous in the Mahometan way'. Contrary to Webbe's claim that converts 'lived in as great felicitie as any lord in that countrie', Pitts states that following his conversion, he remained living with 'my fellow slaves... in a stable' and eating 'very coarse' victuals.⁶⁴ Despite this, he denounces the complaints of 'many who have been slaves in the Turks' country' who 'relate something very affecting' concerning the 'tortures' they suffered. Pitts observes that 'they never, or at least very seldom, use any such severities'. He asserts the truth of his own testimony by explaining why he was 'so unmercifully dealt with' and became 'qualified... to give such an exact description... of their religion'.⁶⁵ Pitts reveals as much as he occludes. He rejects as 'a very false report' those slaves who allege that 'the extremest tortures' were used to compel them to convert, then goes straight on to claim that he himself was 'unmercifully dealt with'.⁶⁶ Whilst acknowledging the use of force in his specific case, he denies that the practice is commonplace. Pitts highlights his extraordinary suffering, in part, to justify his apparent apostasy.

Pitts describes his different relationships with his three different masters in order to contextualise his forced conversion. He describes how the first would exercise 'barbarous cruelty upon me' and 'press me to turn Mussulman'. Pitts only remained with him for two or three months before being 'sold again... out of the possession of that inhuman wretch'. In contrast, his second *patroon* was more lenient and, in spite of the failed attempt by the English consul at Tangier to purchase Pitts, he remained both a slave and a Christian. His description of his conversion dwells heavily on the coercion, physical and emotional, that he suffered. He had

⁶⁴ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 318; Webbe, *Rare and Most Wonderful Things*, sig. C3v.

⁶⁵ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', pp. 305-6.

⁶⁶ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 314.

his head shaved and 'Turkish garb' forced on him by his master's younger brother. It transpires that his master's brother had convinced his master, 'Handsome Ibrahim', that 'proselyting him [Pitts] would be some sort of a proper atonement for his past impieties' as a 'profligate and debauched man' and alleged murderer.⁶⁷

Before his conversion, Pitts was beaten. He describes how he 'roared out to feel the pain of his cruel strokes'. He 'endured this merciless usage so long, till I was ready to faint and die under it' whilst his assailant remained 'as mad and implacable as ever'. Pitts also records fearing that 'I should be everlastingly damned if I complied with his request' and protested that although 'he had changed my habit... he could never change my heart'. During the assault, Pitts regularly 'beseeched him... to hold his hand' and 'held him in suspense three or four times' before, having gained some respite, refusing 'to convert. 'At last, when he realised 'his cruelty towards me [was] insatiable', he converted.⁶⁸ Pitts also claimed that his tormentor denied his wish to convert on his own conscience. He told his master that he would 'pray to God and if I found any better reasons suggested to my mind (than that I then had), to turn by the next morning'. However, his tormentor had 'not patience to stay till morning' and so Pitts 'turn[ed] Mohametan', and immediately received restitution of care, a fire and rest from the beating he had received.⁶⁹

Pitts' asserts that he had no choice but to convert. As both his humanising caricature of his second master as 'Honest Ibrahim' and his insistence that his experience was unusually violent suggests, Pitts did not

⁶⁷ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', pp. 307-11 (esp. pp. 308, 311). Pitts observes that his master's nickname was common amongst the Turks, and notes the parallel with English examples, such as 'Exeter John' or 'Blind Hugh'.

⁶⁸ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 312.

⁶⁹ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 312. The trope of Muslim untrustworthiness is found in a range of documents, including the following; Anon, 'A Brief Relation of the Siege and Taking of the Citie of Rhodes...' in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), v, pp. 1-60. For analysis of this trope, see José Ruiz Mas, 'Another Brick in the Wall of the Turkish Black Legend: The Fall of Nicosia and Its Impact in English Literature', in *The Construction of the Other in Early Modern Britain: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis*, ed. by Rüdiger Ahrens (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter, 2013), pp. 189-204.

view all Muslims as equally malevolent.⁷⁰ Pitts openly acknowledges that his third *patroon* treated him 'like a Father' and had 'great kindness for me'. He also describes friendships with other converts and Christians, though his relations with the former group were at times fraught. However, in order to affirm his Christian identity, it was intolerable for him to acknowledge himself as a Muslim.⁷¹ Note that Pitts describes his third master's emotional attachment *to him*, and is silent on if or whether it was reciprocated.

Pitts' renewed Christian faith reinforces this: since he argues that the Turkish religion was illegitimate, he cannot acknowledge he ever embraced his identity as an apostate or his new identity as a Muslim. He abstracts himself as merely the 'apostate' when describing the ceremonies attended on new converts. In contrast, the beating that compelled him to convert is recounted in the first person. Within a page, Pitts moves on to report the ceremonies attended to 'the new convert (as they call him)' neutrally and in the third person.⁷² Pitts' Christian identity is effectively effaced when he 'turns'. Additionally, Pitts distinguishes between the very basic rites afforded those, like him, who became 'Mahometan by compulsion' and the more complex ceremonies provided for those who 'voluntarily turn[ed] from his religion to the Mahometan'.⁷³ In so doing, he implies that other Muslims viewed his conversion as partial and incomplete, reinforced by instances when his master criticised him for being lax in his Muslim faith.⁷⁴ Pitts distances himself from his apostate self and limits the extent of his apostasy by arguing that actual Muslims did not wholly accept his conversion.

⁷⁰ Matar, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen*, p.79.

⁷¹ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', pp. 323-4, 326.

⁷² Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', p. 312. This parallels Porter's analysis of Anthony Munday's performance of penance at the English College in Rome: Chloe Porter, "'I Satt and Saw': Negotiating the Gaze in the Travel Writings of Anthony Munday and Thomas Dallam', *Journeys*, 14 (2013), pp. 50-68, (pp. 52-3). On the ubiquity of critiques of Catholicism by English visitors to Rome, see Shell, *Catholicism, Controversy*, p. 173.

⁷³ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', pp. 312-13.

⁷⁴ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 318.

Pitts' conversion is never presented as a complete adoption of Islam. The events of Pitts' conversion are part of the wider providential schema of his narrative. By being forced to renounce his Christianity, Pitts connects his apostasy with wider early modern notions that the Almighty tested the faith of his subjects.⁷⁵ Pitts' conversion is thus a providential test in which the peculiar cruelty of his second *patroon's* brother tests Pitts' faith. By dwelling on the author's repeated refusal to convert, Pitts emphasises how unwilling he was to perform the act. Through the violence of his conversion, Pitts is shown to suffer great physical and emotional trauma before relenting. By asserting that his conversion was improper since it was made under duress, Pitts is able to argue that he remained a Christian. This is reinforced by the circumstantial evidence that Pitts cites, including the testimony of English merchants, to demonstrate that he never truly converted.

IV: Pitts' Christian Heart

Pitts' insistence that he secretly remained a Christian is apparent in his secret correspondence with his father during his captivity. He claims that, prior to his conversion, he 'writ a letter to my father giving him an account of my misfortune' via various intermediaries, including other English slaves and an English mariner named George Taylor of Lymson. Several of these letters are reproduced in his narrative, and whilst it is possible that they are merely literary devices, it is undeniable that they lend verisimilitude to Pitts' description of his spiritual suffering. Pitts reinforces their veracity by giving details of how he received the letters, and situating them at particular points in his narrative both before and immediately following his conversion.⁷⁶

In his letters, he denies his apostasy and asserts his identity as a Christian. Concerning his conversion, he writes that he must give his father 'a perfect account of the whole matter... lest he should have thought that

⁷⁵ Oldridge, 'Problem of Evil', pp. 399, 401.

⁷⁶ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 314.

what I did, I did voluntarily and without any coercion'. Pitts assured his father that he was 'forced' by 'cruelty that was exercised upon me to turn Turk yet I was really a Christian in my heart'.⁷⁷ Pitts claimed that he could not publicly identify as a Christian by counterpointing his father's charitable reaction with that of his second master. When Pitts rebuked his *patroon* and claimed to still be a Christian following his conversion, his master threatened to 'have a great fire made' and 'therein burn thee immediately' if Pitts made such a claim in his presence again. In contrast, although his father is dismayed to hear that his son had converted, he writes that 'Peter had not so many temptations to deny his Lord and master as those thou hast'. Pitts worries about 'the danger [his] poor soul was in' as a consequence of words spoken following 'extreme torture and out of love of love to a temporal life'. Pitts acknowledges his guilt, though this is ameliorated by his father's comments. His father assures him that although his son had 'denied thy Redeemer' his actions were forgivable given the 'strength of thy temptations'. Pitts' father maintains that his son had sinned 'with thy mouth' and not with his 'heart' and 'contrary to [his] conscience'. He advised that 'notwithstanding this thy miscarriage', 'if thou dost keep close to God', his soul would still be salvageable.⁷⁸

Alongside his father's reassurance, Pitts' apparent apostasy is nullified in a number of other ways. Firstly, Pitts writes that his father's letter 'comforted me with telling me that he had been with several ministers who unanimously concurred in their opinion that I had not sinned the unpardonable sin'.⁷⁹ Secondly, his conversion is questioned in the eyes of 'one Mr. Butler, a physician in Algier who lived with the consul' who aided Pitts' eventual escape:

Once, Mr. Butler came in while I was reading the Bible. He seemed to wonder at it and asked me why I did so (for he knew that persons under my circumstances would not venture to do so). I answered

⁷⁷ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', pp. 314-16.

⁷⁸ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', pp. 314-17.

⁷⁹ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', p. 316.

him I had no hatred to the Bible, which was the most I durst say for that time.⁸⁰

Pitts claims that he sought to expand his knowledge of Christianity even following his apparent conversion, further nullifying his performance of apostasy. The testimony of his father, the authority of clergymen, and that of respectable Christian merchants who knew him in Algiers all provide evidence of Pitts' Christian identity. These appeals to the authority and respectability of ambassadors, merchants and other well-to-do Englishmen also serve to add credit both to Pitts and his account of his confessional troubles.⁸¹

In one letter, his father claims that God himself would have no choice but to pardon his son. This claim reinforces Pitts' providentialist interpretation of his capture and enslavement. He attributes the circumstances of his eventual return to England to the 'providence' of God.⁸² Pitts' crime, like that of the unnamed *renegado* described by Saunders, was both a matter of personal conscience and public reputation. Pitts establishes that, regardless of his speech and actions as a convert – let's not forget that he was one of the first Europeans to perform the Hajj and write about it – he had never truly abandoned Christ. Pitts' text demonstrates the 'deep immersion' of slaves in their adopted Muslim culture. Carina L. Johnson has shown how Eastern European captives were also intimately involved within the households of their masters, even though asserting their identities as Christians separated them from the community in which they lived and worked.⁸³ North African society had

⁸⁰ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', p. 327. On other occasions, Pitts informs English seamen of his predicament and asks them to convey messages to his family, for example, on pp. 295-6.

⁸¹ On social status and authority in verifying the claims made in travel texts more generally, see Julia Schleck, "'Plain Broad Narratives of Substantial Facts': Credibility, Narrative and Hakluyt's Principall Navigations', *Renaissance Quarterly*, 59 (2006), pp. 768-94. William Biddulph, the puritanical Levant Company chaplain, also used encounters with other travellers to verify the truth of his claims, though he is more antagonistic toward rival English traveller writers: MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 108-10.

⁸² Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 326.

⁸³ Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy*, pp. 57, 86. For an instance of an absconding English slave being able to 'pass' as a Muslim, see Thomas Phelps, 'The True Account of the Captivity of Thomas

very different racial and religious criteria for identifying Others, and Pitts' text explores the psychological experience of existing in another society and faith.⁸⁴ His ethnography is validated by his admission of apostasy yet he is able to provide testimony that affirms his Christian beliefs. Thus, Pitts insists that his forced conversion did not negate his identification as a Christian, even though his public articulation of that identity was constrained. It seems he is less concerned with providing 'a valid form of compensation for his crime' than Viktus suggested.⁸⁵ Rather, Pitts' purpose in writing is to assert his own Christian identity *throughout* the narrative.

Pitts' conversion enabled him to offer an accurate commentary on Islamic religion, but he frames this material in the context of forced conversion, and thus of Christian suffering. He seeks to make a virtue of his performance of apostasy since it has allowed him to know 'everything in use among them' relating to conversion and the practice of their religion.⁸⁶ In his description of the Hajj, he debunks untruths concerning Islamic worship. He remarks that, after his return, he had 'seen many books' about Algiers and Islam 'which are stuffed with very great mistakes'. Pitts sets himself up as an authoritative source for knowledge about Islam.⁸⁷ In his ethnography, Pitts is a measured observer. He contradicts Muslim reports that the *Zamzam* well water which pilgrims consume as part of the Hajj tasted as 'sweet as milk' whilst also refuting the report of French traveller Jean Thevenot that 'the waters of Mecca are bitter'. Pitts described the

Phelps', in *Piracy, Slavery and Redemption: Barbary Captivity Narratives from Early Modern England*, ed. by Daniel Viktus (New York: Columbia University Press, 2001), pp. 195-217 (p. 209). Originally published at London in 1685.

⁸⁴ Matar, 'Introduction', p. 39. On Muslim perceptions of conversion, see Rothman, *Brokering Empire*, pp. 96-7; Krstić, 'Conversion and Converts', pp. 60-73. On North African representations of Europeans (Occidentalism) three valuable introductory works are Ning Wang, 'Orientalism and Occidentalism', *New Literary History*, 28.1 (1997), pp. 57-67; Anouar Majid, *Unveiling Traditions: Postcolonial Islam in a Polycentric World* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2000); Nabil Matar, 'The Question of Occidentalism in Early Modern Morocco', in *Postcolonial Moves: Medieval through Modern*, ed. by Patricia Clare Ingham and Michelle R. Warren (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003), pp. 153-72 (pp. 153-5).

⁸⁵ Viktus, *Piracy, Slavery and Redemption*, p. 219.

⁸⁶ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 314.

⁸⁷ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', pp. 320-2. Compare chapter 9 (pp. 309-26) with chapter 7 (pp. 261-91): the former deals in graphic terms with his conversion and repeatedly restates his innocence from the charge of apostasy, whilst the latter provides a detailed, insider account of Muslims devotions during the Hajj.

miraculous water as tasting 'somewhat brackish', but affirmed that 'the waters of Mecca... [are] as sweet and good as any others'.⁸⁸ This ethnographic detachment contrasts sharply with the biographical elements of his narrative, especially the violence of his conversion discussed earlier. His impersonal ethnographic descriptions of the Hajj, of rituals for new converts and his exposition of perceived flaws in Islamic doctrine are facilitated by the admission of being compelled to convert. Through the testimony of unnamed English religious authorities and named English merchants who knew him during his time in Algiers, Pitts assured his readers of the distress that his performance of apostasy engendered and insists that he remained a Christian 'in his heart'.⁸⁹

Pitts' narrative is one of the most fascinating early modern texts about Islam, largely because of its balance between ethnographic observation and description of the anguish endured by the author's Christian persona following his apostasy. The relationship between Pitts, his Muslim co-worshippers and his averred Christian faith are mediated by the partial elision of Pitts' Islamic self from the text. The detailed description of Islamic doctrines, particularly through his comparisons of Islam with Catholicism, provided a further means of asserting his Protestantism. Pitts' text allows us to explore the private confessional world of one English slave in Algiers who converted to Islam. Furthermore, Pitts' authorship – and the construction of his narrative – demonstrates the complex relationship between reportage and rhetoric in such a text. Pitts' Christian identity is not restored through publication. Rather, he insists that his Protestantism was not compromised but strengthened by the trials of enslavement. By omitting his converted self from his text, Pitts asserts that he was never an active participant in a non-Christian religion.⁹⁰ In the second part of this chapter, Pitts' narrative will be situated in light of wider debates about apostasy and religious conversion in the late seventeenth century.

⁸⁸ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', pp. 283-4.

⁸⁹ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', pp. 315-16.

⁹⁰ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', pp. 258-9.

Conversion and Belief in Early Modern England

Pitts' depiction of his apparent apostasy sits at the intersection of contemporary debates about apostasy, religious conversion, loss of religion and related religious offences in early modern England. Since the early seventeenth century, both Puritan and Arminian writers had affirmed the possibility of apostasy for believing Christians, though the depth and sincerity of apostates' prior faith was the subject of some debate.⁹¹

Following the splintering of confessional identities occasioned by the Reformation, the publication of conversion narratives became an integral part of interdenominational conflict.⁹² During the last decades of the seventeenth century, England also witnessed heated debates about religious toleration both of Catholics and Protestant nonconformists.⁹³

Pitts' text thus connected with three elements of wider religious culture: anxieties about the loss of belief, the nature of conversion and the extent of toleration. There is a certain overlap here since the suggestion that one's religious opponents were atheists who lacked any faith at all was one of the most prominent rhetorical weapons for Christians of all stripes.⁹⁴

We begin by considering how Pitts' account of his captivity contributed to debates about atheism and unbelief. David Wootton began a recent surge in research into early modern atheism by showing that contemporaries 'talked about "atheism" ... [as] a real intellectual possibility' as well as using it as a rhetorical device to criticise opponents. In Pitts' lifetime, the accusation of atheism was increasingly attached to proponents of deism or natural religion.⁹⁵ However, we should not assume that terms like deist or atheist were 'essentialist', or that they should 'necessarily be associated with *single philosophical or religious identities*'. Rather, we must

⁹¹ Smith, 'Metaphor, Cure and Conversion', pp. 474-6, 496-8.

⁹² Smith, 'Metaphor, Cure and Conversion', p. 476.

⁹³ Sowerby, 'Opposition to Anti-Popery', pp. 26-49.

⁹⁴ Michael Hunter, 'The Problem of "Atheism" in Early Modern England', *Transactions of Royal Historical Society*, 35 (1985), pp. 135-57 (pp. 135, 137-8); Leif Dixon, 'William Perkins, "Atheisme", and the Crises of England's Long Reformation', *Journal of British Studies*, 50 (2012), pp. 790-812 (pp. 791-2).

⁹⁵ David Wootton, 'Unbelief in Early Modern Europe', *History Workshop*, 20 (1985), 82-100 (p. 86); Hunter, 'Problem of Atheism', pp. 136, 156. *Emphases* in original.

be sensitive to the 'context' and 'lateral commitments' with which they are allied. In short, they were not merely 'stations on the path to irreligion'. The relationship between disbelief and unbelief was more complicated since ordinarily believing individuals also experienced a variety of doubts.⁹⁶

Alec Ryrie has recently explored the interior and emotional lives of those Christian individuals, particularly amongst Puritan communities, whose self-reflective faith led to doubts about their salvation, and thus the truth of Christian tenets.⁹⁷ Reflection on one's own salvation could contribute to such doubt, though didactic literature and biographical accounts of such spiritual travails tended to reassure readers of the efficacy of salvation in order to assuage their fears.⁹⁸ This is also tacitly true of Pitts' text: his faith is strengthened through the challenges of incarceration, slavery and apostasy. Pitts' actions cause him to experience doubt about his salvation, and his narrative emphasises his spiritual suffering as a consequence of this. This providential element is made explicit, as we have already seen, in his prefatory warning to parents to instruct their children well in Christian principles.⁹⁹ Pitts' spiritual anguish following his conversion and dogged assertion of his Christian beliefs chime with Ryrie's observations of the inner and emotional life of religious doubters.¹⁰⁰

⁹⁶ Wayne Hudson, 'Atheism and Deism Demythologized', in *Atheism and Deism Revalued: Heterodox Religious Identities in Britain, 1650-1800*, ed. by Jeffrey R. Wigelsworth, Wayne Hudson and Diego Lucci (Farnham: Ashgate, 2014), pp. 13-24 (pp. 13-14), see also pp. 14-19. *Emphases* in original.

⁹⁷ Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, pp. 239-58; Diane Willen, "'Communion of the Saints': Spiritual Reciprocity and the Godly Community in Early Modern England", *Albion: A Quarterly Journal Concerned with British Studies*, 27.1 (1995), pp. 19-41 (pp. 19-20, 23-6). Matthew Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet Muhammad in Early Modern English Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), p. 21. On spiritual autobiography in the earlier seventeenth century, see Robert Warren Daniel, "'Have a Little Book in Thy Conscience, and Write Therein': Writing the Puritan Conscience, 1600-1650", in *Sin and Salvation in Reformation England*, ed. by Jonathan Willis (Farnham: Ashgate, 2015), pp. 245-58, esp. pp. 246-55 which covers the importance of writing within everyday practices of spiritual autobiography.

⁹⁸ Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, pp. 102-7.

⁹⁹ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 224.

¹⁰⁰ Oldridge, 'Problem of Evil', pp. 400-4. I am also grateful to Professor Ryrie for an illuminating conversation on apostasy and unbelief following a recent paper which touched upon Protestant responses to the experience of doubt and unbelief: Alec Ryrie, 'Faith, Doubt

Atheism, or the absence of theistic belief, was closely allied to discussion of apostasy in the late seventeenth century.¹⁰¹ Both atheists and apostates 'symbolically embodied the inversion or dissolution of Christian order' by raising 'deeply troubling questions' for the Protestant status quo. By disputing or denying the 'rational' or 'natural' foundations of core Christian doctrines such as divine providence, creation *ex nihilo*, and the favoured status of the Judeo-Christian tradition, apostates and atheists raised doubts about the efficacy and necessity of contemporary religious principles more generally.¹⁰² For many contemporary readers, Pitts' apostasy symbolised a rejection of Christian order and obligations to worship the Christian deity.

Contemporary didactic literature concerning individuals who recanted Christianity in favour of deism, Hobbesian materialism or atheism focused on the 'state of apostate religious despair' experienced when they 'apostatized from Christianity'. Descriptions of apostates' moral character often highlighted their 'typical Christian educational upbringing'. In a similar vein, Pitts describes his youthful confidence and lacklustre Protestantism before his capture. However, unlike those apostates who were led astray by 'supposedly libertine atheist creeds' or freethinking 'scoffers', Pitts did not freely convert.¹⁰³ His description of the torture prior to his forced conversion serve as evidence that Pitts did not voluntarily abstain from Christianity. This can be contrasted with Sault's *The Second Spira* (1693), which describes how 'Spira', an unnamed English law student follows in the tradition of his namesake, the sixteenth-century Catholic-turned-Protestant-turned-apostate John Spira. He espoused atheist ideas having been tempted by a 'licentious life'. Kenneth Sheppard connects several late seventeenth-century 'Spira' texts with the 'heightened sense of unease generated by the Reformation dissolution of Christian unity' and 'Renaissance recirculation of disconcerting non-Christian arguments' from

and the Problem of "Atheism" in Early Modern Britain.', unpublished paper presented at the Society for Renaissance Studies Fourth Welsh Lecture, Cardiff University 26 March 2015.

¹⁰¹ Sheppard, 'Atheism, Apostasy', p. 410.

¹⁰² Sheppard, 'Atheism, Apostasy', pp. 417-19.

¹⁰³ Sheppard, 'Atheism, Apostasy', p. 419.

antiquity. These texts also depict the moral character and divinely ordained sufferings – even the suicide – of apostates and atheists. Sault’s narration of Spira’s story had ‘the same rhetorically Christian aims as anti-atheist confutation’.¹⁰⁴ Likewise, Pitts’ narrative treats Islam as apostasy: comparable to the anti-theist doctrines decried by Sault. Pitts’ description of the pangs of conscience he suffered following his conversion aligns with this genre of Spira texts, though unlike many early modern Spiras, Pitts rhetorically asserted that he had not voluntarily reneged from his Protestant faith.

Pitts’ narrative also differs from other early modern narratives of religious conversion. Often, early modern conversion narratives paired bodily and spiritual sickness and contrasted them with recovery of physical health and revelation of a new or altered set of beliefs. Converts’ published accounts reinforced this parallel with medical metaphors in which the convert goes from a state of ill faith and sickness to a newfound set of beliefs and a concomitant restoration or improvement in their physical health.¹⁰⁵ Pitts draws upon narratives of physical suffering common in wider conversion literature and goes on to beg for ‘God [to] be merciful to me a sinner’ before describing how he came to convert.¹⁰⁶ Pitts’ faith is repeatedly tested and only when his agency is restricted through unbearable beatings does he relent and convert. In this process, Pitts does not experience an inner spiritual transformation. When he receives physical care from his master following his torture and conversion, Pitts

¹⁰⁴ Sheppard, ‘Atheism, Apostasy’, pp. 419, 426, see also pp. 410, 415, 419-20, 424.

¹⁰⁵ Smith, ‘Metaphor, Cure and Conversion’, pp. 476-7; Michael Questier, *Conversion, Politics and Religion in England, 1580-1625* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), pp. 67, 192. Questier suggests that connections between spiritual and physical health were literary devices. Smith develops this by arguing that they reflected somatic experience. On conversion narratives more generally, see Phyllis Mack, *Heart Religion in the British Enlightenment: Gender and Emotion in Early Methodism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008); D. Bruce Hindmarsh, *The Evangelical Conversion Narrative: Spiritual Autobiography in Early Modern England* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008); Kathleen Lynch, *Protestant Autobiography in the Seventeenth-Century Anglophone World* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012).

¹⁰⁶ Smith, ‘Metaphor, Cure and Conversion’, pp. 473-8; Pitts, ‘Religion and Manner of the Mahometans’, p. 306.

describes this as merely a 'love... [of] a temporal life'.¹⁰⁷ In this regard, Pitts story inverted the tropes found in conversion narratives.

Contemporary interdenominational converts experienced suffering through illness or psychic disturbances. In contrast, Pitts' suffering is motivated by the cruelty of his *patroon's* brother who sought to proselytise him.¹⁰⁸ The commonplace othering of Muslims as cruel zealots is deployed in Pitts' narrative to reinforce his suffering as a Christian. Pitts literally swears he is a Christian whilst being beaten, a point underlined in his later worries about the state of his soul. Pitts' correspondence with his father also betrays the anxiety provoked by his commission of apostasy. Pitts excerpts a lengthy extract from one of his father's letters in which his father addresses his 'poor child', observing that his son had committed a 'horrid iniquity' yet reassures him that 'the door of grace and mercy is open for thee'. Pitts comments that despite the 'sorrowful reflections' which his father's letter provoked, it also 'administer[ed] great support and comfort' and so he would 'often go into some by-corner... of a garden to read it'.¹⁰⁹ Pitts' conversion had significant consequences for his religious identity that provoked a deeply emotional response, indicating that Pitts did indeed fear for the fate of his soul after his conversion. Can we simply say that Pitts' emotional response merely records the 'apostate' Pitts wishing to be reincorporated into the English, Christian community?¹¹⁰ I think not: unlike atheists and converts, Pitts vehemently avers that he never truly departed from that community. Pitts was a *renegado*, a Barbary slave and then freeman who adopted the garb, manners, religious practices and life of a Barbary Muslim yet maintained that he had not 'in his heart' committed the cardinal sin of apostasy.¹¹¹ Pitts' text is not a conversion narrative in the conventional sense outlined above: the protagonists' change of faith is incomplete and portrayed as a transgression. Rather,

¹⁰⁷ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', p. 314.

¹⁰⁸ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', p. 312. On the violence of Pitts' conversion, see the present chapter above at pp. 132-6.

¹⁰⁹ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', pp. 316-17.

¹¹⁰ Viktus, *Piracy, Slavery and Redemption*, pp. 218-19.

¹¹¹ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', pp. 315-16.

Pitts' text inverts some of the dominant tropes found in contemporary conversion literature.

It may be tempting to identify Pitts with those 'serial apostates' – men who, for various reasons, chopped and changed their confessional identity multiple times throughout their lives and often suffered pangs of conscience as a result.¹¹² Some of these conversions may have been politically expedient – and this is one possible reading of Pitts' account of his conversion. However, I do not think that Pitts should be counted amongst this minority cohort of controversialists whose fluid religious identities provoked contemporary condemnation.¹¹³ After all, Pitts' conversion was incomplete: although he performed all of the rites and obligations of a Muslim, he claims to have never become a 'thorough-paced Mahometan'.¹¹⁴ When attending the English doctor, Mr Butler, for a cure for his 'very sore eye', Butler requests that Pitts dine with him. Butler served him bacon to ascertain whether Pitts 'would eat swine's flesh', which was prohibited for Muslims. Even though Pitts refused the bacon, Butler suspected that he 'was no real Turk', a point reinforced when he witnessed Pitts reading from the Bible.¹¹⁵ Through these incidents, Pitts assuages any doubt that he ever stopped worrying about his obligations as a Christian and that his Christian neighbours acknowledged this. He was not a serial convert since he privately preserved his birth faith throughout his ordeals.

Having completed the Hajj with his third, kinder master, he was freed from slavery and 'entered into pay'. His third master treated him 'like a son', and Pitts admits that 'I wanted nothing with him: meat, drink,

¹¹² Sheppard, 'Atheism, Apostasy', pp. 413, 415, 424.

¹¹³ On dramatic representations of multiple conversions, see Holly Crawford Pickett, 'Dramatic Nostalgia and Spectacular Conversion in Dekker and Massinger's "The Virgin Martyr"', *Studies in English Literature, 1500-1900*, 49 (2009), pp. 437-62 (pp. 437-8, 440-5). On Barbary slaves' conversion and the ambiguities that they represented, see Thauvette, 'Masculinity and Turkish Captivity', pp. 430-1, 434-5. On resisting conversion and the anxiety provoked by the potentially fluid religious and social identities of central European Jewish communities, see Daniel Jütte, 'Trading in Secrets: Jews and the Early Modern Quest for Clandestine Knowledge', *Isis*, 103.4 (2012), pp. 668-86 (pp. 671-2).

¹¹⁴ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 318.

¹¹⁵ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 327.

clothes, and money, I had enough'. Regardless, he remained 'uneasy' about being a 'Mahometan' and told this to another slave, one James Grey, originally of Weymouth in Pitts' home county of Devon. Their previously close friendship turned sour when Pitts returned from Mecca to find that Grey had converted and become 'diligent in learning to read the Alcoran', being 'looked on as a zealot'. Grey reprimanded Pitts for his 'backwardness to go to mosque' and his 'intimacy with the neighbouring slaves', who were presumably unconverted.¹¹⁶ Despite these glimpses, Pitts distances himself from his Muslim identity throughout his text and tells us remarkably little about his life with his third master or as a free servant, though it is apparent that he did not immediately attempt to return to England upon his manumission. When Butler offered to assist his return to England, Pitts initially avoided the subject before eventually 'opening my sentiments to him'. Pitts admitted that 'I once little thought to be in this condition, and, while I was in it, was never in the least inclined to Mahometanism'.¹¹⁷ In this exchange, Pitts again portrays himself as a lapsed Christian rather than an active Muslim.

Pitts' text reflects broader questions about the relationship between Islam and Christianity in an era when questions of religious toleration, and the nature of religious faith itself, were hotly contested in English political, religious and philosophical debates.¹¹⁸ In this early Enlightenment context, Islam occupies a significant position. It was noted in the previous chapter that scholars of comparative religion made Islam 'a test case for monotheism'. The French exiles Jean Picart and Jean Frederic Bernard devoted an entire volume of their *Religious Ceremonies of the World* (1723)

¹¹⁶ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', pp. 323-4.

¹¹⁷ Pitts, 'Religion and Manners of the Mahometans', p. 327.

¹¹⁸ Sowerby, 'Opposition to Anti-Popery', p. 32-3, 40. On debates about the justification of Christian faith, see William J. Bulman, 'Enlightenment and Religious Politics in Restoration England', *History Compass*, 10/10 (2012), pp. 752-64; Wayne Hudson, *Enlightenment and Modernity: The English Deists and Reform* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2009); Jeffrey R. Wigelsworth, "'Their Grosser Degrees of Infidelity': Deists, Politics, Natural Philosophy, and the Power of God in Eighteenth-Century England" (unpublished PhD, University of Saskatchewan, 2005).

to it.¹¹⁹ Although Pitts' text was printed some decades before the English edition of Bernard's work, subsequent editions circulated contemporaneously and both works would go on to be excerpted in eighteenth- and nineteenth-century ethnography.¹²⁰ These contemporaneous but contrasting descriptions of Islam indicate the range of representations of that religion found in European ethnography during the first half of the eighteenth century. Unlike Bernard, Pitts was neither a scholar of comparative religion nor a religious radical. He set out to establish his own Protestant identity, and through doing so, endorses Protestant exceptionalism against the suggestion of parity with either improper Turkish or Catholic beliefs.¹²¹

In this regard, Wayne Hudson's recent research into the multiple social personae of early Enlightenment radicals provides a useful parallel. Hudson has asserted that contemporary radicals occupied multiple, often contradictory, social roles that dictated the manner in which they expressed or occluded potentially radical sentiments in published works.¹²² Pitts' multiple religious personae are partially concealed in his report of his slavery. His religious identity and spiritual wellbeing are intimately connected with the social identity of an orthodox Protestant. Although Pitts acknowledged having adopted multiple religious guises, he did not – as the early seventeenth-century Protestant preacher and traveller, William Lithgow, had done – take them on and off in jest.¹²³ Because of his enslavement, Pitts' Christian identity is repeatedly asserted in his narrative: despite being enslaved and forced to become a Muslim, Pitts hopes that he has not sinned sufficiently to be beyond redemption. On

¹¹⁹ Lynn Hunt, Margaret Jacob and Wijnand Mijnhardt, *The Book That Changed Europe: Picart and Bernard's Religious Ceremonies of the World* (Cambridge, MA and London: Harvard University Press, 2010), pp. 247-8.

¹²⁰ Viktus, *Piracy, Slavery and Redemption*, p. 219; Hunt et al, *Book that Changed Europe*, pp. 2-5.

¹²¹ See the present chapter above at pp. 129-32.

¹²² Wayne Hudson, *The English Deists: Studies in Early Enlightenment* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2009), pp. 3, 5-13, 18-2, 22-4.

¹²³ Linda McJannet, 'Purchas His Pruning: Refashioning the Ottomans in Seventeenth-Century Travel Narratives', *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 74.2 (2011), pp. 219-42 (p. 239), citing William Lithgow, *A Most Delectable, and True Discourse, of an Admired and Painefull Peregrination* (London, 1614), sigs. P3-P3v.

a rhetorical and personal level, Pitts' spiritual salvation is intimately linked to maintaining that he is a Protestant who has erred significantly but not fatally.

Viktus has pointed out that Pitts' identity as a free Muslim servant following his manumission and before his return home is almost entirely omitted from his account. Viktus maintains that this elision conceals the fact that Pitts had become content with his life in Algiers. This is implicit in the forced casualness of his conversation with Butler. Though Pitts does draw upon tropes of suffering common to other conversion narratives, his account is different since his post-conversion experience is chiefly recounted as ethnography. By separating his authorial self from his apostate identity, Pitts maintained his identity as a Christian throughout the text. There is not merely the 'exchange' of information for reintegration that Viktus proposed.¹²⁴ By occupying a marginal position, Pitts strengthens his ability to write authoritatively about Islamic society since 'in his heart' he remained a Christian.¹²⁵

Conclusion

Pitts' narrative is remarkable for acknowledging the extent of the author's complicity and engagement with the religious culture and ritual practices of Muslims. Pitts' text reflects the increasingly multipolar religious world of the beginning of the eighteenth century. Whereas contemporary deists took criticisms of Islam and applied them to Christian miracles, Pitts drew upon criticisms of Catholicism to discredit Turkish worship. As Matar has observed, it is impossible to reconstruct fully the lives and experiences of many Englishmen who chose or were unable to return to England.¹²⁶ This is also partially true of Pitts' private confessional identity during his captivity. Pitts' silence concerning his post-manumission life in Algiers imply that, possibly, certain elements of his life as an apostate may not

¹²⁴ Viktus, *Piracy, Slavery and Redemption*, pp. 218-19.

¹²⁵ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', pp. 315-16.

¹²⁶ Matar, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen*, pp. 71-82.

have fitted with the narrative of Christian suffering he chose to use to depict his personal confessional journey.

Pitts' text speaks to wider anxieties about the threat of conversion and apostasy. His faith was tested and his soul imperilled by his forced conversion to Islam. His salvation is tied to the text: he hopes his publication will give 'glory to God' as thanks for his providential release and return 'into my own native country'.¹²⁷ Through careful narration, Pitts assures his readers (and, perhaps, himself) that he had fulfilled his obligations as a Christian despite his apostasy. He deployed a providential narrative concerning his eventual release that demonstrated God's care for his subjects whilst warning of the spiritual perils of voluntary apostasy. When his former friend, James Grey died as a Muslim, Pitts writes that it 'pleased God' for him to die 'in a dismal manner' and that his former friend had become 'a very miserable object indeed'.¹²⁸ In contrast, Pitts sets himself up as a 'sinner' pleading for God's mercy.¹²⁹ All of the evidence Pitts presents in his text asserts that his conversion was under duress and in outward performance only. In so doing, Pitts separates himself from those voluntary apostates who received numerous ceremonies on their adoption of Islam and temporal benefits that were (largely) denied to Pitts.

His depiction of his conversion, and concerns about his obligations as a Christian, demonstrate how important confessional identity could be to individual Barbary slaves. This point has perhaps been underestimated in Matar's recent analysis which tended to focus on the socioeconomic benefits of post-emancipation life rather than the concomitant shift or alteration of an individual's confessional identity.¹³⁰ Pitts' erudite denial of his apostasy demonstrates the significance of his Protestant identity to his self-presentation. Pitts' pained reflections of his spiritual condition provide an astonishing record of the religious outlook of a relatively humble late seventeenth-century Protestant forced to cross cultural and religious

¹²⁷ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', p. 223.

¹²⁸ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', p. 324.

¹²⁹ Pitts, 'Religion and Manner of the Mahometans', p. 312. On personal experience of sinfulness and its relationship with prayer, see Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, pp. 33-42.

¹³⁰ Matar, *Turks, Moors and Englishmen*, pp. 40, 43, 47-8, 52, 55-63, 77-81, 85, 88-93, 95.

boundaries. Pitts' narrative is complex and multi-layered: it occludes as much as it reveals. Whilst Pitts was dismayed that several of his countrymen chose to recant Christianity and convert voluntarily, this rhetorical flourish also served to distance Pitts from his own acts as an apostate. Did Pitts eventually experience contentment with his third *patroon*? Not that he reports in his text. Rather, his text is driven by a lucid awareness of the dire spiritual consequences of his performance of apostasy.

Chapter 5

'Some Things may seeme Fabulous, and in maner Incredible': Witchcraft and the Supernatural in European Travellers' Accounts of Lapp Rituals (c. 1550 – c. 1700)

Early modern beliefs about the supernatural provided a frame of reference for travellers' depictions of other societies' beliefs and practices.¹ In this chapter, I explore how the complex of beliefs surrounding witchcraft in early modern European society can elucidate travellers' reports of supernatural encounters abroad. Specifically, I shall look at how such beliefs influenced sixteenth- and seventeenth-century English travellers' representations of Lapp rituals. Recent scholarship on Anglophone travel in the north has not paid much attention to reports of the supernatural.² Therefore, this chapter aims to bridge the gap between the historiography of travel literature and that concerned with domestic magic and witchcraft. Recent studies in the former field have examined the connections between travel texts and other discourses of the early modern era.³ Historians of witchcraft are increasingly widening their field of reference to show how contemporary demonology informed artistic representations, travel texts and other cultural products not directly associated with the prosecution of witchcraft.⁴ Building on this, I shall show how debates about the supernatural influenced travellers' descriptions of Lapp rituals.

¹ The title quote is from Anon, 'The Description of the Regions, People, and Rivers, Lying North and East from Moscovia... taken out of Sigismundus Ab Herberstein', in *Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), III, pp. 405-12 (p. 410).

² Colleen Franklin, "'An Habitation of Devils, a Domicill for Unclean Spirits, and a Den of Goblins': The Marvellous North in Early Modern English Literature', in *The Mysterious and the Foreign in Early Modern England*, ed. by Helen Ostovich, Mary V. Silcox, and Graham Roebuck (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2008), pp. 27-38; Colleen Franklin, *The Strange and Dangerous Voyage of Captaine Thomas James: A Critical Edition* (Montreal: McGill Queen's University Press, 2013), pp. xiv-xxxiii. On interpretations of the marvellous in early modern Europe more generally, see Lorraine Daston, 'Marvellous Facts and Miraculous Evidence in Early Modern Europe', *Critical Inquiry*, 18.1 (1991), pp. 93-124.

³ On travel narratives and domestic religion following the Elizabethan religious settlement, see Chapter 2 above at pp. 42-63.

⁴ See, for example, Charles Zika, *The Appearance of Witchcraft: Print and Visual Culture in Sixteenth Century Europe* (London and New York: Routledge, 2007); Robin Briggs, "'By the Strength of Fancie": Witchcraft and the Early Modern Imagination', *Folklore*, 115 (2004), pp. 259-72; Crawford Gribben, 'Angels and Demons in Cromwellian and Restoration Ireland: Heresy and the Supernatural', *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 76 (2013), pp. 377-92; Andrew Cambers, 'Demoniac Possession, Literacy and "Superstition" in Early Modern England', *Past and*

My research is also informed by Patricia Palmer's recent study of English representations of Ireland and the New World. She suggests that the Elizabethan period witnessed the development of a 'modern, full-fledged, mature nationalism' based upon nationalistic 'ideologies of difference' and 'militant Protestantism', which informed contemporary critiques of other societies. Palmer is principally concerned with how linguistic factors influenced English assertions of 'cultural superiority', highlighting the important distinction between the '(re)conquest of a near neighbour' in Ireland and the 'conquest of a "New World"'.⁵ Although the English were not colonial aggressors in Lapland, they asserted their cultural superiority in a variety of ways. Indeed, English visitors' economic and religious outlooks aligned with those of Scandinavian states intent upon Christianising the Lapp population.⁶ Scandinavian and English sources both stressed the alterity and perceived primitiveness of Lapp society, drawing on tropes also found in depictions of New World societies. 'Ideologies of difference' were also expressed through concerns about magic, witchcraft and taboo interactions with the supernatural world.⁷

I focus on two key ways in which travellers drew upon contemporary demonological works and supernatural beliefs in their encounters with animist Lapp magic and ceremonies. Firstly, I draw upon demonology and published pamphlet accounts of witchcraft prosecutions

Present, 202 (2009), pp. 3-35. On this trend more generally, see Jacqueline van Gent's survey of recent developments in early modern witchcraft studies: Jacqueline van Gent, 'Current Trends in Historical Witchcraft Studies', *Journal of Religious History*, 35.4 (2011), pp. 601-13.

⁵ Patricia Palmer, *Language and Conquest in Early Modern Ireland: English Renaissance Literature and Elizabethan Imperial Expansion* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), pp. 18-19. See also *Strangers to That Land: British Perceptions of Ireland from the Reformation to the Famine*, ed. by Andrew Hadfield and John McVeagh (Gerrard's Cross: Rowman & Littlefield, 1994), p. 1; Patrick Collinson, *The Birthpangs of Protestant England: Religious and Cultural Change in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries* (Houndmills: Macmillan, 1988), p. 5; Richard Helgerson, *Forms of Nationhood: The Elizabethan Writing of England* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994); Claire McEachern, *The Poetics of English Nationhood, 1590-1612* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007); Andrew Hadfield, *Literature, Travel and Colonial Writing In The English Renaissance, 1545-1625* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1998).

⁶ By the end of the seventeenth century, Russian and Scandinavian Christian states were making inroads into conquering and Christianising the Lapps: Roberto Bosi, *I Lapponi [The Lapps]*, trans. by James Cadell (London: Thames and Hudson, 1960), pp. 43-76.

⁷ Palmer, *Language and Conquest*, pp. 18-19. My work also reflects indirectly on the approach of Pompa Banerjee to European reports of *sati* (the Hindu custom of widow burning) and witchcraft beliefs: Pompa Banerjee, *Burning Women: Widows, Witches and Early Modern European Travellers in India* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003).

and popular beliefs.⁸ I explore how discourses surrounding domestic *maleficia* influenced depictions of Lapp magic. Secondly, I consider how travellers established the truth status of the supernatural events they witnessed. I examine how travellers' interpretations of Lapp rituals engaged with contemporary debates about how to prove that a supernatural encounter had occurred. Accounts of supernatural goings-on abroad were informed by a range of domestic beliefs and debates about taboo interactions with the spirit world. First though, a certain amount of contextual material is needed. I begin by demonstrating how pamphlet reports of witchcraft and travel narratives can sit within the same analytical project. This introductory material also outlines the scope of debate about witchcraft prosecution in England and Scandinavia and will allow us to understand the norms and values that travellers' applied to Lapp rituals.

Patterns of Prosecution

The earliest English descriptions of Lapp rituals came from early Elizabethan diplomatic correspondence collated by Richard Hakluyt in the first edition of the *Principal Navigations* (1589). Texts continued to be published sporadically throughout the seventeenth century even as formal prosecutions for witchcraft in England and Christian Scandinavia began to wane. Writing in 1674, Johann Scheffer claimed on his frontispiece that he was providing a history of Lapp 'manners, habits, marriages and conjurations', though he doubted the sincerity of many Lapps' conversions to Christianity.⁹ Like the earliest English descriptions of the region from the middle of the sixteenth century, Scheffer believed that Lapp magic was tantamount to diabolism. Both English and Swedish visitors instilled Lapp rituals with diabolic overtones, akin to the fabled Sabbath, found in many

⁸ A good general introduction to published accounts of witchcraft trials can be found in Marion Gibson, *Reading Witchcraft: Stories of Early English Witches* (London and New York: Routledge, 1999). On witchcraft prosecution in England more generally, see James Sharpe, *Witchcraft in Early Modern England* (New York: Longman, 2001).

⁹ Johann Scheffer, *The History of Lapland Wherein Are Shewed the Original Manners, Habits, Marriages, Conjurations, &c. of That People...* (Oxford, 1674), pp. 1-3, 24, frontispiece.

continental demonological treatises, at which continental witches consorted with demons.

There were broadly similar patterns of prosecution in both regions. English beliefs in the supernatural also influenced wider depictions of northerly peoples and their ritual practices.¹⁰ Witchcraft was prosecuted in similar ways in England and Scandinavia. Distinctive elements of Scandinavian witchcraft prosecutions have been uncovered by recent emic scholarship. Notably, Sweden and other Scandinavian states prosecuted witchcraft amongst their Christian and non-Christian populations.¹¹ Additionally, prosecutions in Sweden lasted somewhat longer than in England. The final prosecution took place in 1734, twenty-two years after the last English trial, and nearly thirty-five years after the last execution.¹² However, Bengt Ankarloo observed that the scale of Sweden's worst witch panic at Uppsala in the 1650s was comparable with that found in Essex during the Matthew Hopkins trials of the previous decade. The pattern of accusations was somewhat different though with child deponents played a more prominent role in the Uppsala prosecutions. Ankarloo has also examined links between Catholic ex-archbishop Olaus Magnus' 1658 demonology and Sweden's most serious outbreak of witchcraft prosecutions.¹³ This emic research has told us much about the meaning of

¹⁰ On associations of northerliness with diabolism, see Franklin, 'Habitation of Devils', pp. 28, 32.

¹¹ For parallels between Scandinavia and England, see E. William Monter, 'Scandinavian Witchcraft in Anglo-American Perspective', in *Early Modern European Witchcraft: Centres and Peripheries*, ed. by Bengt Ankarloo and Gustav Henningsen (Oxford: Clarendon, 1990), pp. 425-34 (pp. 425-9).

¹² Bengt Ankarloo, 'Sweden: The Mass Burnings (1668-76)', in *Early Modern European Witchcraft: Centres and Peripheries*, ed. by Gustav Henningsen and Bengt Ankarloo (Oxford: Clarendon, 1990), pp. 285-319 (pp. 294, 300). For an overview of later English prosecutions, see Phyllis Guskin, 'The Context of Witchcraft: The Case of Jane Wenham (1712)', *Eighteenth Century Studies*, 15.1 (1981), pp. 48-71; Ian Bostridge, *Witchcraft and Its Transformations, c.1650-c.1750* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1997), pp. 124-8, 132-6, 156. For discussion of the particular prosecution patterns in Scandinavia, see Antero Heikkinen and Timo Kervinen, Jens Christian V. Johansen, Hans Eyvind Naess and Kirsten Hastrup's contributions to *Early Modern European Witchcraft*, ed. by Ankarloo and Henningsen, pp. 319-402.

¹³ Ankarloo, 'The Mass Burnings', pp. 285-319. Major witch panics seem to have generally been more common in Scandinavia, though the poor survival of English legal records for many parts of the Midlands and North necessarily skews our perspectives: Monter, 'Scandinavian Witchcraft', pp. 425-34. I am grateful to Paula McBride for an illuminating conversation on alternative ways to track English witchcraft cases given the poor survival of English legal

witchcraft for contemporaries, showing that elements of Scandinavian beliefs were distinctive from wider European discourses.¹⁴

Catharina Raudvere has linked concepts of *trolldómir* [witchcraft/cursing] to earlier Norse traditions, and has recently co-edited a selection of essays on the historical connections between pre-Christian Viking and later Lapp religious beliefs.¹⁵ Ankarloo also noted that Scandinavian beliefs about sorcery were central to the development of the malefic witch stereotype from the late fourteenth century onwards.¹⁶ Stephen A. Mitchell has highlighted the relationship between concepts of heresy, impotence and diabolism in the emergence of the early modern witch stereotype in Scandinavia during the fourteenth century.¹⁷ Despite these uniquely Scandinavian features, prosecutions in Scandinavia had influence beyond its borders. E. William Monter suggests that a 'Scandinavian connection' influenced witchcraft prosecutions across Europe, noting in particular the influence of Danish prosecutions on the trial of the Berwick witches at the start of James I's reign and the influence of the aforementioned Uppsala panics on the Salem trials of the 1690s.¹⁸ Seventeenth-century Scandinavian concepts of witchcraft and magic, whilst possessing certain uniquely Scandinavian elements, were broadly intelligible to English readers of translated demonological texts and reports of prosecutions.

The legal mechanisms for prosecution were comparable in both regions. In England, causing death by witchcraft was a capital offence

records. On this issue, see Wallace Notestein, *History of Witchcraft in England From 1558-1718* (Washington: American Historical Association, 1909).

¹⁴ Catharina Raudvere, 'Trolldómir in Early Medieval Scandinavia', in *The Athlone History of Witchcraft and Magic in Europe: The Middle Ages* 6 vols. (London: Athlone Press, 2002), III, pp. 73-172; Raisa Maria Toivo, 'Marking (dis)order: Witchcraft and the Symbolics of Hierarchy in Late Seventeenth- and Early Eighteenth-Century Finland', in *Beyond the Witch Trials: Witchcraft and Magic in Enlightenment Europe*, ed. by Owen Davies and Willem de Blecourt (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 2004), pp. 9-25.

¹⁵ Raudvere, 'Trolldómir', pp. 73-172. See also *More than Mythology: Narratives, Ritual Practices and Regional Distribution in Pre-Christian Scandinavian Religions*, ed. by Catharina Raudvere and Jens Peter Schjodt (Lund: Nordic Academic Press, 2012).

¹⁶ Ankarloo, 'The Mass Burnings', pp. 285-319; Charles Zika, *Appearance of Witchcraft*, pp. 220-1.

¹⁷ Stephen A. Mitchell, 'Nordic Witchcraft in Transition: Impotence, Heresy and Diabolism in 14th-Century Bergen', *Scandia*, 63.1 (1997), pp. 17-33. On regional differences through Scandinavia, see Monter, 'Scandinavian Witchcraft', pp. 425-9.

¹⁸ Monter, 'Scandinavian Witchcraft', p. 434, see also pp. 431-3.

without benefit of clergy according to Acts of 1542, 1563 and 1604.¹⁹ The latter act stipulated that a crime had been committed not only if death or harm to persons or property (*maleficia*) had been caused through supernatural means such as magic, charms and spells, but also if the same magical tools were used for ostensibly beneficial means, such as to recover lost property or to bewitch someone into love.²⁰ Though Sweden had a longer history of medieval anti-witchcraft statutes, by the early seventeenth century, law codes stipulated capital punishment for causing death through witchcraft and lesser punishments for non-lethal or non-harmful uses of magic.²¹ Although Swedish witchcraft prosecutions peaked later than English trials, neither appears to have claimed significantly more victims.²² Despite the legal orthodoxy in both regions holding that witchcraft was a serious crime punishable by death, this secretive crime was prosecuted relatively infrequently across Europe as a whole. That said, some jurists argued that unorthodox evidence – including the testimony of minors and spectral evidence – should be permitted due to the unusually heinous nature of the pact with the Devil that gave the witch her power.²³ The argument that witchcraft must be treated as a *crimen exceptum* was met by an equally vociferous sceptical tradition that argued that suspected

¹⁹ Rosemary Guiley, *The Encyclopaedia of Witches, Witchcraft and Wicca* (New York: Infobase Publishing, 2008), pp. 379-80; Notestein, *History of Witchcraft*, pp. 10-14; Michael Dalton, *The Countrey Justice Containing the Practice of the Justices of the Peace out of Their Sessions...* (London, 1619), pp. 383-5. The original statutes are 33 Hen. VIII c. 8 (1542), 5 Eliz I c. 16 (1563) and 1 James I c. 12 (1604). On legal processes and their accurate representation in print and associated evidentiary dilemmas in early modern English witchcraft prosecutions, see Orna Alyagon Darr, *Marks of an Absolute Witch: Evidentiary Dilemmas in Early Modern England* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2011), pp. 1-10, 14-16, 25, 278.

²⁰ Dalton, *Countrey Justice*, p. 383; Garthine Walker, 'The Strangeness of the Familiar: Witchcraft and the Law in Early Modern England', in *The Extraordinary and the Everyday in Early Modern England: Essays in Celebration of the Work of Bernard Capp*, ed. by Angela McShane and Garthine Walker (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), pp. 105-24 (pp. 107, 113).

²¹ Per Sörlin, *Wicked Arts: Witchcraft and Magic Trials in Southern Sweden, 1635-1754* (Leiden: Brill, 1999), pp. 42-3.

²² Ankarloo, 'The Mass Burnings', pp. 288-9, 290-2, 294, 295-7, 305.

²³ Dalton, *Countrey Justice*, pp. 384-6 lists acceptable proofs for witchcraft, including reputation of the accused, search for witches' marks, witness to supernatural acts, and the testimony of children. The claim that witchcraft must be viewed as a *crimen exceptum* came from Jean Bodin, *Demon-Mania of Witches*, ed. by Randy A. Scott (Toronto: CRRS Publications, 2001), pp. 173-95.

witches were deluded due to melancholy rather than guilty of causing harm by supernatural means through a pact with the Devil.²⁴

Lapp magic itself also contributed to wider European ideas about magic and the supernatural. Charles Zika highlights connections between Magnus' unprecedented use of images in his description of Lapp ceremonies and wider European demonological, mythical and astrological imageries. These images were also reused in a variety of contexts relating to domestic witchcraft prosecutions across Western Europe and Scandinavia. European demonologies incorporated Lapp practices, as well as how existing demonological discourses shaped Magnus' denunciation of Lapp beliefs.²⁵ Lapps were prosecuted in Russia and Sweden for witchcraft, magic and diabolism.²⁶ For example, in Sweden in 1692, a Lapp man named Anders Poulson was accused for malefic witchcraft, including possession of Lapp ritual paraphernalia.²⁷

The parallel between travel writing and demonology is also reflected in the practices and sources of contemporary demonologists. We need not look too deeply into the canon of contemporary demonology to find similarities between demonological texts about domestic superstitions and ethnography of foreign practices. Indeed, contemporaries were aware of the parallel. Scheffer, the Swedish ethnographer, complained that the Lapp's 'impious' superstitions were a product of their remoteness and attachment to their own traditions. He went on to note that 'something of the same kind may be observed among the country, and other common people' not only in his native 'Sweden, but even in Germany, France and

²⁴ Reginald Scot, *The Discoverie of Witchcraft, Wherein the Lewde Dealing of Witches and Witchmongers Is Notable Detected, in Sixteen Books... Whereunto Is Added a Treatise upon the Nature and Substance of Spirits and Devils* (London, 1584), pp. 7-9.

²⁵ Zika, *Appearance of Witchcraft*, pp. 179-236.

²⁶ Valerie A. Kivelson, 'Male Witches and Gendered Categories in Seventeenth-Century Russia', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 45 (2003), pp. 606-31 (pp. 619-23). This period saw the beginnings of Christianisation of the Russian and Scandinavian hinterlands, and a marked decline in indigenous, pre-Christian beliefs. On the decline of indigenous beliefs, see Bosi, *The Lapps*, pp. 43-76.

²⁷ Liv Helene Willumsen, *Witches of the North: Scotland and Finnmark* (Leiden: Brill, 2013), pp. 298-306.

other nations' where common people indulged in 'paganism' and other 'impious superstitions'.²⁸

Contemporary demonologists recorded popular beliefs and superstitions as evidence of diabolism in a similar manner to travellers' ethnographic descriptions of Lapp rituals. In a recent paper, Darren Oldridge examined a range of English folk beliefs – including the trickster sprite Robin Goodfellow, fairies, *incubi* and 'other familiar or domestical spirits' – that were incorporated into the sceptical demonologist Reginald Scot's *Discoverie of Witchcraft* (1584) alongside learned magical traditions. Although Scot dismissed belief in these beings and the harm they caused as 'ridiculous', his use of popular beliefs and learned magical traditions mirror contemporary travel reports of Lapp magic that attempted to align Lapp traditions with classical sources.²⁹ English demonologists also deployed evidence from Scandinavian reports of Lapp magic to justify the prosecution of supernatural crimes. Arguing against the decriminalisation of witchcraft, the English demonologist Joseph Glanvill reused evidence from narratives of Swedish witchcraft prosecutions, including Magnus' account of the Uppsala panic. Both works referred to Blåkulla, a legendary meeting place for Swedish witches that figured prominently in depositions from afflicted children during the Uppsala panic. Although abduction of child victims was uncommon in English prosecutions, Monter notes that 'structural similarities' exist between the Uppsala witch panic documented by Magnus and the events of Salem, Massachusetts in 1692.³⁰ Writing nearly a century apart, sceptics like Scot and believers like Glanvill deployed evidence from Scandinavia and indigenous English folk beliefs

²⁸ Scheffer, *History*, p. 86. This parallel is repeated in a near-contemporary travel work by Adam Olearius, an ambassador from Holstein to Muscovy: Adam Olearius, *The Voyages and Travells of the Ambassadors Sent by Frederick Duke of Holstein to the Great Duke of Muscovy and the King of Persia...* trans. by John Davies [of Kidwelly], 2nd edn (London, 1669), pp. 31-2, 51-2.

²⁹ Scot, *Discoverie of Witchcraft*, p. 364; Scheffer, *History*, pp. 15, 21-3, 35-6, 45. I am grateful to Dr. Oldridge for discussing popular and demonological magic following a recent paper: Darren Oldridge, "'Doubtful Spirits": Fairies, Imps and Demons in Early Modern England', unpublished paper presented at the Magic and the Supernatural in the Medieval and Early Modern Periods conference, Cardiff University, 21 July 2015.

³⁰ Monter, 'Scandinavian Witchcraft', pp. 431-3; Joseph Glanvill, *Saducismus Triumphatus, Or, Full and Plain Evidence Concerning Witches and Apparitions*, ed. by C. O. Parsons (Gainesville: Scholar's Facsimiles & Reprints, 1966), pp. 563-97. Originally published at London in 1681.

alike.³¹ On both sides of the debate about witchcraft prosecution, demonologists drew upon reports of foreign practices alongside popular and learned domestic beliefs.

What does this all mean for the description of supernatural incidents abroad? First and foremost, all the travel narratives examined here were published in a country where the law defined engagement with ritual magic or supernatural forces as potentially demonic in origin. Secondly, although legal norms were contested, the prevailing legal orthodoxy in Western Europe and Scandinavia argued that certain individuals gained supernatural power to harm their neighbours through a combination of learned magical skill and a pact with the Devil. Finally, an overlap existed between ethnographic reports of foreign rituals and domestic demonology. In sum, early modern English travellers came from a culture in which many people believed that engaging with the supernatural was both dangerous and morally reprehensible. The next part of this chapter examines specific parallels between English and Scandinavian reports of Lapp magic and how these were informed by domestic demonological discourses.

‘Wilde People’: English Reports of Lapp Magic

During the 1560s, the first Englishmen to travel through Lapp territory were fascinated and worried by the rituals they witnessed. In reports that would later be published by Hakluyt in the *Principal Navigations*, they described the inhabitants of the far north as ‘wilde people’ who ‘neither know God, nor yet good order’.³² Elizabeth I’s Muscovy ambassador Giles Fletcher noted that some Lapps were more brutal than others, who at least

³¹ Monter, ‘Scandinavian Witchcraft’, pp. 432-3. On skeptical responses to Glanvill, and the distinctions between spirits and witchcraft, see Peter Maxwell-Stuart, *The British Witch: The Biography* (Stroud: Amberley Publishing Ltd, 2014), chap. 10.

³² Richard Johnson, ‘Certaine Notes Unperfectly Written by Richard Johnson, Servant to Master Richard Chancellour, Which was in the Discoverie of Vaigatz and Nova Zembla, with Steven Burrowe in the Serchthrift 156. And Afterwarde among the Samoedes, Whose Devilish Rites Hee Describeth’, in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), II, pp. 345-9 (p. 345).

claimed to be Christian.³³ Fletcher reported that these some Lapps were known as ‘*Dikoy Lapary*, or the wilde Lappes’ and ‘have no religion at all, but live as brute and heathenish people, without God in the world’. The rituals of these ‘wilde Lappes’ were easily interpreted by contemporaries as akin to the crime of witchcraft.³⁴ This view was shared by the Muscovite rulers of western Siberia. Relatively poor itinerant men from non-Russian ethnic groups, including Tartars, Lapps and others, were most likely to be accused of witchcraft in early modern Muscovite trials.³⁵ Valerie Kivelson has observed that ‘Finnic pagans’ were likely to be suspected of witchcraft and contemporary western European ethnography concurred with Russian authorities on the diabolic nature of Lapp practices.³⁶ Three particular features of Lapp magic were seen as tantamount to witchcraft: their use of familiars and the passing on of magical knowledge, their susceptibility to demonic temptation and the specific mechanisms of supernatural harm used by Lapp magicians. I explore each of these features in more detail below.

Firstly, Scheffer claimed that ‘it is received opinion... that they are people addicted to magic’, which remained ‘one of the greatest... tracks of superstition and idolatry’ that ‘yet continues among them’.³⁷ Scheffer also reported that the Lapps have ‘teachers and professors... [of] witchcraft’ and that they ‘bequeath... their familiars to their Children’. As a result, ‘each house hath peculiar spirits, and of different and quite contrary natures from those of others’. Furthermore, individuals ‘have their particular spirits, sometimes one, two, or more, according as they intend to

³³ Giles Fletcher, ‘The Description of The Countrey of Russia, with the Bredth, Length and Names of the Shires’, in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), III, pp. 353-405 (p. 404). For further descriptions of the inhospitable conditions and ‘primitive’ inhabitants of the north, see Thomas Southam and John Sparke, ‘The Way Discovered by Water by Us Thomas Southam & John Sparke...’, in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), III, pp. 73-83. On Fletcher, see Chapter 2 above at pp. 43-5.

³⁴ Fletcher, ‘Description of the Countrey of Russia’, p. 404; Franklin, ‘Habitation of Devils’, pp. 27-38.

³⁵ Kivelson, ‘Male Witches’, pp. 619, 622-3. It is worth noting that published early modern English narratives never reported on Muscovite criminal prosecutions for witchcraft or any other crime not directly pertaining to English trading interests.

³⁶ Kivelson, ‘Male Witches’, p. 619; Willumsen, *Witches of the North*, pp. 223-322.

³⁷ Scheffer, *History*, p. 45.

stand on the defensive part, or are maliciously inclined and design to be upon the offensive'.³⁸ This belief that individuals kept familiars or spirits either to cause or protect from magical harm informed the 1604 English Act, which criminalised beneficial or white magic for the first time. Confederations or families of witches, who passed on magical knowledge, are mentioned in Michael Dalton's guidebook for English magistrates. He noted that the 'testimony of other witches' was legitimate evidence, especially if it revealed that the suspected witch has any familiar 'spirits' or if the accused had 'been at their meetings' or Sabbaths. Familiars figured prominently, and Dalton noted that it was incriminating for the suspect to have 'been seen with their spirit, or seen to feed some thing secretly', or to 'feed or reward' their familiar, or to have 'consulted or covenanted with their spirit', as well as to 'imploy' their familiar to do harm.³⁹

Pamphlets reporting witchcraft prosecutions during the seventeenth century also bore striking similarities to Scheffer's denunciation of Lapp magic, in particular, the idea that witches passed on their familiars to their children or others in their family. In the pamphlet report of a 1645 witchcraft trial from Essex, one of the accused, Susan Cook, deposed that her mother had, 'about three or four yeeres since' on her deathbed 'desired this examinant privately, to give entertainment to two of her imps' and informed her that 'they would do [her] good'.⁴⁰ English witchcraft law did not distinguish between ritual magic and malefic witchcraft, as Dalton's manual makes clear.⁴¹ Learnt magical skill, like that denounced by Scheffer, was also at the heart of another early modern witchcraft prosecution, reported in a contemporary pamphlet concerning the trial and execution of the serving maid Anne Bodenham. The pamphlet reporting her 1653 trial claimed that she had been educated in malefic

³⁸ Scheffer, *History*, p. 46.

³⁹ Dalton, *Countrie Justice*, pp. 384-5.

⁴⁰ H. F., *A True and Exact Relation of the Severall Informations, Examinations, and Confessions of the Late Witches, Arraigned and Executed in the County of Essex...* (London, 1645), p. 31.

Cook and several other women were found guilty of using witchcraft to damage livestock and kill several of their neighbours. The most recent analysis of these trials can be found in Sheilagh Ilona O'Brien, "'[A] Solemne League and Contract with the Devill': Narratives of Sin and Desire in A True and Exact Relation (1645)", in *Sin and Salvation in Reformation England*, ed. by Jonathan Willis (Farnham: Ashgate, 2015), pp. 117-35.

⁴¹ Dalton, *Countrie Justice*, pp. 385-6.

ritual magic by her former master, the quack doctor and magician, Dr John Lambe.⁴² Scheffer's description of Lapp ritual thus drew on ideas that would have been familiar to English readers from popular accounts of domestic witchcraft trials.

Scheffer's second claim was that the Lapps were 'almost naturally magicians' since 'the Devil [will] take a liking to any person in his infancy' and 'torment them until they consent'.⁴³ Diabolical torment was a common feature of English and European witchcraft cases. For instance, during her 1647 trial, Margaret Moore deposed that she had only become a witch following the death of several of her children. She agreed to become a witch when, after hearing her dead children cry out to her, the Devil appeared and offered to save her one surviving child.⁴⁴ Scheffer's report of the role of the Devil in Lapp magic is thus directly analogous to the kinds of temptation and torment found in conventional English witchcraft narratives. Supernatural encounters with devils, demons, fairies and other beings could occur in many different contexts in early modern Europe. Encounters with the supernatural could be an integral part of both significant and insignificant life events. These interactions with spirits were frequently taboo and Moore's case shows how supernatural entities influenced traumatic and significant events in her life. The testimony of the Carmarthenshire labourer Thomas John indicates the role of supernatural beings in everyday contexts. On trial for the theft of a heifer, John claimed that fairies had led him to the beast and incited him to steal it one dark November night.⁴⁵ Similarly, the Cornish serving-maid Ann Jeffries was

⁴² Edward Bower, *Doctor Lamb Revived, or Witchcraft Condemn'd in Anne Bodenham, A Servant of His...* (London, 1653), pp. 1, 32-3.

⁴³ Scheffer, *History*, p. 49.

⁴⁴ Malcolm Gaskill, 'Witchcraft and Power in Early Modern England: The Case of Margaret Moore', in *Women, Crime and the Courts in Early Modern England*, ed. by Garthine Walker and Jenny Kermode (London: Routledge, 1994), pp. 125-45 (p. 133). On the reality of witchcraft, see Malcolm Gaskill, 'The Pursuit of Reality: Recent Research into the History of Witchcraft', *The Historical Journal*, 51 (2008), pp. 1069-88 (pp. 1084-8).

⁴⁵ Richard Suggett, *A History of Magic and Witchcraft in Wales* (Brimscombe: The History Press, 2008), pp. 53, 136; citing NLW, Great Sessions 4/797/5/80.

imprisoned and questioned by local Justices of the Peace after claiming to have had conversations with fairies.⁴⁶

The lived experiences of individuals like John (an agricultural labourer), Moore (a poor widow) or Jeffries (a maid) were very different from those of the educated men who travelled abroad as part of diplomatic or trading endeavours. Nevertheless, ethnographers and demonologists alike were interested in popular beliefs. Dalton's legal manual and Scot and Glanvill's demonologies all derived their evidence from popular superstitions, folk beliefs often also recorded through depositions from witch trials.⁴⁷ European travellers from nations like England and Sweden who believed in the prosecution of witches argued that Lapp magic functioned in a similar manner to domestic ideas about the Devil, spirits, learned magic and malefic witchcraft. Lapp practices confirmed their expectations about taboo interactions with the supernatural world.

The third way in which Scheffer's description of Lapp witchcraft related to domestic norms concerns those Lapp practices that did not have clear analogies within conventional early modern European demonology. Scheffer thus applies European demonological ideas to explain novel elements of Lapp rituals. Scheffer's report on *Sami* drums attests to this. The drums, whose emic ritual functions would not be studied by anthropologists until the twentieth century were, for Scheffer, explicable as magical tools typical of the demonology of his day. He suggested that the Lapps used them to foretell the future and that the unique carving on the three drums he collected signified that 'some of them are made for more malicious designs, others again for each man's private purpose'.⁴⁸

⁴⁶ Peter Marshall, 'Ann Jeffries and the Fairies: Folk Belief and the War on Scepticism in Later Stuart England', in *The Extraordinary and the Everyday in Early Modern England: Essays in Celebration of the Work of Bernard Capp*, ed. by Angela McShane and Garthine Walker (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), pp. 127-41. A contemporary account of Jeffries' life can be found in Moses Pitt, *An Account of One Ann Jeffries...* (London, 1696). On fairies, see also Diane Purkiss, 'Sounds of Silence: Fairies and Incest in Scottish Witchcraft Stories', in *Languages of Witchcraft: Narrative, Ideology and Meaning in Early Modern Culture*, ed. by Stuart Clark (London: Routledge, 2000), pp. 81-98.

⁴⁷ See earlier in the present chapter at pp. 158-9 above.

⁴⁸ Scheffer, *History*, p. 49; see also pp. 48, 50-2 for Scheffer's full description of the drums and the rituals associated with them and his illustrations. For a contemporary Norwegian prosecution in which a Sami shaman was prosecuted for using such a drum, see Willumsen,

Another novel feature of Lapp magic that Scheffer described concerned magical darts. A number of Scheffer's Lapp informants told him about magical darts that could kill or maim over any distance, causing swellings 'which by the extremity of... pain, kills' the victim 'in three daies'. Such unexpected deaths are common in European witchcraft trials, although the specific mechanism of the dart is more unusual. Scheffer concluded that, in this instance, the harm was caused by direct demonic intervention. He reported that a number of his informants told him that this practice was now extinct and there was 'no person in these times that knows of any such... magical darts'. In case there were any doubt in the mind of his readers, Scheffer made the true force in operation explicit: the darts were in fact 'some little devil' deployed by the Lapps.⁴⁹

A similar, but also unusual, aspect of Lapp magical harm was the *Gam*, a form of magical fly apparently used by the people of Finmark, which killed victims swiftly over great distances.⁵⁰ It is fair to say that flies do not figure prominently in European witchcraft trials or associated literature.⁵¹ In one instance, from Wales in the late 1580s, the victims of bewitchment reported that the accused, Gwen ferch Ellis, kept a familiar in the form of a fly of extraordinary 'bignesse' and had used it to bewitch some unwelcome and unruly house guests.⁵² However, whilst the *Gam*'s species may be unusual, Garthine Walker has shown that out of place but otherwise innocuous animals commonly provoked suspicions of malefic witchcraft.⁵³ The *Gam* is also similar to the fire-breathing clouds, fairies, goblins and

Witches of the North, pp. 304-5. On *sami* drums and their emic ritual function, see Bosi, *The Lapps*, pp. 129-66. A valuable introduction, including discussion of the drums collected by Scheffer, can be found here: Tor Gjerde, 'Sámi Drums or runeбомmer', *Sámi Drums*, (no date), <<http://old.no/samidrum/>> [accessed 22 January 2012].

⁴⁹ Scheffer, *History*, p. 58.

⁵⁰ Scheffer, *History*, p. 58. This kind of long-distance supernatural harm is also found in Stark's work on nineteenth century Finnish sorcery, demonstrating the longevity of these popular beliefs long after courts across the continent stopped prosecuting witchcraft, see Laura Stark, 'Narrative and the Social Dynamics of Magical Harm in the Late Nineteenth- and Early Twentieth-Century Finland', in *Witchcraft Continued: Popular Magic in Modern Europe*, ed. by Willem de Blecourt and Owen Davies (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 2004), pp. 69-88.

⁵¹ On the types of animals commonly identified as familiars, and their role in English witchcraft, see Walker, 'The Strangeness of the Familiar', pp. 111-17.

⁵² Suggett, *History of Magic*, p. 32, citing NLW Great Sessions: 4/9/4/f. 10-1; for further discussion of familiars, see pp. 27-41.

⁵³ Walker, 'Strangeness of the Familiar', pp. 112-13, 115.

other supernatural entities that populated the English diabolical imagination. These creatures featured in demonological works, including those of Scot, George Gifford, as well as antiquarian or scientific works.⁵⁴ For instance, Edward Topsell's *Historie of Serpents* (1665) provided a catalogue of reptilian creatures incorporating firedrakes, dragons and other mythical creatures.⁵⁵ Contemporary demonology and antiquarian studies provided ethnographers with a variety of supernatural parallels useful for describing foreign magical traditions.

I am not arguing that a direct causal link existed between English *maleficium* and Lapp shamans' activities. There is no substantive link between, for example, a witness deposition in a Hertfordshire witchcraft trial and a Lapp ritual in Scandinavia. In this sense, I reject Carlo Ginzburg's hypothesis that pre-Christian pagan beliefs survived across Europe into the early modern period. Ginzburg posits a historically unverifiable correlation between shamanic practice amongst Uro-Finnic peoples and the Sabbath as reported in continental demonology and witch trials.⁵⁶ I am also sceptical of Emma Wilby's view that witchcraft scholarship 'has been inadvertently "secularised" in an unconscious reaction to the ideological excesses of Margaret Murray'. Murray, an early twentieth-century Egyptologist, predated Ginzburg in proposing that a pre-Christian fertility cult survived the first millennium of Christian rule in Europe to be prosecuted in the seventeenth century under the guise of malefic witchcraft.⁵⁷ In positing

⁵⁴ Note that Scot's sceptical work was reprinted several times during the seventeenth century. See, for example, Reginald Scot, *The Discovery of Witchcraft, proving that the Compacts and Contracts of Witches... are Erroneous...* (London, 1665).

⁵⁵ Edward Topsell, *The Historie of Serpents. Or, The Second Booke of Living Creatures Wherein Is Contained Their Divine, Naturall, and Morall Descriptions...* (London, 1608), pp. 162-3.

⁵⁶ Carlo Ginzburg, 'Deciphering the Sabbath', in *Early Modern European Witchcraft: Centres and Peripheries*, ed. by Bengt Ankarloo and Gustav Henningsen (Oxford: Clarendon, 1990), pp. 121-38. For a recent reappraisal of Ginzburg's contributions to Anglophone witchcraft studies, see Ronald Hutton, 'Witch-Hunting in Celtic Societies', *Past and Present*, 212 (2011), pp. 43-77 (pp. 44-6).

⁵⁷ Emma Wilby, *Cunning Folk and Familiar Spirits: Shamanistic Visionary Traditions in Early Modern British Witchcraft and Magic* (Brighton: Sussex Academic Press, 2005), p. 190: Wilby suggests that historians must engage with 'a variety of comparative religious perspectives' in order to counter this secularising tendency and 'gain some insight into' what she terms the 'visionary familiar-encounter' found in English witchcraft prosecutions. As well as invoking 'unconscious' explanations based on the conceptual apparatus of psychoanalysis, Wilby's claims concerning the 'more than sane' status of shamanic practitioners rest on teleological and essentialist assumptions about both Western and non-Western societies.

(respectively) unverifiable psychological explanations or a hidden system of popular beliefs, Wilby and Ginzburg's approaches lack the analytical sophistication of Zika, Andrew Hadfield and Colleen Franklin's insistence on uncovering contingent connections between representations of foreign societies and contemporary domestic discourses.⁵⁸

Contemporary ethnography of Lapp practices drew upon existing European stereotypes about magic and the north. Franklin shows that Elizabethan hunts for the Northwest Passage coincided with a 'fascination' in popular culture with 'witchcraft, devils and the patristic account of Lucifer's rebellion'. She claims that remote parts of the north were seen as intrinsically connected to these myths, and that 'the native people and the elements' were often represented as in the service of the Devil. Her research into late seventeenth-century descriptions of the Faeroe Islands has shown that discourses of northern diabolism persisted long after 'philosophers such as [Francis] Bacon, [René] Descartes, and [Thomas] Hobbes had dismissed a demonic role in the ordering of the natural world'.⁵⁹ She draws on Wolfgang Behringer's claim that the climate event known as the Little Ice Age contributed to the rise of early modern European witchcraft prosecutions since social tensions were increased by economic hardship and food scarcity. Avoiding the strictly causal relations propounded by Behringer and Emily Oster, she argues that travellers believed the climate and geographic conditions of remote, northern regions was particularly propitious to diabolic forces.⁶⁰

Depictions of Lapp society were indebted to wider European beliefs surrounding malefic witchcraft. Travellers from countries with anti-witchcraft statutes drew on domestic ideas about the supernatural in their reports of Lapp magic. Accounts of Lapp beliefs fulfilled the evidential

⁵⁸ Hadfield, *Literature, Travel and Colonial Writing*, pp. 70, 72, 73-7; Zika, *Appearance of Witchcraft*, pp. 179-236; Franklin, 'Habitation of Devils', pp. 28-32.

⁵⁹ Franklin, 'Habitation of Devils', pp. 28, 29, 32.

⁶⁰ Franklin, 'Habitation of Devils', pp. 29, 30, 32. See also Wolfgang Behringer, 'Weather, Hunger and Fear: Origins of the European Witch-Hunts in Climate, Society and Mentality', in *The Witchcraft Reader*, ed. by Darren Oldridge (London: Routledge, 2002), pp. 69-86 (pp. 70-1); Wolfgang Behringer, *Witches and Witch-Hunts: A Global History* (Cambridge: Polity, 2004); Emily Oster, 'Witchcraft, Weather and Economic Growth in Renaissance Europe', *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 18.1 (2004), pp. 215-28.

criteria found in English reports of domestic witchcraft prosecutions. Scheffer's description of how Lapps became magicians drew on the conventional demonology familiar from reports of contemporary witchcraft prosecutions. Contemporaries viewed Lapp magic as functionally similar to existing European tropes concerning witchcraft, magic and the supernatural. Lapp bewitchment using drums and darts was interpreted in terms borrowed from demonological treatises and popular beliefs, including the diabolic pact and the use of familiar spirits to harm others. The other parallels identified here, concerning diabolic temptation, the use of *Sami* drums and confederations of witches who passed on learned magical skills or familiar creatures, also demonstrate the influence of European demonological traditions on representations of Lapp rituals. It is important to view foreign practices through the lens of related contemporary discourses. In so doing, we widen our understanding of contemporary supernatural beliefs and how travellers' experiences drew upon and engaged with debates about the limits and nature of magical agency and diabolical power. This is explored further below as we investigate how English travellers engaged with debates about visual proof for supernatural events in order to validate their claims about the diabolic nature of Lapp rituals.

Supernatural Proof and Travel Narratives

In the *Principal Navigations*, Hakuyt and those travellers whose texts he compiled engaged with contemporary debates about the reality of magical transformations and other supernatural acts. Their descriptions of Lapp rituals can be interrogated from the perspective of early modern debates about how to prove supernatural crimes and other magical occurrences. Just as Scheffer documented practices that conformed to European demonological expectations, Hakluyt's travellers drew upon a range of proofs in order to establish the reality of the supernatural events that they witnessed. Travellers and ethnographers who wrote about foreign magical and supernatural rituals engaged with wider debates about the extent of

magical power in order to establish the truth status of the claims they made.

However, in spite of the connections highlighted already, it would be wrong to say that travellers simply reiterated contemporary notions of witchcraft in their accounts of Lapp practices. Scheffer presents the *Gam* and magical darts as new data on the sorcery of previously unknown foreign peoples.⁶¹ The strangeness of Lapp rituals is also apparent in the narrative of Stephen Burrough, the navigator on Hugh Willoughby's ill-fated voyage.⁶² Burrough described how their guide showed them a 'heap of Samoyed idols' that had 'the shape of men, women and children, very grosly wrought'. Burrough observed that it was 'the most unartificial worke that I ever saw'. The Lapps' reputation for cannibalism, found in Russian texts of the period, was affirmed when Burrough noticed 'the eyes and mouthes of sundrie' of the idols 'were bloodie'.⁶³ Burrough used his own eyewitness testimony to convey the strange and unsettling nature of Lapp idol worship to his readers.

In other instances, the reports collected by Hakluyt explicitly engaged with the reality of supernatural phenomena. In order to validate new and useful information about other lands, it was necessary for travellers and their editors to prove the reality of the things being described. This is apparent in Richard Johnson's descriptions of Lapp magic. Johnson, who travelled with Richard Chancellor and Burrough on the first English expeditions to Muscovy during the 1550s, engaged with contemporary discourses concerning visual proof and supernatural

⁶¹ Franklin, 'Habitation of Devils', p. 27.

⁶² On Willoughby's fate, see James McDermott, 'Willoughby, Sir Hugh', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004 <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/29599>> [accessed 18 October 2011].

⁶³ Stephen Burrough, 'The Navigation and Discoverie Toward the River Ob, Made by Master Steven Burrough, Master of the Pinnesse Called the Serchthrift, with Divers Things Worth the Noting, Passed in the Yere 1556', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), II, pp. 322-44 (p. 338). The term 'Samoyed' is now seen as offensive by modern-day Lapp/Sami communities owing to its association with cannibalism. Hakluyt includes the Elizabethan Muscovite ambassador Giles Fletcher's account of the etymology of their name deriving from Russian accusations of cannibalism: Fletcher, 'Description of the Countrey of Russia', p. 402. Incidentally, similar crude carved talismans were used for magical purposes in domestic witchcraft cases. See, for example, Suggett, *History of Magic*, pp. 40-1, 44-6, 48. It should be noted that the sacrificial overtones of Burrough's report are absent from descriptions of such totems in domestic witchcraft trials.

phenomena. His text was edited by Hakluyt and, to my knowledge, no surviving manuscript of Johnson's original text survive. Given Hakluyt's copious editorial interventions in other works found in the *Principal Navigations*, it is plausible to assume that Hakluyt edited this text to provide the most comprehensive account of Lapp magic.⁶⁴ This view is supported because Hakluyt's marginal annotations do not cast doubt on the validity of Johnson's claims.⁶⁵

The version of the text in the *Principal Navigations* does not explicitly refer to the considerable body of demonological literature produced in the decades between Johnson's expedition in 1556 and the publication of his narrative in 1589. However, the text does display a lively awareness of wider debates within demonological and scientific literature concerning the reality of supernatural events. Hakluyt's version of Johnson's text demonstrates engages with some of the evidentiary concerns that supernatural phenomena provoked.⁶⁶ Johnson/Hakluyt's apparent concern with eyewitness testimony and other ways of proving supernatural events suggest a familiarity with ideas of proof commonplace in demonological debates and criminal proceedings, a large number of which had taken place across Europe in the intervening decades.

Johnson's account engages with contemporary debates about how real supernatural events were separated from illusory ones.⁶⁷ Stuart Clark has outlined the discursive space in which early modern debates about visual proof took place. He highlights interactions between emerging scientific discourses, with their emphasis on eyewitness proof, and theological developments, such as the Protestant excising of Purgatory.

⁶⁴ Philip S. Palmer, "'All Suche Matters as Passed on This Vyage': Early English Travel Anthologies and the Case of John Sarracoll's Maritime Journal (1586-87)", *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 76 (2013), pp. 325-44 (pp. 325-9). On Hakluyt and his editorial practices more generally, see Chapter 2 above at pp. 40-77.

⁶⁵ For an instance of Hakluyt doubting descriptions of strange northern peoples, see Hakluyt's annotations and disclaimers on Anon, 'Description of the Regions... North from Moscovia', p. 410.

⁶⁶ On early modern intellectual culture and the supernatural, the authoritative account is Stuart Clark, *Thinking with Demons: The Idea of Witchcraft in Early Modern Europe* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1997).

⁶⁷ Stuart Clark, *Vanities of the Eye: Vision in Early Modern European Culture* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007), pp. 150-1.

These debates influenced long-standing controversies about the extent of magical power and witchcraft. In intellectual circles, the extent and nature of demonic power was the subject of heated debate across Western Europe. The debate over the reality of witchcraft was one element of wider controversies surrounding the limits of diabolical power and visual and non-visual means of proof. Johnson's account is illuminating since he uses particular proofs to show that Lapps were demoniacs and sorcerers. In so doing, he touches upon a nexus of concerns in early modern society surrounding the possibility that supernatural incidents were merely the result of ocular distortion or visual dissimulation. Johnson's text details three supernatural events – one involving a sword-swallowing priest and two occasions when a Lapp priest apparently dies only to be subsequently revived. The different ways in which Johnson handles these events indicate the range of explanations that the supernatural provoked in early modern Europe.

In one ceremony, Johnson describes how the 'Priest' repeatedly called upon the rest of the 'company [to] answer him with this *owtis igha, igha, igha*... so manie times, then in the ende he becommeth as it were madde, and falling down as [if] hee were dead'. When Johnson enquired 'why hee lay so', he was told that 'nowe doeth our God tell him what wee shall doe, and whither we shall goe'. On another occasion, the priest was more unambiguously extinguished as, when Johnson enquired about movement from behind the cloth that concealed the priest, he is informed that 'what I sawe.... [was] not his finger; for he was yet dead'.⁶⁸ The question of whether death could be artificially simulated by diabolical forces was hotly debated in the early modern period. By the time that Scheffer reported on these rituals in 1674, he claimed that 'without doubt... it is impossible for either man, or devil, to restore the soul to the body it hath once left'. Instead, Scheffer contended that 'the devil only stifles the faculties of the soul for a time'. However, in other respects, Scheffer's text conforms to the particulars recorded a century earlier by Johnson and

⁶⁸ Johnson, 'Certaine Notes', pp. 347-8, 349.

Burrough, including the (simulated) death of the priest and the anointing of various idols.⁶⁹

During a second ritual, Johnson describes how the Lapp priest took 'a sword of a cubite and a spanne long', heated it in the fire and then 'put it into his bellie halfeway'. He then 'thrust it through his bodie... at his navill and out at his fundament'. At some undisclosed point, Johnson found the opportunity to 'mete [measure] it myself' in order to ascertain the dimensions of the sword. He also corroborated the puncture of the priest by noting that 'the poynt beeing out of his shirt behind', Johnson 'layde [his] finger upon it' before it was removed.⁷⁰ Such proofs were the subject of significant debate during the later sixteenth and early seventeenth century. By the 1560s, both Protestant and Catholic writers had, following the lead of Aristotle, come to argue that a variety of factors could lead individuals to believe 'thyngs utterly false, to be very true'. The Zurich Protestant, Ludwig Lavater argued that demonic deception could be responsible for a range of phenomena. This included 'juggling and magical trickery', such feats as 'that someone could swallow a sword, or vomit money, or cut off a fellowes head, which afterward he setteth on agayne', alongside the illusions caused by optics and more theologically contentious apparitions such as angels and ghosts.⁷¹ Writing in 1605, the Catholic writer Pierre Le Loyer provided a similar catalogue of 'things... meereley natural' which 'are taken by the sight or hearing being deceived' to be 'things prodigious', as well as the various diabolical and non-diabolical mechanisms by which such deceptions could occur.⁷²

A few years after Hakluyt published Johnson's narrative, the English Puritan George Hakewill attributed any number of 'delusions of the sight' to the 'subtiltie of the divel', 'the charmes of sorcerers', or 'by the violent passions of fear and melancholy' as well as a whole host of other diabolic

⁶⁹ Scheffer, *History*, pp. 42-3, 56, see also pp. 37-9, 43, 56; Burrough, 'The Navigation', p. 338; Johnson, 'Certaine Notes', pp. 347-9.

⁷⁰ Johnson, 'Certaine Notes', p. 348.

⁷¹ Clark, *Vanities*, pp. 207-8, 211-12, citing Lavater, *Of Ghostes...* (1572), pp. 18, 144-1; Aristotle, *Meteorologica*, in *Works of Aristotle*, ed. by W. D. Ross, (Princeton, Princeton University Press, 1984), III, p. 4.

⁷² Clark, *Vanities*, pp. 214-15, citing Le Loyer, *Treatise of Specters* (1605), sigs. 1r-3v, 112v.

and non-diabolic causes.⁷³ Two other English divines, John Deacon and John Walker, argued in 1601 (just two years after Johnson's narrative was included in the second edition of the *Principal Navigations*) that magical transformations were only possible 'in outward appearance'.⁷⁴ In a further expansion of demonic power, the French Protestant demonologist Henri Boguet argued that witches could magically transform themselves into other creatures. He asserted that it was possible for the Devil to create 'a virtual event': one whose 'reality no-one, barring the Devil himself... could determine using their senses alone' by 'confusing the four humours of which [the witch] is composed' in order to 'represent whatever He will'.⁷⁵ Uncertainty about the extent of diabolic power was key to many early modern demonological debates and many of those who 'believed in witchcraft... offered striking arguments for not taking at least some of it seriously'. After all, 'an all-embracing illusion' of diabolic origin rendered the very business of defining any event as real or illusory problematic.⁷⁶ It was increasingly acknowledged that illusions could be 'non-demonic' in origin. Indeed, many sceptical writers suggested that delusions caused by natural means provided a strong justification 'for doubting the reality of the crime' of witchcraft.⁷⁷

There are parallels here with what travel writers more generally were seeking to achieve. The question of what one has seen and how one proves it are integral to the element of reportage implicit in contemporary travel writing and ethnography.⁷⁸ In representing foreign places and peoples to people who have never been there to meet them, travellers drew on the knowledge and beliefs of their own culture in order to render the other culture intelligible. Travellers reflected upon domestic debates about the reality of supernatural occurrences when reporting such

⁷³ Clark, *Vanities*, p. 28, citing George Hakewill, *The Vanitie of the Eie...* (1608), pp. 55-6.

⁷⁴ Clark, *Vanities*, p. 134, citing Deacon and Walker, *Dialogicall Discourses* (1601), p. 143.

⁷⁵ Clark, *Vanities*, p. 139, citing Boguet, *An Examen of Witches*, trans. E. A. Ashwin, ed. by M. Summers, (London, 1929), pp. 146-8.

⁷⁶ Clark, *Vanities*, p. 140. *Emphases* in original.

⁷⁷ Clark, *Vanities*, p. 142.

⁷⁸ On establishing the truth of travel reports, see Julia Schleck, "'Plain Broad Narratives of Substantial Facts": Credibility, Narrative and Hakluyt's *Principall Navigations*', *Renaissance Quarterly*, 59 (2006), pp. 768-94; Joan Pau Rubiés, 'Instructions for Travellers: Teaching the Eye to See', *History and Anthropology*, 9.2-3 (1996), pp. 139-91.

incidents abroad. Johnson's conclusion concerning the temporarily dead priest shows the benefits of this approach. He observed that when the Lapp priest was lying 'dead', he had 'perceive[d] him to breathe'.⁷⁹ Johnson clearly believed that at least some of what he witnessed was the result of dissimulation. In contrast, Scheffer was convinced that demons could 'stifle' the soul and make a body appear dead. They thus took different views as to the reality of a particular supernatural event. Although Johnson proposed a simpler form of priestly deception, he endorsed the reality of the sword-swallowing priest by measuring the sword and confirming that it had indeed popped out of the priest's rear end. Johnson's text thus highlights some of the ambiguities within early modern debates about the reality of supernatural or prodigious events.⁸⁰

Furthermore, it seems Johnson was no sceptic when it came to diabolical goings-on. In his description of a third and final ritual, he recounted a potentially corporeal demonic encounter. Johnson narrates how a Lapp priest was concealed from the crowd 'with a gown of broad cloth without lining'. A rope was 'made fast about his necke' and 'two men... began to draw and drew til they had drawn the ends of the line stiff'. Johnson reported that he then 'heard a thing fall into the kettle of water' that had been concealed behind the cloth with the priest. When he asked what he had heard, he was told that 'it was his [the priest's] head, his shoulder and left arm, which the line had cut off'. Johnson 'rose up and would have looked whether it were so or not', but was prevented from doing so since they believed that 'if they should see him with their bodily eyes they should live no longer'.⁸¹ Johnson's reliance on the experience of his own eyes, as in the cases of the length of the sword and the previous simulated death, is thus denied. As a result, Johnson merely implies who the true agent in this ritual is. He records that he 'sawe a thing like a finger of a man two times together thrust through the gowne from the Priest'.

⁷⁹ Johnson, 'Certaine Notes', p. 347; Scheffer, *History*, pp. 42-3.

⁸⁰ Scheffer, *History*, pp. 42-3. On other disputed signs – namely, celestial ones – and their interpretation, see Christopher Carter, 'Meteors, Prodigies, and Signs: The Interpretation of the Unusual in Sixteenth-Century England', *Parergon*, 29.1 (2012), pp. 107-33.

⁸¹ Johnson, 'Certaine Notes', pp. 348-9.

Having been told that the priest was again temporarily dead, Johnson asked what he had seen and was told that 'that which I saw appeare through the gowne was a beast, but what beast they knew not, nor would not tell'.⁸² Although not clearly stated, it is possible to read the 'beast' as diabolic in origin. Like Scheffer's interpretation of Lapp magical darts and the *Gam*, it was commonplace in contemporary demonology for demons to assume the form of animals, with witches' familiars playing an unusually prominent role in English prosecutions.⁸³ In this example, Johnson's testimony contradicts Lavater's view that simulated beheadings were merely the result of dissimulation.⁸⁴

Johnson's description, with its corporeal demon, contradicted the view of Scot, the sceptical demonologist, whose 1584 treatise left 'virtually no room for the physicality of devils'.⁸⁵ Whereas Johnson was able to reinforce the physicality of the sword in the first ritual, in the case of the beheaded priest he is unable to give an eyewitness account of the beast. In this instance, he draws upon a similar kind of proof to that which led the pamphleteer Henry Goodcole to ask the convicted witch Elizabeth Sawyer whether she ever 'handled' the Devil. Goodcole was attempting to prove whether she had been subject to 'a visible delusion of her sight only'.⁸⁶ Although both writers wished to demonstrate the true nature of a demonic visitor, the physicality of Johnson's 'beast' is more in doubt: glimpsed through a cloth rather than directly interacting with the accused witch. Johnson's corporeal demon also has echoes in Scheffer's 'little demons' that

⁸² Johnson, 'Certaine Notes', p. 349.

⁸³ Clark, *Vanities*, p. 130-1; Walker, 'Strangeness of the Familiar', p. 111. Although these prosecutions took place in the decades after Johnson's journey, published disputes such as those discussed by Clark and popular accounts of witchcraft were in circulation by the time Hakluyt came to include Johnson's account in *The Principal Navigations*. It is possible that the Richard Hakluyt "Principal Navigations" Editorial Project (led by Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt) may uncover information on surviving manuscripts or other works by Johnson. Such documents would allow us to understand the nature and extent of Hakluyt's editorial intervention in a similar manner to Palmer's study of Hakluyt's Senegambian sources: Palmer, 'All Suche Matters', pp. 325-44.

⁸⁴ Clark, *Vanities*, pp. 207-8, 211-12, citing Lavater, *Of Ghostes...* (1572), pp. 18, 144-1.

⁸⁵ Clark, *Vanities*, p. 141.

⁸⁶ Henry Goodcole, 'The Witch of Edmonton', in *The Witch of Edmonton*, ed. by Peter Corbin and Douglas Sedge (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1999), p. 147; Clark, *Vanities*, p. 151.

allowed Lapp magicians to kill their victims over long distances.⁸⁷ The physicality of devils came under intense scrutiny in learned circles during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. The relationship between visual and physical sensory perception was the subject of heated debate in early modern Europe. However, as the scope of belief and doubt expressed in both intellectual treatises and by travellers abroad suggests, such issues were often judged on a case-by-case basis.

These beliefs persisted long after sceptics began arguing that the whole business of supernatural crime and punishment was credulous. Both antiquarian interest in malefic magic and occasional instances of vigilante justice occurred long after the legal mechanisms for prosecution in England had been discredited. There is significant evidence that witch beliefs persisted in England and Scandinavia long after formal decriminalisation during the eighteenth century.⁸⁸ This 'afterlife' of interest and belief in witchcraft is attested to by the first English translation of Scheffer's *History of Lapland*, which included extensive material on Lapp magical traditions, in 1678. This was only a decade before England hung its last witch at Bideford in 1688 and only a few more prosecutions would occur before decriminalisation in 1736.⁸⁹ In contrast to this decrease in prosecutions, Scheffer's text was reprinted twice, in 1715 and 1754 with the description of Lapp magic unchanged. The sporadic demand for Scheffer's account demonstrates the persistence of interest in malefic magic long after the impetus for and legal mechanisms of prosecution in England had been discredited.

⁸⁷ Scheffer, *History*, p. 58.

⁸⁸ Stephen A. Mitchell, 'Witchcraft Persecutions in the Post-Craze Era: The Case of Ann Izzard of Great Paxton, 1808', *Western Folklore*, 59.3/4 (2000), pp. 304-28; Stephen A. Mitchell, 'A Case of Witchcraft Assault in Early Nineteenth-Century England as Ostensive Action', in *Witchcraft Continued: Popular Magic in Modern Europe*, ed. by Willem de Blecourt and Owen Davies (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 2004), pp. 14-28; Stark, 'Social Dynamics of Magical Harm', pp. 69-88.

⁸⁹ Witchcraft was decriminalised and accusing others or feigning to have magical skill made a criminal offence by the act 9 Geo. II c. 5 (1736). For a full account of the final executions at Bideford, see Anon., *A True and Impartial Relation of the Informations Against Three Witches...* (London, 1682). On other early eighteenth century prosecutions, see Guskin, 'The Context of Witchcraft', pp. 48-71. For an overview of debates surrounding the 1736 Act, see Maxwell-Stuart, *British Witch*, chaps. 10-13.

His descriptions of Lapp priests were also cited by Thomas Barker as an example of 'heathen prophets affected like Demoniacks'.⁹⁰ The French Catholic writer Augustin Calmet also cited Scheffer's description of Lapp magical traditions in his ambivalent report on various eastern European supernatural beliefs. Elements cited by Calmet included the inheritance of 'a familiar devil... by a father to his children', 'magical flies or devils in a leather bag' that could be used to 'destroy their enemies, hurt cattle or raise storms', and the use of magical drums and trances to foretell the future.⁹¹ Scheffer's work was a useful resource for eighteenth-century religious writers, demonologists and others who remained unwilling to jettison a worldview that incorporated active supernatural agencies of various kinds.

Alongside Magnus' demonology of Swedish witchcraft, Scheffer's text would go on to inform the description of Lapland found in John Trusler's *The Habitable World Described* (1788-97). Trusler criticised Magnus – and, by implication, Scheffer as well – as a 'very credulous man' and, although he repeated in detail some descriptions of Lapp magic, he observed that it would 'tire the reader's patience to relate' other 'magical contrivances'. He claimed that Lapp magical skill has been in abeyance since the 'time of paganism'. Although Trusler noted the Lapp's fame for magical skill and reiterated Scheffer's claim that Lapps pass familiars to their children, bewitch others to death with darts, and covenant with spirits, he asserted that they do so not 'so frequently... as they did in former times'.⁹² In a similar vein, the Reverend Isaac Watts cited Scheffer's claim that the 'religion of the Lapps... is half or more than half heathen' and used their reputed magical skills as evidence that they are 'gross idolaters'.

⁹⁰ Thomas Barker, *The Nature and Circumstances of the Demoniacks in the Gospels, Stated and Methodized* (London, 1783), p. 46.

⁹¹ Augustin Calmet, *Dissertations upon the Apparitions of Angels, Dæmons, and Ghosts, and Concerning the Vampires of Hungary, Bohemia, Moravia, and Silesia* (London, 1759), pp. 126-7.

⁹² John Trusler, *The Habitable World Described, or the Present State of the People in All Parts of the Globe...* 2 vols. (London, 1788), I, pp. 185-93. An interesting new angle on these latterday uses of demonological texts would potentially take into account the significance of folklore or mythic tales to local identity, potentially building on Daniel Robert Woolf's study: Daniel Robert Woolf, "'Of Danes and Giants': Popular Beliefs about the Past in Early Modern England", *Dalhousie Review*, 71 (1991), pp. 166-209.

Lapp magical practices were transformed in Watts' account from an efficacious and potentially dangerous magical power to a symptom of their idolatry.⁹³ Even as prosecutions declined, Scheffer's ethnography continued to contribute to a variety of debates concerning rituals, magic and the supernatural.

Travel narratives about the supernatural must be examined alongside contemporary pamphlet literature and demonology. The complex physical realities being described by Johnson can be contextualised in light of domestic ideas about witchcraft and magic. Understanding of these realities was shifting even by the time Scheffer reinforced the active role of the Devil in stifling the faculties of possessed Lapp priests, as later sceptical citations of Scheffer's ethnography attest. Demonological literature, criminal prosecutions and reports of foreign ceremonies all drew upon similar discourses concerning the limits of supernatural power. Johnson and Scheffer's employment of conventional European demonologies indicate that foreign supernatural rituals were subsumed into domestic magical norms and expectations. The conceptual baggage that Europeans took with them allowed them to understand and explain novel foreign practices in light of domestic debates, beliefs and practices.⁹⁴ Tales of the supernatural in early modern travel narratives should be read in light of contemporary debates about what was and was not achievable through ritual action. We have seen a number of instances in which travel texts and demonological works engaged with wider debates about visual proof and the changing limits of demonic or supernatural power. Travel narratives about supernatural incidents abroad derived their terms of proof from wider debates about the separation of real events from illusory ones. By examining travel texts in light of Clark's work on visual proof, we are able to explore how early

⁹³ Isaac Watts, *The Works of the Rev. Isaac Watts, D.D...* 7 vols. (Leeds: Edward Baines, 1800), III, pp. 69-70. On idolatry and antiquarian fascination with contemporary and ancient pagan traditions, see Chapter 2 above, especially pp. 63-75.

⁹⁴ Daniel Carey, 'Travel, Identity and Cultural Difference 1580-1700', in *Cross-Cultural Travel: Papers from the Royal Irish Academy International Symposium on Literature and Travel, National University of Ireland, November 2002*, ed. by Jane Conroy (Oxford: Peter Lang, 2003), pp. 39-48 (pp. 39-41).

modern travel writing engaged with contemporary religious and visual cultures.

Conclusion

By comparing travel literature with demonological texts, it is clear that travel writers drew upon debates concerning the reality or otherwise of the various supernatural phenomena they recounted. Johnson's descriptions of Lapp rituals explicitly engaged with contemporary questions about the proof of supernatural events. The close correlation between the proofs Johnson gives and those found in contemporary academic treatises on the subject strongly suggests that he (or Hakluyt, who edited and published his text) was aware of, and explicitly engaging with, these debates and questions in framing the evidence he presented. The supernatural events he describes connect in a variety of ways with contemporary debates about what was or was not possible through ritual action and the nature and extent of diabolic power. Early modern travel narratives about the supernatural could be put to a variety of uses. Unpicking their relationship with demonological debates enables us to widen our understanding of how contemporaries read and understood these texts.

In this chapter, we have explored connections between two diverse strands of historical enquiry. I have shown how travel narratives are susceptible to analysis in light of contemporary debates about, and beliefs in, the supernatural. In sum, it is important to read travel narratives in the context of wider debates within the society that produced them. Travel narratives provided raw materials for sceptical and credulous demonological texts, as well as later antiquarian works interested in connections between ancient and foreign societies' beliefs and practices. This can be seen both in the parallels between Scot's demonology and Scheffer's *History*, as well as the various ways in which later authors drew upon Scheffer's work.

The self-identity of the traveller is constructed through multiple and shifting oppositions, as Palmer suggests.⁹⁵ We should be wary of a hermeneutic reading of travel narratives that sees them merely as English representations of other societies and cultures, whose sole intention was the Othering of foreign traditions. Not only did supernatural issues inform travellers' descriptions of Lapp rituals but travel narratives complemented and contributed to wider domestic debates. Neither Scheffer's description of confederacies of Lapp witches nor Johnson's evidence for the supernatural elements of Lapp ceremonies can make full sense without reference to similar, contemporaneous beliefs circulating in Western Europe. Situating travel narratives in the context of the culture that produced them is vital if we wish to properly understand who believed what and for what reasons about foreign cultures and societies during the early modern period.

⁹⁵ Palmer, *Language and Conquest*, pp. 18-19.

Chapter 6

'To trace all forms of Divine Worship to one Sacred and Primeval Source': Deism and Heterodoxy in Eighteenth-Century Orientalist Travel Writing

The Enlightenment radically reshaped many aspects of the early modern world.¹ By the close of the eighteenth century, Britain's imperial position was vastly transformed with the East India Company becoming a major economic and territorial force in the Indian subcontinent. At home, a flood of Oriental goods transformed bourgeois culture.² Similarly, intellectual and artistic life was altered in distinct ways as freethinking intellectuals criticised the traditional foundations of Christian belief. Simultaneously, the Romanticist movement sparked a re-evaluation of existing distinctions between civil and barbarous, cultured and primitive.³ The conventional argument is that the social, political and cultural transformations that began during the first half of the eighteenth century indicate that this period is distinctly 'modern': the emergence of modern science, rationality, and democratic movements marked a break with the post-medieval early modern period.⁴

Recent scholarship has moved us a long way from the assumption that a modern vanguard – be they capitalists, deists or political radicals – fought against reactionary and conservative individuals and institutions attached to traditional religious, political and cultural values. The

¹ The quote in the chapter title is taken from Michael Symes, *An Account of an Embassy to the Kingdom of Ava Sent by the Governor-General of India in the Year 1795* (London: Bulmer and Co., 1800), p. 302.

² See, for example, Marguerite Eyer Wilbur, *The East India Company and the British Empire in the Far East* (New York: Richard R Smith, 1945); Douglas M. Peers, *India under Colonial Rule: 1700-1885* (Edinburgh: Pearson, 2006); Kate Teltscher, 'India / Calcutta: City of Palaces and Dreadful Night', in *The Cambridge Companion to Travel Writing*, ed. by Peter Hulme and Tim Youngs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 191-206; Robert Travers, *Ideology and Empire in Eighteenth-Century India* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007); Miles Ogborn, *Indian Ink: Script and Print in the Making of the English East India Company* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2007). For analysis of colonial-metropolitan relations over the modern period more generally, see *Tensions of Empire: Colonial Cultures in a Bourgeois World*, ed. by Frederick Cooper and Ann Laura Stoler (Berkeley & Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1997).

³ Giles Tillotson, *The Artificial Empire: The Indian Landscapes of William Hodges* (Richmond: Curzon, 2000), pp. 1-2, 96, 111-12.

⁴ All these assumptions are challenged in Gary S. De Krey, 'Between Revolutions: Re-Appraising the Restoration in Britain', *History Compass*, 6/3 (2008), pp. 738-73 (pp. 379-43).

Enlightenment did not mark a clean break from the Reformation: questions of conformity and tolerance remained central to all these intellectual debates right up to the nineteenth century.⁵ Revisionist scholarship has broken down the Enlightenment in a number of ways: into early and late phases or Protestant and radical components.⁶ We have come to appreciate the multifaceted (and at times seemingly contradictory) nature of eighteenth-century social, political and religious culture and change. This chapter focuses on one aspect of change in that period. It will examine how radical deist theologies related to Britain's expanding imperial sphere of influence in India.

For modern readers, it may seem axiomatic that travellers' overseas experiences force them to rethink the beliefs and prejudices of their own societies.⁷ We cannot take this for granted for other historical periods. This chapter examines earlier forms of religious relativism within their broader cultural context of early Enlightenment and Romanticism. Specifically, I will examine the community of Orientalists, artists and linguists who were

⁵ Dmitri Levitin, 'From Sacred History to the History of Religion: Paganism, Judaism, and Christianity in European Historiography from Reformation to "Enlightenment"', *The Historical Journal*, 55 (2012), pp. 1117-60. The most comprehensive expression of the radical Enlightenment versus conservative Enlightenment hypothesis is Jonathan Israel, *Radical Enlightenment: Philosophy and the Making of Modernity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001). For discussion of seventeenth-century reactions to religious diversity, see Michael T. Ryan, 'Assimilating New Worlds in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 23.4 (1981), pp. 519-38; Jonathan Sheehan, 'The Altars of the Idols: Religion, Sacrifice, and the Early Modern Polity', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67 (2006), pp. 649-73. On empire and religious toleration of various kinds, see Robert Travers, 'The Eighteenth Century in Indian History', *Eighteenth Century Studies*, 40 (2007), pp. 492-508; Rahul Sapra, 'Orientalism of Capitalism: Warren Hastings and the Rhetoric of Empire', in *Tall Tales and True: India, Historiography and British Imperial Imaginings*, ed. by Kate Brittlebank (Clayton: Monash University Press, 2008), pp. 8-19; Paul Stevens and Rahul Sapra, 'Akbar's Dream: Mughal Toleration and English/British Orientalism', *Modern Philology*, 104 (2007), pp. 379-411.

⁶ Two good responses to the radical Enlightenment thesis propounded by Israel are Wayne Hudson, *Enlightenment and Modernity: The English Deists and Reform* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2009); Jeffrey R. Wigelsworth, *Deism in Enlightenment England: Theology, Politics and Newtonian Public Science* (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 2009).

⁷ For an amusing but informative overview of modern travel writing practices, see Susan Parman, 'A Harrowing True Mysterious Pilgrimage Travel Adventure on the Road Less Travelled (by Bike/Camel/Motorcycle/Ultralight) into the Heart of a Dark Lost Island as Told by the Sole Survivor of a Zen Odyssey among Jaguars, Serpents, and Savages: Travel as Western Cultural Practice Revealed by the Titles of Travel Books', *Journeys*, 3 (2002), pp. 50-60. See also Michael Mewshaw, 'Travel, Travel Writing and the Literature of Travel', *South Central Review*, 22.2 (2005), pp. 2-10.

drawn into investigating Indian religion as a result of their occupations as administrators and traders for the East India Company.⁸ This research builds on recent scholarship that has shifted the emphasis away from the postcolonial narrative that emphasised the imbalance of power between British colonisers and colonised Indian society. Recent studies have uncovered evidence of cross-cultural co-operation, reverse transculturation and other forms of mediation. Building on this scholarship, this chapter addresses religious topics that have been marginalised in recent postcolonial scholarship.⁹

The discussion below is split into three parts. First, I outline the broader political and religious context in which the governance of India

⁸ Michael J. Franklin, *Orientalist Jones: Sir William Jones, Poet, Lawyer, and Linguist, 1746-1794* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), pp. 19-21; Rahul Sapra, *The Limits of Orientalism: Seventeenth Century Representations of India* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2011), pp. 30, 170; Garland Hampton Cannon, 'Oriental Jones: Scholarship, Literature, Multiculturalism and Humankind', in *Objects of Enquiry: The Life, Contributions, and Influences of Sir William Jones, 1746-1794*, ed. by Garland Hampton Cannon and Kevin R. Brine (New York: New York University Press, 1995), pp. 21-50. On transculturation – the borrowing between coloniser and colonised cultures – see Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Studies in Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992).

⁹ Penelope Carson, *The East India Company and Religion, 1698-1858* (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2012), p. 3; Amal Chatterjee, *Representations of India, 1740-1840: The Creation of India in the Colonial Imagination* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2001), pp. 31-48, esp. pp. 34-41; Travers, 'The Eighteenth Century in Indian History', pp. 492-508; Kate Teltscher, *India Inscribed: European and British Writing on India 1600-1800* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1995); P. J. Marshall, and Glyndwr Williams, *The Great Map of Mankind: British Perceptions of the World in the Age of Enlightenment* (London: J. M. Dent & Sons, 1982); Urs App, *The Birth of Orientalism* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010); App, 'William Jones's Ancient Theology', *Sino-Platonic Papers*, 125 (2009), pp. 1-125; Michael J. Franklin, 'Cultural Possession, Imperial Control, and Comparative Religion: The Calcutta Perspectives of Sir William Jones and Nathaniel Brassey Halhed', *The Yearbook of English Studies*, 32 (2002), pp. 1-18; Raf Gelders, 'Genealogy of Colonial Discourse: Hindu Traditions and the Limits of European Representation', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 51 (2009), pp. 563-89; Raf Gelders, and S. N. Balagangadhara, 'Rethinking Orientalism: Colonialism and the Study of Indian Traditions', *History of Religions*, 51 (2011), pp. 101-28; Peter Heehs, 'Shades of Orientalism: Paradoxes and Problems in Indian Historiography', *History and Theory*, 42 (2003), pp. 169-95; Thomas R. Trautmann, 'Does India Have History? Does History Have India?', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 54 (2012), pp. 174-205 (pp. 176-81). Much has been written about economic relationships between Britain and its Indian possessions, see, for example, Natasha Glaisyer, 'Networking: Trade and Exchange in the Eighteenth-Century British Empire', *The Historical Journal*, 47.2 (2004), pp. 451-76 (p. 455); Tirthankar Roy, 'Where Is Bengal? Situating an Indian Region in the Early Modern World Economy', *Past and Present*, 213 (2011), pp. 115-46; William R. Pinch, 'Same Difference in India and Europe', *History and Theory*, 38 (1999), pp. 389-407 (p. 407); K. N. Chaudhuri, *The Trading World of Asia and the English East India Company 1660-1760* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978); *The Imperial Impact: Studies in the Economic History of Africa and India*, ed. by Clive Dewey and Anthony G Hopkins (London: Athlone Press for the Institute of Commonwealth Studies, 1978).

was debated in the latter half of the eighteenth century. In particular, I focus on how British Christians squared their faith with administering India's vast and religiously diverse population. I show how, by the end of the eighteenth century, Christian revivalism at home came into open conflict with an old guard of long-serving East India Company officials who had, in various ways and for various reasons, come to argue that the economic benefits of colonial rule were inseparable from toleration of Indian religious diversity.¹⁰ I suggest that Company hostility to evangelism in the subcontinent can be rooted in intercultural experiences that contributed to or facilitated deist criticisms of the revealed status of Christian religion.

Secondly, I provide an overview of eighteenth-century religious debates, drawing in particular on arguments for natural religion put forward by deist writers. Drawing on recent scholarship that has emphasised the heterogeneity of deist writing, I advocate a similar approach to eighteenth-century Orientalist texts and travel writing. Thirdly, I will show how these ideas were reflected in the writings of British colonialists engaged in administering and ambassadoring for the East India Company. In short, I propose that ideas about natural religion and deism informed senior Company officials' resistance to evangelism.¹¹ The conclusion then discusses the implications of East India Company men holding theologically unorthodox positions in light of the broader debate about the governance of India.

Company Debates: Evangelicals versus Orientalists

At Vellore in 1806, a significant number of Indian sepoys (troops) revolted against changes in dress regulation that restricted Hindu signifiers of caste. The Company argued that the Vellore mutiny demonstrated the dangers of intervening in Indian religious practices, since moderate religious reform

¹⁰ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 1-7.

¹¹ On evangelical campaigns, see Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 2-6, 8-9, 15-16; Ian Copland, 'Christianity as an Arm of Empire: The Ambiguous Case of India under the Company, c. 1813-1858', *The Historical Journal*, 49.4 (2006), pp. 1025-54 (pp. 1025-30).

had provoked a breach of the peace. As support for missionary campaigns in East India Company territories increased, Company officials claimed that India's religious and civil administrations were inextricably connected. The Company used this incident, and others like it, to argue that minority British rule, and the economic benefits of Empire were only sustainable if they avoided upsetting local religious sensitivities.¹² However, a growing number of evangelical organisations in Britain questioned the Company's mandate to rule large parts of the Indian subcontinent without interfering in the religious lives of its vast population.

Comparably little has been written about the religious affiliations of senior Company officials who resisted evangelical calls, though it is generally assumed that they were sympathetic to ecumenical or deist ideas.¹³ Their resistance to Christian evangelism in the subcontinent has been documented by both Penelope Carson and Rahul Sapra.¹⁴ Governor General Warren Hastings administration between 1772 and 1788 is generally regarded as the high point of reverse transculturation, during which Indian norms influenced British authority in a variety of ways. Carson suggests that Hastings was 'probably a deist', and therefore at least somewhat hostile to the Church of England. Following his impeachment in 1788 and eventual acquittal in 1795, Hastings actively contributed to the campaign against missionary activities, particularly in the wake of the Vellore rebellion.¹⁵ This evidence does suggest that Hastings was unwilling

¹² Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 3, 15, 70-6.

¹³ Michael J. Franklin, "'And the Celt Knew the Indian": Sir William Jones, Oriental Renaissance and Celtic Revival', in *English Romanticism and the Celtic World*, ed. by G. Carruthers and A. Rawes (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), pp. 20-37 (p. 30); App, 'Jones's Ancient Theology', p. 76.

¹⁴ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 29-31; Sapra, *Limits of Orientalism*, pp. 164-72.

¹⁵ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, p. 75, citing Toone to Hastings, 20 January 1808, BL Add. MSS, 29183, p. 138, in which Hastings passed his papers relating to his campaign against missionary access to India to Colonel Sweny Toone, a member of the Court of Directors who was attempting to restrict missionary activity following the Mysore rebellion, also pp. 80, 134-5, 238-9. On Hastings' patronage networks and his controversial career, see P. J. Marshall, 'Hastings, Warren', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2008, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/12587>> [accessed 18 October 2013]. Hastings' impeachment and lengthy trial raised the spectre of Company malpractice. This ghost would only be laid to rest when the Crown took over rule from the Company in 1858. See also Beth Fowkes Tobin, *Picturing Imperial Power: Colonial Subjects in Eighteenth Century British Painting* (Duke University Press,

to tolerate missionary activity in India. Although this indicates Hastings' opposition to missionary activity, it is not evidence of his opposition to either the Christian faith itself or the Established church, especially given the prominence of evangelical denominations within the pro-missionary movement.¹⁶ Carson cites no direct evidence to support her claim that Hastings was a 'deist', but goes on to note that he 'took care to attend church regularly and died a communicant of the Church of England'.¹⁷ As we shall see, a range of positions on evangelism, and Christianity itself, were advocated by Company officials.

Many senior Company officials remained hesitant to sponsor institutions with missionary links. However, this was not a universal trait and some sponsored both secular and evangelical projects. For example, Lord Moira, Governor General following the 1813 renewal of the Company's charter, was a major sponsor of a college in Serampore that provided a secular education to Indians and Christians in both Indian 'literature' and European 'sciences'. He also sponsored a Baptist project to distribute Bibles, though Carson suggests that he may have been unaware of the evangelical goals and backing of the Baptist English and Foreign Bible Society.¹⁸ In focusing on the minutiae of Company debates, Carson neglects the theological foundations of anti-evangelical policies amongst Company elites. We must be cautious not to chase ghosts though. Hastings' religious behaviour, like Moira's sponsorship of religious and secular projects, could indicate hostility to revivalist evangelism rather than a deeper-seated hostility to the Established church.¹⁹ By exploring how

1999), pp. 135-8; P. J. Marshall, 'The Whites of British India, 1780-1830: A Failed Colonial Society', in *Trade and Conquest: Studies on the Rise of British Dominance in India*, ed. by P. J. Marshall (Brookfield: Varorium, 1993), pp. 26-44 (pp. 27-9, 43-4); Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 206-36.

¹⁶ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 21-2, see also pp. 15, 35, 75, 83, 133; Sapra, *Limits of Orientalism*, pp. 165-8.

¹⁷ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 21-2.

¹⁸ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 22, 160-1. On the complexity of identifying an individual's private confessional identity even when they had a reputation for controversial opinions, see Wayne Hudson, *The English Deists: Studies in Early Enlightenment* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2009), pp. 3, 5-13, 18-20, 22-4; Wigelsworth, *Deism in Enlightenment England*, pp. 3-6, 8, 10.

¹⁹ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 21-2, 75.

religious doubt and unbelief figured in Orientalist travel writing, what follows brings us a little closer to understanding the confessional makeup of eighteenth-century East India Company Orientalists.

During the 1790s, opposition to missionary activity in India was not restricted to Company elites. Carson's diligent investigation of government and Company archives has highlighted the difficulties experienced by the evangelical lobby during the 1793, 1803 and 1813 renewals of the Company's charter, exemplified by successful Company opposition to the Baptist Charles Grant's 1793 'pious clause'. Grant called for 'fit and proper persons... as schoolmasters, missionaries or otherwise' to be sent out and provided for by the Company in order to improve the spiritual lot of 'both the "dissolute" Europeans and the "depraved" Indians'.²⁰ Grant's nonconformist background also set him against religious members of the House of Lords. Prominent bishops in the Lords concurred with the Company, arguing that India's religion and government were deeply interconnected. Therefore, no 'foreign state' had the right to 'interfere with the Government of another country "without an express commission from Heaven"'.²¹ As late as 1793, many within the British establishment refused to advocate the wholesale transformation of India's religious system.

This was not to last: by the 1813 renewal of the Company's charter, the loose and divided alliance of evangelicals had persuaded the government and Directors that something must be done to reform India's religious beliefs.²² By 1813, the Company had conceded the necessity of Christian teaching, and the Company had begun to take an active role in the organising, remunerating and equipping of Church of England-sponsored

²⁰ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, p. 37, citing *Journals of the House of Commons* (14 May 1793) pp. 48, 778; William Wilberforce, *Life of William Wilberforce*, (London, 1838), II, pp. 392-3. On conflict amongst evangelicals, see Torkel Brekke, 'Baptism and the Bible in Bengal', *History of Religions*, 45 (2006), pp. 213-33.

²¹ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, p. 39, citing *The Senator*, (5 June 1793), VII, pp. 896-7.

²² Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 4-5, 20-3, 25-7, 42-4, 76-80, 94-8, 112-20, 122-7.

missionaries.²³ Beth Fowkes Tobin suggests that Company elites became less comfortable with accommodating or acculturating to Indian norms as the nineteenth century progressed.²⁴ In general, a growing number of British Christians, including members of the Established Church, Baptists, Methodists and other non-conformists, criticised the Company's role in revenue collection at Hindu religious sites. Company rule was also slated for enforcing Hindu and Muslim legal codes. This broad-based and at times internally conflicted evangelical movement criticised the Company for restricting the activities of missionaries on the subcontinent and opposing further proselytising.²⁵

Carson principally addresses disputes within the pro-evangelical lobby, overlooking the cross-pollination between Orientalists and indigenous religious texts and discourses.²⁶ Hastings' enthusiastic

²³ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 96, 133, 145-8, 166. Sapra suggests that Hastings' impeachment in 1788 marked an important turning point in the decline of Company toleration: Sapra, *Limits of Orientalism*, pp. 80, 164-5, 238-9.

²⁴ Tobin, *Picturing Imperial Power*, p. 137. For an example of nineteenth-century conflict between non-interference and civilising impulses, see Jane Tschurenne, 'Between Non-Interference in Matters of Religion and the Civilizing Mission: The Prohibition of Suttee in 1829', in *Colonialism as Civilizing Mission: Cultural Ideology in British India*, ed. by Harald Fischer-Tine and Michael Mann (London: Anthem Press, 2004), pp. 68-91; Teltscher, 'India / Calcutta', pp. 191-206. For discussion of domestic crimes, legal authority and civilising impulses which demonstrate the multiple perspectives evinced by British and Indian individuals, see Glaisyer, 'Networking: Trade and Exchange', pp. 452-4; Durba Ghosh, 'Household Crimes and Domestic Order: Keeping the Peace in Colonial Calcutta', *Modern Asian Studies*, 38.3 (2004), pp. 599-623; Michael Mann, 'Dealing with Oriental Despotism: British Jurisdiction in Bengal, 1772-93', in *Colonialism as Civilizing Mission: Cultural Ideology in British India*, ed. by Harald Fischer-Tine and Michael Mann (London: Anthem Press, 2004), pp. 29-48; Margaret Frenz, '"A Race of Monsters": South India and the British "Civilizing Mission" in the Later Eighteenth Century', in *Colonialism as Civilizing Mission: Cultural Ideology in British India*, ed. by Harald Fischer-Tine and Michael Mann (London: Anthem Press, 2004), pp. 49-67.

²⁵ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 62, 98, 99; for arguments against mission in the later nineteenth century, see pp. 190-1, 197; Travers, *Ideology and Empire*, pp. 20-3, 148-51, 186, 246, 248; Jeffrey Cox, *The British Missionary Enterprise since 1700* (Oxford and New York: Routledge, 2008), pp. 79-82. On growing evangelical fervour at home, see Anna Johnston, 'British Missionary Publishing, Missionary Celebrity, and Empire', *Nineteenth-Century Prose*, 32.2 (2005), pp. 20-47. Revivalism was strongly linked with the spread of Methodism and other Independents. On this topic, see Russell E. Richey, 'From Puritanism to Unitarianism in England: A Study in Candour', *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 41 (1973), pp. 371-85 (pp. 371-2); David Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1780s to the 1830s* (London: Unwin Hyman, 1989).

²⁶ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 3, 53-4, 56-60. See also Michael J. Franklin, '"I Burn with a Desire of Seeing Shiraz": A New Letter from Sir William Jones to Hartford Jones', *The Review of English Studies*, 56 (2005), pp. 749-57; Franklin, 'Cultural Possession', 1-18; Shruti Kapila, 'Race Matters: Orientalism and Religion, India and Beyond, c. 1770-1880',

patronage of Romanticist painters, including William Hodges and John Zoffany, and the linguist and polyglot William 'Orientalist' Jones give some indications of the confessional background of men associated with Hastings' rule. Sapra suggests that Hastings' Indocentric approach was inspired, at least in part, by the Orientalist and Romanticist individuals whose activities he sponsored.²⁷ Giles Tillotson argues that Hodges' writings and paintings are not merely the product of colonial authority. He notes that this view effectively denies agency to the artist since it asserts that European representations of Indian subjects are *a priori* Orientalist (in the Saidian sense) simply because of the broader power dynamics between the two cultures.²⁸

In contrast, Nigel Leask suggests that eighteenth-century representations of India depict a place in an 'associative vacuum'. The 'totalising perspective' of European Orientalism forced artists and writers such as Hodges to populate Indian landscapes with familiar Greco-Roman elements.²⁹ A far more complex and interesting picture emerges in Almeida and Gilpin's study of the controversial connections between Classical and Indian forms that Hodges' paintings and writings provoked. Through formalistic art analysis and cultural history, they show that Hodges asserts that 'Indian subjects' possessed 'the same artistic validity as classical scenes'.³⁰ Hodges' published diary argued that Indian monuments were 'remnants of an advanced and original civilisation' of 'greater antiquity' than classical Greek or Roman forms. He proposed that Indian architecture

Modern Asian Studies, 41 (2007), pp. 471-513; Sapra, *Limits of Orientalism*, pp. 11-32, 33-4, 44-5, 51-3, 89-132.

²⁷ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, p. 27; Sapra, *Limits of Orientalism*, p. 167-72; Tillotson, *Artificial Empire*, pp. 2-3, 7; Tobin, *Picturing Imperial Power*, pp. 118, 130-2, 136-8. See also Christopher Alan Bayly, *The New Cambridge History of India: Indian Society and the Making of the British Empire* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1988), II, p. 78.

²⁸ Tillotson, *Artificial Empire*, pp. 60-1, 100-2.

²⁹ Nigel Leask, *Curiosity and the Aesthetics of Travel-Writing, 1770-1840: 'From an Antique Land'* (Oxford: Clarendon, 2002), pp. 2, 7.

³⁰ Hermione de Almeida, and George H. Gilpin, *Indian Renaissance: British Romantic Art and the Prospect of India* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2005), p. 114; William Hodges, *Travels in India During the Years 1780, 1781, 1782, & 1783* (London, 1793), pp. 11, 26, 150-1; Leask, *Curiosity*, p. 161; Tillotson, *Artificial Empire*, pp. 5, 98. On Hodges' wider travels, artwork and reception, see L. H. Cust, 'Hodges, William', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2009, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/13425>> [accessed 21 December 2012].

may have inspired the classical forms admired by eighteenth-century artists and architects alike.³¹ Zoffany's work also brought together European and Indian subjects in new ways. Zoffany's painting of Chief Justice Elijah Impey's daughter dancing to Indian musicians in front of a Greco-Roman portico is a good example of the kind of hybridity provoked by day-to-day immersion in, and intellectual engagement with, Mughal and Hindu civilisations.³²

Company elites were closely intertwined with Orientalist and Romanticist movements.³³ Jones' duties as a judge sat comfortably alongside his vocation as the most distinguished Oriental scholar of his generation.³⁴ Jones' linguistic schema, which observed for the first time connections between Indo-European languages, was in line with Hodges' Romanticist vision of Indian architecture. Jones' argued that a concurrence existed between Indian and European languages. His antiquarian study of Indian religious and historical texts also disrupted Christocentric assumptions about the God-given status of Hebrew and with it the Judeo-Christian ancestry of Protestantism. Yet having posited similarities between Indian and European linguistic forms, Jones was also motivated by the desire to uncover the historical foundations of Christian sacred histories in lands far removed from their traditionally agreed origins in the Holy Land. Jones' vision radically destabilised pre-existing religious and historical notions: his linguistic theories had an impact on European self-perception that was comparable with that of Darwin's theory of evolution a century later.³⁵

Contemporary Orientalism was intimately connected with confessional issues.³⁶ Urs App argues that 'the role of colonialism' and

³¹ Almeida and Gilpin, *Indian Renaissance*, pp. 114, 117, see also pp. 132-43; Tobin, *Picturing Imperial Power*, pp. 112-15, 120-3, 125, 127-9, 133, 135.

³² Tobin, *Picturing Imperial Power*, pp. 125, 127-8, 131, 138.

³³ Almeida and Gilpin, *Indian Renaissance*, pp. 114-15, 117; Leask, *Curiosity*, pp. 4-5, 157-8, 161, 201; Tillotson, *Artificial Empire*, pp. 95-6, 98-9, 102-5, 110-12, 113-16; Tobin, *Picturing Imperial Power*, pp. 112-17, 120-2; Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, pp. 8-12.

³⁴ Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, pp. 19-20, 34-6, 40-1, 213-15.

³⁵ Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, p. 47-8.

³⁶ App, 'Jones's Ancient Theology', pp. vi-viii, 2-4; Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 2-7, 8.

'economic and political interests' in 'the birth of Orientalism dwindles to insignificance compared to the role of religion'. He notes that the eighteenth century saw intellectual debates within Europe move away from Christian 'theology [and] Bible studies', and a downplaying of 'Europe's time-honored [sic] Judeo-Christian worldview' because of growing interest in 'India as the cradle of civilisation'.³⁷ This view is more than substantiated by Susan Marchand's study of German Orientalism in the nineteenth century, which elaborates on the importance of religion for German Orientalists.³⁸ Throughout the eighteenth century, British officials were intimately involved in the ritual lives of Indian people, as revenue-raising powers granted them authority, first in Bengal and then elsewhere, to tax Hindu religious festivals. British lawyers, including Jones, relied upon Hindu pandits translating and interpreting existing Mughal and Hindu codes for the benefit of British judges.³⁹ Company officials had to square their position as Christians with close involvement in the administration of non-Christian legal systems and religious celebrations.⁴⁰

Edward Said memorably described Jones as being motivated by the needs and requirements of imperial power.⁴¹ Michael J. Franklin has rebuffed Said's polemical and present-centred approach. Franklin lucidly observes that Said's account of Jones 'states the blindingly obvious' and assumes that scholarly neutrality was desirable for contemporary Orientalists. Jones and his contemporaries appear to have been entirely comfortable acknowledging that increasing their knowledge of India's

³⁷ App, *Birth of Orientalism*, pp. xi-xiii.

³⁸ Suzanne L. Marchand, *German Orientalism in the Age of Empire: Religion, Race and Scholarship* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), p. xx, 22-3, 49, 59-65, 127, 134-7, 191.

³⁹ Travers, *Ideology and Empire*, pp. 17-18; Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, p. 34. See also Rosane Rocher, 'Weaving Knowledge: Sir William Jones and Indian Pandits', in *Objects of Enquiry: The Life, Contributions, and Influences of Sir William Jones, 1746-1794*, ed. by Garland Hampton Cannon and Kevin R. Brine (New York: New York University Press, 1995), pp. 51-81.

⁴⁰ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 3, 15.

⁴¹ Edward W. Said, *Orientalism: Western Conceptions of the Orient* (London and New York: Penguin, 1978), p. 36. On applying Said's insights to India, see Gyan Prakash, 'Edward Said in Bombay', in *Edward Said: Continuing The Conversation*, ed. by W.T. J. Mitchell and Homi Bhabha (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2005), pp. 135-41; Kim Phillips, *Before Orientalism: Asian People and Cultures in European Travel Writing, 1245-1510* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013), pp. 16-17.

culture, beliefs and history would facilitate rule by a tiny minority of white British men. In Franklin's view, colonial appropriation and reverse transculturation were inextricable from each other.⁴²

It is also difficult to separate intellectual investigation into Indian religion and history from the practical business of colonial governance. Travel texts and Orientalist works documenting Indian traditions need to be understood in light of this shift away from traditional beliefs, in particular notions of Christian exceptionalism. App has shown that, from the late seventeenth century onwards, religious issues were of paramount significance to Orientalist scholars within both the English and French traditions.⁴³ Within the context of British rule in India, the toleration of other faiths became a fundamental tenet of Company rule, facilitated by antiquarian interest in Hindu and Mughal historical and legal traditions and by a legal fiction which maintained that British rule was simply a continuation of Mughal juridical traditions.⁴⁴

Franklin argues that we should avoid either condemning Hastings' rule as Orientalist or exaggerating its positive qualities. Hastings appreciated the value of Orientalist knowledge (rather than military superiority) that allowed a relative 'handful' of Europeans to govern. Orientalist literature and travel texts served not only to emphasise the 'literary and historical gains' which colonial rule brought to European audiences, but also reinforced the 'cultural politics' of Hastings regime.⁴⁵ There were other benefits too: Company officials could enrich themselves financially and politically on their return to Britain. For some, this advancement was also allied with a keen interest in the historical and religious traditions of the subcontinent.⁴⁶ East India Company men like Jones were also motivated by antiquarian and philological interest in

⁴² Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, pp. 19-20.

⁴³ App, *Birth of Orientalism*, pp. xi-xiii; Jonathan Sheehan, 'Sacred and Profane: Idolatry, Antiquarianism and the Polemics of Distinction in the Seventeenth Century', *Past and Present*, 192 (2006), pp. 35-67 (pp. 60-4).

⁴⁴ Travers, *Ideology and Empire*, pp. 17-18; Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, p. 34.

⁴⁵ Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, pp. 19-20.

⁴⁶ Chatterjee, *Representations of India*, pp. 31-48; Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, p. 33.

Orientalism and the newly emerged discipline of comparative religions.⁴⁷ Investigating the history and beliefs of the subcontinent's various peoples fed a cosmopolitan, bourgeois market at home, eager to consume the striking novelty of the Orient.⁴⁸

In conclusion, the latter half of the eighteenth century saw two factions square up against each other over the question of the religious governance of India. On one side, the Company and a (decreasing) number of episcopal and lay supporters at home expressed suspicion and hostility toward calls for evangelisation, preferring to argue either that British rule must be 'Indianised' or that, whilst converting Indians to Christianity was desirable, it was not possible to do so at present.⁴⁹ On the other side, increasingly vocal non-Conformists were joined by senior members of the clergy in insisting on 'pious' clauses that called for the Company to take greater spiritual (Christian) care of its vast subject population.⁵⁰ The backbone of the anti-evangelist movement within the Company consisted of senior and long-serving officials. Many of these individuals also allied themselves with contemporary Orientalist studies. Below, we investigate the extent to which these individuals' antiquarian studies led them to engage with radical or sceptical ideas.⁵¹ Franklin points out that Orientalist Jones' 'speculation about mankind's monogenesis' and the 'primeval source' of Christian civilisation drove scholarly enquiries 'throughout Europe' and represented a 'Romantic threat to existing systems of belief'. Through his study of Sanskrit, Jones tended towards the 'separation of language from religion and mythology', leading the way in distinguishing

⁴⁷ A useful overview of these debates can be found in Levitin, 'From Sacred History', pp. 1120-1, 1136-40.

⁴⁸ Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, pp. 78-80. On European artistic practices and their novelty in diplomatic exchanges with Indian rulers, see Natasha Eaton, 'Between Mimesis and Alterity: Art, Gift, and Diplomacy in Colonial India, 1770-1800', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 46 (2004), pp. 816-44 (pp. 818-19); on Asian-European musical exchanges, see David R. M. Irving, 'Lully in Siam: Music and Diplomacy in French-Siamese Cultural Exchanges, 1680-1690', *Early Music*, XL.3 (2012), pp. 393-420.

⁴⁹ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 20-2.

⁵⁰ On internal divisions within the evangelical campaign, see Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 18-151.

⁵¹ Rational religion can be traced back to Restoration debates and continued to be articulated in increasingly radical ways following the so-called Glorious Revolution: John Spurr, "'Rational Religion" in Restoration England', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 49.4 (1988), pp. 563-85.

the new 'science of linguistics' from the version of history found in Scripture.⁵²

By investigating how Orientalist and Romanticist discourses influenced Hastings and those around him, I shall show how hostility to evangelism represented more than merely concerns about security and the maintenance of minority rule, as Carson and Robert Travers have alleged.⁵³ The Romantic and Orientalist visions of India found in Jones' writings indicate the freethinking tendencies associated with the circle of intellectuals associated with Hastings' rule.⁵⁴ Rational religion had its part to play in Orientalist traditions and we shall see later on how antiquarian investigations entertained deist criticisms of the dominant Judeo-Christian exceptionalism that underpinned Church of England Protestantism. Given the concentration of prominent Orientalists allied to this debate about the role of Christianity in India, it seems prudent to investigate the extent to which the two were linked. First, we must more properly understand why deist critiques were radical and how such radical theologies were expressed in a society that placed great emphasis on religious conformity.

Deism and the English Religious Context

Dmitri Levitin has claimed that although 'seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Orientalism was the home of huge innovations... a widespread emphasis on "natural religion" was not, for the most part, one of them'.⁵⁵ Levitin rightly argues that mainstream scholarship was more influential on the development of comparative religion as a discipline than the small

⁵² Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, p. 38; Garland Hampton Cannon and Michael J. Franklin, 'A Cymmrodor Claims Kin in Calcutta: An Assessment of Sir William Jones as Philologist, Polymath, and Pluralist', *Transactions of the Honourable Society of Cymmrodorion*, 11 (2005), pp. 50-69. For an alternative perspective on Christian monogenetic origin myths from seventeenth-century travellers, see Anthony Pagden, *The Fall of Natural Man: The American Indian and the Origins of Comparative Ethnology*, 2nd edn (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986), pp. 19-20.

⁵³ Travers, 'The Eighteenth Century in Indian History', pp. 492-508; Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, p. 75.

⁵⁴ Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, pp. 9-35.

⁵⁵ Levitin, 'From Sacred History', p. 1139.

cabal of radical deists identified by Jonathan Israel.⁵⁶ Antitrinitarians and deists may have adapted humanist scholarship to serve their freethinking motives, but these investigations had their roots in the ‘contextualisation of the Old Testament’ found amongst Christian apologists and polemicists from the ‘late sixteenth century onwards’. Although the deist critiques of Christian doctrines of revelation were novel, deists like John Tolland and sceptics like Voltaire were indebted to earlier studies of ‘the history of ancient paganism’.⁵⁷ I contend that natural religion was on the minds of certain prominent English Orientalists. This overlap is to be expected given that, as App, Daniel Varisco, Ziad Elmarsafy, and Guy Stroumsa have pointed out, Orientalism emerged from historical investigations allied to biblical exegesis.⁵⁸ Whilst the study of Asian traditions was not a major contributor to emergent Enlightenment ideas about rational religion, the latter left its mark on the former in a number of ways. First, it is worth outlining the nature of English deism and how recent scholarship on deism and deists can inform our study of contemporary Orientalism.

A small group of English deist writers formed an integral part of early Enlightenment religious debates.⁵⁹ Their ideas concerning natural religion and associated doubts about the revealed status of the Judeo-Christian tradition had a long-lasting impact. This impact is increasingly understood in light of wider debates about the relationship between Scripture, history and ethnography of other religious traditions. Within this wider world of *historia sacra* and the antiquarian or contextual study

⁵⁶ Jonathan Israel, *Enlightenment Contested: Philosophy, Modernity, and the Emancipation of Man, 1670-1752* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), pp. 409-35, 472; Israel, *Radical Enlightenment*, pp. 449, 451.

⁵⁷ Levitin, ‘From Sacred History’, pp. 1139-40.

⁵⁸ App, ‘Jones’s Ancient Theology’, p. 77; Daniel Martin Varisco, *Reading Orientalism: Said and the Unsaid* (Washington: University of Washington Press, 2007), pp. 115-16; Ziad Elmarsafy, *The Enlightenment Qur’an: The Politics of Translation and the Construction of Islam* (Oxford: Oneworld, 2009), pp. 28-9; Guy G. Stroumsa, ‘John Spenser and the Roots of Idolatry’, *History of Religions*, 41.1 (2001), pp. 1-23 (p. 6).

⁵⁹ Recent works on English deism include Wayne Hudson, *Enlightenment and Modernity*; Hudson, *The English Deists*; Lynn Hunt, Margaret Jacob, and Wijnand Mijnhardt, *The Book That Changed Europe: Picart and Bernard’s Religious Ceremonies of the World* (Cambridge, MA and London: Harvard University Press, 2010); Matthew Lalor, *Tindal, Freethinker: An Eighteenth Century Assault on Religion* (London: Continuum, 2006); Diego Lucci, *Scripture and Deism: The Biblical Criticism of the Eighteenth-Century British Deists* (Bern: Peter Lang, 2008).

of the Old Testament, Orientalists were prominent, as Dietrich Klein and Martin Mulsow both suggest.⁶⁰ Whilst this antiquarian scholarship was theologically mainstream in the sense that it acknowledged the authenticity and accuracy of Christian Scripture, it could be 'idiosyncratic'. For example, the polymath Athanasius Kircher claimed that idolatry had come about when the 'common people' misunderstood 'an original Adamic revelation' which had been 'preserved through Noah and his sons to all the world's nations'.⁶¹ Kircher's universalist revelation, also reflected in Thomas Tenison's *Of Idolatry* (1678), suggested a foundational, universal Christian religion which has degenerated into polytheism. This notion was fundamental to many Orientalist ideas, substantiating Levitin's view that rationalist theologies were some distance removed from contemporary Orientalists' minds. Yet we shall see later on that some Orientalists advocated heterodox, potentially deist theologies that were deeply sceptical of the kinds of revelations that were the bread and butter of mainstream theologically informed histories.

More generally, Levitin notes that early modern religious philosophers 'eschewed abstract philosophical reasoning in favour of historical modes of discourse'. Levitin documents the rise of the 'history of scholarship as a discipline in its own right' and has shown that a 'systematic' approach to the prehistory of disciplines, including biblical criticism or patristics, has led to the synthesis of new historical approaches, at once works of 'scholarly biography' but also 'intellectual historians interested in broader patterns of change'.⁶² These developments

⁶⁰ Jan Loop, 'Johann Heinrich Hottinger (1620-1667) and the "Historia Orientalis"', *Church History and Religious Culture*, 88 (2008), pp. 169-203; Martin Mulsow, 'Socinianism, Islam and the Radical Uses of Arabic Scholarship', *Al-Quantara*, 31 (2010), pp. 549-86. Also relevant to seventeenth-century relations between oriental studies, Islam and anti-Trinitarian beliefs is Dietrich Klein, 'Inventing Islam in Support of Christian Truth: Theodore Hackspan's Arabic Studies in Altdorf, 1642-6', *History of Universities*, 25 (2010), pp. 26-55.

⁶¹ Levitin, 'From Sacred History', p. 1134. On Kircher and his 'rehabilitation' by modern scholarship, see the essays in *The Great Art of Knowing: The Baroque Encyclopaedia of Athanasius Kircher*, ed. by Daniel Stolzenberg (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001).

⁶² Levitin, 'From Sacred History', p. 1122. See also Christopher Ligota and Jean-Louis Quantin, 'Introduction', in *History of Scholarship: A Selection of Papers from the Seminar on the History of Scholarship Held Annually at the Warburg Institute*, ed. by Christopher Ligota and Jean-Louis Quantin (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), pp. 1-38.

can be usefully applied to eighteenth-century Orientalism, a discipline whose shared interest in historical modes of analysis, and obsessive interest with antiquity and ancient texts cannot be overstated. In the next section, I show how these ideas influenced Orientalist accounts of polytheistic religions, examining the theological orthodoxy or otherwise of Orientalist investigations into world religious history, both radical and mainstream.⁶³

First though, I shall outline some of the key individuals and ideas within English deist thought. This will allow us to see how contemporary Orientalism had the potential to endorse or subvert the mainstream, revelatory account of religious diversity. The canon of English deist works is generally identified with early eighteenth-century ‘freethinkers’ such as John Toland, Anthony Collins, Matthew Tindal, Thomas Morgan, Thomas Chubb and Peter Annet.⁶⁴ Recently, Wayne Hudson has explored important continuities with seventeenth-century writers, including Herbert of Cherbury and Charles Blount.⁶⁵ Broadly speaking, all these writers expressed doubts about the role of miracles, prophecies and revelations within mainstream Christian traditions. In general, English deists argued that positive revelation, including such staples of the Old and New Testaments as prophecy and miracles, were inventions of priests and superfluous to a rational justification of faith based on reason alone.⁶⁶ Deism substituted supernatural effects for an ‘innatist doctrine of revealed religion’ that effectively reduced the biblical history of Christ to the re-foundation of ‘the religion of nature’. Revealed religion itself became

⁶³ Levitin, ‘From Sacred History’, p. 1134; Joan-Pau Rubiés, ‘Theology, Ethnography and the Historicization of Idolatry’, *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67 (2006), pp. 571-96.

⁶⁴ Hudson, *English Deists*, pp. 1-28; Lalor, *Tindal, Freethinker*, p. 2; Lucci, *Scripture and Deism*, pp. 16, 19-20; Wigelsworth, *Deism in Enlightenment England*, p. 6.

⁶⁵ Hudson, *English Deists*, pp. 41-77, esp. pp. 49-51, 77.

⁶⁶ Lalor, *Tindal, Freethinker*, pp. 138, 142; Alex Schulman, *The Secular Contract: The Politics of Enlightenment* (New York: Continuum, 2011), pp. 83-8, p. 171, 172, 174-5; Lucci, *Scripture and Deism*, p. 15. See also Peter Harrison, ‘Miracles, Early Modern Science, and Rational Religion’, *Church History*, 75.3 (2006), pp. 493-510. This idea can also be found in Charles Blount, *Religio Laici, Written in a Letter to John Dryden Esq.* (London, 1683), pp. 15-17, 20-8. On anticlericalism in deist writing, see Alex Barber, “‘Why don’t those Lazy Priests Answer the Book?’ Matthew Tindal, Censorship, Freedom of the Press and Religious Debate in Early Eighteenth-Century England”, *History*, 98 (2013), pp. 680-707 (pp. 686, 688-92).

‘superfluous’ as revelation merely served to confirm ‘natural religion’.⁶⁷ For instance, Tindal was hostile to doctrines of predestination, and also held other anti-Scripturalist views. Indeed, Tindal argued that ‘if one person, much less an entire nation, was left without a divine revelation which was of benefit to others, it would be most unfair’, and therefore ‘everyone must have equal access to the means of salvation’.⁶⁸

Through denying the favoured status of the Judeo-Christian tradition, the constellation of writers known as the English deists promulgated a radical reinterpretation of the relationship between God and His creation. Their alternative – an innatist view of the deity as a non-interventionist force within nature – cast doubt on the doctrine of creation *ex nihilo*. By suggesting that prophecy and miracles were contrary to reason and, therefore, either superfluous or fictitious, English deism radically challenged the orthodox view of God’s relationship with the Established church, which was founded on historical accounts of revelations found in key Christian texts. Instead, they advocated a more limited conception of the deity as a creative force inherent in nature, provoking the ire of Lesley Stephen and a generation of Tractarian Victorian commentators as a result.⁶⁹

These critiques also influenced subsequent historiography. Historians throughout the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries largely dismissed the English deists as marginal to the Enlightenment in England, often recapitulating High Church critiques of nineteenth-century polemicists such as Stephen.⁷⁰ There has recently been a revival of scholarly interest in early Enlightenment arguments for rational religion.⁷¹ However, the revisionist historiography championed by Jonathan Israel

⁶⁷ Lucci, *Scripture and Deism*, pp. 15-16.

⁶⁸ Lalor, *Tindal, Freethinker*, p. 142. Lalor is paraphrasing Tindal: Matthew Tindal, *Christianity as Old as the Creation: Or, the Gospel, a Republication of the Religion of Nature*, 2 vols. (London, 1730), I, pp. 1-12.

⁶⁹ Hudson, *English Deists*, pp. 10-3; on the emergence of different forms of deism, see pp. 32-3, 38-9, 41-71; Wigelsworth, *Deism in Enlightenment England*, pp. 204-9.

⁷⁰ Hudson, *English Deists*, pp. 3-4; Lalor, *Tindal, Freethinker*, p. 141; Lucci, *Scripture and Deism*, pp. 18-21.

⁷¹ Spurr, ‘Rational Religion’, pp. 564-85.

has been critiqued for assuming a 'dichotomy between conservative English Enlightenment... and deists'.⁷² Hudson has shown that the published writings of Blount, Collins, Toland and Tindal only tell us so much about their confessional identities. By analysing their private correspondence and clandestinely circulated manuscript works alongside their published works, Hudson demonstrated that 'multiplicities and ambiguities characterise their lives as well as their texts'. In so doing, he avoids assuming 'in advance that they were deists, infidels or atheists in an exclusive identity sense'.⁷³

By situating these authors in the context of Protestant early Enlightenment, Hudson has shown how the English deists writings were manifested in their 'various social roles as philosophers, theological writers, political pamphleteers, clergy, classical scholars, historians, lawyers, university dons and public officials'. By 'recapturing the social and intellectual tensions which defined their social roles', their 'radical religious ideas' are situated within the wider 'Protestant thought' of the early eighteenth century. His 'nuanced reading' shows that 'these writers were not publicists advancing their extreme views in civil society', but rather 'multi-layered cultural performers'. Furthermore, 'many [deist] writers were constrained by livelihood or social role to be Christians', extending in some cases to active involvement with the Church of England.⁷⁴ In short, deistic discourses were not as marginal to eighteenth-century religious debates and discourses as earlier historiography had suggested. Deism was not an exclusive identity, and individuals commonly mixed heterodox and orthodox theological positions. When considering deist philosophies, it is important to be aware of their flexibility and adaptability and avoid assuming a binary opposition between sceptical and orthodox positions.⁷⁵

⁷² Wigelsworth, *Deism in Enlightenment England*, p. 4.

⁷³ Hudson, *English Deists*, p. 26; *Enlightenment and Modernity*, p. 2.

⁷⁴ Hudson, *English Deists*, pp. 5, 23. See also discussion of Hastings' alleged deism in the present chapter above, pp. 185-6.

⁷⁵ The most recent scholarship on this issue can be found in *Atheism and Deism Revalued: Heterodox Religious Identities in Britain, 1650-1800*, ed. by Jeffrey R. Wigelsworth, Wayne

In contrast, Diego Lucci suggests that deists ‘regarded reason as a means to undermine the Christian faith and traditional Christian beliefs’.⁷⁶ In a similar vein, Matthew Lalor emphasised Tindal’s role in consolidating deistic rationalism.⁷⁷ However, these readings are derived from older assumptions that deism was a marginal and radical offshoot of the Enlightenment.⁷⁸ Lucci suggests that the deists’ sole concern was ‘reason in religion’ – i.e. that faith was insufficient and God had instituted natural reason as the sole foundation for religious belief and mankind’s’ salvation.⁷⁹ In this regard, Jeffrey Wigelsworth’s argument is more convincing. He asserts that ‘many of the assumed truisms’ of the deists ‘politics and natural philosophy do not withstand close scrutiny’, in particular assumptions about their separation from the mainstream of Protestant Enlightenment. He contends that ‘a shared sense of Protestantism’ was ‘integral to the early modern English polity’ and it is essential to consider deists and associated freethinkers in this ‘cultural context’.⁸⁰ In Hudson’s analysis, each generation of deistic writers built upon the writings of their predecessors. Whilst acknowledging that a defining characteristic of the deists’ work was their ‘doubt [concerning] revealed religion’, Hudson suggests that ‘a range of positions influenced by [multiple] forms of deism’ developed before Toland and Tindal.⁸¹ Alex Barber reinforces this view, showing how a variety of individuals within the Established church responded positively and negatively to Tindal’s publications, in particular his *Rights of the Christian Church* (1706).⁸²

Deism incorporated a range of sceptical beliefs that could happily cohabit with more mainstream theologies. Earlier writers such as Herbert

Hudson and Diego Lucci (Farnham: Ashgate, 2014). Hudson’s contribution is of particular relevance, see Wayne Hudson, ‘Atheism and Deism Demythologized’, in *Atheism and Deism Revalued: Heterodox Religious Identities in Britain, 1650-1800*, ed. by Jeffrey R. Wigelsworth, Wayne Hudson, and Diego Lucci (Farnham: Ashgate, 2014), pp. 13-24.

⁷⁶ Lucci, *Scripture and Deism*, p. 21.

⁷⁷ Lalor, *Tindal, Freethinker*, pp. 141-6.

⁷⁸ Hudson, *English Deists*, pp. 1-4.

⁷⁹ Lucci, *Scripture and Deism*, p. 20.

⁸⁰ Wigelsworth, *Deism in Enlightenment England*, pp. 4-5. See also Linda Colley, *Britons: Forging the Nation 1707-1837* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992), pp. 11-54.

⁸¹ Hudson, *English Deists*, p. 116.

⁸² Barber, ‘Why don’t those Lazy Priests’, pp. 683-4, 685, 687-8, 690-5, 697, 700, 703-4.

and Blount often only circulated their most radical views pseudonymously or clandestinely. Although later writers were proficient publishers, they did not always acknowledge their deism explicitly.⁸³ We must, therefore, be wary of assuming that any one individual defined the English deist tradition. Wigelsworth suggests that ‘an accurate account’ of deism cannot be found ‘within the output of [any] one individual’ in the tradition.⁸⁴ Lalor has claimed that ‘theological lying’ mars our understanding of many English deist texts. Hudson refutes this, suggesting that the ‘many levels of their texts’ demonstrate their role as ‘intra-Protestant thinkers’. In rejecting the view of ‘deists writing against Christianity’ propounded by Israel, Hudson shows how their ‘private beliefs’ meshed with their ‘multiple social roles’ and thus how ‘the challenges they made to... Christianity as a positive religion’ were received and critiqued in the context of wider early Enlightenment society and the Church of England establishment.⁸⁵

Similarly, App has suggested that individual Orientalists possessed multiple and competing confessional identities. His analysis displays the value of understanding how Orientalist writers mediated their religious outlooks through their published works.⁸⁶ In considering the confessional outlook of Orientalists, we are also investigating the long-lasting impact of deism over the British Enlightenment. The overlap between deism and Orientalism demonstrates that Levitin is correct to say that the simple ‘heterodox/progressive versus orthodox/progressive model of [historical] change’ is inadequate.⁸⁷ The progeny of radical deist challenges fused with more mainstream theological enquiries and had a wider impact upon histories of both Christianity and so-called primitive religions.⁸⁸ Thus, both

⁸³ Hudson, *Enlightenment and Modernity*, pp. 1-3, 12.

⁸⁴ Wigelsworth, *Deism in Enlightenment England*, p. 9.

⁸⁵ Hudson, *English Deists*, p. 117; Lalor, *Tindal, Freethinker*, p. 146. See also David Berman, ‘Deism, Immortality, and the Art of Theological Lying’, in J. A. Leo Lemay (ed.), *Deism, Masonry, and the Enlightenment: Essays Honouring Alfred Owen Aldridge* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1987), pp. 61-78.

⁸⁶ App, ‘Jones’s Ancient Theology’, pp. 71-7.

⁸⁷ Levitin, ‘From Sacred History’, p. 1121.

⁸⁸ Sheehan, ‘Sacred and Profane’, pp. 60-1.

radical and conservative theologies influenced contemporary Orientalism. Like the deists writers already discussed, we cannot assume that Orientalists possessed a singular theological outlook, nor that their publications clearly state every nuance of their philosophical and theological opinions.

Deist ideas influenced a range of debates in the decades before Orientalist Jones set sail for Bombay. Despite its contribution to 'the advancement of biblical criticism' and the development of the Enlightenment in England, Lucci claims that 'deism finally died down in the second half of the eighteenth century'.⁸⁹ There are three reasons why we should doubt this account of the diminution of deism. Firstly, a brief survey of items available via Eighteenth Century Collections Online found around fifty works both supporting and refuting deist ideas published in the latter half of the eighteenth century.⁹⁰ Although deism was not the hot topic it has been in the first half of the century, we should hesitate before confining deism to an early Enlightenment moment. Anti-deist works continued to be published in the latter half of the century and were met by a comparable number of pro-deist texts, some of them pseudonymous. For example, John Leland's encyclopaedia of theological disputes devoted considerable attention to deism and anti-deism and was republished several times between 1754 and 1798. Reprints of earlier deist works, in particular those of Peter Annet, who subsequently recanted his deism, were also common right up to the end of the century, with French editions of two of Annet's texts and one by Toland also being printed during the 1760s.⁹¹

Secondly, deism was stringently criticised by Tractarian Victorian writers, most prominently Stephen, suggesting that defenders of

⁸⁹ Lucci, *Scripture and Deism*, p. 16.

⁹⁰ I have located 59 works both attacking and defending deist ideas from 1750-1800 through Eighteenth Century Collections Online. This number was supplemented by reprints of earlier deist tracts from the first half of the century. The work of recanted deist Peter Annet was particularly popular: his *Deism Revealed* was reprinted multiple times between 1750 and 1800.

⁹¹ Hudson, *Enlightenment and Modernity*, p. 2; John Leland, *A View on the Principal Deistical Writers that have appeared in England in the Last and Present Century*, (London, 1755, 1764, 1798).

Trinitarianism still felt the need to make an example of these earlier heresies, even as they receded over the horizon of the previous century.⁹² Thirdly, deism had an impact on the development of comparative religious studies as a discipline. In their fascinating study of Jean Frederic Bernard and Bernard Picart's *Religious Ceremonies of the World* (1723), Lynn Hunt, Margaret Jacob and Wijnand Mijnhardt argue that the author and illustrator's personal experiences as Protestant French exiles in the Netherlands provoked sympathy for deistic ideas. Bernard and Picart's seven-volume collection considered various Christian denominations alongside a startling array of foreign traditions, including Judaism, Islam and Hinduism in a neutral and measured tone. Bernard and Picart's work was translated and widely praised across Europe. Bernard and Picart's sympathetic depiction of other believers' practices, including contemporary deists, showed the potential for ethnography, comparative religion and deistic freethinking to segue into a distinctive and radical Enlightenment vision of comparative religion.⁹³

There are two principal takeaways from this overview of deism, one historical and the other historiographical. Firstly, any study of contemporary Orientalism must take account of both overt and covert indications of 'infidel' beliefs made by Jones and his associates.⁹⁴ Secondly, Hudson's emphasis on the multiple social personae of deist writers can be usefully applied to the motley crowd of Orientalists, antiquarians and travel writers who wrote about Indian religious traditions. By taking a 'constellational' view of the principal advocates of English deism, Hudson has shown how the private beliefs and social roles of individual 'deists' interacted and, at times, conflicted.⁹⁵ This approach emphasises the diversity of private confessional beliefs and can be usefully applied to the intellectual circle surrounding Jones in India. It allows us to trace

⁹² Lalor, *Tindal, Freethinker*, p. 141.

⁹³ Hunt et al, *Book that Changed Europe*, pp. 247-69. Their work was roughly contemporaneous with Joseph Pitts' ethnographically inclined account of his conversion to Islam, see comparisons between the two works in Chapter 4 above at pp. 147-8.

⁹⁴ Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, pp. 38-9, 47-9, 108.

⁹⁵ Hudson, *English Deists*, pp. 18-26.

subversive and orthodox theologies through Orientalist texts without having to wonder whether any individual author was a deist in an exclusive identity sense. Such a 'constellational' approach allows us to draw conclusions about individual Orientalist writers' private and public beliefs within the wider context of both their colonial careers and their accounts of Indian history and religion. Thus, I approach eighteenth-century Orientalism as a diversity of ideas rather than a singular tradition. In so doing, I aim to highlight the potential for multiple, contested and conflicting theological positions within the corpus of Orientalist literature.

Deism in India: Orientalist Writing and Heterodox Theologies

At the same time as senior Company officials were opposing the evangelisation of India's non-Christian population, administrators, traders and lawyers in Bombay and Calcutta were producing Orientalist accounts of Hindu and Muslim religious and legal texts. Their translations and travel works were swiftly reprinted back in Britain and fed a growing appetite for the exotic amongst educated readers. These texts testify to an increased knowledge and awareness of non-European traditions, although often couched in terms borrowed from Classical traditions or dressed up in Romanticist terms.⁹⁶ Such works also tacitly engaged with debates about natural religion because they sought to understand the origins and assess the validity of various polytheistic traditions. Deism was entertained explicitly and implicitly by 'Orientalist' Jones in his historical account of Indian, Greek and Roman religions, and by Michael Symes (a lesser-known diplomat and travel writer) in his account of his embassy to Burma. Their contrasting views of these radical theologies demonstrate the benefits of a 'constellational' approach to these texts.

Orientalist engagements with Hindu and Buddhist traditions uncovered contradictions between Christian Scripture and Vedic traditions. Like the Indo-European language family, Jones' linguistic schema, these ideas had radical implications in a society where many

⁹⁶ Franklin, 'The Celt knew the Indian', p. 27.

contemporaries believed the Bible to be a literally true history of the world.⁹⁷ Jones' explorations of Mosaic Law, and other arguments for a correlation between Hindu and European traditions, highlight the largely Christocentric nature of these enquiries. Just as English deists performed multiple and overlapping social roles within a Protestant society that disapproved of their more radical beliefs, Orientalists were indebted to earlier mainstream biblical scholarship. They worked within a discipline that was only gradually being emancipated from a tight focus on biblical exegesis and Scriptural analysis.⁹⁸ Like the deists, their works challenged some of the fundamental assumptions that underpinned European Christianity, including notions of Judeo-Christian exceptionalism and the favoured status of the Israelites and their Christian inheritors.⁹⁹ However, unlike many deists, Jones and Symes were interested in establishing the historical truth of Christian originary myths.

Since Thomas Roe visited India in the early seventeenth century, travel works had emphasised the civility of Mughal rulers and their religious toleration.¹⁰⁰ During the eighteenth century, Indomania amongst Britain's ruling classes manifested itself in popular Romanticist works of art on Oriental subjects and the conspicuous adoption of 'Oriental' dress, crockery and customs amongst *nouveau riche* returning nabobs.¹⁰¹ Jones had already established his reputation as an Orientalist within this cosmopolitan milieu before he departed for Bengal in 1783. He had produced translations of Hindu and Persian texts that whetted the appetites of many intellectual readers for further knowledge of Oriental

⁹⁷ App, *Birth of Orientalism*, p. xii; Rubiés, 'Theology, Ethnography', pp. 573-4.

⁹⁸ App, 'Jones's Ancient Theology', pp. 73, 77.

⁹⁹ Hudson, *Enlightenment and Modernity*, pp. 1-3; Israel, *Radical Enlightenment*, pp. 449, 451; Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, p. 47-8. The latter identifies both Jones and his father as unequivocally deist. On the wider deist tradition and the value of context-based analysis rather than an *a priori* assumption of radicalism, see Levitin, 'From Sacred History', pp. 1127-8.

¹⁰⁰ Sapra, *Limits of Orientalism*, pp. 17, 19, 33, 62-72, 88, 90-2.

¹⁰¹ On Indian influences on England, see Almeida and Gilpin, *Indian Renaissance*, p. 119; Chatterjee, *Representation of India*, pp. 31-83; Franklin, 'I Burn with Desire of Seeing Shiraz', pp. 749-57; Philip B. Wagoner, 'Precolonial Intellectuals and the Production of Colonial Knowledge', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 45 (2003), pp. 783-814.

traditions.¹⁰² Jones' love of Indian and Persian literature complemented his professional duties as a judge. His colonial profession and Orientalist vocation came together in his study and translation of *Mānava-Dharmaśāstra*, the law-code of the school of Manu, a prestigious Hindu 'system of jurisprudence'. Jones saw the Law of Manu as foundational to ensuring Company rule developed along Indian lines.¹⁰³ Likewise, his aforementioned linguistic theory, which identified the Indo-European language family, would contribute to the reverse transculturation and Orientalisation of intellectual culture in Britain.¹⁰⁴

Like Jones, Symes' Orientalist works were a direct product of his employment as a diplomat for the Company. Symes' narrative of his 1795 Burmese embassy provides a comprehensive historical and cultural description of one of the largest Southeast Asian kingdoms remaining outside British imperial control at the turn of the nineteenth century.¹⁰⁵ Symes had served in the Bengal army of the East India Company for over a decade when he was dispatched as Company envoy to Burma. His narrative was produced whilst on leave in 1800 and was one of the most detailed reports of Burma to date.¹⁰⁶ Alongside descriptions of local architecture,

¹⁰² Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, pp. 78-89.

¹⁰³ Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, p. 34; Franklin, 'The Celt knew the Indian', pp. 27-8. On Jones and the relative prestige of Indian systems, see Bruce Lincoln, 'Isaac Newton and Oriental Jones on Myth, Ancient History, and the Relative Prestige of Peoples', *History of Religions*, 42.1 (2002), pp. 1-18.

¹⁰⁴ Franklin, *Limits of Orientalism*, pp. 39-42.

¹⁰⁵ Symes was sent to deal with a border dispute that had its roots in ethnic, religious and economic tensions in Arakan, the region that straddled the border between British-controlled Bengal and Burma. On the origins of these tensions, see Michael W. Charney, 'Crisis and Reformation in a Maritime Kingdom of Southeast Asia: Forces of Instability and Political Disintegration in Western Burma (Arakan), 1603-1701', *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient*, 41.2 (1998), pp. 185-219; Victor B. Lieberman, 'Ethnic Politics in Eighteenth-Century Burma', *Modern Asian Studies*, 12.3 (1978), pp. 455-82; E. R. Leach, 'The Frontiers of "Burma"', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 3.1 (1960), pp. 49-68. On later colonial developments and the relationship between European and Burmese legal and philosophical systems, see Andrew Huxley, 'Positivists and Buddhists: The Rise and Fall of Anglo-Burmese Ecclesiastical Law', *Law & Social Enquiry*, 26.1 (2001), pp. 113-42; Anthony Webster, 'Business and Empire: A Reassessment of the British Conquest of Burma in 1885', *The Historical Journal*, 43.4 (2000), pp. 1003-25.

¹⁰⁶ Michael Symes, *Journal of His Second Embassy to the Court of Ava in 1802*, ed. by D. G. E. Hall (London: Allen & Unwin, 1955), pp. lxi-lxiii; Douglas M. Peers, 'Symes, Michael', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/26880>> [accessed 12 September 2013]. For a contrasting account by Symes' successor as ambassador

customs and a narrative of his negotiations with king Bodawpaya, Symes also included an extensive historical narrative and a nuanced portrayal of their Buddhist faith and a number of other religious groups encountered during his voyage. The format of his *Embassy* (1800) is clearly indebted to the carefully structured eclecticism that Joan Pau Rubiés identified as a defining feature of early modern travel writing as a genre.¹⁰⁷

P. J. Marshall and Glyndwr Williams have shown that Buddhism remained somewhat elusive in European travel narratives until well into the nineteenth century.¹⁰⁸ Though Symes acknowledges that differences existed between Burmese religious practices and those of India's 'Brahminical' population, he tends to see the two as different sects of the same religion.¹⁰⁹ Symes' evidence for identifying Burmese Buddhism as a sect of Hinduism comes from the identification of Buddha as one of the avatars of Vishnu, although he overlooks the view of many orthodox Hindus that Buddhists were deviant since they deny the authority of Vedic tradition. In addition, he suggests that the Burmese also followed the law

that emphasised Burmese incivility, see G. P. Ramachandra, 'Captain Hiram Cox's Mission to Burma, 1796-1798: A Case of Irrational Behaviour in Diplomacy', *Journal of Southeast Asian Studies*, 12 (1981), pp. 433-51; Hiram Cox, *Journal of a Residence in the Burmhan Empire* (London: J. Warren, 1821). On British intelligence gathering more generally, see Christopher Alan Bayly, *Empire and Information: Intelligence Gathering and Social Communication in India, 1780-1870* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996). Symes' report was more influential than Cox' amongst English historians of Burma and is cited throughout Arthur P. Phayre's Victorian history of Burma: Arthur P. Phayre, *History of Burma: From the Earliest Time to the End of the First War with British India* (Oxford: Routledge, 1883, 2007), pp. 147, 149, 159, 162, 220, 221-3.

¹⁰⁷ Joan Pau Rubiés, 'Instructions for Travellers: Teaching the Eye to See', *History and Anthropology*, 9 (1996), pp. 139-91 (pp. 140-2).

¹⁰⁸ Marshall and Williams, *Great Map of Mankind*, pp. 111-12. Marshall and Williams also note that 'deism' was identified by European travellers and writers in 'such apparently improbable places as Siberia and Mongolia' though there is no evidence that contemporaries interpreted Buddhism as a form of natural religion. However, the diversity of Asian religions was used as an argument for atheism, see George Berkeley, 'Alciphron, Or, the Minute Philosopher; in Seven Dialogues. Containing an Apology for the Christian Religion, against Those Who Are Called Free-Thinkers', in *Works of George Berkeley*, ed. by Alexander Campbell Fraser, 3 vols. (Oxford: Clarendon, 1871), II, pp. 1-368 (pp. 36, 51).

¹⁰⁹ This was a common misconception amongst European travellers: Marshall and Williams, *Great Map of Mankind*, p. 111. Gelders observes that the very concept of 'Hinduism' emerged from European attempts to 'classify a heterogeneous collection of traditions': Gelders, 'Genealogy of Colonial Discourse', pp. 563-4. For a more recent handling of the central role of Buddhism in European conceptions of 'Oriental philosophy', see Urs App, *The Cult of Emptiness: The Western Discovery of Buddhist Thought and the Invention of Oriental Philosophy* (Kyoto: University Media, 2012).

school of Manu, and that 'there is no separating their laws from their religion'.¹¹⁰ It would be a mistake to measure the accuracy of eighteenth-century sources by the ethnographic standards or more finely tuned religious categories of today. That said, it provides a useful indication of the potential gap between Orientalist opinions and indigenous believers' experiences.

Symes' text engaged with deeply divisive religious issues within his own society. Indeed, it is possible to reconstruct some of Symes' theological concerns from the manner in which he describes Burmese religious culture and ritual practices. In so doing, it becomes apparent that Symes was aware of and explicitly engaged with issues that relate to the emergence and evolution of idolatry in the world and contemporary debates about natural religion and deism.¹¹¹ Throughout the *Embassy*, Symes refers to Jones' annual *Discourses* and 'On The Gods of India, Italy and Greece' (c. 1784) in particular. Symes praises Jones as a 'great man' and wishes that the recently deceased 'genius whose learning so lately illuminated the East [had] been longer spared for the instruction and delight of mankind'.¹¹² He thus clearly intended his work to be a contribution to the Orientalist study of Asian civilisations championed by Jones. In 'On the Gods', Jones' confessional outlook is apparent. He tempered 'comparativism with relativism' in order to 'establish the classical dignity of the Hindu pantheon on a par with' that of Olympus.¹¹³ Symes' approach, in particular the way in which he identified features of resemblance between Eastern and Western traditions in order to

¹¹⁰ Symes, *Embassy*, p. 298, 503. He also observes that a play put on at the end of the Burmese solar year came from a Hindu sacred text (pp. 177-8).

¹¹¹ On the wider context of the meanings of idolatry and the debates it provoked in early modern thought, see Sheehan, 'Sacred and Profane', pp. 60-1; Jonathan Sheehan, 'Introduction: Thinking about Idols in Early Modern Europe', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67 (2006), pp. 561-69 (pp. 566, 568-9).

¹¹² Symes, *Embassy*, pp. 299-300, 302.

¹¹³ Franklin, 'The Celt knew the Indian', p. 31.

incorporate the former into established Christian histories, mirrors Jones' approach in 'Of the Gods'.¹¹⁴

Symes followed Jones' method by searching for historically specific connections between European paganism and Vedic tradition. Jones suggested that 'features of resemblance, too strong to have been accidental, are observable in different systems of polytheism' and, therefore, 'we can scarce help believing that some connection has immemorially subsisted between the several nations who have adopted them'.¹¹⁵ Jones observed that 'the *Gothick* system, which prevailed in the northern regions of *Europe*' was 'not merely similar' to ancient Roman and Greek beliefs 'but almost the same in another dress with an embroidery of images apparently Asiatick'. He claimed that 'a general union or affinity' existed 'between the most distinguished inhabitants of the primitive world'. The famous Orientalist argued that there can be no 'room to doubt of a great similarity between their strange religions'.¹¹⁶ Jones' view of Creation, and the divergence of religious and linguistic creeds, mirrored the established Scriptural narrative in which the postdiluvian repopulation of the earth by Noah's sons and the diffusion of languages following the fall of the tower of Babel were seen as responsible for the diversity of linguistic and religious practices around the world. Yet it also fundamentally altered that story by finding evidence for an 'Asiatick' influence over the foundational Ur-religion. Jones' lifelong fascination with Sanskrit, Persian and Asian languages led him to radical conclusions about the relationship between European and Asian traditions.¹¹⁷

¹¹⁴ Trautmann, 'Does India have History', pp. 176-81. On Orientalist methods, and the close involvement of Indian pandits, Brahmins and others in producing 'colonial' knowledge, see Wagoner, 'Precolonial Intellectuals', pp. 783-814.

¹¹⁵ William Jones, 'On the Gods of Greece, Italy and India', in *The Works of Sir William Jones, with the Life of the Author* ed. by Lord [John Shore] Teignmouth, 13 vols. (London: John Stockdale, 1807), III, pp. 319-397, (p. 319). 'On the Gods' was Jones' earliest essay on Indian religion, a topic he returned to repeatedly throughout *Asiatick Researches* and his other publications.

¹¹⁶ Jones, 'On the Gods', pp. 319-20.

¹¹⁷ Trautmann, 'Does India have History', pp. 176-81; Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, pp. 37, 38-9. On earlier discussions of this relationship, see Phillips, *Before Orientalism*, pp. 16-17; Benjamin Braude, 'The Sons of Noah and the Construction of Ethnic and Geographic Identities in the Medieval and Early Modern Periods', *William and Mary Quarterly*, 53.1 (1997), pp. 103-42.

Although indebted to Jones' position in a number of ways, Symes' argument is also distinct from it. He alludes to deism and attempts to pinpoint the chronological point at which Asiatic and European forms of paganism diverged. However, he also suggests that the correlation identified by Jones resulted from a shared 'sacred and primeval source' for both traditions.¹¹⁸ As well as implying a sacred source for both traditions, neither writer commented on the idolatrous character of either European paganism or Hindu/Buddhist worship. In this regard, they set themselves apart from conservative historiographical traditions that tended to use historical and contemporary exempla to demonstrate the favoured status of Christianity.¹¹⁹

As he investigated the divergence between these two traditions, Symes developed Jones' argument by insisting on more historically precise dating. He argued that the 'Boodh [Buddha] of the Indians and the Birmans... creates a striking resemblance... [with] the Woden of the Goths', as well as with 'Foe', the object of Chinese worship.¹²⁰ However, Symes claimed that 'chronology... must always be accepted as a surer guide to truth than inferences drawn from the resemblance of words'. He observed that Indian histories of 'the ninth incarnation of Vishnu [were] long antecedent to the existence of the deified hero in Scandinavia'. He pointed out that Jones' own calculations suggest that 'Boodh appeared on the earth... 1014 years before the birth of Christ'. In contrast, Symes asserted that 'Woden flourished at a time not very distant from our saviour' and, therefore, 'even the Birman Gaudma [Burmese Gautama, Buddha]... must have lived above 500 years before Woden'. Symes observed that 'so immense' a period of time 'can hardly be supposed to have been overlooked', and therefore argued that 'the supposition refers, not to the warrior of the north [Woden], but to the original deity Odin'. Symes also

¹¹⁸ Symes, *Embassy*, p. 302.

¹¹⁹ Hunt et al, *Book that Changed Europe*, pp. 2-3, 7-10, 19.

¹²⁰ Symes, *Embassy*, p. 301. Symes appears here to be referring to Chinese Buddhism as a separate belief system. On Jesuit representations of Chinese Buddhism, see Marshall and Williams, *Great Map of Mankind*, pp. 99, 110-1. On Buddha in German Orientalism in the later nineteenth century, see Marchand, *German Orientalism*, pp. 134-7, 271-7.

cast doubt on the claim that 'Boodh and Woden [were] the same person' since 'their doctrines are opposite, and their eras are widely remote'. Additionally, he highlighted 'apparent inconsistencies' between the Scandinavian 'god of terror' and 'the Ninth Avatar, [who] brought the peaceful olive, and came into the world for the sole purpose of preventing sanguinary acts'.¹²¹ Symes' argument emerged from investigating the religious dimension of the Indo-European linguistic family identified by Jones. Very much in the spirit of Jones' work, Symes provided a relativistic rather than racist solution to the 'enormous problem' that Jones 'bequeathed to an imperial world' of dark-skinned people possessing an 'ancient and "exquisitely refined" civilisation'.¹²²

As this example shows, Symes engaged with Orientalist ideas by following Jones' attempt to connect Indian deities to pagan European religious systems. However, by subjecting religious traditions to mathematical scrutiny, he rejected the symbolic analogue preferred by Jones. Instead, he emphasised the possibility of some prehistoric shared 'sacred and primeval' source. Both texts present these diverse traditions as emerging from common sacred origins and both can be located within the Orientalist tradition of comparative religion.¹²³ Furthermore, the suggestion that non-Christian traditions had sacred origins speaks powerfully to deist viewpoints, in particular Toland's assertion that Christianity was a natural religion founded at the Creation and intrinsic to man's reason rather than the product of the later revelations described in the Bible.¹²⁴

Jones' study of Indian languages, religions and histories generally reinforced the conventional view that foreign polytheists had deviated from a 'monogenetic origin and a divine revelation as proclaimed in the Old

¹²¹ Symes, *Embassy*, pp. 301-2.

¹²² Franklin, 'The Celt knew the Indian', p. 20; Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, pp. 39-40.

¹²³ Hunt et al, *Book that Changed Europe*, pp. 17-19.

¹²⁴ Wigelsworth, *Deism in Enlightenment*, pp. 8-10; Sheehan, 'Sacred and Profane', pp. 60-1; Barber, 'Why don't those Lazy Priests', pp. 686-8, 706-7. Toland's argument that priestly deception proliferated revelations and miracles made explicit similar arguments made implicitly in Charles Blount, *Great Is Diana of the Ephesians: Or The Original of Idolatry, Together With the Politick Institutions of the Gentiles' Sacrifices* (London, 1680).

Testament'.¹²⁵ Symes' theological position is harder to work out. This is apparent in his suggestion that a shared 'sacred' origin might explain the apparent similarities between pagan European and Buddhist religions. Like Jones, Symes is sceptical of more implausible and radical examples of Vedic influence on European traditions. Symes noted that Charles Vallancey's theory that 'the Hindoos have been in Britain and in Ireland' is nothing more than a 'fanciful speculation' despite the 'respectable authority' of the author.¹²⁶ This inconsistency reflected Jones' view of Vallancey's theories. Despite having advised the Irish antiquarian on Indian source materials, Jones dismissed his conclusions as 'stupid'.¹²⁷ His claim that the Celts originated from India or Persia was clearly controversial since it significantly destabilised the prevailing Judeo-Christian and Greco-Roman origin myths of European society.

As an aside, it is worth noting that Vallancey's fanciful claims were entirely in keeping with the spirit of Orientalist Jones' antiquarian enterprise. Romanticist culture was as fascinated by the histories of the Celtic regions colonised by Anglo-Saxons as it was by Indian territories.¹²⁸ However, neither Symes nor Jones considered Vallancey's claims of Vedic-Celtic cultural contact respectable enough to be worthy of further investigations. Jones' relationship with his own Celtic heritage was very different. Franklin highlights similarities between Jones' father's interest in ancestral connections with ancient Welsh bards and Jones' own investigations into 'biblical genealogy and... linguistic families'. Jones' enthusiasm for translating and disseminating Oriental texts emulated the efforts of earlier Welsh scholars such as Lewis Morris in 'feeding the

¹²⁵ App, 'Jones's Ancient Theology', p. 11.

¹²⁶ Symes, *Embassy*, p. 302; Charles Vallancey, *A Vindication of the Ancient History of Ireland* (Dublin, 1786). See also Franklin, 'The Celt knew the Indian', pp. 33-6.

¹²⁷ Norman Vance, 'Vallancey, Charles', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/28051>> [accessed 22 October 2013]; Barbara Maria Stafford, *Voyages into Substance: Art, Science, Nature, and the Illustrated Travel Account, 1760-1840* (Cambridge, MA and London: The MIT Press, 1984), esp. pp. 138-9, 144-5.

¹²⁸ Franklin, 'The Celt knew the Indian', pp. 20-3.

Romantic hunger for the primitive and exotic' whilst 'uncovering... cultural riches' of non-Greco-Roman traditions.¹²⁹

Symes' comments on Vallancey do more than situate him within Romantic Orientalist writing and the investigation into the relationship between Asiatic civilisations and biblical history. He claims that further speculation such as Vallancey's (and, tacitly, his own work) will increase the chances 'of being able to trace all forms of divine worship to one sacred and primeval source'. Symes acknowledged diverse religious traditions as having a shared sacred origin, tacitly therefore being legitimate forms of 'divine' worship. This position implies a deistic conception of natural religion and, as was noted previously, substantiates Tindal's claim that an immanent God must be accessible to all nations and individuals. Symes was also aware of the theological significance of these conclusions and observed that, with these ideas in mind, 'the inquiry' into the relationship between Asian and European belief systems 'becomes more interesting, and awakens a train of serious ideas in a reflecting mind'.¹³⁰ For Symes, the question of the origins of polytheistic systems was intrinsically linked to uncovering the divinely ordained Ur-religion of mankind's earliest days.

In this regard, Symes strays from Jones' conclusions by explicitly addressing the potentially divine nature of polytheistic traditions. In contrast, Jones' engagement with floodology demonstrates the importance of mainstream Scriptural study to certain Orientalists. Jones used Noah's deluge as a point of reference and sought to confine lengthy Hindu historical traditions to the more circumspect dates given for the Creation in the Bible.¹³¹ Such enquiries place Jones at the intersection between an older, Scripturally-informed tradition and other Orientalists who were less concerned with producing comparisons between Christian Scripture and oriental belief systems.¹³² App notes that there is an 'undertone of doubt' in

¹²⁹ Franklin, 'The Celt knew the Indian', pp. 23-4, 27. On Jones' relationship with his Welsh ancestry, see Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, pp. 43-89.

¹³⁰ Symes, *Embassy*, p. 302.

¹³¹ Trautmann, 'Does India have History', pp. 176-81; Marshall and Williams, *Great Map of Mankind*, p. 106.

¹³² App, 'Jones's Ancient Theology', pp. 8-9, 11-14, 77.

'On the Gods'. Jones suggests that the connection between 'the most distinguished inhabitants of the primitive world' occurred 'at the time when they deviated... from the rational adoration of the only true God', which Jones holds to be a primeval religion akin to Christianity.¹³³ Jones claimed that there were four 'principal sources' for this degeneration from original, rational worship: the perversion of 'historical or natural truth... by ignorance', 'the mad apotheosis' of 'great men or of little men falsely called great', 'a wild admiration of the heavenly bodies' and the creation of 'numberless divinities... solely by the magick of poetry'. False gods could also be created by 'the metaphors and allegories of moralists and metaphysicians'.¹³⁴ Indeed, Jones' categories neatly mirror earlier conceptions of the causes of idolatry by Christian apologists.¹³⁵

Jones' reading is novel in other ways, though. Even his 'seemingly unequivocal endorsement of revelationism, Old Testament prophecy' and Christian exceptionalism as the 'legitimate heir of Old Testament religion' betrays an 'undertone of doubt'. He goes on to wonder about the origin of these beliefs and their divine nature. Jones asserted that 'a connection subsisted between the old idolatrous nations of *Egypt, India, Greece and Italy*' prior to the birth of Moses, though went on to claim that the 'truth and sanctity of the *Mosaick* history' was endorsed rather than doubted by his new claims. Despite his caution, Jones' conclusions clearly raised the question of 'the originality and revelatory basis' of the Scriptural history of Moses.¹³⁶

Jones' confessional views can also be traced through other works. In his *Hymn to Náráyena* (1785), Jones asserts that 'the wisest among the ancients, and some of the most enlightened among the moderns' believe

¹³³ App, 'Jones's Ancient Theology', pp. 11-14; Jones, 'On the Gods', pp. 321-2.

¹³⁴ Jones, 'On the Gods', pp. 321-2.

¹³⁵ See, for example, Thomas Tenison, *Of Idolatry: A Discourse in Which Is Endeavoured A Declaration Of Its Distinction from Superstition...* (London, 1678), pp. 45-8; Arthur Young, *An Historical Dissertation on Idolatrous Corruptions in Religion From the Beginning of the World* (London, 1734), I, pp. 28, 29, 30-1, 32, 36-7, 40-1, 57-79. Tenison's view of idolatry is discussed in Chapter 2 above, especially pp. 64-72.

¹³⁶ App, 'Jones's Ancient Theology', pp. 13-14; citing *Asiatick Researches*, I, pp. 271, 272. On these questions in wider Orientalist literature, see App, *Birth of Orientalism*, pp. 1-15. *Emphases* in original.

that ‘the whole Creation was rather *energy* than a *work*, by which the Infinite Being, who is present at all times and in all places, exhibits to the minds of his creatures a set of perceptions’. This doctrine of original uncreated oneness incorporated Hindu conceptions of ‘*māyā* [deception, or ‘the illusive operation of the deity’] as the fall into deception and multiplicity, and of a return to oneness where only God is perceived. In the hymn, Jones’ confessional perspective mingled contemporary, Classical and Oriental sources, bringing together Plato and the English empiricist George Berkeley in support of an ‘idealist theosophy’.¹³⁷

Is this ‘Deist’ Jones revealing himself through poetical metaphysics? An infrequent churchgoer, Jones’ investigations into ‘mankind’s first religion’ nonetheless found evidence of ‘God’s “omnipresence, wisdom and goodness”’ in Vedic texts, Sufi poetry and other Hindu and Persian texts.¹³⁸ Jones was more ‘attached to biblical authority’ than his contemporary Voltaire, attested to in his attempts to ‘trace... the origin of all peoples in the world’ back to the landing place of Noah’s ark, indicating the importance of Scripture to his Orientalism. This puts him at odds with contemporary Orientalists, including Abraham Anquetil-Duperron and John Holwell. Unlike Jones, they came to regard “Indian” texts as older than the Bible and invested them with as much (or even more) authority’.¹³⁹ Indeed, App is surprised by Jones’ ‘deep attachment to Bible-inspired chronology’, especially considering Jones’ contribution to the ‘emancipation’ of Orientalism from theology.¹⁴⁰

Hudson’s analysis of English deist writers may be instructive in this regard. The late seventeenth-century deist, Blount, expressed largely

¹³⁷ App, ‘Jones’s Ancient Theology’, pp. 17-18, see also pp. 17-21, citing William Jones, *The Collected Works of William Jones*, ed. by Garland Hampton Cannon, 13 vols. (Richmond: Curzon, 1993), xiii, pp. 302-9.

¹³⁸ App, ‘Jones’s Ancient Theology’, p. 76.

¹³⁹ App, ‘Jones’s Ancient Theology’, p. 77. On Jones’ disagreement with Anquetil-Duperron, see Franklin, *Orientalist Jones*, pp. 74-6. On Holwell and Anquetil-Duperron’s confessional perspectives in their oriental writing, see App, *Birth of Orientalism*, pp. 297-362, 363-439 respectively.

¹⁴⁰ App, ‘Jones’s Ancient Theology’, p. 77.

orthodox views in many of his published writings.¹⁴¹ Although Blount wrote under very different circumstances from Jones, both promulgated views that many saw as unorthodox in a society that (for the most part) still took biblical history to be literally true and saw Christianity as the ‘fulfilment and goal of all religion’.¹⁴² However, it would be a mistake to assume that in either ‘On the Gods’ or his *Hymn to Náráyena*, Jones was a ‘theological liar’ (to borrow Lucci’s phrase).¹⁴³ Franklin suggests that, prior to his departure for India, Jones was ‘appalled’ by the 1780 anti-Catholic Gordon riots, and advocated an ‘Enlightened deism’ in his poem ‘Kneel to the Goddess whom all Men Adore’ (1780).¹⁴⁴ Jones’ own experiences informed his confessional outlook, which was expressed in differing ways, with differing emphases, in different contexts throughout his career.

Jones’ history of connections between Indian and European pagan gods may have superficially reiterated Christian theology. It was also informed by Enlightenment principles and by Jones’ passion for Indian literature and law. By incorporating Persian, ancient Greek and Roman myth and history alongside Hindu religious concepts such as *māyā*, Jones radically claimed Asian origins for European religious traditions. Like earlier writers including Kircher and Tenison, Jones established the Protestant church as benefitting from and befitting of divine favour from the Christian deity. Although he asserted that non-Christian religion originated in a deviation from a foundational monotheism, his Ur-religion was decidedly Asiatic in character. It would be inaccurate to argue too strongly for Jones’ conformity to contemporary Protestant orthodoxy.

Symes drew upon the radical potential latent in much of Jones’ work. Symes advocated a more radical position, explicit in his claim that that Burmese, Hindu and Scandinavian beliefs are all forms of ‘divine worship’. Symes does not appear to see polytheism as inherently idolatrous, thereby suggesting that the deviation from Jones’ foundational

¹⁴¹ Hudson, *English Deists*, pp. 15, 18-19; Wigelsworth, *Deism in Enlightenment England*, pp. 8, 10.

¹⁴² App, *Birth of Orientalism*, p. xiii.

¹⁴³ Lalor, *Tindal, Freethinker*, p. 146.

¹⁴⁴ Franklin, ‘The Celt knew the Indian’, p. 30.

proto-Christian Ur-religion was less of a problem for Symes. In this sense, Symes' view comes closer to that of political and religious radicals such as Voltaire, and other Orientalists including Holwell and Louis Antequin.¹⁴⁵ He expressed 'great surprise' that the Burmese *Dharma Sastra* (which he terms their holy law) 'correspond[ed] closely with a Persian account of Sri Lankan law'.¹⁴⁶ Like Jones, he was also interested in relating Asian (in this case, Burmese) beliefs with Greco-Roman antiquity. He asserted that Burmese beliefs in reincarnation paralleled ancient Greek traditions. He suggested that Burmese followers of Buddha 'believe in metempsychosis', yet he also claimed they believe that 'after having undergone a certain number of transmigrations, their souls will at last either be received into their Olympus on the mountain Meru, or be sent to suffer torments in a place of divine punishments'.¹⁴⁷ European Christians had long ago adopted Greco-Roman beliefs as proto-Christian in character. Yet, it was as a direct result of Jones' Indo-European linguistic schema that it became thinkable for 'oriental' beliefs to be considered part of the history of civilised nations. Symes asserted that Buddhist doctrine derived from the more familiar Hindu and Persian traditions that had been familiarised by the research of Jones and other Orientalists like Nathaniel Halhed. In so doing, he connected Burmese beliefs with the more conventionally venerable antiquity of Europe.¹⁴⁸

When discussing non-Christian beliefs, Symes was more reticent than Jones to assume that polytheistic or idolatrous traditions were separate from or inferior to the Judeo-Christian tradition. This is apparent when we consider his description of the inhabitants of the isolated

¹⁴⁵ App, 'Jones's Ancient Theology', p. 77.

¹⁴⁶ Symes, *Embassy*, pp. 302-4. Dharmaśāstra refers to the body of Hindu legal and religious knowledge taken by early British colonial administrators to be the legal system of India: Franklin, 'Cultural Possession, Imperial Control, and Comparative Religion', pp. 4, 7. Similar observations were made by William Francklin in his near-contemporaneous journey across Persia: William Francklin, *Observations Made on a Tour from Bengal to Persia In the Years 1786-7...* (Calcutta, 1788), pp. 12-13. For Francklin's biography, see George Goodwin, 'Francklin, William', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/10081>> [accessed 21 December 2012].

¹⁴⁷ Symes, *Embassy*, pp. 302-3.

¹⁴⁸ Franklin, 'Cultural Possession', pp. 1-18.

Andaman Islands, a remote archipelago in the Indian Ocean, where a short-lived British colony had been established shortly before Symes visited en route to Rangoon.¹⁴⁹ Symes draws upon a tradition that dated back to Protestant descriptions of pagan idolatry from the latter half of the seventeenth century.¹⁵⁰ In particular, he suggests that the Andaman islanders worship 'the sun, as the most obvious source of good', together with 'the moon..., the genii of the woods, the waters, and the mountains, as inferior agents'.¹⁵¹ Jones castigated such worship as a deviation from 'the rational adoration of the one true God'.¹⁵² In contrast, Symes characterises their 'religion' as 'the simple, but genuine homage of nature'. An affinity for natural religion is also apparent when he describes how the Andaman islanders worship 'the incomprehensible ruler of the universe', which, he claimed, they merely 'express' through the veneration of material things. He noted that 'our imperfect means of discovering their opinions' meant that it is not known whether, like the Buddhists he would go on to encounter in Burma, 'they have any idea... of a future state' (i.e. a conception of heaven or hell). This did not stop him concluding that 'even amongst the most ignorant and barbarous of mankind' one can find 'confirmation of the great and pleasing truth, that all reasoning existence acknowledges a God'.¹⁵³

This view was controversial since it asserted, contrary to anti-deist arguments, that human reason was sufficient to gain knowledge and understanding of God and to venerate Him appropriately.¹⁵⁴ Although we cannot assume that there was necessarily a 'causal relationship between emphasising natural religion and heterodoxy', Symes' comments on the

¹⁴⁹ The colony was established in 1789 but disease forced the colonists to abandon it during the 1790s. The islands would go on to be home of an infamous British penal colony, established in 1858: Clare Anderson, 'Writing Indigenous Women's Lives in the Bay of Bengal: Cultures of Empire in the Andaman Islands, 1789-1906', *Journal of Social History*, 45 (2011), pp. 480-96 (pp. 480-1). On life in the colony and the challenges that such communities present to historians, see Clare Anderson, 'Introduction to Marginal Centers: Writing Life Histories in the Indian Ocean World', *Journal of Social History*, 42.2 (2011), pp. 335-44.

¹⁵⁰ Tenison, *Of Idolatry*, 14-15, 51; Young, *Historical Dissertation*, p. 126.

¹⁵¹ Symes, *Embassy*, p. 133.

¹⁵² Jones, 'On the Gods', pp. 321-2.

¹⁵³ Symes, *Embassy*, p. 133.

¹⁵⁴ Hudson, *English Deists*, pp. 8-11.

divine origin of various polytheistic and animist beliefs suggest he held heterodox beliefs of some kind. However, this does not necessarily mean that Symes was convinced 'that [Christian] religious tenets are false'. Rather, his admiration for Jones and his investigations into historical relationships between non-Christian and biblical traditions imply that he held heterodox views by the standards of eighteenth-century High Church or evangelical writers.¹⁵⁵

Symes claims that the 'half-humanised Andamaner invokes the luminaries that lend him light; and in that simple and spontaneous praise, he offers up the purest devotion of an unenlightened mind'.¹⁵⁶ This indicated a heterodox view of reason. His positive gloss of the 'purest devotion' of 'unenlightened' worship offered by 'half-humanised' Andaman islanders suggests a Rousseauian state of nature. Symes' views would doubtless have been unpalatable to the doctrinaire Protestant clergyman Isaac Watts who argued that human reason was insufficient grounds for either happiness or true religious knowledge.¹⁵⁷ Symes claim that the Andaman islanders' religious practices are the products of a reason-based natural religion. This view contrasts with Jones' claim that polytheism was a deviation from a primeval, revealed, monotheistic religion. That said, Symes' account is not explicitly deist. We cannot say for sure that he was an unbeliever, though he clearly invokes heterodox opinions on the relationship between reason and belief in his description of the Andaman Islanders. In this regard, it is clear that he was amenable to deistic reasoning and thought.

Furthermore, in identifying a 'divine' source for European pagan and contemporary Burmese practices, he asserts that natural religion can be found in different pantheistic traditions. This shared, ancient root of other religions in 'divine' worship contrasted with the view of mainstream Scriptural and antiquarian scholarship, which averred that, at some

¹⁵⁵ Hudson, *English Deists*, p. 12.

¹⁵⁶ Symes, *Embassy*, p. 133.

¹⁵⁷ Isaac Watts, *The Works of the Rev. Isaac Watts, D.D...* 7 vols. (Leeds: Edward Baines, 1800), III, pp. 7-122.

debateable historical point, non-Christian traditions had deviated from an original, revealed, Christian religion. In contrast, Jones is keen to reinforce Christian orthodoxy. He noted that 'some intelligent and virtuous persons are inclined to doubt the authenticity of the accounts delivered by Moses concerning the primitive world'. However, he goes on to state that 'either the first eleven chapters of *Genesis*' are true and merely need to be considered in light of the 'due allowances... for a figurative Eastern style', or that 'the whole fabrick of our national religion is false'. Jones was clearly concerned that his research into Oriental religions should not be seen as evidence of doctrinal unorthodoxy. He asserted that he 'cannot help believing in the divinity of the Messiah' as a result of his 'manifest completion of many prophecies, especially those of Isaiah'. Jones claimed that this proof obliged him 'to believe the sanctity of the venerable books' not merely as 'the truth of our national religion' but rather, as 'truth itself'. Jones is keen to defend revealed religion against scepticism, and to aver that his Orientalist interests did not intend to provoke seditious, deist conclusions.¹⁵⁸

Jones argument in his earliest work is, in some respects, a necessary prerequisite for Symes claims. By asserting that Judeo-Christian traditions originated in the East, Jones casts doubt on the geographical and historical locus of contemporary Scriptural exegesis. If Mosaic Law came from the 'primeval foundations of Indian literature' then it was to this literature that Christians must look if they wish to confirm their founding myths.¹⁵⁹ Jones' claim that Mosaic Law originated in the Orient, emphatically defended the Christian tradition against doubts concerning its authenticity, including deistic criticisms of prophecy and revealed religion.¹⁶⁰ Regardless of where

¹⁵⁸ Jones, 'On the Gods', pp. 324-6.

¹⁵⁹ Jones, 'On the Gods', pp. 324-6; App, 'Jones's Ancient Theology', pp. 11-14; Sapra, *Limits of Orientalism*, pp. 169-71.

¹⁶⁰ See, for example, Hudson, *English Deists*, p. 97: Toland 'rejected Jewish exceptionalism' and suggested that a better genealogy for the Christian tradition could be found in the 'rational civic law' traditions of ancient Egypt. He claimed that Moses' law was not 'designed to eliminate all traces of Egyptian idolatry' but rather was a 'human invention' by a 'typical ancient legislator' who 'pretended to a revelation from God in order to win acceptance for his "Republic"'. Hudson traces elements of this view to works by Charles Blount, particularly his *Great is Diana of the Ephesians* (1680).

it originated, it seems that Jones did not wish to doubt the revealed status of the Judeo-Christian tradition.

Jones and Symes' contrasting approaches to the relationship between Indian and European religious traditions demonstrate the breadth of Orientalist writing about Indian religion. These contrasts also suggest the value of taking a 'constellational' approach to this canon of texts. Whilst Jones advocated a somewhat traditional position that hypothesised Indian origins for the revealed Judeo-Christian tradition, in contrast, Symes drew on deistic theories of natural religion and implied that an immanent God within Creation received worship from wildly divergent traditions. Symes' arguments for the purity of Andaman and Burmese worship tacitly rejected the 'Jewish exceptionalism' emphasised both by Jones and by Protestant apologists' attacks on natural religion and deism.¹⁶¹ Yet Jones' own confessional opinions in his later works indicate a more heterodox outlook, indicating a belief in an innate deity if not necessarily scepticism toward Christian revelatory traditions. Taken together, Jones' prodigious output and Symes' text indicate that various forms of deism informed elements of contemporary Orientalist scholarship.

Conclusion: Deism and the East India Company Debate

What were the implications of sceptical or deist philosophies for the East India Company debates about evangelisation with which we opened this chapter? British East India Company travellers in India and neighbouring territories used orthodox and heterodox Christian ideas in their representations of Hindu and Buddhist belief systems. The hostility of many Company officials to Christian evangelisation reflected not only security concerns associated with governing a vast and religiously diverse population, but also a deeper theological antipathy towards the missionary movement. These hostilities were a consequence of both Romanticist accounts of India that stressed the ancient status of Indian culture, and

¹⁶¹ Hudson, *English Deists*, p. 97.

contemporary debates about natural religion and deism. For Orientalists and their patrons in senior Company positions, the history of India was not that of some alien other society. Rather, it was intimately connected with that of Christianity.

As was noted at the outset, it is difficult to precisely pinpoint the theological perspectives of prominent individuals in the Company's campaign against evangelical activity. In the case of Hastings, intervening generations have expended much energy reviling and reviving his reputation as an administrator and patron of Indian culture. His association with Jones, who did not explicitly advocate an innatist conception of religion, suggests we are dealing with shades of heterodoxy rather than full-blown deism.¹⁶² The evidence presented here supports App's view that Jones' personal beliefs fused Vedic, Christian and Enlightenment principles.¹⁶³ Jones held heterodox beliefs, yet we cannot definitively say that this amounted to unbelief. Likewise, Symes' account betrays the influence of ideas of natural or innate religion, but this also implies heterodoxy rather than deism.

The campaign against missionary access to India's vast population should be understood in light of these theological issues. The preceding discussion complements Carson's analysis of the motivations and divisions within the evangelical lobby by showing how Romanticist, Orientalist and antiquarian interests informed the confessional alignment of those opposed to missionary activity in the subcontinent. As we saw at the outset, growing antipathy at home made it increasingly untenable for Christian governors to be actively involved in maintaining idolatrous Indian religious buildings and institutions.¹⁶⁴ Contemporaries also suspected that deism, or heterodoxy more generally. Far from merely being concerned with security, Company opposition to evangelism had its

¹⁶² Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 21-2.

¹⁶³ App, 'Jones's Ancient Theology', pp. 76-7.

¹⁶⁴ Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 7-10, 15-16. For an example of later accounts of Hinduism which blended biblical concerns with Orientalist interests, see R. A. Leslie Moore, 'The Gods of the Hindus', *Journal of the East India Association*, New Series, VI.1 (1915), pp. 68-92.

roots in wider theological debates that questioned the revealed status of the Judeo-Christian tradition. These positions were deeply unpalatable for many evangelicals, indicating contemporary disquiet at the potentially dissident theologies of some East India Company employees.

Chapter 7

'Tahiti Has Its Own Customs, and Other Countries Have Theirs': Congregationalism and Indigenous Beliefs in the London Missionary Society Transactions (1796-1815)

In January 1803, two Congregationalist missionaries undertook a preaching tour of the islands of Tahiti and Eimeo (in present-day French Polynesia), the remote Pacific islands where the London Missionary Society had established its first mission to the heathen in 1797.¹ Coming to 'the last house on the north side of the island', Henry Bicknell and Charles Wilson came face-to-face with one of the principal deities of the indigenous belief system they were intent on extirpating in the name of spreading Christianity. The man who took care of the dwelling informed them that it belonged 'to Oro', a prominent god in the Tahitian cosmology, but had previously been the residence of another deity. What of Oro himself? The missionaries reported that 'in one end of the house, in a box open at one extremity, is Oro deposited'.² They then 'asked the man if Oro would come out and let us see him'. The man, seemingly baffled by their request, 'replied no, but gave us leave to pull him out'. The newcomers pulled the *to'o* of Oro out and proceeded to anatomise the great 'national idol' of Tahiti as nothing more than 'a mat stuffed with something, bound with small cords, and had some red feathers stuck on the outside... about four feet long and taper[ing] at one end'.³

The missionaries' scorn for Oro is readily apparent in their report, taken from the *Transactions of the London Missionary Society*, one of a

¹ The quote in the chapter title is taken from John Davies, *The History of the Tahitian Mission: 1799-1830*, ed. by Colin Newbury (Cambridge: Hakluyt Society, 1961), p. 112.

² Maia Kerr Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods: Encounters with Gods and Missionaries in Tahiti and the Austral Islands 1797-1830' (unpublished PhD thesis, University of East Anglia, 2007), <uk.bl.ethos.490367> [accessed 31 October 2012], pp. 80-1, 83-5; London Missionary Society (LMS), *Transactions of the Missionary Society* 4 vols. (London: T. Williams, 1803-10), II, p. 135.

³ LMS *Transactions*, II, p. 135; William Ellis, *Polynesian Researches during A Residence of Nearly Six Years in the South Sea Islands...* 2 vols. (London: Fisher, Son & Jackson, 1829), I, p. 108. On indigenous religion and 'national' cultures of the Pacific, see Anne Keary, 'Origins Stories: Missionary Projects and Colonial Translations in Tahiti, North-western America and Eastern Australia', in *Decentring Empire: Britain, India and the Transcolonial World*, ed. by Durba Ghosh and Dane Kennedy (Hyderabad: Orient Longman, 2006), pp. 182-212 (p. 188). Such *to'o* were usually constructed of a central core of wood or sinnet, to which bindings and feathers were attached. For further details, see Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', p. 316; Simon Kooijman, 'Ancient Tahitian God-Figures', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 73.2 (1964), pp. 110-25.

number of publications which reported on missionary activity in order to encourage domestic support for the evangelical cause.⁴ Such missionary literature represented missionary endeavour in terms of ‘Christian soldiers battling with the forces of Satan’. Jeffrey Cox argues that this drew upon ‘a much older providential narrative going back through [John] Bunyan to the Bible’.⁵ These missionary publications reflected the interests of the wide readership that these cheap and accessible works enjoyed in the wake of religious revival and growth of non-conformist and independent churches across Britain.⁶ These texts also provide us with evidence of how the London Missionary Society brought Christian assumptions to bear on their representations. Indeed, several recent studies have shown the value of these texts for understanding both early forms of Christianity in the region and the indigenous beliefs they displaced.⁷

This chapter explores how the published representations of the missionaries’ experiences reinforced their Congregationalist beliefs. Although technically non-denominational, the London Missionary Society’s membership and missionary recruits were chiefly Congregationalist, made

⁴ Anna Johnston, ‘British Missionary Publishing, Missionary Celebrity, and Empire’, *Nineteenth-Century Prose*, 32 (2005), pp. 20-47; Winter Jade Werner, ‘William Ellis, John Williams, and the Role of History in Missionary Nation-Making’, *The Journal of the Midwest Modern Language Association*, 46 (2013), pp. 71-91. On the wider value of such literature from missionaries across different colonial contexts, see Keary, ‘Origin Stories’, pp. 182-212. The international dimension of evangelical efforts is demonstrated by the following volume by the following American Tract Society which extracted information from the missionary *Transactions* to form a narrative history of their successes in the South Pacific: Favell Lee Mortimer, *The Night of Toil: Or A Familiar Account of the Labours of the First Missionaries in the South Sea Islands* (New York: American Tract Society, 1838).

⁵ Rod Edmond, ‘Missionaries on Tahiti, 1797-1840’, in *Voyages and Beaches: Pacific Encounters, 1769-1840*, ed. by Alex Calder, Jonathan Lamb, and Bridget Orr (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1999), pp. 226-40 (pp. 227-9).

⁶ Johnston, ‘British Missionary Publishing’, p. 30. On the rise of evangelical impulses and British overseas expansion, see Eleanor H. Tejirian and Reeva Spector Simon, *Conflict, Conquest, and Conversion: Two Thousand Years of Christian Missions in the Middle East* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2014), pp. 69-93.

⁷ On indigenous perspectives in Pacific history, the founding text is arguably J. W. Davidson, ‘Problems of Pacific History’, *Journal of Pacific History*, 1 (1966), pp. 5-21. For a challenge to the postcolonial perspective outlined by Davidson, see S. J. Francis X. Hezel, ‘New Direction in Pacific History’, *Pacific Studies*, 11 (1988), pp. 101-10. For an overview of more recent approaches, see K. R. Howe, *Nature, Culture, and History: The ‘Knowing’ of Oceania* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 2000), pp. 58-86.

up principally of 'Nonconformist or dissenting church-goers'.⁸ We shall explore how Congregationalist principles influenced their dealings with the indigenous population during the first two decades of the mission before the islanders began to adopt and adapt Christianity.⁹ This chapter is split into two sections exploring how the missionaries' Congregationalist outlook informed their reports on Tahitian rituals and their understanding of the relationship between religious and civil authority in Tahiti. In order to understand these two points of conflict, we first need to understand the missionaries in relation to the broader history of European colonialism in the Pacific and how missionary literature impacted upon domestic perceptions of Tahiti.¹⁰

Tahiti in the European Imagination, 1767 – c. 1820

The establishment of the London Missionary Society community at Matavai Bay in 1797 marked the beginning of sustained contact between Europeans and Tahitians. Although Europeans had visited the islands several times since their 'discovery' in the 1760s, these visits, including that of James Cook to observe the transit of Venus in 1771 and William Bligh's ill-fated breadfruit quest in 1788-9, had been relatively brief.¹¹ The

⁸ Johnston, 'British Missionary Publishing', p. 30; Anna Johnston, 'Missionary Men: Forming Identities in Imperial Evangelical Britain', *Australasian Victorian Studies Journal*, 9 (2003), pp. 89-105 (pp. 90-1); Paul Landau, 'Review of *The London Missionary Society in Southern Africa*, ed. by John de Gruchy, *The International Journal of African Historical Studies*, 33 (2000), pp. 703-5 (pp. 703-4). On missionary identity and masculinity, see William C. Barnhart, 'Evangelicalism, Masculinity, and the Making of Imperial Missionaries in Late Georgian Britain, 1795-1820', *The Historian*, 67.4 (2005), pp. 712-33.

⁹ On the on-going relevance of London Missionary Society symbols in present-day Tahiti, see Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 25-8.

¹⁰ Jeffrey Cox, *The British Missionary Enterprise since 1700* (Oxford and New York: Routledge, 2008), pp. 82-4. On the growth of Protestant evangelism more generally, see A. G. Roeber, 'The Waters of Rebirth: The Eighteenth Century and Transoceanic Protestant Christianity', *Church History*, 79 (2010), pp. 40-76. On missionaries, Pacific explorers and empire, see Vanessa Smith, *Intimate Strangers: Friendship, Exchange and Pacific Encounters* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010); *Exploration and Exchange: A South Seas Anthology 1680-1900*, ed. by Jonathan Lamb, Vanessa Smith and Nicholas Thomas, (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2000); Vanessa Smith, *Literary Culture and the Pacific: Nineteenth-Century Textual Encounters* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998); Harriet Guest, *Empire, Barbarism, and Civilisation: James Cook, William Hodges, and the Return to the Pacific* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007).

¹¹ Lamb et al, *Exploration and Exchange*, pp. xxiv, 139-43. A good recent overview of European presence in the Pacific can be found in Joyce E. Chaplin, 'The Pacific before Empire, C. 1500-c.1800', in *Pacific Histories: Ocean, Land, People*, ed. by David Armitage and Alison Bashford

longest sustained contact before the arrival of the missionaries occurred in 1772 when a pair of Spanish friars spent around two years on the island before returning to Peru.¹² Additionally, throughout the last decades of the eighteenth century, a motley assortment of drifters, castaways and runaways from European vessels could be found on many Pacific islands, including Tahiti.¹³

Though the London Missionary Society would go on to be the foremost purveyor of British missionaries to the rest of the world, progress was slow in the first decades, especially in the South Seas. The Tahitian group devoted much of their time to cataloguing the religious practices (and erroneous beliefs) of the indigenous population. However, the mission's accounts of indigenous rituals lack the lurid detail that Cox suggests were essential to evangelical narratives of encounters with

(Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), pp. 53-74. The 'discovery' of Tahiti is detailed in George Robertson, *The Discovery of Tahiti: A Journal of the Second Voyage of H.M.S. Dolphin Round the World, Under the Command of Captain Wallis, R.N., in the Years 1766, 1767, and 1768*, ed. by Hugh Carrington (London: Hakluyt Society, 1948); Lamb et al, *Exploration & Exchange*, pp. 57-72. For Cook, see Joan Druett, *Tupaia: The Remarkable Story of Captain Cook's Polynesian Navigator* (Auckland: Random House, 2011); *The Endeavour Journal of Joseph Banks, 1768-1771*, ed. by J. C. Beaglehole, 5 vols. (Sydney: Angus Robertson, 1962). The historiography on the European presence in Tahiti is expansive. See, for example, Steven Roger Fischer, *A History of the Pacific Islands* (New York: Palgrave, 2002); John Garrett, *To Live Among the Stars: Christian Origins in Oceania* (Fiji: WCC Publications, 1982); Neil Gunson, 'Great Women And Friendship Contract Rites In Pre-Christian Tahiti', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 73 (1964), pp. 53-69; Robert I. Levy, 'Tahiti Observed: Early European Impressions Of Tahitian Personal Style', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 77 (1968), pp. 33-42; H. E. Maude, 'Post-Spanish Discoveries In The Central Pacific', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 70 (1961), pp. 67-111; Colin Newbury, 'Aspects Of Cultural Change In French Polynesia: The Decline Of The Ari''i', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 76 (1967), pp. 7-26; Colin Newbury, 'Te Hau Pahu Rahi: Pomare II and the Concept of Inter-Island Government in Eastern Polynesia', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 76 (1967), pp. 477-514; Jane Sanson, 'Translation Teams: Missionaries, Islanders, and the Reduction of Language in the Pacific', in *Missionaries, Indigenous Peoples and Cultural Exchange*, ed. by Patricia Grimshaw and Andrew May (Eastbourne: Sussex Academic Press, 2010), pp. 96-109; Robert C. Schmitt, 'Missionary "Censuses" of Tahiti, 1797-1830', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 76 (1967), pp. 27-34.

¹² On the Catholic mission, see *The Quest and Occupation of Tahiti by Emissaries of Spain during the Years 1772-1776*, ed. & trans. by Bolton Glanvill Corney, 3 vols. (London: Hakluyt Society, 1913).

¹³ For a general overview of itinerant Europeans in the region, see Colin Newbury, 'Introduction', in *The History of the Tahitian Mission: 1799-1830*, ed. by Colin Newbury (Cambridge: Hakluyt Society, 1961), pp. xxvii - liv (pp. xxvii, xxxvii); Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, pp. 82-5, 117-21, 132-8. Few substantial written records of these itinerant individuals' experiences have survived. For an example of beachcomber life from a slightly later period, see the biographies of lapsed missionary George Vason: James Orange, *Narrative of the Late George Vason* (Derby: Henry Mozley, 1840); Anon [Solomon Pigott], *An Authentic Narrative of Four Years' Residence at Tongataboo, One of the Friendly Islands...* (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees and Orme, 1810).

heathens. Anna Keary proposes that the missionaries were ‘ambivalent’ toward many of the indigenous beliefs they recorded since the Society tended to view them merely as ‘obstacles to Christianisation’ and ‘proof of an irrational mindset’. This complements Cox’ claim that religious ethnography was principally advanced by individual missionaries who wished to document the customs that they were intent on supplanting.¹⁴

During this initial period, the Congregationalists saw only limited competition from Baptists and other denominations. After several false starts and failures, Congregationalist forms of Protestantism began to make inroads from the 1820s onwards and soon had entirely transformed indigenous religious practices.¹⁵ Despite this, the missionaries’ early experiences were uniformly negative. The missionaries encountered a number of difficulties, including food shortages, conflict with local rulers and the apathy and increasing hostility of the wider population. The first decades were characterised by intransigence on the part of the local population to engage with missionary preaching.¹⁶ Their arrival also precipitated unprecedented conflict between rival factions of islanders, exacerbated by the increased availability of European weapons.¹⁷ This led to significant political unrest, resulting in outright war between the missionaries’ allies, the powerful Pomare clan, and so-called ‘disaffected districts’ of Atehuru in the south of the island. By 1808, the mission’s safety was seriously threatened and they and their Tahitian allies were forced to evacuate the island to nearby Huahine.¹⁸

¹⁴ Keary, ‘Origin Stories’, p. 186; Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, pp. 114-17, 118-21.

¹⁵ Jessop, ‘Unwrapping Gods’, pp. 281-7, 297-8; Despite the French taking control of the islands in the 1840s, syncretic forms of Congregationalism have remained influential across Polynesia up to the present day. On modern religion in the islands, see Garry W. Trompf, ‘New Religious Movements in Oceania’, *Nova Religio: The Journal of Alternative and Emergent Religions*, 18 (2015), pp. 5-15.

¹⁶ Jessop, ‘Unwrapping Gods’, pp. 277, 282-3; Neil Gunson, *Messengers of Grace: Evangelical Missionaries in the South Seas 1797-1860* (Melbourne and New York: Oxford University Press, 1978), pp. 1, 214, 218, citing CWM/LMS South Seas Incoming; Pritchard 26 December 1828.

¹⁷ Keary, ‘Origin Stories’, pp. 183-4; Colin Newbury, *Tahiti Nui: Change and Survival in French Polynesia, 1767-1945* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1980), pp. 14-71.

¹⁸ Rod Edmond, *Representing the South Pacific: Colonial Discourse from Cook to Gauguin* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), p. 99; Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, pp. 110-26. Details of the missionaries time in Tonga are not included in Newberry’s edited edition of Davies’ journal but are discussed in Albert J. Schultz, ‘John Davies’s Hibernia Journal:

How was the missionary enterprise in the South Seas perceived back home? Multiple assumptions about Tahitian culture proliferated in Britain. Eighteenth-century representations of Tahiti dwelt upon the natural beauty of the island and its inhabitants, as well as their remoteness from the corrupting influences of civilisation. Romanticist visions and Jean-Jacques Rousseau's social contract theory influenced depictions of Tahiti as a place where man lived in a natural state, unpolluted by the sins of labour and civilisation.¹⁹ The author and exploration publicist John Hawkesworth found Tahitian ritual life a 'rich topic... for reflection' on what he held to be the deistic beliefs of the islanders. For Joseph Banks, the naturalist on Cook's voyage, and William Hodges, the Romanticist painter, the Polynesian islands were an Edenic paradise. Banks praised the civility and alterity of Tahitian life and both men were involved in Orientalist or Romanticist circles. His Romanticist vision was controversial though, and in later life, political opponents mocked him for his eccentric and potentially subversive interests in Tahitian ritual life.²⁰ Likewise, Hodges' paintings of South Pacific scenes, including the famous *moai* statues of Easter Island, received negative reviews following their first exhibition in London. Polynesian landscapes and subjects were not universally seen as 'sublime'.²¹ Indeed, Bernard Smith contrasts this minority of positive views with that of the majority of 'God-fearing Englishmen' from across the religious spectrum who saw the Tahitians not as 'innocents of nature' but as 'depraved and benighted savages' untouched by the wisdom of the Gospel. Growing evangelical enthusiasm, and the growth of dissenting congregations in the latter part of the century, reinforced this view.²²

Missing Epsilons and the Tongan Presence', *The Journal of Pacific History*, 15.2 (1980), pp. 108-9.

¹⁹ Bernard Smith, *European Vision and the South Pacific 1768-1850: A Study in the History of Art and Ideas* 2nd edn (London: Oxford University Press, 1960), pp. 41-5; Hermione de Almeida and George H. Gilpin, *Indian Renaissance: British Romantic Art and the Prospect of India* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2005), pp. 114-18; Gunson, *Messengers of Grace*, p. 12.

²⁰ Guest, *Empire, Barbarism and Civilization*, pp. 77-8; Smith, *European Vision*, pp. 46-50.

²¹ Almeida and Gilpin, *Indian Renaissance*, pp. 117-18. For details of Hodges' paintings of the *moai*, see William Hodges, *A View of the Monuments of Easter Island [Rapanui]*, c 1776, <<http://collections.rmg.co.uk/collections/objects/13275.html>>, [accessed 9 December 2015].

²² Smith, *European Vision*, pp. 44-5.

Missionary literature produced by dissenting congregations and evangelical organisations would further expand popular knowledge of Pacific societies. This missionary vision inflected popular views of Tahiti and other fields of missionary activity with a decidedly evangelical outlook.²³ The London Missionary Society was central to this evangelical effort. As ‘the largest evangelical institution peddling its spiritual wares in the arena of empire’, the Society contributed to the flood of ‘morally improving texts’ that aimed to ‘proselytise’ domestic audiences and ‘to advertise’ its overseas efforts.²⁴ Johnston’s exploration of missionary ‘celebrity’ demonstrates the popular appeal of missionary narratives within the print culture and public sphere of the nineteenth century. The ‘mass readership’ of subscribers to missionary organisations produced a ‘community of readers’ that would influence the ‘development of British evangelical identities’. Indeed, by the middle of the century, missionary leaders boasted that ‘the moral condition of the heathen is better understood today by the children of our schools than it was by the enlightened classes of society fifty years ago’.²⁵ These contrasting depictions of Tahitians – as blessed innocents or benighted savages – indicate the scope of contemporary representation of religious and cultural others.

Surprisingly, the former image influenced the London Missionary Society’s decision to choose Tahiti for their first mission in 1795. In particular, they were influenced by the reports of Bligh, who had visited the islands prior to the mutiny on the *Bounty*. The evangelical founders of

²³ Penelope Carson, *The East India Company and Religion, 1698-1858* (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2012), p. 112; Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, pp. 7-8. 9; Johnston, ‘British Missionary Publishing’, p. 20. On the role of missionary literature in the later nineteenth century, see for example, Aled Jones, ‘Culture, “Race” and the Missionary Public in Mid-Victorian Wales’, *Journal of Victorian Culture*, 10.2 (2010), pp. 157-83 (pp. 158-60).

²⁴ Anne McClintock, *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest* (New York & London: Routledge, 1995), p. 261; Johnston, ‘British Missionary Publishing’, p. 21; Johnston, ‘Missionary Men’, p. 90.

²⁵ Johnston, ‘British Missionary Publishing’, pp. 41-3; LMS, *Brief Review of the London Missionary Society, from Its Formation, September 1795*. (No publisher: The LMS Annual Meeting, 1845), pp. 4-5. For discussion of very different, ecumenical religious public spheres from the later nineteenth century, see Emily Mace, ‘Comparative Religion and the Practice of Eclecticism: Intersections in Nineteenth-Century Liberal Religious Congregations’, *The Journal of Religion*, 94 (2014), pp. 74-96.

the Society did not seem unduly worried by reports of 'licentious dances..., prostitution and infanticide... strange funerary customs, and those symbols of paganism, the *marae* [sacred enclosures] and *tupapa'u* [ghost healing]'.²⁶ Bligh's vision combined Romanticist depictions of innocent islanders with a fervent evangelism and proved particularly influential over missionary leaders. Many of the organisers and backers of the Tahitian mission were convinced that the islanders would welcome the Christian faith.²⁷

This fitted with the ideological emphasis of subsequent missionary publications, which set out to prove that the spread of Christianity 'could not be consigned to the apostolic age'. Such texts displayed evidence of the way that 'the Lord was moving [right] now' since it was hoped that the accomplishments of missionaries would validate the missionary endeavour itself. Indeed, the proliferation of conversions across the Pacific in the 1820s and 1830s served as a stern rebuke to those who argued that Christians 'should wait upon the Lord to convert others to Christianity'.²⁸ The civilising impulses of empire and Christianising impulses of missionary groups did not necessarily go hand-in-hand. Opponents of missionary activity thought it 'absurd to even attempt to Christianise people before they were first civilised'. In contrast, the missionaries and their backers were caught between defaming indigenous practices for being pagan and defending them on the basis of 'Christian universalism'.²⁹

²⁶ Smith, *European Visions*, p. 44. On *tupapa'u*, see Claire D. Parsons, *Healing Practices in the South Pacific* (Honolulu; University of Hawaii Press, 1995), pp. 177-8. On *maraes*, see Christophe Descantes, 'Simple Marae Of The 'Opunohu Valley, Moorea, Society Islands, French Polynesia', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 102 (1993), pp. 187-216.

²⁷ Greg Denning, *Mr Bligh's Bad Language: Power, Passion and Theatre on the Bounty* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), pp. 157-239; Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, pp. 97-8. On the value of missionary reports home for keeping missionaries in touch with their spiritual roots (in this case, amongst Jesuits), see Bernard Heyberger and Chantal Verdeil, 'Spirituality and Scholarship: The Holy Land in Jesuit Eyes (Seventeenth to Nineteenth Centuries)', in *New Faith in Ancient Lands. Western Missions in the Middle East in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries*, ed. by Heleen Murre-van den Berg (Leiden: Brill, 2006), pp. 19-41 (pp. 20-1).

²⁸ Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, p. 138. These views are similar to those encountered by evangelicals campaigning for missionary access to India's vast non-Christian population, see Chapter 6 above at pp. 184-94. On the syncretic and uniquely Polynesian forms of Christianity adopted, see Neil Gunson, 'An Account Of The Mamaia Or Visionary Heresy Of Tahiti, 1826-1841', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 71 (1962), pp. 208-43.

²⁹ Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, pp. 116, 121, 125-30, 134-5. On the various applications of these principles by missionaries around the world, see the essays collected in *Missionaries*,

Thomas Haweis, the first director and one of the principal founders of the London Missionary Society, unquestionably took the latter view. In sermons and texts publicising the first mission to Tahiti, he opined that ‘no other part of the heathen world affords so promising a field for a Christian mission’. He claimed that, in the South Sea Islands, ‘the temper of the people, the climate, the abundance of food, and easy collection of a number together for instruction, bespeak the fields ripe for harvest’. Haweis believed the brethren would ‘start with a psychological advantage’ since ‘consciousness of the superiority of Europeans’ had already been ‘awakened in the islanders’ by previous European visitors who had written at length of the warm welcome they received from senior islanders.³⁰ For Haweis, it was illogical to argue that ‘primitive’ Polynesians on a remote Pacific archipelago could be anything other than grateful for the spiritual bounty of the Christian faith.

However, the published journals of the mission for the first decade of the nineteenth century indicate that the Tahitians’ determined attachment to their own traditions repeatedly confounded the missionaries. As Cox, Maia Kerr Jessop, Neil Gunson and Michael Cathcart have all outlined, the Tahitian mission was hardly a beacon of hope for the imminent conversion of the heathen.³¹ Only five of the original cohort remained on Tahiti more than a year. Although the second cohort, who arrived in 1801, fared better, at least one of their number, James Elder, married an unconverted native woman and was excommunicated from the

Indigenous Peoples and Cultural Exchange, ed. by Andrew May and Patricia Grimshaw (Eastbourne: Sussex Academic Press, 2010). On Christianisation and civilising impulses and their conflict in eighteenth- and nineteenth-century British imperialism, see Andrew Porter, *Religion versus Empire?: British Protestant Missionaries and Overseas Expansion, 1700-1914* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2004).

³⁰ Thomas Haweis, *Sermons Preached in London, at the Formation of the Missionary Society...* (London, 1795), pp. 12-13; Haweis, ‘The Very Probable Success of A Proper Mission to the South Sea Islands’, *The Evangelical Magazine*, (1795), I, pp. 261-70; see also Newbury, ‘Introduction’, p. xxix. The missionaries’ ally, ‘king’ Pomare I (Tū-nui-‘ē’a-i-te-atua Pomare I), was amongst the senior islanders who met Cook, Bligh and others: Jessop, ‘Unwrapping Gods’, pp. 47, 49-50.

³¹ Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, pp. 93-102; Michael Cathcart et al, *Mission to the South Seas: The Voyage of the Duff, 1796-1799* (Melbourne: Parkville, 1990), p. 138; Garrett, *To Live Among the Stars*, pp. 12-31. See also Gunson, *Messengers of Grace*, pp. 4-5. On the growth (and relative success) of evangelism in India, see Carson, *East India Company and Religion*, pp. 1-90.

mission community as a result.³² Proving personal piety and moral upstanding was vital for would-be missionaries, as Johnston's examination of later nineteenth-century London Missionary Society recruitment questionnaires attests. The Society had a 'very clear vision of the evangelical identities' that it 'wished to inculcate'.³³ These identities would be severely tested in the mission field because missionaries were removed from the direct regulation of their employers.

The Society's objectives and membership formed part of the wider community of English Dissenters. Driven by their experience of political and social marginalisation over the previous two centuries, the Society advocated 'rights to "free conscience" and self-determination on *both* the individual and national levels'. Concomitantly, they placed a profound emphasis on individual piety and on the unmediated relationship between freely organised congregations and the Holy Spirit.³⁴ Its principal supporters – both in terms of missionary recruits themselves and consumers of missionary literature – were Nonconformist or dissenting individuals from the 'aspirational working class and middle-class' who identified with or aspired to 'solid respectability and public spiritedness' through charitable organisations.³⁵ Emphasis was solidly placed on an individual's spiritual rebirth, as demonstrated by the early life of the most renowned London Missionary Society recruit, David Livingstone.³⁶

³² Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, pp. 98-9. This separation continued during the missionaries' stay on a sandbank in Fiji following their escape from Tahiti and a subsequent shipwreck en route to Australia. Extracts of this portion of Davies' *History* can be found in William Lockerby, *The Journal of William Lockerby, Sandalwood Trader in the Fijian Islands during the Years 1808-1809: with an Introduction & Other Papers Connected with the Earliest European Visitors to the Islands.*, ed. by Sir Everard Im Thurn and Leonard C. Wharton (London: Hakluyt Society, 1925), pp. 119-60, (pp. 138, 146).

³³ Johnston, 'Missionary Men', esp. pp. 92-4, 100-1.

³⁴ Werner, 'Role of History', pp. 76-7. *Emphases* in original. On Congregationalist hostility to state interference in religious matters, see Michael Ledger-Lomas, "'Glimpses of the Great Conflict": English Congregationalists and the European Crisis of Faith, circa 1840-1875', *Journal of British Studies*, 46 (2007), pp. 826-60 (p. 827).

³⁵ Johnston, 'Missionary Men', esp. pp. 92-4, 100-1.

³⁶ Having undergone a conversion experience in his teenage years, Livingstone became convinced that 'salvation' was 'freely available to everyone'. As a result, he (and his family) abandoned their Calvinist background and began attending a Congregationalist church. This denominational change brought him into the orbit of the London Missionary Society and it was as a missionary for this organisation that he departed for Africa some years later: Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, pp. 145-6; Sujit Sivasundaram, *Nature and the Godly Empire*:

As Congregationalists, the Society's organisers and principal backers embraced a form of Christianity that emphasised the independence of individual churches and rejected (at least in principle) the notion that churches' legal and political authority should derive from the state. Despite its 'nondenominational' status, the Society was 'fundamentally committed to keeping religious belief out of politics and, conversely, politics out of religious belief'. The independent volition of heathen peoples to embrace Christian truths was central to Congregationalist thought, as well as that of many other Independent churches active overseas.³⁷ We shall discuss in more detail below how the missionaries' political dealings risked violating the Society's fundamentally Congregationalist principles.

Despite inculcating thoroughly middle-class virtues, earlier recruits such as those despatched to Tahiti in 1795 and 1798, were largely from working-class backgrounds. The Tahitian mission community was made up of a variety of personalities, several of whom were forcibly separated from the mission when their piety (or other conduct) was questioned. The private diary of the mission librarian, John Davies, tells us much about the difficulties the mission experienced. Often this corroborates reports found in the *Transactions*, though Davies' private journal is more critical of the Society Directors. Correspondence was infrequent and, from Davies perspective, much of the advice given by their distant employers was unhelpful.³⁸ We cannot be sure that this means Davies or his colleagues disagreed with their employers on points of doctrine since we have no direct evidence concerning the precise confessional identities of any individuals from the first two cohorts to arrive in Tahiti. The Directors would not introduce a formal test of individual recruits' beliefs and intents

Science and Evangelical Mission in the Pacific, 1795-1850 (Cambridge & New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005), p. 25. On narratives of evangelical rebirth, see David Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1780s to the 1830s* (London: Unwin Hyman, 1989), p. 63.

³⁷ Johnston, 'Missionary Men', p. 90.

³⁸ Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, pp. 84-6, 90-4; Gunson, *Messengers of Grace*, p. 4. Gunson details a number of examples of Davies' criticisms of the LMS Directors from his surviving correspondence and we discuss the difficulties he experienced in gaining the Directors' approval to publish his diaries below, pp. 252-8.

until 1818, though Johnston suggests that this process merely formalised and standardised earlier informal interview processes in response to a spike in applications.³⁹

As a group, however, we can find out much about how their beliefs influenced their dealings with Tahitian individuals and institutions by consulting the published *Transactions*. This 'occasional publication' collected together reports from mission stations around the world over a number of years. Although the large and expensive *Transactions* would likely have been out of the reach of ordinary working-class subscribers, the reports found within are similar in character and overlap substantially with those found in the more frequent and cheaper publications, such as the *Missionary Sketches*. Johnston suggests that the Society's more expensive publications were aimed at church and community groups with an educational as well as didactic function.⁴⁰ Both publications consisted of reports written up from the missionaries' own journals which were regularly despatched to London for the attention of the Directors and editing for subsequent publication.⁴¹ Even taking into account the intervention of London-based editors, we can find out much about how their particular version of Christianity influenced their depictions of indigenous ritual life and practice.

Religious ethnography is by far the most memorable element of the *Transactions*, though it has been somewhat overlooked in recent years.⁴² Cox argues that many prominent members of the Society, like other evangelical groups, 'conflated the export of Christianity to the South Pacific with the export of early Victorian middle-class material culture'.⁴³ He claims that 'manuscript accounts' from missionaries in the field were nothing more than 'prosaic accounts of institution building, although in an

³⁹ Johnston, 'Missionary Men', p. 91. For a full breakdown of the occupations of the first generation of LMS missionaries, see Richard Lovett, *The History of the London Missionary Society 1795-1895* 2 vols. (London: Henry Froude, 1899), I, p. 127.

⁴⁰ Johnston, 'British Missionary Publishing', pp. 30-2.

⁴¹ Johnston, 'British Missionary Publishing', pp. 22-4. The *Transactions* inform Michael Cathcart et al's 1978 survey of the institutional development of the Tahitian mission, though this work lacks much of the appropriate scholarly apparatus to be useful as a reference work and is principally concerned with institution building.

⁴² Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 32-3, 41; Gunson, *Messengers of Grace*, pp. 1-3.

⁴³ Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, p. 136.

exotic setting'. In contrast, 'editors of missionary magazines wanted heroic tales of encounters with heathen chiefs... cannibals or idol worshipers'. Cox suggests that the genre of 'religious ethnography' emerged due to individual missionaries' desire to file regular reports home.⁴⁴ Jessop and Gunson both observe that missionary sources, when taken together with indigenous oral tradition, can expand our knowledge of indigenous perspectives. Indeed, the 'journals, reports and personal correspondence' of the brethren 'relate, observe, document and record their delights, misgivings and frustrations in daily dealings with islanders'. As we shall see, the *Transactions* provide instances of 'close engagement' with Tahitian individuals, displaying the 'range of emotion inherent' in the experiences that they sought to record and represent.⁴⁵

Jessop's upbeat assessment of the close correlation between missionary publications and the reality they purport to represent should not blind us to the constructed and ideologically-inflected nature of these texts: missionaries were well aware that their writings were published and that such publications were essential to publicising and raising funds for their Society. An awareness of domestic popular interest in (and perhaps, popular misconceptions about) Tahiti may have also been a factor in encouraging the brethren to record day-to-day encounters in such detail. Their failure to secure any conversions doubtless also contributed to this anatomising of indigenous ritual life and recording day-to-day events amongst their Tahitian neighbours. Whereas contemporary missions to South Africa could boast of their pious daily routines and the movement of the spirit of the Lord amongst local San (Bushmen) hunter-gather communities,⁴⁶ the Tahitian brethren's daily prayer activity was confined to the mission community and is recorded briefly and tersely.⁴⁷

With zero Tahitian converts to minister to, the missionaries tasks in these early days consisted of keeping a weather eye on the relations

⁴⁴ Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, pp. 116-17.

⁴⁵ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', p. 40. See also Gunson, *Messengers of Grace*, pp. 1-3; Douglas Oliver, *Ancient Tahitian Society* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1974), p. 1361.

⁴⁶ LMS, *Transactions*, II, pp. 9-10.

⁴⁷ See, for example, LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 309.

between the Pomares and their opponents, and undertaking regular preaching and catechising tours which generally concluded with complaints about the indifferent response of the Tahitians. Thus, their journals are characterised by the perennial optimism of the brethren, counterbalanced by copious evidence of their abject failure. For example, when one man stated that a Christian sermon had been '*parrow myeteye roadoo*, most excellent', he was immediately 'laughed... to scorn' by the chief's wife, who rejected his opinion as '*namava*, mad'.⁴⁸ There has yet to be a focused study of the missionaries' engagement with Tahitian daily life, and in particular encounters like this in which Tahitians expressed opinions about Christian beliefs, or informed the missionaries about indigenous ritual life. The *Transactions* not only shed light on the development of syncretic Christianity in the Pacific but also shed some light on indigenous customs, and how Tahitians sought to fit the new arrivals into existing belief systems.⁴⁹ Through missionary writing about the problems they experienced, we can understand more about how they understood Tahitian beliefs, in particular, how the missionaries' own beliefs were rhetorically challenged in interactions with Tahitian individuals and groups.

Of Gods and Men: Tahitian Responses to Christianity

Garrett has suggested that Polynesians were not 'in general' motivated by a desire for European goods.⁵⁰ However, they evidently acquired substantial quantities of them.⁵¹ Both the *Transactions* and Davies' diary record that the missionaries faced material hardships because they distributed their possessions in order to gather the islanders together for instruction.

⁴⁸ Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, pp. 69-70; LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 326. For further instances of ambiguous or positive responses to the missionaries, see p. 329. On the cult of Oro and its emergence before the arrival of Europeans, see Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 101, 110-11.

⁴⁹ Gunson, *Messengers of Grace*, pp. 1-12, Garrett, *To Live Amongst the Stars*, pp. 1-22; Smith, *Intimate Strangers*, pp. 14-17; Lamb et al, *Exploration and Exchange*, pp. 139-43; Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 29-31.

⁵⁰ Garrett, *To Live Among the Stars*, p. 5. On exchanges, emotional and tangible, see Smith, *Intimate Strangers*, esp. pp. 1-20.

⁵¹ On European goods within the Tahitian spiritual and material economy, see Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 50, 52-3.

Valuable manufactured European goods had been acquired from all preceding European visitors, and the Tahitians interest in the newcomers appears to have waned somewhat when they were no longer their benefactors.⁵² This problem was exacerbated by the failure of the Society to establish a reliable way of resupplying the missionaries with desirable manufactured items to distribute. Davies complained that children were 'instigated by their parents' to say 'you come here frequently, but what do you give us? Give us pins, beads, and fish hooks, or else we will not be taught'. It was common for the islanders to complain that the missionaries' instruction was a 'tiresome, unprofitable thing' and for the Tahitians to see 'the missionaries [as] their debtors' and to demand payment for 'submitting to instruction'. One missionary grumbled that 'it is no uncommon thing with some of them when they seem me coming, to go and conceal themselves!'⁵³ The Tahitians believed that submitting to British education was part of a bond obligation and that the brethren should provide material benefits in recompense for their time and attention.⁵⁴ British and Tahitian expectations were confounded by each other's norms and practices.

This is evident in another of the brethren's perennial concerns: the active disruption of preaching. Davies, the mission librarian, reported to his colleagues in June 1804 that, when attempting to catechise Tahitian children, the adults will

keep up a constant conversation among themselves, or with the children, so that nothing can be heard or attended to for noise or clamour... at other times, some will sit close by the children and whisper in their ears to give such nonsensical and ridiculous answers as to excite the laughter of the whole company.⁵⁵

⁵² The items brought by the mission included ironmongery, tools, boxes, chests, gardening equipment, seeds, Bibles, clothing and shoes, all donated by British congregations. From early on, the missionaries were requesting further stock from London: Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', p. 56.

⁵³ Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, p. 69; LMS, *Transactions*, II, pp. 305-8, 314-15, 320-2.

⁵⁴ This has parallels in Vanessa Smith's study of *taio* friendship/economic bonds between mariners and Tahitians: Smith, *Intimate Strangers*, pp. 107-17, esp. pp. 113-14.

⁵⁵ LMS, *Transactions*, II, pp. 306-7.

Additionally, it was common for adults to 'loudly contradict every thing that is said, and use the names Jehovah and Jesus Christ in the most contemptuous manner'. It was common for Tahitians to ridicule both the missionaries' religion and their avowed desire to convert the population. Despite these difficulties, in 1804 the missionaries wrote optimistically that 'some knowledge' of 'the great truths of the Christian religion' had 'spread among the people' despite 'their indifference and inattention'. However, they were forced to concede that many of their flock 'wondered [why] the missionaries should give themselves so much trouble in travelling and speaking to them and seemed to pity them for their folly'.⁵⁶

It appears that the intentions of these strange newcomers were the subject of some debate on the island. Their itinerant preaching was tolerated rather than gladly received, as the following exchange recounted by Davies suggests. A native 'friend' of the missionary William Scott 'one day asked him why the missionaries took so much trouble' in talking about their religion. The 'friend' opined that they were to be 'pitied for their great trouble' since 'the people of Tahiti *never* would renounce their religion... and, therefore, it would be better for the missionaries to *parahi noa* (sit down quiet) and let them alone'.⁵⁷ Whilst some Tahitians' patience was tested by the Christians' sermons, others took the view that such preaching must be 'the custom of their country'. In an argument that likely made sense in light of the ways in which indigenous cults spread between islands, they suggested that 'one country had one set of customs, and another country another set of customs'. Consequently, it was right to 'let the *popaa* (the missionaries) have their own way'. However, tellingly, 'they did not like to be troubled often by them'.⁵⁸

Even if we acknowledge that the *Transactions* – like all missionary publications – only told certain stories about missionary clashes with foreign heathens, such records are valuable because of they indicate the kinds of problems that the missionaries reported experiencing. They also reflect, albeit indirectly, the islanders' reaction to the newcomer's

⁵⁶ LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 307.

⁵⁷ Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, p. 70, n. 1. *Emphases* in original.

⁵⁸ Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, p. 70; Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 84-7.

interruptions to their lives. The missionaries' experiences, even mediated by the editors of the *Transactions*, belied the rhetoric of Haweis and the other directors that the South Sea islanders lived lives of bucolic innocence and would quickly and happily convert to Christianity.⁵⁹ Despite this, the practical experience of attempting to preach Christian doctrine in Tahitian appears to have reinforced central Congregationalist doctrines as the missionaries searched for evidence of an inner transformation toward faithfulness amongst the Tahitian population.

On a more practical level, the missionaries were forced to concede that their own beliefs and practices did not conform to Tahitian expectations. As one report put it, since 'the English [do] not bring them *red* feathers, with which they make or decorate their gods', the Tahitians will not receive the Christian faith.⁶⁰ By invoking the fundamentally sinful nature of Tahitian society, the missionaries drew on Congregationalist principles, in particular the view that the truths of Scripture were both literal and self-evident. By providing the islanders with knowledge of Christianity, it was expected that they would embrace the inner transformation wrought by the Gospel.

This is particularly apparent in the missionaries' accounts of indigenous objections to Christian doctrine. These incidents provide a fascinating insight into day-to-day interactions between the missionaries and Tahitians. Descriptions of Tahitian idols sit alongside apparent Tahitian complaints about key Christian doctrines and ideas. In a limited way, we can perceive Tahitian beliefs and ideas talking back in the missionaries' record of their exchanges about religious matters. The particular objections that the missionaries saw fit to record – and editors in London saw fit to print – inform us about the specific concerns of the Congregationalist missionaries and their editors. Indeed, Tahitians often objected to elements of Christian doctrine that the vast majority of British Christians would have considered non-negotiable, thereby exacerbating the alterity of Tahitian society for their readers.

⁵⁹ Haweis, *Sermons Preached at the Formation of the Missionary Society*, pp. 12-13; Haweis, 'Very Probable Success', pp. 261-70. See also Newbury, 'Introduction', p. xxix.

⁶⁰ LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 338. *Emphases* in original.

Unlike previous generations of evangelicals, the London Missionary Society placed great weight on 'human responsibility' for personal salvation. This both justified their missionary endeavour and characterised their activities to reveal the gospels to the population through preaching.⁶¹ As we shall see later, they were strictly forbidden from intervening in the civil government of the islands. On their departure, the missionaries were urged to take 'the greatest care... to avoid' conforming 'to the heathen superstitions of the natives'. They were advised to avoid giving the impression that they 'gave credit to their religious traditions', but equally, to 'guard against such rash violations of the customs which they hold most sacred' or 'provok[ing] their resentment', to avoid rendering the mission 'contemptible by your supposed ignorance' of indigenous beliefs.⁶² With these injunctions in mind, and in the face of the abject failure of Christianity to spread amongst the islanders, the missionaries sought to make Christian religious ideas intelligible to the Tahitians. In doing so, they began to work outside of the frameworks that the Directors had originally envisaged for the mission. In 1815, the Directors wrote to the mission to urge them to refrain from producing excerpted or shortened histories of Scripture and to focus instead on 'a professed translation of a particular book' of the Bible to avoid corrupting the truth of the text by 'misrepresentation'. In response, the missionaries argued that 'their conscientiousness for the word of God' had led them to produce such summaries and excerpts. The missionaries in Tahiti argued that a full translation of any one book of the Bible would have less purchase on the imaginations of their Tahitian charges. In contrast, excerpted or adumbrated texts could draw upon over a decades experience ministering to the Tahitian population and render alien Christian concepts meaningful to them.⁶³

⁶¹ Sivasundaram, *Nature and the Godly Empire*, p. 25.

⁶² Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission* pp. 17-18, citing Directors to Tahiti Missionaries, n. d. The missionaries rarely interfered in the ritual life of the island, though at p. 126 Davies records how they grudgingly accepted that the building of a godhouse took precedence over building dwellings for themselves on their arrival at Fare Harbour on Huahine in 1808.

⁶³ Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, pp. 162-3; on earlier difficulties establishing a Tahitian alphabet, see pp. 77-8.

By the time the Directors complaints reached them, the missionaries had plenty of experience of what did not make sense to the Tahitians. In the *Transactions* they reported that Tahitians believed that 'at death the soul leaves the body and goes into the other world and is eaten by one or other of the gods. It comes through him again, is raised to life, washed, turned into a god, rendered immortal, and never liable to any more suffering'. Although wholly apocryphal to the missionaries, they noted that 'in this account of theirs there is a punishment after death, that of being eaten' and 'there is a resurrection of the spirit after being eaten'.⁶⁴ The structure of Christian eschatology informed missionary descriptions of Tahitian beliefs. Just as the missionaries sought to categorise Tahitian religious practices in Christocentric terms, the indigenous population sought to understand the new Christian beliefs and doctrines in terms of their own beliefs. This process of mutual interrogation shows the dialogic nature of intercultural encounters, and how Tahitian beliefs about life after death apparently clashed with the missionaries' beliefs. These records also attest to the gulf of cultural and religious expectations between the Polynesians and the British.

During a preaching tour in 1803, two of the missionaries came to a village where a large group of 'attentive' Tahitians were 'particularly set upon opposing the doctrine of the resurrection'. Despite their aforementioned parallels between Tahitian beliefs about the afterlife and Christian doctrines, the brethren were somewhat perturbed to discover that the natives 'will not allow the possibility of a resurrection of the body after it is once rotten'.⁶⁵ One man objected to the missionaries claim that 'the dead *should* be raised again' since 'many have been dead several thousands of seasons, and still are not raised'. The man went on to point out that their bodies 'are rotten and become dirt' and so the missionaries' claims about bodily resurrection were impossible.⁶⁶ The missionaries

⁶⁴ LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 331.

⁶⁵ LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 331.

⁶⁶ LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 330. *Emphases* in original. Ellis complained that the islanders tended to take Christian doctrine literally, though himself missed the 'complexity of the

resorted to a practical analogy in an attempt to reconcile Christian and Tahitian cosmologies. They explained that ‘several things in the vegetable kingdom die, and when their season comes they will live again’. However, the indigenous belief system did not tolerate this metaphor. The man rebuked the missionaries, observing that ‘the first woman, whom they call Hyena’ made ‘the moon, apples, turmeric etc in that state’ so that they ‘die and live again in their season’. However, ‘the first man, whose name was Tee, would not agree to her proposal, and, therefore, man will not live again’.⁶⁷ In 1804, the missionaries wrote that the islanders ‘in general affect to despise’ the notion of ‘salvation of the soul... and the resurrection of the body they commonly ridicule as extreme foolishness’.⁶⁸ Although the brethren described the Tahitians as having a spirit world effectively analogous to the Christian one, the Christian idea of an immortal soul simply did not correspond with Tahitian ideas about life and death. The missionaries’ recourse to this vegetable-based (and decidedly non-Scriptural) analogy also indicates the brethren going outside the officially sanctioned policy of the Society to simply preach Christian truths in their original form. Indeed, many of the missionaries who arrived after 1815 criticised the first generation of missionaries for adapting too readily to Tahitian customs, norms and beliefs.⁶⁹

We can discern Tahitian beliefs about the missionaries in their responses to Christian doctrines of bodily resurrection. There are two possible causes for the Tahitians’ objection to the missionaries’ new-fangled belief in resurrection. The first relates to indigenous funerary practices whilst the second draws demographic and anthropological research and considers how the Christians and their new religion were perceived on the island. Firstly, we know from subsequent ethnographic

Polynesian conceptual landscape’: Ellis, *Polynesian Researches*, II, pp. 424-5, 437; Jessop, ‘Unwrapping Gods’, pp. 44-5.

⁶⁷ LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 331. On contemporary representations of the Tahitian afterlife, see Religious Tracts Society, *Missionary Records: Tahiti and the Society Islands* (London, Religious Tracts Society: n.d. [c. 1830s]), III, p. 5. We must be aware here, as with all such missionary literature, that this is not authentic testimony of Tahitian beliefs. Rather, it is being mediated through a Christian worldview, for more discussion of these representational strategies see Keary, ‘Origin Stories’, pp. 186-91, 211.

⁶⁸ LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 349.

⁶⁹ Edmond, *Representing the South Pacific*, pp. 100-1.

research and the testimony of contemporaries, including Banks, that the bodies of high-status Tahitians were exhumed at death on a bier near to their dwelling and only interred once putrefaction had taken place.⁷⁰ This may in part explain why Tahitians' doubted the Christian doctrine of bodily resurrection. This is reinforced by the Tahitian man's claim that bodies which are 'rotten and become dirt' are unlikely to be resurrected.⁷¹

The second factor gives us a much clearer impression of how some Tahitians perceived the newcomers. Contact with Europeans, both from the mission and earlier visiting ships had resulted in the introduction of a large number of previously unknown diseases to the islands. Jessop suggests that outbreaks of disease following previous visits of Europeans were incorporated into Tahitian patterns of ritual and conflict, but that these began to break down following the arrival of the mission. The result was a prolonged period of conflict and instability between 1801 and 1815.⁷² This can also be traced through the missionaries' published accounts. As early as 1801, the missionaries reported that some Tahitians claimed 'the disorder that makes such havoc among them came from England'. A complex of beliefs seem to have been in circulation linking the missionaries with the new diseases and increased mortality.⁷³ For example, when Henry Bicknell and John Youl were preaching in the south of the island in 1803, a woman who 'was inspired by their god Mahoo' 'spoke several times' asking the missionaries 'where were there any saved through your *parrow* or speech: Pomare is dead, and we are all dying with your diseases'. New diseases had been 'brought here by the English' and she concluded by asking the two Englishmen 'when will you give over? We will hear our own gods: they will kill you!'⁷⁴

⁷⁰ These practices are discussed in the context of affective relations between Europeans and Tahitians in Smith, *Intimate Strangers*, pp. 150-75, esp. p. 152-4.

⁷¹ LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 349.

⁷² Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 31, 100-4, 122-3, 133-7, 143-4, 219-24.

⁷³ LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 299-300, 326-7.

⁷⁴ LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 345. The old king, Pomare I, whose name Europeans gave to the dynasty he founded, had passed authority to his son Tu some years before the mission as established. Pomare died unexpectedly earlier that year. Davies' eulogy to him can be found in Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, pp. 64-5.

These beliefs persisted despite the missionaries arguing that ‘sin’ was ‘the cause of diseases’.⁷⁵ Indeed, Davies observed that many Tahitians ‘attribute[d] their evils to our *parrow*’. Some Tahitians explicitly blamed the missionaries, claiming that ‘there are very few men left [and] nothing but stones remain’. They also believed that the Europeans had the power to heal these newly introduced sicknesses. Davies complained that many sick individuals ‘wantonly... call on us to look on those who have broken backs, the ague, the venereal etc. and ask if those will be healed by our *parrow*’. *Parrow* seems to pertain both to physical health and spiritual wealth as the Tahitians conflated the missionaries’ religious message about the Christian afterlife with restorative power. Following a preaching tour in 1803, two missionaries recorded that ‘whenever they [the Tahitians] hear of being saved, they fondly think that it is to be saved from sickness, and to abide in this world’.⁷⁶ The Christian heaven was interpreted as freedom from unprecedented sickness in this world, not the next.

A dramatic population crisis was occasioned by contact with Europeans since the islanders had no immunity to their diseases. By conservative estimates, around fifty percent of the population was wiped out as a result.⁷⁷ This dramatic statistic corroborates the islanders’ sinister interpretation of the missionaries’ preaching about life after death.⁷⁸ The group of Tahitians who opposed Christian doctrines of resurrection went on to tell the missionaries that ‘they do not wish to die: they wish to live

⁷⁵ LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 331.

⁷⁶ LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 349. This parallels later nineteenth-century debates within evangelical British circles about the nature of the second coming of Christ about the nature of the second coming of Christ. David Bogue, the missionary sponsor and organiser of the LMS, was involved in these debates, arguing that it was incorrect to believe that Christ would literally return to rule over mankind, neatly paralleling the missionaries’ objections to apparent Tahitian objections here. For more detail on these debates, see Martin Spence, *Heaven on Earth: Reimagining Time and Eternity in Nineteenth-Century British Evangelism* (Eugene: Pickwick Publications, 2015), pp. 63, see also pp. 31-73.

⁷⁷ Schmitt, ‘Missionary Censuses’, pp. 27-34. The missionaries were aware of the population decrease, though suspected that dodgy counting by previous English visitors could be to blame. Having travelled through most of the island in 1803, the head of the mission, John Jefferson, recorded that ‘Capt. Cook’s computation of 200,000’ inhabitants was ‘very much suspect’. However, Jefferson also observed that the population as ‘calculated by Mr. W. Wilson, 1787, is now reduced to less than one half’ and that, were Cook’s figures in ‘any ways right... an awful and dreadful carnage’ had occurred ‘in a few years’: LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 144.

⁷⁸ LMS, *Transactions*, II, pp. 327, 345. *Emphases* in original.

here, eat their own food and converse with one another'.⁷⁹ The indigenous population seem to have connected the missionaries' preaching about life after death with the increase in illnesses and deaths at all levels of their communities.

From these encounters, we can get some impression of the reactions of the Tahitians to the new and strange religion of the missionaries, and how they interpreted Christian beliefs in light of their own traditions. The resurrection was recoded as a folly, since it could not be reconciled with established Tahitian conventions concerning death and the afterlife. Similarly, the missionaries' preaching about resurrection after death took on an ominous tone from the perspective of a society facing death and disease on a scale unknown before the arrival of European ships.⁸⁰ As the missionaries attempted to make their religious message meaningful to the islanders, it was interpreted in particularly Tahitian ways.

Yet these descriptions are also fundamentally problematic. How, as historians, should we approach missionary sources that provide our only (biased) first-hand textual record of a religious culture that was entirely transformed by its encounter with evangelical Christianity? Historians of the Tahitian mission have been somewhat slow to account for the nuances of the relationship between the missionaries' beliefs and indigenous religious traditions. Garrett claimed that native ritual consisted of a 'partly phallic dance drama'. His reading relies on a psychoanalytic reading of missionary sources concerning Tahitian rituals. Whilst he attributed some rationality to Tahitian interrogation of Christian beliefs, he reinforced some of the Eurocentric assumptions of the missionaries. This is most explicit in his claim that the Tahitians 'desired to test the God who seemed to be the source and controlling power behind a floating society of marvels'.⁸¹

⁷⁹ LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 332. On the missionaries and indigenous beliefs about sickness, see Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 30-1, 100-1, 104, 122, 133-7, 143-4, 220-8.

⁸⁰ Albert J. Schultz, 'Urbanization in French Polynesia', *Land Economics*, 38.1 (1962), pp. 71-75.

⁸¹ Garrett, *To Live Among the Stars*, pp. 5-7.

We need not revive the sense of cultural superiority that the missionaries felt in order to investigate how Tahitians reacted to the strange beliefs of the newcomers. Rod Edmond has argued that we must be alert to the relationship between the 'epistemic (and literal) violence of colonialism' and 'the subjectivity and agency of the colonised'. Drawing on Henry Louis Gates' 'succinct' outline of the problem faced by postcolonial academics, Edmond suggests that we must negotiate a path between the proverbial rock and hard place. On the one hand, by 'empower[ing] discursively' indigenous agency, scholars risk 'downplaying the epistemic (and literal) violence of colonialism'. On the other hand, by 'play[ing] up the absolute nature of colonial domination', we risk 'negating the subjectivity and agency of the colonised'. Edmond responds to this impasse with a call to resolve it in 'specific cultural and historical situations', rather than at a more abstracted 'level of pure theory'. Edmond underlines the 'significant differences... within the tight-knit group of London Missionary Society missionaries on Tahiti', as well as their conflict in later decades with other 'agents of colonialism' in the region. Edmond insists that we should not assume that either the Tahitians or the British missionaries had 'a single voice'. Both coloniser and colonised groups possessed multiple voices, thus highlighting multiple interconnected layers of power relations both between these two societies and within them.⁸² Edmond's reading also alerts us to the limits of our historical knowledge of vanished societies. Whilst it may be ideologically satisfying to recuperate the lost voices of indigenous tradition, it is very difficult to avoid making them vocalise our own postcolonial concerns, revivifying them with all the characteristics of some past 'golden age' prior to the pernicious influence of Christianisation

⁸² Rod Edmond, 'Missionaries on Tahiti', p. 227; Henry Louis Gates Jr., 'Critical Fanonism', *Critical Inquiry*, 17.3 (1991), pp. 457-70, (p. 462). For a similar discussion of relationships within mission communities, in this case from the larger South African LMS mission, see Wendy Woodward, 'The Petticoat and the Kaross: Missionary Bodies and the Feminine in the London Missionary Society, 1816-1828', *Kronos*, 23 (1996), pp. 91-107. On missionaries in southern Africa more generally, see *The London Missionary Society in Southern Africa, 1799-1999: Historical Essays in Celebration of the Bicentenary of the LMS in Southern Africa*, ed. by John de Gruchy (Athens: Ohio University Press, 2000).

and imperialism.⁸³ We cannot extricate these sources from these processes, and these texts are implicated in the subjugation of the subaltern communities whose agency we are seeking to recover.⁸⁴

The missionaries' recording of Tahitian objections raised concerns that were relevant to their own Christian beliefs. By dwelling on Tahitian objections to the story of Christ's resurrection, the missionaries emphasised the distance between Tahitian paganism and Christian truths. Their Congregationalist vocation made it essential for individuals to voluntarily renounce their former sins and join the Christian community and this element of Congregationalist thought remained undimmed. However, as their experiences informed their practices, the missionaries began to adapt their strategies to what they understood of indigenous beliefs by summarising Scripture and attempting to present Christian doctrine metaphorically. Through the missionary *Transactions*, we have seen instances where the changing circumstances in the mission field confirmed or challenged Christian beliefs and Congregationalist principles. In the next section, we examine how the missionaries tried to maintain friendly relations with particular chiefs without abandoning their commitment to non-intervention in political affairs.

Of Brethren and Chiefs: Politics and Religion

Congregationalists believed that individual conscience had to be protected from the interference of governments. David Bogue, Congregationalist minister and founder of the Society, underlined this point in a 1795 sermon on the inauguration of the Society. He made it clear that 'the missionaries shall not in the smallest degree interfere with the political concerns of the countries in which they labour, nor have anything to say or do with the affairs of the civil government. And whoever shall transgress

⁸³ For twentieth-century account of Polynesian alterity indebted to the concerns of its *fin de siècle* author, see Paul Gauguin, *Noa Noa: The Tahitian Journal*, trans. by O. F. Theis (New York: Dover, 1920), pp. 4-7. On New Historicist historiography and its tendency toward this approach, see Chapter 1, pp. 9-10. For a critical evaluation of New Historicism more generally, see Sanjay Subrahmanyam, *Three Ways to Be Alien: Travails and Encounters in the Early Modern World* (Waltham: Brandeis University Press, 2011), pp. 174-7.

⁸⁴ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', p. 40. See also Gunson, *Messengers of Grace*, pp. 1-3; Oliver, *Ancient Tahitian Society*, p. 1361.

this rule, will be immediately dismissed in shame'.⁸⁵ Although 'we recognise clearly today' that missionaries are complicit 'in the "destabilisation of indigenous cultural and political structure"', Congregationalist missionaries in the early nineteenth century were 'perhaps the most beholden to the moral injunction to leave such social and political structures well enough alone'.⁸⁶ This was exacerbated by the specific problems facing the Tahitian missionaries during their first decade on the island as the proliferation of European weapons and the missionaries' allegiance with the Pomares exacerbated existing patterns of intertribal violence.⁸⁷

The missionaries' *Transactions* record that shortly after their arrival, they assumed legal ownership of an area of land in Matavai Bay, including the house that Bligh had had built during his visit to the island in 1789.⁸⁸ Meanwhile, the journal of the mission ship captain, James Wilson, indicates that competing indigenous political factions took advantage of the ignorance of the newly arrived missionaries to make competing claims for *taio* friendship and trading relations with the missionaries. Vanessa Smith has shown that these bonded obligations allowed high-ranking Polynesians to 'enhance their own status and leverage in local political affairs' by establishing exclusive trading relationships with individual Europeans. These 'complex' relationships were a 'compound of economics and affect' yet 'never fully reducible to one or the other'. *Taio* bonds were 'neither the pure products of the global relations that enabled them nor of the emotional responses they engender[ed]' between often 'illiterate sailors' and 'preliterate' Polynesians.⁸⁹ These *taio* bonds were not confined

⁸⁵ Werner, 'Role of History', p. 76, citing David Bogue, 'Objections Against a Mission to the Heathen, Stated and Considered', in LMS, *Sermons, Preached in London, at the Formation of the Missionary Society, September 22, 23, 24, 1795* (Newburyport: Barret & March, 1797), pp. 171-216, (p. 183).

⁸⁶ Susan Thorne, *Congregational Missions and the Making of an Imperial Culture in Nineteenth-Century England* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1999), p. 9; Werner, 'Role of History', p. 76. On the value of sermons for informing us of wider attitudes, see Laura M. Stevens, 'Why Read Sermons? What Americanists Can Learn from the Sermons of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts', *History Compass*, 3 (2005), pp. 1-19.

⁸⁷ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 117-18.

⁸⁸ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', p. 49.

⁸⁹ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 50-4; Smith, *Intimate Strangers*, p. 20.

to the lower orders aboard ship either: elite crewmembers, including Bligh, Cook and Wilson as well as a host of other captains and ship's officers also entered into such relationships. Indeed, it appears that the Tahitians became adept at establishing the status of Europeans mariners before 'ceremonies of friendship-making sealed the connection'. In contrast, Europeans were prone to identifying 'random signifiers of status' and often failed to correctly determine the status of Tahitian individuals keen to make *taio* bonds with them.⁹⁰

Even before their religious vocation became apparent,⁹¹ the missionaries' insistence that they were not there to trade or sell weapons immediately marked them out from previous European visitors. Wilson's account of the voyage was authorised and publicised by the Directors and describes how the missionaries assured Pomare and other chiefs that 'they would not, on any account, intermeddle in their wars'.⁹² Jessop suggests that, although the missionaries displayed 'naiveté', their early statements made clear that they sincerely intended to 'live... in a kind of isolated enclave, making in-roads into Polynesian ideologies, but remaining unchanged themselves'.⁹³ This 'naiveté' can be attributed to the separation of religion and politics so central to Bogue's sermons given at the inauguration of the missionary society before their departure in 1795.

When establishing the mission station at Matavia Bay, the missionaries solemnly claimed ownership of the land, ceding it from the political authority of indigenous chiefs. In 1803, Robert Smirke was commissioned by the Directors to produce a painting and engraving of this

⁹⁰ Smith, *Intimate Strangers*, pp. 71-3. For the account of one of the *Bounty's* crew who remained on Tahiti for longer, see James Morrison, *Account of the Island of Tahiti & the Customs of the Island*, ed. by Paul Turnbull (London: Golden Cockerel Press, 1935).

⁹¹ On religious matters, previous encounters had been mixed. Banks had been honoured to participate in Tahitian funerary rights, he also (perhaps unintentionally) 'desecrate[d]' a shrouded *to'o* when he visited nearby Ra'iatea: Smith, *Intimate Strangers*, pp. 161, 212. For other instances of Europeans misunderstanding or damaging *to'o*, see Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', p. 59-60; Beaglehole, *Endeavour Journals*, I, p. 318.

⁹² Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', p. 51; James Wilson, *A Missionary Voyage to the Southern Pacific Ocean, Performed in the Years 1796, 1797, 1798, in the Ship Duff...* (London, 1799), p. 63. The missionaries characterised Pomare and his male descendants as the hereditary dynasty ruling the islands.

⁹³ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', p. 52.

founding moment.⁹⁴ This depiction implied that acquiring the ‘bond of land’ for ‘secure... residence of the missionaries’ was straightforward and that their Tahitian hosts welcomed the new arrivals with open arms and a thorough understanding of the European legal norms being invoked by the ‘cession’ of territory to the mission.⁹⁵ The commissioning of Smirke’s painting of this moment perhaps also underlines its significance within the Congregationalist principles sketched out above. By ceding territory from the islanders, the missionaries were establishing their own godly community that would, they hoped, expand to include all of the indigenous population. To European eyes, the painting illustrated the mission’s independence from Tahitian civil authority.

This principled attachment to detachment, as well as the missionaries’ ignorance of indigenous political, social and religious forms, would have significant consequences for the conflicts that were to develop in the following decade and the missionaries’ understanding of them. The Society’s vision of the encounter depicted in Smirke’s painting ignored – and perhaps the missionaries themselves did not fully appreciate – that the mission ship and her captain and crew were also being incorporated into the ‘historical and mythical landscapes of Tahiti’. For the Tahitian priests and chiefs present at the ceremony, ‘it was crucial that these potent’ new arrivals be ‘formally integrated into the ranks of Polynesian gods, chiefs

⁹⁴ Robert Smirke, *The Cession of the District of Matavai in the Island of Otaheité to Captain James Wilson, for the Use of the Missionaries of the London Missionary Society*, 1803, <<http://www.gac.culture.gov.uk/work.aspx?obj=17048>> [accessed 27 July 2015].

⁹⁵ Jessop, ‘Unwrapping Gods’, p. 69; Wilson *Missionary Voyage*, pp. 76-7. On the role of high-status Tahitians in stage-managing these initial dealings with the mission, see Jessop, ‘Unwrapping Gods’, pp. 61-2. For instances in the missionary *Transactions* that suggest the Tahitian understanding of the brethren’s authority in the Matavai area was very different, see the following instances of tribute or sacrifices being required from Matavai: LMS, *Transactions*, I, p. 252; Religious Tracts Society, *Missionary Records: Tahiti*, III, pp. 38-9; Newbury, ‘Introduction’, p. xxxviii; Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, p. 32, citing CWM/LMS/02 South Seas 1 Wilson to Directors, 15 March 1802. Such sacrificial victims were regularly requested by the *raatiras* [chiefs] for ritual and political reasons. I have found only one instance in which request for a sacrificial victim was denied by Matavai, and it is unclear whether the missionaries themselves influenced the refusal: ‘another human sacrifice from the District of Faana was brought round the great *marae* of Atehuru and a man was asked of the District of Matavai but not given’: Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, p. 6.

and the European captains... who had visited these northern districts before them'.⁹⁶

The missionaries' understanding of indigenous politics was fragmentary and often suffused with terms borrowed from European political culture. They seem to have misunderstood the nature of chiefly authority in Tahiti, assuming that Pomare and his male descendants were rightful rulers of the entire island in the style of a European monarchical kingdom. The reality was very different. Indeed, rival chiefs from across the island attempted to trade with the newly arrived missionaries.⁹⁷ However, the British tended to assume that these individuals were subservient to Pomare's authority rather than rivals to it. Due to their exchange relationships with Pomare and his supporters, the brethren became engaged in a 'network of exchange and attendant obligations' that centred on Pomare, his son Tu, (later Pomare II) and their supporters.⁹⁸ The immediate consequence of this was the rapid depletion of the missionaries' supplies of trading goods, the growing realisation that they were dependent on Pomare for patronage and, following thefts and threats of violence, the hasty departure of eleven of the original eighteen missionaries within a year of arrival in Tahiti.⁹⁹ In the longer term, the missionaries seem to have developed greater knowledge of indigenous political systems. Shortly after his arrival in 1801, Davies noted that the conflict on the island is between two parties: 'royalist' forces loyal to Tu and his father Pomare, who Davies styled as the rightful king of the island, and the rebels, who are referred to as the 'disaffected District of Atehuru'. The latter were presented as resisting the rightful authority of the

⁹⁶ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 69, 71. The inclusion of the names of captains, appending Wilson to the likes of Wallis, Bougainville and Cook, in genealogies of Tahitian gods, chiefs and districts indicates how European visitors had entered into Tahitian cosmologies and how significant their visits were for elite Tahitians: Smith, *Intimate Strangers*, pp. 71-3.

⁹⁷ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 62, 73. On misunderstanding as the basis of cultural encounter and translation, see Carmine G. di Biase, 'Introduction: The Example of the Early Modern Lexicographer', in *Travel and Translation in the Early Modern Period*, ed. by Carmine G. di Biase (Amsterdam and New York: Rodopi, 2006), pp. 9-32.

⁹⁸ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 63-4, 67-8; on the missionaries continuing role in exchange relationships, see p. 28. For clarity, I refer to Pomare II as Tu throughout to avoid confusion with his father (Pomare I) or the clan and royal dynasty that the latter founded. Tu's full name in modern orthography is Tū Tū-nui-ē'a-i-te-atua Pōmare II.

⁹⁹ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', p. 76.

former.¹⁰⁰ In contrast, when major conflict threatened the mission again in 1808-10, Davies does not use these terms. On this occasion, the rebels were victorious and Tu and his supporters, including the missionaries, fled from Tahiti.¹⁰¹

Whilst the missionaries understood that civil and political institutions on the island were closely linked to the islanders' (in the mission's terms) idolatrous worship, the precise contours of this relationship consistently eluded them. The cult of Oro, which centred on possession of *tapu* [see below] artefacts like the *to'o* described by Bicknell and Nott at the beginning of this chapter, was also intimately connected with the 'extended conflicts' of the first decade of the nineteenth century.¹⁰² Jessop suggests that the evangelicals failed to appreciate that 'war and religion were not separate spheres' of Tahitian activity but rather were 'intimately linked'. For instance, Davies' narrative does not explicitly link Tu's increased number of sacrifices during the first months of 1807 with his invasion of 'the disaffected district of Atehuru' in May of that year. Writing up his memoir some years later, Davies claimed that the renewed hostilities were 'unexpected by the missionaries at that time' despite them 'having lately heard of many human sacrifices being taken to [the *marae* at] Tautira', which had been a significant locus of sacrificial activity during the earlier hostilities of 1803. Davies reported that the missionaries had believed that conflict was not imminent since 'many months would be spent in these performances'.¹⁰³

The missionaries were also ignorant of their own role in the deepening conflict. The proliferation of violence between 1801 and 1815 resulted in part from the Pomare clan's attempts to use their privileged position in trading relationships with the British to 'increase their religious and secular authority'. This provoked 'resentment and opposition' amongst

¹⁰⁰ LMS, *Transactions*, III, p. 116; Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, p. 64; Religious Tract Society, *Missionary Records: Tahiti*, III, p. 43.

¹⁰¹ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 116-18.

¹⁰² Newbury, 'Introduction', pp. xxxvii-xliii; Dening, *Bligh's Bad Language*, pp. 205-7; Oliver, *Ancient Tahitian Society*, p. 1307. The term *tapu* refers to the series of restrictions attached to sacred artefacts within a number of indigenous Polynesian religious systems. It is also the root word of the modern English 'taboo'.

¹⁰³ Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, pp. 96-7.

other chiefs, including those of the rival district and important sacred centre of Atehuru.¹⁰⁴ Though the missionaries would later become the 'dominant European community' in Tahiti, in these early decades the missionaries were almost entirely dependent on the patronage and protection of the Pomare family. The missionaries legitimised this relationship by styling Pomare and his son Tu as the rightful 'kings' of Tahiti.¹⁰⁵ Convincing Tu to convert to Christianity was central to the missionaries' strategy.¹⁰⁶ This is evident in Davies' diary, written up for publication between 1827-30 in which Davies sought to explain away the slow (i.e. non-existent) progress of the mission in its first decade.¹⁰⁷ Davies, a Welshman and former schoolteacher, was part of the second batch of missionaries who arrived in 1801 to replace those who fled in the first year. His background locates him squarely within the aspiring working class and lower middle class communities from which the majority of missionary recruits came.¹⁰⁸ Despite this, after many years in Tahiti, some of his opinions were at variance with those of the Directors.¹⁰⁹

Davies' account of Tahitian religious and political life betrays an awareness of Congregationalist views on the separation of religious and political matters. He asserted that the Tahitians were 'religious people, and their religion (or if you please superstition) influences all their affairs'. As a result, the London Missionary Society's desire to 'civilise' the Tahitians could only be achieved by wholesale reform of their 'religious system'. By 1814, Davies was cautiously optimistic that 'as Christianity prevails a different state of things will gradually take place'. Davies attributed the missionaries' failure thus far to the central role that indigenous cults

¹⁰⁴ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 100-4.

¹⁰⁵ Cox, *Missionary Enterprise*, p. 132.

¹⁰⁶ Anon, *The Missionary Magazine for 1810...* (Edinburgh: Andrew and James Aikman, 1810), xv, pp. 36-7, 271-5, 493, 534, 576-7; Anon., *The Missionary Register for the Year 1814: Containing an Abstract of the Proceedings of the Principal Missionary and Bible Stations...* (London: L. B. Seeley: 1814), pp. 72-4.

¹⁰⁷ Newbury, 'Introduction', pp. liii-liv.

¹⁰⁸ Johnston, 'Missionary Men', pp. 94-7.

¹⁰⁹ For example, Davies was amongst those missionaries who were unconvinced by the linguistic schema arrived at for the first Tahitian alphabet. He also objected to later injunctions against abbreviating Scripture for Tahitian consumption: Newbury, 'Introduction', p. xlv; Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, pp. 77-8, 162 n. 3.

played in legitimising the political authority of chiefs.¹¹⁰ Davies depicts Tu as being paralysed by idolatrous religious traditions. According to Davies, Tu 'has heard much of the true God, and understands more than most of his countrymen'. He reckoned that the king 'would act in some respects' 'were it not for political motives'. Since 'the present national religion is so blended with the civil concerns' and the 'privileges and authority of the chiefs', the islanders had 'no conception [that] the one can stand without the other'.¹¹¹ For Davies, the Tahitians' idolatrous tradition was reinforced by a political system and one could not be reformed without reshaping the other. He appears to suggest that moral reformation of the islanders' religious practices could only be achieved by political changes which persuaded the chiefs that a Christian religious system – presumably of freely associating congregations of individuals touched by personal experience of divine revelation – was preferable.¹¹²

Davies' suggestion that Tu was paralysed by the interconnection of native religion and political authority express the sort of Congregationalist opinions that Bogue would have approved of. Davies did not argue that the missionaries should directly meddle in political matters or make politically expedient justifications for Pomare to convert. However, his diaries failed to meet with the approval of the Directors when he sought permission to publish them following his retirement. It seems likely that the Directors' decision was linked to Davies' criticisms of later missionaries' doctrinaire insistence on separation from indigenous communities, as well as these later arrivals' widely publicised criticisms of the conduct of Davies and his colleagues.¹¹³ Despite their protestations to the contrary, the first generation of missionaries had become involved in the islanders' political

¹¹⁰ Garrett, *To Live Among the Stars*, p. 22, citing LMS/SSL, Davies to Directors, 7 January 1814 (now located in CWM/LMS, South Seas: Incoming correspondence, 1796-1840, H2, Box 2).

¹¹¹ Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, p. 103.

¹¹² See, for example, LMS, *Transactions*, I, p. 252; *Transactions*, II, pp. 322-3; *Transactions*, III, p. 112; Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, p. 32, 47, 49-50, 61, 96-7, 102, 111, 114, 116, 162; Religious Tracts Society, *Missionary Records: Tahiti*, III, pp. 38-9. Further details of sacrificial practices can be found in Newbury, 'Introduction', p. xxxviii.

¹¹³ Newbury, 'Introduction', pp. liii-liv. On tension between pro-'native' and imperialist outlooks amongst missionaries, see Cox, *British Missionary Enterprises*, pp. 108-9.

and ritual life.¹¹⁴ After new missionaries arrived in 1815, and Tu converted in 1819, the missionary community was divided between new recruits and longer-standing members.¹¹⁵

In the early decades, their dependence on the Pomare clan required both careful negotiation and delicate representation given their engagement with the taboo topic of indigenous politics. Davies' text raised issues about the first generation of missionaries' conduct that the Directors may well have found objectionable. The Directors' decision may also have stemmed from concern that Davies' recollections would provide ammunition for domestic critics of missionary activity. Throughout the first half of the nineteenth century, prominent critics including Charles Dickens and the explorer Otto von Kotzebue 'charged missionaries with hypocrisy' and suggested that they exercised "'unbounded" power over the minds of the Tahitians'.¹¹⁶ Winter Jade Werner notes that missionaries in the South Seas went to great lengths to demonstrate that they 'respected the separation of religion from politics'.¹¹⁷

William Ellis' *Polynesian Researches* (1829) is a good example of such a text. Authorised and publicised by the Society at home, Ellis text asserted that indigenous practices restricted liberty and so the islanders appreciated Christianisation as a wholly liberating experience.¹¹⁸ Writing within a providential framework in which 'history progresse[d] not by human will but by divine fiat', Ellis used a 'curious double-speak that strategically denies the individual missionary's ability to effect significant social change' whilst attributing the significant transformations they collectively instituted within Polynesian societies to 'God's agency'. When describing Tahitian institutions abolished by the missionaries, Ellis tends to 'elide or downplay... missionary efforts' in order to avoid 'unwanted

¹¹⁴ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 103-4.

¹¹⁵ Edmond, 'Missionaries on Tahiti', pp. 227-8.

¹¹⁶ Werner, 'Role of History', pp. 77-8, citing Otto van Kotzebue, *A New Voyage Around the World in 1823, 1824, 1825, and 1826* (London: Henry Colburn and Richard Bentley, 1830), p. 162; Charles Dickens, *Letters of Charles Dickens: 1857-1870* ed. by Georgina Hogarth and Mary Dickens 2 vols. (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1879), pp. 280-4.

¹¹⁷ Werner, 'Role of History', pp. 83-4.

¹¹⁸ Werner, 'Role of History', pp. 83-4. See also Anna Johnston, 'The Book Eaters: Textuality, Modernity and the London Missionary Society', *Semeia*, 88 (1999), pp. 13-40.

controversy' arising from their 'overthrowing [of indigenous] authority figures'. Furthermore, Ellis argued that Polynesian culture was not indigenous to that region, thereby asserting that 'massive political and cultural change' had precedents in the islands in order to justify the massive social, political and cultural transformation wrought by the missionaries themselves.¹¹⁹

In contrast, Davies is open about the missionaries' increasing involvement in the civil institutions and government of the island. Following Tu's victory over his opponents in Atehuru in 1803, he had unexpectedly presented some land there to the missionaries. Davies later regretted that this land was lost when the Pomares' authority on the islands was overthrown in the disturbances leading up to the evacuation in 1808.¹²⁰ This gift suggested that the first generation of missionaries had become integrated into Tahitian political life. Their closeness to Tahitian political authority was also apparent when Davies recounted how, during an illness in 1807, Tu warned the missionaries and Idia (his mother) that they should 'escape in case of his death' as 'they would all be in danger of their lives'.¹²¹ Davies' positive gloss of Pomare's concern for his mother and the missionaries implied that the mission were far more complicit in indigenous political affairs than their Congregationalist principles should have allowed. The former mission librarian clearly wished to record for posterity his contemporaries' activity in establishing their close relationship with the Pomare dynasty that had begun the process that led many leading chiefs to burn their idols and embrace Christianity. In so doing, however, Davies said more than the Directors would have liked about the political activities of the Tahitian mission.¹²²

The fate of Davies' text also backs up Cox' view that missionary texts could be caught between defaming indigenous practices for being idolatrous and defending them on the basis of 'Christian universalism'.¹²³

¹¹⁹ Werner, 'Role of History', pp. 80-2; Gunson, *Messengers of Grace*, p. 12.

¹²⁰ Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, pp. 104-5.

¹²¹ Davies, *History of the Tahitian Mission*, p. 111.

¹²² On poor relations with London, see Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', p. 118.

¹²³ Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, pp. 116, 121, 125-30, 134-5.

Davies' text suggested that the missionaries were complicit in the political authority of the pre-Christian religious system. The refusal of the Society to publish it clearly implies that the Directors disapproved of Davies' version of events. The librarian's account of the mission's acquisition of territory, and of their attachment to the Pomare dynasty, suggested that their conduct may not have been entirely in agreement with Bogue's statement of intent prior to their departure. More broadly, the Directors feared that publication would play into the hands of critics of missionary activity in the Pacific by exposing their political activities as self-interested.

As the missionaries adapted to the realities of Tahitian politics, Bogue's insistence on separation from political affairs was overlooked when it seemed essential to the mission's survival or expedient to further their interests. In contrast to the image presented in Wilson's account and Smirke's painting, the missionaries quickly became deeply immersed in the political and religious life of the islanders. As a result, they developed a number of strategies to maintain their favoured status in the orbit of the Pomare clan.¹²⁴ In so doing, they became involved in indigenous political and religious life. When the ascendancy of Pomare faltered in 1808-10, the missionaries were forced to abandon the island alongside its rightful 'king'. Davies' account stands at variance with authorised publications since it does not make the same use of providential rhetoric to conceal the missionaries' interventions in indigenous civil affairs.

Conclusion

By the time Tu had re-established the Pomares' authority over Tahiti in 1815, many Tahitians had come to doubt the efficacy of their own gods. We cannot know precisely how much any individual factor contributed to this shift, though it seems certain that a combination of factors were ultimately responsible. The destructive conflicts of the previous decade, the terrible morbidity caused by introduced diseases and the catechising activities undertaken by the missionaries between 1797 and 1808 must have all

¹²⁴ Some of these activities were clearly relatively harmless from a Congregationalist viewpoint. For instance, one missionary produced European style furnishings for the chiefs; see Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', p. 56.

contributed to Tahitian doubts about the 'efficacy of gods who brought no respite from over a decade of disease and warfare'.¹²⁵ The missionaries' strategies for survival, and their adaptation of Christian ideas for indigenous audiences, reflected the complex nature of intercultural encounters in the Pacific. Moreover, their published texts demonstrate the various ways in which both sides expanded their understanding and ability to represent each other's fundamental beliefs.

Diseases, people and ideas all crossed borders. Yet the manner in which they were received was often intimately linked to the values of the particular individuals and societies involved. Just as the missionaries recorded Tahitian religious objects as symptomatic of their idolatrous religious system, the islanders represented Christian ideas in ways meaningful to their own beliefs. Whilst the mission saw Tahitian beliefs as symptomatic of post-diluvian idolatry, the Tahitians represented the missionaries as possessors of quasi-magical *parrow* that had brought unprecedented levels of death and disease to their communities. Being alert to the dialogic process of representation in cross-cultural encounters is essential if we wish to properly understand historical situations when different cultures interact. The specific ideologies of the missionaries and their Tahitian interlocutors shaped these encounters, whilst the brethren's published representations were informed by the ideological expectations of their editors and audiences.

When the Tahitian keeper of Oro's house gave permission to Bicknell and Wilson to take the *to'o* idol from its container, was he confused by their request that Oro 'come out and let us see him'?¹²⁶ Perhaps he already knew a little about the missionaries' beliefs – about their immaterial and immanent deity and the salvation through death that was apparently only accessible through the missionaries and their magical books. We know that indigenous *tapu* restrictions survived into the new

¹²⁵ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', p. 104, 122, 133-6, 140-3, 153, 220. On vanishing religious traditions more generally, see Joel Robbins, 'How Do Religions End? Theorising Religious Traditions from the Point of View of How They Disappear', *Cambridge Anthropology*, 32 (2014), pp. 2-15.

¹²⁶ LMS, *Transactions*, II, p. 135.

forms of Christianity that prevailed on the islands from the 1820s onwards.¹²⁷ In these early encounters between two religious systems, that future had not yet been written: understanding and misunderstanding mingled in everyday interactions. Tahitian understandings of the *parrow* of the Europeans and the missionaries' condemnations of Tahitian sinfulness and disruptiveness were both symptomatic of this process of cultural coexistence and collision. We have seen how important it is to take religion seriously in its own terms when discussing historical intercultural encounters. Religious questions were integral to early modern cultural collisions, and Davies' account indicates how doctrinaire religious principles could be rewritten through the experience of missionary activity and cross-cultural exchange. These entangled encounters greatly enrich our understanding of the relationship between colonial expansion and Christianisation. The Congregationalist vocation of the missionaries provided the basis for their voyage to the South Seas, yet it was also challenged by the exigencies of survival in a very different political culture.

Through the mission records, there is the persistent sense that neither side ever fully understood the values of the other. The lowercase 'other' is significant: the evidence suggests that neither side considered the other to be essentially alien. For the missionaries, Christian universalism, specifically their emphasis on individual piety and freely associated congregations of believers, made some consideration of indigenous culture essential if they were to achieve their objective of converting the islanders. On the other hand, Tahitian oral traditions incorporated the missionaries' arrival into indigenous histories of previous European visitors, with their own significance within the political and religious life of the island. These partial understandings, suffused in respectively European and Polynesian norms and beliefs, make the interconnected nature of travel narratives explicit. These relationships are further reinforced if we look at how the missionaries became involved in indigenous political matters.

These entangled histories of intercultural encounter demonstrate that travel texts betray multiple and contested readings of non-Christian

¹²⁷ Jessop, 'Unwrapping Gods', pp. 240-7, 272-3.

belief systems. In the final chapter, we consider how attitudes to foreign beliefs and practices adapted and altered over time. By highlighting differences in perspective between the various case studies I have already examined, I show that religious matters were integral to the construction of early modern travel writing as a genre.

Chapter 8

Conclusion

When a storm inflicted serious damage to his ship, Thomas Forrest awaited the repairs as a guest of a senior noble in Jolo, capital of the Sulu Sultanate, a small independent Muslim state south-west of the Spanish-controlled Philippines. The vessel's crew were principally Malay Muslims and so, with the exception of the Spanish ambassador, Sinior Abderagani, Forrest and his fellow British officers were the only Europeans at the court. Local food taboos held non-Muslims to be unclean and so 'the Spaniard and myself, with some few people belonging to us' were 'the only persons at court... doomed to drink our chocolate out of glass tumblers, while everyone else drank out of fine china'.¹ Despite acknowledging that court protocols set him apart as an Englishman and a Christian, Forrest described the sweet beverage as one of the defining marks of the Rajah's hospitality. Forrest only came to comment on this status distinction some months later. In Forrest's report, the civility of the heir apparent to the Sultanate was not diminished even though these taboos apparently enshrined the otherness of Europeans.

Unlike those travellers to the Levant that we have already encountered, Forrest's lengthy account of his voyage does not comment upon religious differences between Christians and Muslims. Earlier in the *Voyage* (1779), Forrest noted how he modified his own behaviour in order to avoid offending his Muslim crew by violating their food taboos. Whilst on the Papuan coast, he described how he 'frequently bought... pieces of wild hog' from local villages but made sure he 'avoided carrying [it] on board the galley, but dressed and eat [sic] it ashore, unwilling to give

¹ Thomas Forrest, *A Voyage to New Guinea, and the Moluccas, from Balambangan: Including an Account of Magindano, Sooloo, and Other Islands...* (London, 1779), pp. 209, 294. On trade in the region more generally, see James Francis Warren, *The Sulu Zone, 1768-1898: The Dynamics of External Trade, Slavery, and Ethnicity in the Transformation of a Southeast Asian Maritime State*, 2nd edn (Singapore: National University of Singapore Press, 1981). On constructions of South East Asia by Europeans, see Siti Nuraishah Ahmad, Shanthini Pillai and Noraini Md. Yusof, 'Rehabilitating Eden: Archetypal Images of Malaya in European Travel Writing', *Journeys*, 12.1 (2011), pp. 22-45. Forrest's brief biography can be found here: J. K. Laughton, 'Forrest, Thomas', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2015, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/9891>> [accessed 8 November 2015].

offence to the crew'.² Forrest's account of his own behaviour stressed an inclusionary approach to other religious cultures, hinting at an ecumenical perspective motivated by his desire to maintain good relations with his crew.³ Forrest's text demonstrates the central role that 'personal relationships' between 'individuals with their own aspirations, fears and circumstances' played in travellers' recollections.⁴

Moreover, Forrest constantly shifts between multiple positions, emphasising or concealing his confessional identity dependent on the circumstances.⁵ He emphasised the benefits to local rulers of establishing trading relations with the British, and also gave gifts to translators and other locals who assisted him in order to ensure the beneficence of British traders is remembered.⁶ Despite this, his own prose is more circumspect about the benefits brought by competing European empires to the economy and politics of the region.⁷ Through describing his actions, Forrest emphasised different identities in order to negotiate successfully with a variety of interlocutors. These interactions are uniformly successful in the published rendition of his enterprises, indicating that travellers' self-fashioning underpins the account they give in their publications. For instance, Forrest recounts in detail how a Suluk noble ruled in his favour in a dispute with the pilot of his ship, Hadji Omar.⁸ Where Forrest does admit his own weaknesses, it is against forces that he could not have expected to prevail, such as the death of crewmembers⁹ or the mendacious tactics of

² Forrest, *Voyage*, p. 97.

³ Carina L. Johnson, *Cultural Hierarchy in Sixteenth-Century Europe: The Ottomans and Mexicans* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), pp. 262-9. On the East India Company's religious policies more generally, see Penelope Carson, *The East India Company and Religion, 1698-1858* (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2012) Rahul Sapra, *The Limits of Orientalism: Seventeenth Century Representations of India* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2011), pp. 40-59; Robert Travers, 'The Eighteenth Century in Indian History', *Eighteenth Century Studies*, 40.3 (2007), pp. 492-508 (pp. 498-508).

⁴ John-Paul Ghobrial, *The Whispers of Cities: Information Flow in Istanbul, London and Paris in the Age of William Trumbull* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), pp. 86-7.

⁵ Forrest, *Voyage*, pp. 290-4.

⁶ Forrest, *Voyage*, p. 110.

⁷ Forrest, *Voyage*, pp. 45, 48; Sapra, *Limits of Orientalism*, pp. 33-59; Rahul Sapra, 'Orientalism of Capitalism: Warren Hastings and the Rhetoric of Empire', in *Tall Tales and True: India, Historiography and British Imperial Imaginings*, ed. by Kate Brittlebank (Clayton: Monash University Press, 2008), pp. 8-19.

⁸ Forrest, *Voyage*, pp. 214-16, 220, 262.

⁹ Forrest, *Voyage*, pp. 223-6, 227-8.

other nations' merchants.¹⁰ Through these admissions of fallibility, complex relationships and others' perceptions of the traveller can be evaded – we never get a proper sense of what the Muslim rulers at Jolo thought of Forrest's politicking – whilst others are exaggerated when they shed positive light on the traveller writer.

When Fakymolano, their host's father, enquired about the differing religious opinions of Forrest (a Protestant) and the Catholic envoy, Forrest recalls that his circumspect answer 'greatly abated that gall, which has for ages dignified many personages both in church and state on the other side of the globe' in Europe. However, when recalling other private conversations with Fakymolano, he admits that 'a little ridicule concerning indulgences, celibacy of priests, and the like would now and then escape me'. Nonetheless, he writes (perhaps disingenuously) that he also assured Fakymolano that 'the world possessed no greater men than some Spaniards'.¹¹ We may be tempted to conclude that Forrest did not see the Spanish envoy as his religious equal, despite their shared European heritage and identity. This view is supported by his critical comments on the colonial squabbles and predatory trading activities of Dutch, Spanish and British trading companies in the region.¹² However, on another occasion, he collaborated with Abderagani when their host requested they undertake a Malay translation of a European religious text.¹³ In general, Forrest enjoyed better relations with his Muslims hosts than with the Spanish envoy. On his departure, he records how he had 'received... great civility' from their host and 'great sincerity and good advice' from his father.¹⁴

¹⁰ Forrest, *Voyage*, p. 45.

¹¹ Forrest, *Journey*, p. 294.

¹² Forrest, *Journey*, pp. 45, 115. On competing colonialisms in the region, see Dhara Anjaria, 'Someone Else's Empire: European Colonialisms in South East Asia, 1800 to 1914', *Middle Ground Journal*, 5 (2012), <<http://www2.css.edu/app/depts/HIS/historyjournal/index.cfm?name=Review-Essay%3A-Someone-Else's-Empire%3A-European-Colonialisms-in-South-East-Asia%2C-1800-to-1914&cat=7&art=121>> [accessed 10 January 2013]. On Southeast Asian maritime spaces, piracy and conflict between various colonial and precolonial states, see Jennifer L. Gaynor, 'Piracy in the Offing: The Law of Lands and The Limits of Sovereignty at Sea', *Anthropological Quarterly*, 85.3 (2012), pp. 817-57.

¹³ Forrest, *Journey*, pp. 292-4.

¹⁴ Forrest, *Journey*, pp. 290-1.

Religious issues informed Forrest's text just as much as his quest for nutmeg and the other trading activities that motivated his travels as an East India Company factor. In his representations of fellow Christians, Forrest drew upon patriotic notions of English exceptionalism and Protestant critiques of Catholicism that had informed travel writing since Richard Hakluyt's time.¹⁵ His opinions are also shaped by the prevalent anti-Catholic prejudice and legislation of the eighteenth century.¹⁶ Forrest's experiences in India, where toleration of Indian religious diversity informed British government in Bombay, may also explain his diplomatic reticence to dwell too long on doctrinal differences with Catholics, at least in the presence of the ambassador.¹⁷ Forrest's self-representation embodies particular stereotypes about the well-informed or cosmopolitan English traveller that had first been articulated in the 'cultural outlook' of Elizabethan traders and their sponsors.¹⁸

Despite this, the preservation of 'uncontaminated religion' informed Forrest's text to a lesser extent than it did the late sixteenth-century advice to travellers discussed by Joan-Pau Rubiés.¹⁹ In particular, Forrest's criticisms of Britain's involvement in unequal and corrupt trading practices indicate the time that had elapsed since Hakluyt enshrined the 'nationalistic mythology necessary to' organise and justify 'pirating and trading expeditions' and obtain 'social and financial support for them'.²⁰ Forrest appeals to a benevolent notion of British imperial expansion that emphasised the ostensible benefits that such trade brought to other polities and societies. In early modern travel literature more generally, a variety of confessional identities were articulated and elided as religious beliefs and practices were amongst the most obvious markers of difference, and one element that travellers were urged to comment upon

¹⁵ Kim Phillips, *Before Orientalism: Asian People and Cultures in European Travel Writing, 1245-1510* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013), pp. 63-4.

¹⁶ See the outline of religious change in Chapter 1 above at pp. 17-24.

¹⁷ On toleration of Catholics, especially in colonial settings, see Jessica L. Harland-Jacobs, 'Incorporating the King's New Subjects: Accommodation and Anti-Catholicism in the British Empire, 1763-1815', *Journal of Religious History*, 39.2 (2014), pp. 1-21.

¹⁸ Joan Pau Rubiés, 'Instructions for Travellers: Teaching the Eye to See', *History and Anthropology*, 9.2-3 (1996), pp. 139-91 (p. 171).

¹⁹ Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', pp. 170-1.

²⁰ Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', p. 174, on Hakluyt, see pp. 161-2.

following the 'crisis of... religious consensus' occasioned by the Reformation and the associated 'fragmentation of [European] political and cultural spaces'.²¹ In their writing about religions, travellers' own confessional perspectives were also articulated: in identifications with and repudiations of deviants and dissidence, travellers could either reinforce or resist religious orthodoxies. Through articulating a range of reactions to other societies' beliefs and practices, travellers situated themselves within an increasingly 'broad-based' Protestant religious culture.²²

Over the last seven chapters, we have explored different travellers' engagement with various strands of Protestant religious culture. I have shown how travel experiences abroad and doctrinal debates, controversies and intellectual movements at home influenced travellers' accounts of other religious cultures. Travellers employed a variety of different strategies in order to participate in and contribute to these wider debates. Within the wider generic conventions of early modern travel writing, these texts all reflect upon the relationship between the individual and their own society as well as representing their interactions and encounters with individuals and institutions from other societies.

The first part of this conclusion summarises the key arguments of the thesis, highlighting the connections between the preceding three pairs of chapters that have focused on the perspectives of travel, deviants and dissidents respectively. In so doing, I also highlight how each case study relates to the central premise of this thesis: that travel narratives were intimately connected with the confessional outlooks of their authors, and that these texts can inform us of the multiple familiar and unfamiliar religious worlds in which they moved. Following this, two shorter sections highlight important connections between the largely synchronic analyses found in the preceding chapters. Firstly, we consider a topic already touched upon in the foregoing discussion of Forrest's travels by considering how the articulation of travellers' confessional allegiances changed over the *longue durée* of the thesis. Secondly, I shall explore the

²¹ Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', p. 151.

²² Alec Ryrie, *Being Protestant in Reformation Britain* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), p. 6.

relationship between the research presented here and wider transnational historiography. In both these final sections, I reflect upon the connections between global and local perspectives and sketch briefly how the analysis presented here could be expanded to address other topics, texts and contexts.

Travelling with Beliefs

This thesis has examined the religious identities of individual travellers and how these were expressed through their representations of foreign societies' beliefs and practices. I have studied a variety of travel texts that explored pertinent contemporary religious issues through discussion of editorial practices and providentialism; deviant discourses through discussion of apostasy and witchcraft; and the dissident perspectives of deists and Congregationalists. These issues have, respectively, been explored through the lens of travel writing about Orthodox Christianity, the Ottoman Empire, North African slavery, Lapp rituals, Indian polytheisms and Tahitian customs. Through these six case studies, I have shown how representations of other societies informed, were influenced by and could influence domestic religious discourses and debates.²³

Moreover, I have argued that European and non-European societies did not exist in the separate spheres envisioned by older, postcolonial analysis. Social, diplomatic, economic and political interconnections meant ambassadors, traders, slaves, missionaries and other travellers regularly crossed and re-crossed cultural and religious boundaries. Travellers' texts depict multiple and at times contradictory social, cultural and political roles dependent on the context in which their authors found themselves, as in Forrest's various negotiations of his Christian, British and Protestant identities.²⁴ A range of confessional identities can be found in early modern

²³ David R. Blanks, 'Western Views of Islam in the Premodern Period: A Brief History of Past Approaches', in *Western Views of Islam in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Perception of Other*, ed. by Michael Frassetto and David R. Blanks (New York: St Martin's Press, 1999), pp. 1-54 (p. 38); Gerald MacLean, *The Rise of Oriental Travel: English Visitors to the Ottoman Empire, 1580-1720* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), pp. 168-9.

²⁴ An excellent microhistorical articulation of the multiple social roles occupied by a traveller/diplomat can be found in John-Paul Ghobrial's work on the seventeenth-century

travel writing between c. 1550 and c. 1800. I have explored how domestic debates, beliefs and practices influenced representations of Orthodox Christianity rituals, Islamic identities and doctrines, Lapp rituals, Hindu/Buddhist philosophies and indigenous Tahitian cosmologies. Employing a similarly global perspective to Alison Games' analysis of English cosmopolitanism, I have explored how travellers of different confessional allegiances navigated dealings with and representations of other religious groups.²⁵ This thesis has brought together a geographically and temporally diverse range of case studies. Each chapter has highlighted the influence of specific English theological controversies on accounts of other societies' beliefs and practices.

Both Chapters 2 and 3 considered travel writing and the different perspectives it evinced. Chapter 2 focused on the editorial practices of Hakluyt and those who excerpted his collection in different contexts. Chapter 3 examined relationship between stereotypes of the Mahometan other and travel literature in light of widespread Protestant beliefs in providence. The following pair of chapters (Chapters 4 and 5) examined ideas of deviance. Chapter 4 examined how concerns about apostasy, conversion and unbelief influenced slavery narratives by Englishmen held captive in North Africa. Chapter 5 mapped debates about witchcraft and the supernatural onto reports of Lapp rituals and magical beliefs. The final pair of chapters (Chapters 6 and 7) looked at the writings of different types of religious dissidents. The most obvious group at loggerheads with mainstream religious opinion were English deists and Orientalists discussed in Chapter 6. This chapter explored how ideas about natural religion influenced eighteenth-century Orientalist writing about Hinduism and Buddhism. Following that, Chapter 7 considered how the experience of missionary life in Tahiti led Congregationalist missionaries to disregard

English diplomat William Trumbull: Ghobrial, *Whispers of Cities*, pp. 7-11. See also Lawrence Danson, 'The Sultan's Organ: Presents and Self-Presentation in Thomas Dallam's Diary', *Renaissance Studies*, 23.3 (2010), pp. 639-58; Nabil Matar, 'Arab Views of Europeans, 1578-1727: The Western Mediterranean', in *Re-Orienting the Renaissance: Cultural Exchanges with the East*, ed. by Gerald MacLean (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 126-47.

²⁵ Alison Games, *The Web of Empire: English Cosmopolitans in an Age of Expansion, 1560-1660* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), pp. 219-53.

some of the precepts of their order, thereby problematising their relationship with subsequent generations of missionaries and their employers at home.

How were travel texts used and reused over time? This issue occupied Chapter 2, which focused on two elements of Hakluyt's *Principal Navigations*: (1) its relationship with existing editorial practices and travel writing conventions and (2) how Hakluyt's descriptions of other religions were utilised by subsequent generations. The first part examined Hakluyt's own editorial strategies, exploring how contentious religious and political issues were handled in order to reinforce a benchmark of authorised Protestant rituals and norms. Hakluyt's compendium of descriptions of Russian churches and doctrines recorded how English religious experiences changed during Elizabeth's reign. Hakluyt's sources from the 1550s and 1560s contrasted with later Elizabethan depictions of Orthodox Christianity. The novelty of the organ-maker Thomas Dallam's description of Greek Orthodox worship diverged from earlier ambassadorial reports that acknowledged the familiarity of Catholic elements of Orthodox worship. We also saw how Dallam's lower social status and background – he came from Lancashire, an area with unusually high rates of recusancy – influenced his depiction of foreign forms of Christianity. Hakluyt's reports reinforced a nationalistic conception of English Protestantism that underpinned in different ways all the subsequent texts analysed in this thesis.

Hakluyt's preeminent status as a compiler of English travel narratives led many subsequent writers to assume the empirical facticity of his narratives and to deploy snippets in order to validate their own opinions.²⁶ This was explored in the second part of Chapter 2, which considered later seventeenth-century reuses of Hakluyt's anthology. The moderate archbishop Thomas Tenison deployed Hakluyt's descriptions of idolatrous worship in the Arctic to highlight the separation of Protestant Christianity from polytheism and idolatry, as well as the spiritual dangers

²⁶ Julia Schleck, "'Plain Broad Narratives of Substantial Facts': Credibility, Narrative and Hakluyt's *Principall Navigations*", *Renaissance Quarterly*, 59.3 (2006), pp. 768-94.

of engaging with idolatrous practices.²⁷ In charting Hakluyt's editorial strategies and those of subsequent writers who cited his most famous work, this chapter showed how travel texts engaged with and adapted to the broad contours of Protestantism at two discreet points in the century and a half following the break from Rome.

Chapter 3 considered ideas about providence that had purchase across Western Christianity more generally. Providential thinking was explored through William Biddulph and Henry Blount's accounts of their respective journeys to the Ottoman Empire, both of which dealt with the history of Islam and the Ottoman Empire. By relating European constructions of Mahomet and Mahometanism to travel texts about travel to Muslim lands, this chapter explored how competing understandings of Mahomet/Muhammad influenced traveller's representations of Turkish religion. Developing upon recent work by Matthew Dimmock and Ziad Elmarsafy, this chapter examined representations of the Prophet and depictions of the 1453 Ottoman capture of the Byzantine capital Constantinople, an event with repercussions across Europe for Christian-Muslim relations.²⁸ The chapter explored inconsistencies within Biddulph and Blount's narratives, showing how different versions of the European Mahomet myth were articulated through reportage of religious doctrine and practice in the Ottoman Empire.

The range of positive and negative depictions of Muhammad and Islam demonstrate the range of confessional outlooks being articulated in travel texts. Biddulph's puritan inclinations informed the cruel, lascivious and militaristic version of Mahomet found in his text. It also required this perennial enemy of Christians to be constrained within a providential framework: Biddulph justified past Ottoman military victories as divine punishment for Orthodox and Catholic immorality. Drawing upon ideas of general and special providence, Biddulph articulated the reassuring view

²⁷ Jonathan Sheehan, 'The Altars of the Idols: Religion, Sacrifice, and the Early Modern Polity', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67.4 (2006), pp. 649-73.

²⁸ Matthew Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet Muhammad in Early Modern English Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013); Ziad Elmarsafy, *The Enlightenment Qur'an: The Politics of Translation and the Construction of Islam* (Oxford: Oneworld, 2009).

that future Christian triumphs were foretold in Scripture, yet warned that God's beneficence was contingent on Christians worshiping properly and Protestantly. Where Biddulph found things in the Ottoman Empire that pleased him, these often reflected upon the moral failings of his own countrymen. In contrast, Blount articulated a more sceptical view of divine providence. His version of Mahomet was sceptical of religious ceremonies and doctrines of all kinds.²⁹ Blount's own scepticism towards religious ritual led him to praise the civil and religious unity of the Ottoman Empire, in particular the Empire's military achievements and assets. Blount's Mahomet was principally a lawgiver, though in a somewhat less positive fashion than the version found in later Enlightenment works.³⁰ Blount's Mahomet allowed him to articulate criticisms of religious ritual more generally. Despite placing considerable emphasis on human reason in the formulation of a proper religious system, he concurred with Biddulph about the impropriety of Mahomet's doctrine. Biddulph and Blount's respective accounts of Mahomet and his religion demonstrate important cleavages in early modern representations of Islam, as well as how these related to wider religious debates concerning providence and the relationship between the Christian deity and His creation. Chapters 2 and 3 considered the lives of travel texts over a century or more. Taken together, they show how travel writers and editors engaged with influential religious debates and ideas either directly, as in the reuse of Hakluyt in Chapter 2, or more subtly, as in the transmission of various versions of Mahomet and competing providential discourses in Chapter 3.

In contrast, the following chapter (Chapter 4) focused on a single text. Joseph Pitts' account of his apostasy, conversion to Islam and subsequent experiences as a Muslim provided a fascinating opportunity to reconstruct the religious world of a relatively humble late seventeenth-century seaman. Pitts' depiction of his conversion was explored in four separate contexts. Firstly, I showed how providential reasoning underpinned texts by English Barbary slaves. Providential logic provided a

²⁹ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 155-76.

³⁰ Elmarsafy, *Enlightenment Qu'ran*, p. 63.

narrative mode for slaves to depict their sufferings and give praise to the Christian God for their eventual release. Secondly, we saw how Pitts demonstrated his knowledge of Christianity and reassured readers of his Christian persona. Thirdly, Pitts reinforced his Christian identity by emphasising the brutal suffering he endured that led him to convert. Finally, Pitts marshalled evidence from his family in England, religious authorities and English merchants who knew him in Algiers to aver that he remained privately a Christian despite performing the Hajj and living for a significant number of years as a free Muslim servant.

Thus, Pitts' deviance is rhetorically negated throughout the very narrative that purported to document it. Pitts' representation of his apostasy parallels the spiritual travails reported in contemporary devotional literature, in particular the tropes of suffering, providence and Pitts' repeated reference to his private Scriptural study. Pitts' apostasy validated his ethnographic observations yet his apostasy was fundamentally performative: he does not concede that he ever converted or worshiped willingly as a Mahometan. Affirming his identity as a Christian man makes it impossible for him to identify as a Muslim. In this multi-layered text, Pitts' conversion is painfully recollected and yet is rendered moot by his insistence on his uninterrupted private identification as a Christian. Pitts' Christian identity is integral to his self-representation, indicating how significant religious affiliation could be for Barbary captives speculating on the material and spiritual benefits of either remaining in North Africa or returning to England.³¹

An altogether different opponent of Christianity was the subject of Chapter 5, which considered English travel texts and translated Swedish ethnographic reportage of Lapp beliefs. This chapter explored the legal context of English prosecutions for malefic witchcraft and showed how travel writers and ethnographers paralleled the descriptive strategies of contemporary demonologists in their descriptions of Lapp rituals and practices. Elements of continental and English demonology were deployed

³¹ Nabil Matar, *Turks, Moors, and Englishmen in the Age of Discovery* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), pp. 139-65.

in descriptions of Lapp magical rituals, diabolical temptation and methods of magical harm. Moreover, travellers and their editors were aware of the complex debates surrounding the proof of supernatural events. Having documented a range of parallels between reports of domestic witchcraft and descriptions of Lapp magical practices, I showed how travel narratives drew upon wider debates about the visual proofs of ostensibly preternatural events. From sword-swallowing priests to magical imps, European travellers' accounts of Lapp rituals raised theologically contentious questions about the supernatural world and advocated a range of credulous and sceptical responses to supernatural occurrences.

In these two chapters, we examined how two very different sins influenced travel works. Despite their different subject matters, both chapters explored how other societies' beliefs and practices were incorporated and rejected in early modern travel texts.³² In the case of Pitts' apostasy, he asserted that although he had been physically separated from the English community, he was still able to assert his identity as a Christian. His conversion facilitated his ethnographic depictions yet also placed his immortal soul in peril. In asserting his Christian identity, he denied the efficacy of his conversion and retained his authority to comment on Muslim doctrine and beliefs. Authority of a different kind informed the descriptions of Lapp magic and witchcraft. These descriptions were indebted to demonological literature across Europe and engaged with competing accounts of the nature and extent of diabolical power. These understandings of diabolical activity abroad also fed into domestic debates, indicating structural parallels between early modern demonological and ethnographic writing. Ethnographers and apostates drew a range of moral lessons from their experiences with other belief systems.

However, there were important differences. The social standing or moral perspectives of observers of Lapp magic were not imperilled by their

³² Jesús López-Peláez Casellas, "'Menne of Straunge Borders': Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis. An Introduction', in *The Construction of the Other in Early Modern Britain: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis*, ed. by Rüdiger Ahrens (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter, 2013), pp. 1-12.

representations. In contrast, Pitts had to exculpate himself from his apparent participation in the beliefs and practices that he was describing. Travel accounts of apostates and witches abroad demonstrate more than just the application of domestic beliefs to foreign societies or the importance of taking the religious elements of contemporary travel writing seriously. Taken together, these chapters also demonstrate the wide-reaching relevance of travel literature to other areas of early modern historiography.

Debates around concealing or articulating controversial opinions were central to Chapter 6, the first of two chapters to look at travel texts by religious dissidents. This chapter explored ethnography and travel writing by William Jones, the notorious Orientalist, polyglot and lawyer, and Michael Symes, an East India Company emissary to Burma. It explored Orientalist travel writing in the context of the debate about how British rulers should administer India's vast, religiously heterodox population. Religious factors influenced Company policies of non-interference in Indian religious traditions. Company hostility to Christian evangelism was contextualised in light of contemporary Orientalist and antiquarian studies of Indian religious and legal traditions, including Hindu, Buddhist and Andaman traditions.

This chapter also investigated the overlap between the controversies associated with English deism and Orientalist projects. Engagement with polytheistic Hindu and Buddhist traditions contributed to a widespread scepticism towards mainstream Protestant ideas of Judeo-Christian exceptionalism. Heterodox theologies tinged by deist ideas recurred throughout Jones' writings and Symes' narrative of his embassy. These ideas were shared by many prominent Orientalists attached to Governor General Warren Hastings' administration. They also tacitly informed Company resistance to missionary activity in India. Deist criticisms of revealed religion combined with ecumenical perspectives on Indian religious traditions and paralleled Jones' linguistic achievements by establishing historical evidence that Indian traditions were as long-

standing and valid as Judeo-Christian ones.³³ Jones and Symes both articulated controversial dissident perspectives that cast doubt upon the very foundations of English Protestantism and its self-representation within a divinely-favoured Judeo-Christian tradition.

The divinely favoured status of Christian beliefs and traditions was not in doubt for the missionaries whose published *Transactions* formed the principal source of Chapter 7. The Congregationalist London Missionary Society established its first mission in Tahiti in 1797 with the aim of spreading the gospel to the heathen population of this remote Pacific island. Endemic conflict on the islands, and their misunderstandings of indigenous political and religious authorities, led the missionaries to form an alliance with the prominent Pomare clan. In so doing, they violated the Society's Congregationalist principles, which insisted that missionaries not meddle in political affairs. In this regard, the practical experience of missionary work led the first generation of missionaries to sidestep or disregard some of the founding principles of their employers and order. The missionaries' entanglement with local politics provoked armed resentment so serious that the missionaries were forced to flee from Tahiti along with their allies in the Pomare family. By mistakenly assuming that European models of feudal kingship applied on the island, the missionaries fundamentally misunderstood the relationship between political and religious authority and the precarious balance of allegiances that maintained the Pomare clan's rule. The richness of the missionary *Transactions* also give us some indication of how the newcomers' strange new faith was understood by the indigenous population. The spread of European diseases led many islanders to criticise the missionaries' preaching, and to a sinister interpretation of Christian doctrines concerning spiritual and bodily resurrection. In recording these objections, the missionaries were able to influence the wide community of English non-conformist readers' understandings of other religions.

³³ Michael J. Franklin, *Orientalist Jones: Sir William Jones, Poet, Lawyer, and Linguist, 1746-1794* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), pp. 38-42.

This final pair of chapters considered strikingly different examples of dissident travellers. The subversive religious ideas articulated in Orientalist texts contrast sharply with the evangelical Protestantism of the Congregationalist missionaries. Yet there are important parallels here. Both the Orientalists and the missionaries applied European categories to indigenous religious, political, historical and cultural forms. Both groups were liable for the wholesale reorganisation of the other societies in which they lived. Moreover, in both India and the Pacific, colonial institutions left a long and justifiably bitter legacy. Confessional politics – be it rationalist or Congregationalist – profoundly influenced early articulations of colonial authority. These miscommunications, and the successes and failures of intercultural encounters, reinforce the dialogical nature of travel texts in their reportage of other societies' beliefs and practices, a theme that has recurred throughout this thesis.

In different ways, these six chapters have all examined the religious dimension of travel texts as representations of intercultural encounters. By considering the domestic religious context into which representations of other societies' beliefs circulated, we can contextualise why different foreign religious beliefs were incorporated or rejected, assimilated or othered.³⁴ Through the various representations of Orthodox Christians, Muslims, Lapps, Hindus, Buddhists, Andaman Islanders and Tahitians discussed already, we have developed a greater understanding of how different travellers' perspectives influenced the reporting of foreign religious cultures. Foreign practices could be denigrated as deviant or used to endorse or subvert dissident positions. A range of other accommodations was possible: individual travellers could mitigate or exacerbate the perceived otherness of other societies' ritual life. I have shed light on the background of particular travellers, as well as how their position within and perspective on issues within wider English/British religious culture affected their depictions of these others. Taken together, these case studies demonstrate the variety of religious responses occasioned by intercultural encounters. The diverse range of responses

³⁴ López-Peláez Casellas, 'Menne of Strange Borders', pp. 1-12.

encountered in the preceding chapters demonstrate the range of descriptive strategies which English travellers resorted to in making sense of unfamiliar beliefs and customs. These representations were often partial and contradictory: as much the result of spontaneous encounters and contingent factors than the deployment of clearly structured oppositional or ecumenical ideologies.³⁵ I now bring together elements from the preceding chapters in order to highlight two themes that have emerged from this research. Firstly, we consider change over time and incorporate all the subsequent case studies into the general outline of the development of English Protestantism outlined in Chapter 2. This is followed by a summary of the contribution that this research makes to the transnational turn of recent scholarship. Each of these sections also highlights potential future directions for research that build upon the findings of this thesis.

Evolution of the Believing Traveller

This thesis has explored how the complexities of English Protestantism played out in Anglophone travel writing. Consequently, it is as much tied up in religious debates as it is in the genre of travel writing. Within the 'broad-based' Protestant culture identified by Alec Ryrie, there were significant points of discord and disagreement.³⁶ Over the *longue durée* of this thesis, different issues emerged as a result of particular religious, political and social pressures at home. In documenting how different issues were reflected or mediated through texts about other religious cultures, this thesis has widened our understanding of how contemporary religious debates and travel writers' own religious experiences influenced their writings. It is important to note, however, that I am not advocating the simplistic and teleological view that English Protestantism went from doubt to conquest having ascertained sufficient self-confidence in its doctrinal and moral rectitude. Rather, I have shown how individual and collective spiritual issues and crises played out in the construction of

³⁵ Ghobrial, *Whispers of Cities*, p. 87.

³⁶ Ryrie, *Being Protestant*, p. 6.

particular texts, reflecting the specific concerns and experiences of individual travellers.

In this regard, Chapter 2 provided a framework for the subsequent chapters. By studying two moments in the reception of Hakluyt's *Principal Navigations*, this chapter explored the construction and reuse of Hakluyt's narratives in light of the particular religious issues surrounding the Elizabethan Reformation and the Restoration. It showed that concern with doctrinal orthodoxy was reinforced through Hakluyt's editorial strategies, highlighting nascent ideas of Protestant English exceptionalism in critiques of the perceived popish excess of Orthodox Christian ceremonies. It also documented the ways in which later writers used extracts from the *Principal Navigations* in the context of late seventeenth-century antiquarian studies interested in the history of idolatry. Religious scholars used travel writing and ethnography alongside Classical and Scriptural sources in order to document the historical and contemporary spread of idolatrous beliefs. Travel texts were subjected to similar reading strategies. By highlighting how Hakluyt's text engaged with Elizabethan and later seventeenth-century religious discourses, connections with domestic religious debates were established.

Subsequent chapters mapped travel texts onto particular issues or events within domestic religious history. Chapter 3 considered how puritans and sceptics wrote about recent Christian-Muslim relations. Blount's handling of Islam was seen as an early manifestation of some of the themes touched upon by later scholars of comparative religion. In Chapter 4, Pitts' apostasy was contextualised in light of contemporary corrective literature addressing the moral consequences of apostasy and unbelief. Chapter 5 mapped debates about supernatural causation onto accounts of Lapp magic. Chapter 6 explored how deist ideas connected with eighteenth-century Orientalist works, underlining the radical religious potential implicit in Orientalist projects. Finally, Chapter 7 highlighted the difficulties which Congregationalists faced as they rode the wave of missionary enthusiasm. All these chapters were concerned with how particular travellers articulated their confessional identities.

The consequences of travellers holding unorthodox beliefs were also examined in these chapters. Pitts, Jones, Symes and the English deist authors all held, or were reputed to hold, controversial or potentially seditious religious opinions. In Pitts' case, he deployed various strategies to demonstrate that he was an orthodox Protestant. In contrast, Jones and Symes' writings presented a complex and multi-layered accounts of their beliefs. Like the deists examined by Wayne Hudson, all three men inhabited multiple social personae. Radical elements of their confessional outlooks were occluded to different degrees.³⁷ Pitts' affirmation of his Protestant identity demonstrates that, beyond the coterie of radical free-thinkers, conversion to Islam was an anathema to mainstream English religious norms in the early eighteenth century. These different strategies highlight the different social status and religious climate these different groups inhabited. Pitts' lower social status, and his extended stay in Algeria and confessed conversion required a very different performance of religious identity to those of Enlightenment Orientalists a half century or so later. Along with Blount's *Journey* (1636), all these travel texts were informed by the emergence of the discipline of comparative religion, as well as by wider debates around the nature and extent of religious toleration. The diverse confessional outlooks presented by the various travellers considered in this thesis then reflect a variety of positions over the long period from the Reformation to the Enlightenment.

We have already noted that the East India Company's tolerant view of Indian religious diversity increasingly came under fire due to growing religious fervour at home. Thus, the emergence of popular religious movements informed the rear-guard actions of Orientalist travel works. It also directly contributed to the founding and evangelical activities of the London Missionary Society, discussed in Chapter 7. Though Congregationalism had a long history – and long associations with overseas trading endeavours³⁸ – its missionary activity emerged as a direct result of the general trend toward revivalism in later eighteenth-century

³⁷ Wayne Hudson, *The English Deists: Studies in Early Enlightenment* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2009), pp. 3, 5-13, 18-20, 22-4.

³⁸ Games, *Web of Empire*, pp. 226-9.

Britain.³⁹ Later eighteenth-century debates between evangelicals and sceptics, and the evangelical ascendancy in the sphere of popular print, represent another occasion when the evolution of English Protestantism informed the travel works considered in this thesis.

Finally, the study of witchcraft and supernatural beliefs presented in Chapter 5 engages with a different strand of the history of popular beliefs in England. The long afterlife of popular belief in magic was attested to in subsequent citations of Johan Scheffer's *History of Lapland* (1674). Additionally, the debates around visual proof and supernatural events connected with later sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Protestant theological desires to reframe or demote various spectres of Catholicism, including ghosts and Purgatory.⁴⁰ The apparent decline of beliefs in supernatural causation amongst the elite marked another important moment in the transformation of English religious beliefs. Taken as a whole, this thesis has explored the transformation of English travellers' religious beliefs and the wider significance of their religious writings and observations in light of domestic religious culture.

Kim Phillips observed that the religious debates raised by medieval travel writing are copious enough to require a volume of their own.⁴¹ This is equally true for travel works produced following the proliferation of print in the early modern period. This thesis has examined how certain key religious issues informed depictions of other religions, and what this can tell us about their authors' confessional outlooks. This thesis has analysed the religious contents of a number of early modern travel works and provides the grounding for a range of subsequent studies. For instance, a study of representations of foreign idolatry – a central idea in post-Reformation English Protestant identity – would be a valuable start. This thesis has dealt with various Others (Catholics, Russian Christians, Hindus, Lapps and Tahitians) who were considered idolatrous. Investigating the

³⁹ Anna Johnston, 'British Missionary Publishing, Missionary Celebrity, and Empire', *Nineteenth-Century Prose*, 32.2 (2005), pp. 20-47 (pp. 21-2).

⁴⁰ Stuart Clark, *Vanities of the Eye: Vision in Early Modern European Culture* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007), pp. 150-1.

⁴¹ Phillips, *Before Orientalism*, p. 11.

different meanings attached to this term would also complement Matthew Dimmock's recent exploration of connections between Islam and idolatry.⁴² Across the period 1550 to 1800, figures from Edward Brerewood to Bernard Picart and Jean-Frédéric Bernard identified idolatry as a fourth world religion yet this identification was clearly unstable. A future study could focus on the multiple forms that idolatry took, from biblical and contemporary sources. It could also examine how biblical definitions informed travel texts and were reshaped by them.⁴³

In a similar vein, a future study could look at travel reports of foreign magic or witchcraft in a cross-European perspective. Lapp rituals were not the only foreign religious practices criticised for their diabolical overtones. Hindu rituals, New World belief systems and African faiths all merited censure for their supernatural overtones.⁴⁴ Such a study would examine depictions of ritual magic, possession and witchcraft abroad in light of domestic beliefs and practices. Additionally, it could investigate how the transnational European phenomenon of witchcraft prosecution translated into various precolonial and colonial contexts. More broadly, such a study could investigate the extent to which differences in the legal

⁴² Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, pp. 101-48.

⁴³ On idolatry, see Jonathan Sheehan, 'Sacred and Profane: Idolatry, Antiquarianism and the Polemics of Distinction in the Seventeenth Century', *Past and Present*, 192 (2006), pp. 35-67; Joan Pau Rubiés, 'Theology, Ethnography and the Historicization of Idolatry', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67.4 (2006), pp. 571-96; Carina L. Johnson, 'Idolatrous Cultures and the Practice of Religion', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67.4 (2006), pp. 597-621; Martin Mulsow, 'Idolatry and Science: Against Nature Worship from Boyle to Rudiger, 1680-1720', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67.4 (2006), pp. 697-711.

⁴⁴ See, for example, Peter Martyr d'Anghera, 'The Decades of the Newe World or West India', in *The First Three English Books on America* ed. by Edward Arber, trans. by Richard Eden, (Westminster: A. Constable, 1885), pp. 50, 66, 69, 107, 110, 120, 130, 157, 187; George Forster, *A Journey From Bengal to England Through the Northern Part of India...* 2 vols. (London & Delhi, 1798), I, pp. 26-7; William Hodges, *Travels in India during the Years 1780, 1781, 1782, & 1783* (London, 1793), pp. 35-6; John Huygen van Linschoten, *His Discours of Voyages unto the East and West Indies*, trans. by John Wolfe (London, 1598), pp. 64-5; William Moorcroft and George Trebeck, *Travels in the Himalayan Provinces of Hindustan and the Panjab...* ed. by Horace Hayman Wilson, 2nd edn (Patiala: Punjab Languages Dept, 1837), pp. 75-6; Jean-Baptiste Tavernier, *The Six Voyages of John Baptista Tavernier, A Noble Man of France Now Living, Through Turkey Into Persia, and the East-Indies...* trans. by J. Phillips (London, 1678), p. 93. On New World witchcraft, see Charles Zika, *Exorcising Our Demons: Magic, Witchcraft, and Visual Culture in Early Modern Europe* (Leiden: Brill Academic Publishers, 2003), pp. 411-80; Fernando Cervantes, 'The Devil's Encounter with America', in *Witchcraft in Early Modern Europe: Studies in Culture and Belief* ed. by Jonathan Barry, Marianne Hester, and Gareth Roberts (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1996), pp. 119-44.

status of witchcraft across Europe influenced travellers' perceptions of diabolical rituals abroad.

Recent historiography has moved away from monolithic binary distinctions between the Christian West and Muslim East. This is telling in Pitts' text (Chapter 4): whilst there is a repeated distinction between what 'they' do, 'they' were also humanised, particularly in his depictions of his various masters. A microhistorical approach to Pitts' text, including any relevant contemporary Arabic documents, would provide a useful corollary to this present study since it would indicate how *renegados* like Pitts were represented by their Muslim neighbours and contemporaries.⁴⁵ Such a polyglot study could also potentially tell us much about the typicality of Pitts' experiences, and further contextualise his self-presentation as a secret Christian and public Muslim.

Between 1550 and 1800, individual and collective religious beliefs in Britain altered radically. This thesis explored how travel writers engaged with the changing domestic religious fabric of their lives. It has provided a number of snapshots into the confessional world of early modern individuals who travelled. Experiences of other rituals and beliefs could be praised or denigrated, and travellers engaged with a variety of strategies in order to render foreign belief systems intelligible to their readers and to comprehend their differences in contingently meaningful ways.⁴⁶

Transnational Perspectives: Past and Present

⁴⁵ On returning slaves' reports in Venice, see E. Natalie Rothman, *Brokering Empire: Trans-Imperial Subjects between Venice and Istanbul* (New York: Cornell University Press, 2012), pp. 90-121; Tijana Krstić, *Contested Conversion to Islam: Narratives of Religious Change in the Early Modern Ottoman Empire* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2011), pp. 1-2; Tijana Krstić, 'Conversion and Converts to Islam in Ottoman Historiography of the Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries', in *Writing History at the Ottoman Court: Editing the Past, Fashioning the Future*, ed. by H. Erdem Çipa and Emine Fetvacı (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2013), pp. 58-79. For an English example of a return slave who ascribed his later career as a linguist to his experience of captivity, see Francis Cheneau, *Francis Cheneau's French Grammar, Enrich'd with a Compendious and Short Way to Learn the French Tongue in a Very Short Time* (London, 1685). I am grateful to John Gallagher's blog for directing me to this source: <http://earlymodernjohn.wordpress.com/2013/06/13/tall-tales-and-teaching-tongues/> [accessed: 24 November 2015].

⁴⁶ López-Peláez Casellas, 'Menne of Straunge Borders', pp. 1-12.

By exploring a variety of perspectives on travel and examining intercultural interactions that crossed political and religious borders, this thesis has contributed to the 'transnational turn' in recent historiography. My research has drawn upon two principal aspects of recent transnational scholarship. Firstly, I have employed microhistorical techniques, dealing intensively with the travel itineraries, biographies, private and public confessional outlooks and publications of a small number of individuals.⁴⁷ Secondly, I have been influenced by the scholarship of John-Paul Ghobrial, Natalie Rothman, Molly Greene, Tijana Krstić and others who have reconstructed the particular networks, interactions and exchanges that characterised diplomatic, political or religious exchanges across porous cultural frontiers. Their focus has been squarely on the eastern Mediterranean and the regularly traversed frontier between Christian Europe and the Muslim Ottoman Empire.⁴⁸ Their work also complements a range of recent work examining cross-cultural exchanges in the eighteenth century, most notably in recent work by Urs App, Thomas Trautmann, Peter Heehs, Michael J. Franklin and Rahul Sapra. In all these discussions of Anglo-Indian religious and linguistic exchanges, complex identities emerge from interactions between individuals with different cultural and religious backgrounds.⁴⁹

In the preceding chapters, we have come across travellers' representations that displayed an awareness, both intentionally and unintentionally, of the complex intercultural interactions that contributed

⁴⁷ Sanjay Subrahmanyam, *Three Ways to Be Alien: Travails and Encounters in the Early Modern World* (Waltham: Brandeis University Press, 2011), pp. 15, 21-2.

⁴⁸ Ghobrial, *Whispers of Cities*, pp. 12, 14-15; Rothman, *Brokering Empire*, pp. 1-26; Krstić, 'Conversion and Converts to Islam', pp. 58-79. On local acculturation and conflict, see Molly Greene, *A Shared World: Christians and Muslims in the Early Modern Mediterranean* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000).

⁴⁹ Thomas R. Trautmann, 'Does India Have History? Does History Have India?', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 54.1 (2012), pp. 174-205; Peter Heehs, 'Shades of Orientalism: Paradoxes and Problems in Indian Historiography', *History and Theory*, 42.2 (2003), pp. 169-95; Michael J. Franklin, 'Cultural Possession, Imperial Control, and Comparative Religion: The Calcutta Perspectives of Sir William Jones and Nathaniel Brassey Halhed', *The Yearbook of English Studies*, 32 (2002), pp. 1-18; Sapra, 'Orientalism of Capitalism', pp. 8-19; Paul Stevens and Rahul Sapra, 'Akbar's Dream: Mughal Toleration and English/British Orientalism', *Modern Philology*, 104.3 (2007), pp. 379-411; Urs App, *The Birth of Orientalism* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010); Urs App, 'William Jones's Ancient Theology', *Sino-Platonic Papers*, 191 (2009), pp. 1-125.

to the construction of their texts. This is apparent in Biddulph and Blount's desire to describe their eyewitness experiences (Chapter 3), a key element in the formulation of the Renaissance genre of travel writing.⁵⁰ Similarly, Hakluyt's editorial interventions (Chapter 2) crossed and re-crossed political and religious boundaries by circumscribing uncomfortable political truths and emphasising unreformed religious practices. Similarly, the witchcraft cases discussed in Chapter 5 show how accounts of witchcraft and magic – like travel narratives – crossed European borders and could influence prosecutions and ethnographies in other societies. Contemporary ethnography shared the horrified fascination that characterised demonological reports of domestic folk beliefs and witchcraft prosecutions.

Biddulph's description of Syrian Christian ignorance and praise of their psalm-singing provides a neat microcosm of the paradoxical nature of early modern travel writing. Biddulph's attitudes exemplified the 'complex interplay of contradictory attitudes' to others of various kinds found in this literature.⁵¹ Complex intercultural encounters are also apparent in the various mediations and translations that inform Pitts' account of his apostasy (Chapter 4) and Jones' Orientalist translations (Chapter 6). Elements of Pitts' experience as a free Muslim servant and Jones' initial reliance on Hindu pandits and translators are elided from their texts which, in different ways, sought to identify their authors with the archetype of the well-informed and curious European traveller.⁵² When the Congregationalist missionaries tried to codify Tahitian language and beliefs (Chapter 7), their reliance on European frames of reference further inflamed political hostilities on the island. Despite their religious vocation, these missionaries were as entangled with Tahitian life as Pitts was with

⁵⁰ Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', pp. 170-4.

⁵¹ López-Peláez Casellas, 'Menne of Straunge Borders', p. 6.

⁵² On curiosity in early modern travel writing, see Nigel Leask, *Curiosity and the Aesthetics of Travel-Writing, 1770-1840: 'From an Antique Land'* (Oxford: Clarendon, 2002). For alternative perspectives on cultural and social hierarchies, see Antoinette Burton, 'Amitav Ghosh's World Histories from Below', *History of the Present*, 2.1 (2012), pp. 71-77. Burton explores the benefits for historians in engaging with historical fiction that has a solid grounding in archival research, indicating new directions for understanding the subjective experiences of individuals who crossed cultural boundaries in the past.

the Muslim community that forcibly incorporated him. Even where our travellers give the illusion of ethnographic distance, as in Pitts' description of the Hajj, these sources raised questions about the intentions and motivations that led their authors to have, and write about, these experiences.

Taken together, the sources that this thesis has examined all replicate an image of the travelling subject in different contexts and for different audiences.⁵³ In examining travel reports about various different societies over two hundred and fifty years, it is unsurprising that our travellers' confessional perspectives vary substantially. By considering the mediation of individual confessional identity in light of wider domestic religious debates, we have explored what the foreign could mean to contemporaries in superficially very different contexts. We have seen how different denominational groups dealt with instances of foreign deviance, as well as how dissident perspectives were reflected in descriptions of other societies' religious beliefs.

Religious ideas could both break down and reinforce cultural boundaries. For different reasons, Pitts and Biddulph condemn Turkish religious practices. In contrast, Blount and later freethinkers developed an alternative conception of Mahometan religion. This European idea may have been more respectful of Muslim traditions but was as much a product of European religious debates and discourses.⁵⁴ Travel texts reinforced, but could also reshape, existing ideas about other peoples and societies. Their power came from demonstrating the authority of their authors to comment on a wide range of features of other societies. However, this process was always unstable and incomplete, as attested to in the various expressions and negotiations of confessional identities discussed throughout this thesis. Likewise, these narratives could be repurposed by subsequent generations, as demonstrated by sceptical reuses of Scheffer's ethnography (Chapter 5) and religious uses of Hakluyt's Arctic materials (Chapter 2).

⁵³ Rubiés, 'Teaching the Eye to See', pp. 172-7.

⁵⁴ Dimmock, *Mythologies of the Prophet*, pp. 1-2, 8-19.

Because of the growth of transnational histories, historians have become rightly sceptical of grand narratives, especially when they relate to intercultural encounters. The partial and contingent nature of identity has been stressed through the at times haphazard and partial manner in which individuals constructed and reconstructed their social, political and religious identities in their published texts.⁵⁵ Pitts' evasion of his Mahometan identity is a good example of this, but so, too, are Blount's various uses of the Mahomet myth, Jones' various expressions of heterodox theologies and Davies' attempt to justify the conduct of the first generation of Tahitian missionaries. Early modern attitudes to religious others were characterised by a 'complex interplay of contradictory attitudes' and accompanied by 'a certain discursive inconsistency and lack of coherence and unity'.⁵⁶

Perhaps one way to further our understanding of these complex European attitudes would be to consider the various cultural spaces and geographies of the other societies that European travellers are representing. Gagan D. S. Sood's 'new analytical orientation' focuses attention on comparison across 'Islamicate Eurasia', emphasising continuities and differences within Muslim social, economic and religious activities across this vast region.⁵⁷ A logical development of this project

⁵⁵ Rothman, *Brokering Empire*, pp. 122-3; Krstić, *Contested Conversion*, pp. 1-25; Nancy Bisaha, *Creating East and West: Renaissance Humanists and the Ottoman Turks* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004), pp. 1-12.

⁵⁶ López-Peláez Casellas, 'Menne of Straunge Borders', pp. 6-7.

⁵⁷ Gagan D. S. Sood, 'Circulation and Exchange in Islamicate Eurasia: A Regional Approach to the Early Modern World', *Past and Present*, 212 (2011), pp. 113-62 (pp. 113-14). See also Rohan D'souza, 'Crisis before the Fall: Some Speculations on the Decline of the Ottomans, Safavids and Mughals', *Social Scientist*, 30.9/10 (2002), pp. 3-30; Rudi Matthee, 'Was Safavid Iran an Empire?', *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient*, 53 (2010), pp. 233-65; Eric Tagliacozzo, 'Strange Parallels and the Big Picture: "Asia" Writ Large Over a Turbulent Millennium', *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 70.4 (2011), pp. 939-63. On Persia and its representation in English travel, see Chloe Houston, '"Thou Glorious Kingdome, Thou Chiefe of Empires": Persia in Early Seventeenth-Century Travel Literature', *Studies in Travel Writing*, 13.2 (2009), pp. 141-52. See also Jos J. L. Gommans, *The Rise of the Indo-Afghan Empire, c.1710-1780* (Leiden: Brill, 1995); John M. Flannery, *The Mission of the Portuguese Augustinians to Persia and Beyond (1602-1747)* (Leiden: Brill, 2013); John Foran, 'The Long Fall of the Safavid Dynasty: Moving beyond the Standard Views', *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, 24.2 (1992), pp. 281-304. On contemporary Persian and Mughal travellers in this Islamicate cultural space, see Muzaffar Alam and Sanjay Subrahmanyam, *Indo-Persian Travels in the Age of Discoveries, 1400-1800* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007). A reappraisal of East India Company records that record histories of Anglo-Persian exchanges

would be to engage with Sood's ideas and examine how early modern English archetypes of Mahomet were developed or modified in light of different English relationships with and representations of Ottoman, Persian, Mughal and South-East Asian Muslim societies. By relating travellers' experiences with non-European cultural spaces, we can gain a fuller understanding of the lived realities of early modern European travellers from the perspective of the societies and individuals that they interacted with.

Future research could also expand the range of materials considered. This thesis has principally considered printed sources, yet this would not be possible without recourse to the impressive secondary literature which has contextualised published works in light of private correspondence and other manuscript sources. Additionally, artistic and cartographic depictions of other cultures have largely fallen outside the remit of the present study.⁵⁸ A biographical study, providing a more detailed examination of the public and private archives of some of the key figures discussed here, would doubtless shed further light on their confessional allegiances. For example, it would be interesting to uncover how Forrest's (Chapter 8) and Symes' (Chapter 6) respective publications fit into their wider biographies and careers as traders and diplomats, as well as investigating any overlap in their social circles with more renowned Orientalists such as Jones. For Symes, it would also be fascinating to know whether any surviving correspondence in East India Company archives documents his confessional outlook in more detail, or how his ecumenical confessional outlook informed his diplomatic

may also be valuable. See, for example, F. C. Danvers, *Report on the India Office Records Relating to Persia and the Persian Gulf* (London: Eyre and Spottiswoode, 1889), pp. 15-17; Penelope Tuson, *The Records of the British Residency and Agencies in the Persian Gulf* (London: India Office Library and Records, 1979). For an early example of how English travellers understood doctrinal differences between Sunni and Shi'a Muslims, see Geoffrey Duckett, 'Further Observations Concerning the State of Persia, Taken in the Foresayd Fift[h] Voyage into Those Partes...' in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), III, pp. 158-66 (pp. 159-60).

⁵⁸ Luigi Monga, 'Translating the Journey: A Literary Perspective on Truth in Cartography', in *Cross-Cultural Travel: Papers from the Royal Irish Academy International Symposium on Literature and Travel, National University of Ireland, November 2002*, ed. by Jane Conroy (Peter Lang, 2003), pp. 11-30.

practice.⁵⁹ Such an approach would parallel Gerald MacLean's analysis of the important continuities and differences between Blount's public personae and his private correspondence and unpublished works (Chapter 3).⁶⁰

Balancing microhistorical interest in individual biographies with an awareness of their wider engagements with pertinent religious, political, social, cultural and economic issues has been at the heart of the distinction between deviants and dissidents presented in this thesis. This useful heuristic device has facilitated a nuanced exploration of the wider confessional outlooks of individuals who travelled. As transnational historians, our methods and approaches must continue to tease out the complex and multi-layered nature of early modern individuals' political, religious, social and cultural affiliations. This is especially important when considering the production and reception of travel narratives. Through their representations of religious issues, travellers could reinforce or question domestic norms and values. Whichever course they took – and whatever their justifications for doing so – in writing about others' beliefs and practices, they mapped divisive spiritual issues onto encounters with other societies.

Concluding Remarks

Through this wide-ranging study of travel texts, we have explored the religious affiliations of various travellers and the ways in which they influenced representations of other cultures' beliefs and practices. We have examined how difference was constructed and how diverse confessional perspectives – from orthodox Protestant to Muslim convert, missionary to sceptic – were articulated. By considering a range of case studies across the

⁵⁹ This work would complement Ramachandra's discussion of Symes' contemporary, Hiram Cox. For details, see G. P. Ramachandra, 'Captain Hiram Cox's Mission to Burma, 1796-1798: A Case of Irrational Behaviour in Diplomacy', *Journal of Southeast Asian Studies*, 12 (1981), pp. 433-51.

⁶⁰ MacLean, *Rise of Oriental Travel*, pp. 121-2. More generally, understanding what was and was not included in publications about other religions could form the basis of a future research project that would complement on-going work by the Hakluyt Principal Navigations Editorial Project. For details, see Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt, 'The Richard Hakluyt "Principal Navigations" Editorial Project', *University of Southampton*, 2012, <http://www.southampton.ac.uk/english/research/projects/hakluyt_editorial_project.page> [accessed 19 October 2015].

period 1550 – 1800, this thesis has also shown how travel writers engaged with and contributed to the development of different manifestations of English Protestantism. Early modern travel narratives engaged with a range of domestic religious controversies, including those surrounding providence, apostasy, witchcraft, deism and evangelism discussed in the present work.

Travellers' engagement with these issues emerged from particular cross-cultural encounters yet they also had a wider relevance to the individuals who produced them and the readers who consumed them. In this respect, accounts of overseas travel were obviously informed by the domestic sociocultural milieu from which their authors emerged. Travel writing provides a mirror not only of the travelling subject but also of issues pertinent to the society from which they came. Descriptions of foreign religious practices engaged with domestic religious issues and could clarify pertinent confessional issues. Whether dealing with the operation of providence, the commission of apostasy, the casting of magical spells, the relationship between Christian and Hindu traditions or the spreading of the Christian faith itself, travel writing engaged with theological issues. By understanding these different engagements, we can get closer to rebuilding the religious outlooks of travellers and understanding how, as a genre, travel writing adapted and evolved in a period of unprecedented religious change. These travel texts reflect different aspects of the fractured world of early modern English Protestantism, demonstrating that religious issues were integral to contemporary understandings of cross-cultural encounters.

Bibliography

Printed Primary Sources (before 1800)

Anon, *A Letter of Advice To Young Gentleman of an Honourable Family, Now in His Travels beyond the Seas: For His More Safe and Profitable Conduct in the Three Great Instances, of Study, Moral Deportment, and Religion* (London, 1688)

— — —, *A True and Impartial Relation of the Informations Against Three Witches, Viz., Temperance Lloyd, Mary Trembles, and Susanna Edwards, Who Were Indicted, Arraigned and Convicted at the Assizes Holden for the County of Devon, at the Castle of Exon, Aug. 14, 1682 with Their Several Confessions, Taken before Thomas Gist, Mayor, and John Davie, Alderman, of Biddiford, in the Said County, Where They Were Inhabitants : As Also, Their Speeches, Confessions and Behaviour at the Time and Place of Execution on the Twenty Fifth of the Said Month. , London : Printed by Freeman Collins and Are to Be Sold by T. Benskin and C. Yeo* (London, 1682)

Barker, Thomas, *The Nature and Circumstances of the Demoniacs in the Gospels, Stated and Methodized* (London, 1783)

Biddulph, William, *The Travels of Certaine Englishmen into Africa, Asia, Troy, Bythinia, Thracia and to the Black Sea and into Syria, Cilicia, Pisidia, Mesopotamia, Damascus, Canaan, Galile, Samaria, Iudea, Palestina, Ierusalem, Iericho, and to the Red Sea: And to Sundry Other Places. Begunne in the Yeare of Iubile 1600. and by Some of Them Finished in This Yeere 1608. The Others Not yet Returned. Very Profitable to the Help of Trauellers, and No Lesse Delightfull to All Persons Who Take Pleasure to Heare of the Manners, Gouernement, Religion, and Customes of Forraine and Heathen Countries. Printed by Th. Haueland. for W. Aspley, and Are to Bee Sold at His Shop in Paules Church-Yard, at the Signe of the Parrot, 1609* (London, 1609)

Blount, Charles, *Great Is Diana of the Ephesians: Or The Original of Idolatry, Together With the Politick Institutions of the Gentiles' Sacrifices* (London, 1680)

Blount, Henry, *A Voyage into the Levant: A Breife Relation of a Journey, Lately Performed by Master H. B. Gentleman, from England by the Way of Venice, into Dal[matia,] Sclavonia, Bosnah, Hungary, Macedonia, Thessaly, Thrace, Rhodes and Egypt, unto Gran Cairo, 2nd edn* (London, 1636)

Bower, Edward, *Doctor Lamb Revived, or Witchcraft Condemn'd in Anne Bodenham, a Servant of His, Who Was Arraigned and Executed the Lent Assizes Last at Salisbury* (London, 1653)

Brerewood, Edward, *Enquiries Touching the Diversity of Languages, and Religions Through the Cheife Parts of the World. Written by Edw. Brerewood, Lately Professor of Astronomy in Gresham Colledge in London* (London, 1622)

Calmet, Augustin, *Dissertations upon the Apparitions of Angels, Daemons, and Ghosts, and Concerning the Vampires of Hungary, Bohemia, Moravia, and Silesia* (London, 1759)

Cheneau, Francis, *Francis Cheneau's French Grammar, Enrich'd with a Compendious and Short Way to Learn the French Tongue in a Very Short Time* (London, 1685)

Dalton, Michael, *The Countrey Justice Containing the Practice of the Justices of the Peace out of Their Sessions, Gathered for the Better Help of Such Justices of Peace as Have Not Been Much Conversant in the Study of the Laws of the Realm. To Which Is Now Added: The Duty and Power of Justices of Peace in Their Sessions an Abridgement (under Proper Titles) of All Statutes Relating Thereunto, to the End of the Last Session of Parliament, Ending April 27, 1696; a Large Table of the Principal Matters Herein Contained ; with Two Other Tables, One, of the Chapters in This Book, and the Other, of Such Acts of Parliament as Concern the Office of a Justice of Peace* (London, 1619)

Dent, Arthur, *The Plaine Mans Path-Way to Heaven, Wherin Euery Man May Cleerly See Whether He Shall Be Saued or Damned. Set Foorth Dialogue-Wise, for the Better Vnderstanding of the Simple* (London, 1601)

Fletcher, Giles, *Of the Russe Common Wealth Or Manner of Government by the Russe Emperour (commonly Called the Emperour of Moskovia) with the Manners and Fashions of the People of That Countrey* (London, 1591)

Forde, William, *A Sermon Preached at Constantinople in the Vines of Perah, at the Funerall of the Vertuous and Admired Lady Anne Glouer, Sometime Wife to the Honourable Knight Sir Thomas Glouer, and Then Ambassadour Ordinary for His Maiesty of Great Britaine, in the Port of the Great Turke. By William Forde Bachelour in Diuinitie, and Lately Preacher to the Right Honourable Ambassadour, and the Rest of the English Nation Resident There* (London, 1616)

Forrest, Thomas, *A Voyage to New Guinea, and the Moluccas, from Balambangan: Including an Account of Magindano, Sooloo, and Other Islands; and Illustrated with Thirty Copperplates. Performed in the Tartar Galley, Belonging to the Honourable East India Company, During the Years 1774, 1775, and 1776, By Captain Thomas Forrest. To Which Is Added, a Vocabulary of the Magindano Tongue* (London, 1779)

Forster, George, *A Journey From Bengal to England Through the Northern Part of India, Kashmire, Afghanistan, And Persia And Into Russia By the Caspian-Sea*, 2 vols. (London, Delhi: Languages Dept, Punjab, 1798)

Francklin, William, *Observations Made on a Tour from Bengal to Persia In the Years 1786-7, with a Short Account of the Remains of the Celebrated Palace of Persepolis: And Other Interesting Events* (Calcutta, 1788)

Green, John, ed., *A New General Collection of Voyages and Travels Consisting of the Most Esteemed Relations, Which Have Been Hitherto Published in Any Language: Comprehending Every Thing Remarkable in Its King, in Europe, Asia, Africa and America, With Respects to the Several Empires, Kingdoms, and Provinces; Their Situation, Extent, Bounds and Division, Climate, Soil and Produce; Their Lakes, Rivers, Mountains, Cities, Principal Towns, Harbours, Buildings, &c. and the Gradual Alterations That from Time to Time Have Happened in Each: Also the Manners and Customs of the Several Inhabitants; Their Religion and Government, Arts and Sciences, Trades and Manufactures: So as to Form A Compleat System of Modern Geography and History, Exhibiting the Present State of All Nations*, 4 vols. (London, 1745)

Hakluyt, Richard, *The Principall Navigations, Voiages, and Discoveries of the English Nations: Made by Sea or over Land to the Most Remote and Farthest Distant Quarters of the Earth at Any Time within the Compasse of These 1500 Years : Divided into Three Several Parts according to the Positions of the Regions Whereunto They Were Directed; the First Containing the Personall Travels of the English unto Indæa, Syria, Arabia ... the Second, Comprehending the Worthy Discoveries of the English towards the North and Northeast by Sea, as of Lapland ... the Third and Last, Including the English Valiant Attempts in Searching Almost All the Corners of the Vaste and New World of America ... Whereunto Is Added the Last Most Renowned English Navigation Round about the Whole Globe of the Earth*, 1st edn (London, 1589)

Haweis, Thomas, *Sermons Preached in London, at the Formation of the Missionary Society, Sept 22, 23, 24, 1797* (London, 1795)

— — —, 'The Very Probable Success of A Proper Mission to the South Sea Islands', *The Evangelical Magazine*, 1 (1795), 261-70

H. F., *A True and Exact Relation of the Severall Informations, Examinations, and Confessions of the Late Witches, Arraigned and Executed in the County of Essex* (London, 1645)

Hodges, William, *Travels in India during the Years 1780, 1781, 1782, & 1783* (London, 1793)

Howell, James, *Instructions for Forreine Travell* (London, 1650)

Leland, John, *A View on the Principal Deistical Writers That Have Appeared in England in the Last and Present Century* (London, 1755)

Linschoten, John Huygen van, *His Discours of Voyages unto the East and West Indies*, trans. by John Wolfe (London, 1598)

Marchant, John James, 'The First Voyage of Master John Davis, Undertaken in June 1585, for the Discoverie of the Northwest Passage', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London, 1589), 776-80

More, Henry, *An Exposition of the Seven Epistles to the Seven Churches; Together With a Brief Discourse of Idolatry with Application to the Church of Rome* (London, 1669)

Olearius, Adam, *The Voyages and Travells of the Ambassadors Sent by Frederick Duke of Holstein to the Great Duke of Muscovy and the King of Persia. Begun in the Year MDCXXXIII and Finished in MDC XXXIX. Containing a Compleat History of Muscovy, Tartary, Persia. and Other Adjacent Countries. With Several Publick Transactions Reaching near the Present Times. Whereunto Are Added the Travels of John Albert de Mandelslo (a Gentleman Belonging to the Embassy) Form Persia, into the East Indies. Containing A Particular Description of Indosthan, the Mogul's Empire, the Oriental Islands, Japan, China &c. and the Revolutions Which Happened in Those Countries, within These Few Years. In III Books.*, trans. by John Davies [of Kidwelly], 2nd edn (London, 1669)

Ovington, John, *A Voyage to Suratt in the Year 1689* (London, 1696)

Owen, James, *The History of Images, and Of Image Worship. Shewing, the Original and Progress of Idolatry among Pagans, Jews, and Christians: With A Refutation of the Second Council of Nice, and of Other Advocates for Idolatry* (London, 1709)

Phelps, Thomas, *The True Account of the Captivity of Thomas Phelps* (London, 1685)

Pitt, Moses, *An Account of One Ann Jeffries, Now Living in the County of Cornwall, Who Was Fed for Six Months by a Small Sort of Airy People Call'd Fairies, and of the Strange and Wonderful Cures She Performed with Slaves and Medicines She Received from Them, for Which She Never Took One Penny of Her Patients in a Letter from Moses Pitt to the Right Reverend Father in God, Dr. Edward Fowler, Lord Bishop of Gloucester* (London, 1696)

Pitts, Joseph, *A True and Faithful Account of the Religion and Manners of the Mohammetans. In Which Is a Particular Relation of Their Pilgrimage to Mecca, the Place of Mahomet's Birth, and a Description of Medina and of His Tomb There. As Likewise of Algier and the Country Adjacent, and of Alexandria, Grand Cairo Etc. With an Account of the Author's Being Taken Captive, the Turk's Cruelty to Him and of His Escape. In Which Are Many Things Never Published by Any Historian Before* (Exeter, 1704)

Prideaux, Humphrey, *The True Nature of Imposture Displayed in the Life of Mahomet* (London, 1698)

Rawlins, John, *The Famous and Wonderfull Recoverie of a Ship of Bristoll, Called the Exchange, from the Turkish Pirates of Argier, with the Vnmatchable Attempts and Good Successe of Iohn Rawlins, Pilot in Her, and Other Slaues; Who in the End with the Slaughter of about 40. of the Turkes and Moores, Brought the Ship into Plimouth the 13. of February Last; with the Capitaine a Renegado, and 5. Turkes More, besides the Redemption of 24. Men, and One Boy, from Turkish Slauerie.* (London, 1622)

Scheffer, Johann, *The History of Lapland Wherein Are Shewed the Original Manners, Habits, Marriages, Conjurations, &c. of That People*. Written by John Scheffer, Professor of Law and Rhetoric at Upfal in Sweden (Oxford, 1674)

Scot, Reginald, *The Discoverie of Witchcraft, Wherein the Lewde Dealing of Witches and Witchmongers Is Notablie Detected, in Sixteen Books ... Whereunto Is Added a Treatise upon the Nature and Substance of Spirits and Devils* (London, 1584)

— — —, *The Discovery of Witchcraft Proving That the Compacts and Contracts of Witches with Devils and All Infernal Spirits or Familiars Are but Erroneous Novelties and Imaginary Conceptions : Also Discovering, How Far Their Power Extendeth in Killing, Tormenting, Consuming, or Curing the Bodies of Men, Women, Children, or Animals by Charms, Philtres, Periapts, Pentacles, Curses, and Conjurations : Wherein Likewise the Unchristian Practices and Inhumane Dealings of Searchers and Witch-Tryers upon Aged, Melancholly, and Superstitious People, in Extorting Confessions by Terrors and Tortures, and in Devising False Marks and Symptoms, Are Notably Detected ... : In Sixteen Books / by Reginald Scot ... ; Whereunto Is Added an Excellent Discourse of the Nature and Substance of Devils and Spirits, in Two Books : The First by the Aforesaid Author, the Second Now Added in This Third Edition ... Conducing to the Compleating of the Whole Work, with Nine Chapters at the Beginning of the Fifteenth [sic] Book of The Discovery. Discourse Concerning the Nature and Substance of Devils and Spirits. Discourse Concerning the Nature and Substance of Devils and Spirits.* (London, 1665)

Symes, Michael, *A Brief Account of the Religion & Civil Institutions of the Burmans; and A Description of the Kingdom of Assam, Formerly Part of the Empire of Ava, Under the King of Pegue, Translated from the Alumoernamem. To Which Is Added, an Account of the Petroleum Wells, in the Burmah Dominions, Extracted from a Journal from Rangoon up the River Eraiwaddy to Amarapoorah, the Present Capital of the Burmah Empire* (Calcutta, 1798)

Tavernier, Jean-Baptiste, *The Six Voyages of John Baptista Tavernier, A Noble Man of France Now Living, Through Turkey Into Persia, and the East-Indies, Finished in the Year 1670. Giving An Account of the State of Those Countries... Together with a New Relation of the Present Gran Seignor's Seraglio, By the Same Author. Made English by J. P. To Which Is Added A Description of All the Kingdoms Which Encompass the Euxine and Caspian Seas, by An English Traveller, Never before Printed*, trans. by J. Phillips (London, 1678)

Tenison, Thomas, *Of Idolatry: A Discourse in Which Is Endeavoured A Declaration of Its Distinction from Superstition, Its Notion, Cause, Commencement and Progress; Its Practice Charged on Gentles, Jews, Mahometans, Gnosticks, Manichees, Arians, Socinians, Romanists: As Also, of the Means Which God Hath Vouchsafed towards the Cure of It by the Sechinah of His Son* (London, 1678)

Tindal, Matthew, *Christianity as Old as the Creation: Or, the Gospel, a Republication of the Religion of Nature*, 2 vols. (London, 1730)

Topsell, Edward, *The Historie of Serpents. Or, The Second Booke of Living Creatures Wherein Is Contained Their Divine, Naturall, and Morall Descriptions, with Their Lively Figures, Names, Conditions, Kindes and Natures of All Venemous Beasts: With Their Severall Poysons and Antidotes; Their Deepe Hatred to Mankind, and the Wonderfull Worke of God in Their Creation, and Destruction. Necessary and Profitable to All Sorts of Men: Collected out of Divine Scriptures, Fathers, Phylosophers, Physitians, and Poets: Amplified with Sundry Accidentall Histories, Hieroglyphicks, Epigrams, Emblems, and Aenigmaticall Observations* (London, 1608)

Trusler, John, *The Habitable World Described, or the Present State of the People in All Parts of the Globe, from North to South; Shewing the Situation, Extent, Climate, Productions, Animals, &c. of the Different Kingdoms and States; Including All the New Discoveries: Together with the Genius, Manners, Customs, Trade, Religion, Forms of Government, &c. of the Inhabitants, and Every Thing Respecting Them, That Can Be Either Entertaining or Informing to the Reader, Collected from the Earliest and Latest Accounts of Historians and Travellers of All Nations;*

with Some That Have Never Been Published in This Kingdom; And, Nothing Advanced but on the Best Authorities. With a Great Variety of Maps and Copper-Plates, Engraved in a Capital Stile, the Subjects of Which Are Mostly New, and such as Have Never yet Been given in Any English Work, 2 vols. (London, 1788)

Vallancey, Charles, *A Vindication of the Ancient History of Ireland* (Dublin, 1786)

Webbe, Edward, *The Rare and Most Wonderful Things Which Edw. Webbe an Englishman Borne, Hath Seene and Passed in His Troublesome Travailes, in the Cities of Ierusalem, Damasko, Bethlehem and Galely: And in the Landes of Iewrie, Egypt, Grecia, Russia, and Prester John. Wherein Is Set Forth His Extreame Slavery Sustained Many Yeeres Together in the Gallies and Warres of the Great Turke, against the Landes of Persia, Tartaria, Spaine and Portugale, with the Maner of His Releasement and Comming into England in May Last. Newly Enlarged and Corrected by the Author* (London, 1590)

Wilson, James, *A Missionary Voyage to the Southern Pacific Ocean, Performed in the Years 1796, 1797, 1798, in the Ship Duff, Commanded by Captain James Wilson: Compiled from Journals of the Officers and the Missionaries; and Illustrated with Maps, Charts, and Views. With a Preliminary Discourse on the Geography and History of the South Sea Islands* (London, 1799)

Young, Arthur, *An Historical Dissertation on Idolatrous Corruptions in Religion From the Beginning of the World; And on the Methods Taken by Divine Providence of Reforming Them*, 2 vols. (London, 1734)

Printed Primary Sources (from 1800)

Adam, Robert, *The Religious World Displayed: Or, a View of the Four Grand Systems of Religion, Judaism, Paganism, Christianity, and Mohammedism, and of the Various Existing Denominations, Sects, and Parties in the Christian World: To Which Is Subjoined a View of Deism and Atheism* (London: L. B. Seeley, 1823)

Aldersey, Lawrence, 'The First Voyage or Journey, Made by Master Laurence Aldersey, Marchant of London, to the Cities of Ierusalem, and Tripolis, &c in the Yeere 1581 Penned and Set Down by Himselfe', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), v, 202-14

d'Anghera, Peter Martyr, 'The Decades of the Newe World or West India', in *The First Three English Books on America*, ed. by Edward Arber, trans. by Richard Eden (Westminster: A. Constable, 1885)

Anon, 'A Brief Relation of the Siege and Taking of the Citie of Rhodes, by Sultan Soliman the Great Turke, Translated Out of French into English at the Motion of the Reverend Lord Thomas Dockwray, Great Prior of the Order of Ierusalem in England, in the Yeere 1524', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), v, 1-60

— — —, 'The Description of the Regions, People, and Rivers, Lying North and East from Moscovia: As the Way from Moscovia to the River Petzora, and the Province Jugaria or Juhra, and from Thence to the River Obi. Likewise, the Description of the Other Countreys and Regions, Even unto the Empire of the Great Can of Cathay, Taken out of Sigismundus Ab Herberstein', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), iii, 405-12

— — —, *The Missionary Magazine for 1810: A Periodical Monthly Publication Intended as A Repository of Discussion and Intelligence Respecting The Progress of The Gospel Throughout the World* (Edinburgh: Andrew and James Aikman, 1810), xv

— — —, *The Missionary Register for the Year 1814: Containing an Abstract of the Proceedings of the Principal Missionary and Bible Stations throughout the World* (London: L. B. Seeley, 1814)

Anon [Solomon Pigott], *An Authentic Narrative of Four Years' Residence at Tongataboo, One of the Friendly Islands in the Southsea by [anon] Who Went Thither in the Dugg, under Captain Wilson, in 1796, with an Appendix by an Eminent Writer* (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees and Orme, 1810)

Berkeley, George, 'Alciphron, Or, the Minute Philosopher; in Seven Dialogues. Containing an Apology for the Christian Religion, against Those Who Are Called Free-Thinkers', in *Works of George Berkeley*, ed. by Alexander Campbell Fraser, 3 vols. (Oxford: Clarendon, 1871), II, 1-368

Bodin, Jean, *Demon-Mania of Witches*, ed. by Randy A. Scott (Toronto: CRRS Publications, 2001)

Burrough, Stephen, 'The Navigation and Discoverie Toward the River Ob, Made by Master Steven Burrough, Master of the Pinnesse Called the Serchthrift, with Divers Things Worth the Noting, Passed in the Yere 1556', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), II, 322-44

Cox, Hiram, *Journal of a Residence in the Burmhan Empire* (London: J. Warren, 1821)

Dallam, Thomas, 'Thomas Dallam's Diary, 1599-1600', in *Early Voyages and Travels in the Levant*, ed. by James Theodore Bent (London: Hakluyt Society, 1893), pp. 1-98

Davies, John, *The History of the Tahitian Mission: 1799-1830*, ed. by Colin Newbury (Cambridge: Hakluyt Society, 1961)

Ducket, Geoffrey, 'Further Observations Concerning the State of Persia, Taken in the Foresayd Fift[h] Voyage into Those Partes, and Written by M. Geoffrey Ducket, One of the Agents Employed in the Same', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), III, 158-66

Ellis, William, *Polynesian Researches during A Residence of Nearly Six Years in the South Sea Islands; Including Descriptions of the Natural History and Scenery of the Islands - with Remarks on the History, Mythology, Traditions, Government, Arts, Manners and Customs of the Inhabitants*, 2 vols. (London: Fisher, Son & Jackson, 1829)

Fletcher, Giles, 'The Description of The Countrey of Russia, with the Bredth, Length and Names of the Shires', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), III, 353-405

Glanvill, Joseph, *Saducismus Triumphatus, Or, Full and Plain Evidence Concerning Witches and Apparitions*, ed. by C. O. Parsons (London, Gainesville: Scholar's Facsimiles & Reprints, 1681, 1966)

Hakluyt, Richard, *The Principal Navigations Voyages Traffiques & Discoveries of the English Nation Made by Sea or Over-Land to the Remote and Farthest Distant Quarters of the Earth at Any Time within the Compasse of These 1600 Yeeres*, Extra Series, 1-12, XII vols. (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903)

Hakluyt [the Elder], Richard, 'Notes in Writing, Besides More Privie by Mouth, That Were Given by M. Richard Hakluyt of Eiton in the Countie of Hereford, Esquire, Anno 1580: To M. Arthur Pet, and to M. Charles Jackman, Sent by the Merchants of the Moscovie Companie for the Discovery of the Northeast Straight, Not Altogether Unfit for Some Other Enterprises of Discovery, Hereafter to Be Taken By Hand', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), III, 264-75

Harborne, William, 'A Letter of Directions of the English Ambassadour to M. Richard Forster, Appointed the First English Consul at Tripolis in Syria', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), v, 261-63

— — —, 'The Voyage of the Susan of London to Constantinople, Wherein the Worshipfull M. William Harborne Was Sent First Ambassadour unto Sultan Murad Can [Murad III], the Great Turke, Wth Whom He Continued as Her Majesties Ligier Almost Six Yeeres', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), v, 243-58

Jenkinson, Anthonie, 'A Compendious and Briefe Declaration of the Journy of M. Anth. Jenkinson, from the Famous Citie of London into the Land of Persia, Passing in This Same Journey Throrow Russia, Moscovia, and Mare Caspium, Alias Hircanum, Sent and Employed Therein By the Right Worshipfull Societie of the Merchants Adventurers, for the Discoverie of Lands, Islands &c. Being Begun the Fourteenth Day of May, Anno 1561, and in the Third Yere of The Reigne of the Queenes Majestie That Now Is: This Present Declaration Being Directad and Written to the Foresayd Societie', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), III, 15-38

— — —, 'The First Voyage Made By Master Anthonie Jenkinson, from the Citie of London toward the Land of Russia, Begun the Twelfth of May, in the Yeere 1557', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), II, 413-25

— — —, 'The Voyage of Master Anthony Jenkinson, Made from the Citie of Mosco in Russia, to the City of Boghar in Bactria, in the Yeere 1558: Written by Himself to the Merchants of London of the Moscovie Company', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), II, 449-79

— — —, *Early Voyages and Travels to Russia and Persia*, ed. by Edward Delmar Morgan and Charles Henry Coote, 2 vols. (London: Hakluyt Society, 1886)

Johnson, Richard, 'Certaine Notes Unperfectly Written by Richard Johnson, Servant to Master Richard Chancellour, Which Was in the Discoverie of Vaigatz and Nova Zembla, with Steven Burrowe in the Serchthrift 156. And Afterwarde among the Samoedes, Whose Devilish Rites Hee Describeth', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), II, 345-49

Jones, William, 'On the Gods of Greece, Italy and India', in *The Works of Sir William Jones, with the Life of the Author*, ed. by Lord [John Shore] Teignmouth, 13 vols. (John Stockdale, 1807), III, 319-97

— — —, *The Works of Sir William Jones, with a Life of the Author*, ed. by Lord [John Shore] Teignmouth, 13 vols. (London: John Stockdale and John Walker, 1807)

Locke, John, 'The Voyage of M. John Locke to Jerusalem', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), v, 76-105

Lockerby, William, *The Journal of William Lockerby, Sandalwood Trader in the Fijian Islands during the Years 1808-1809: With an Introduction & Other Papers Connected with the Earliest European Visitors to the Islands*, ed. by Sir Everard Im Thurn and Leonard C. Wharton (London: Hakluyt Society, 1925)

London Missionary Society, *Brief Review of the London Missionary Society, from Its Formation*, The London Missionary Society Annual Meeting (No publisher, 1845)

— — —, *Transactions of the Missionary Society*, 4 vols. (London: Bye & Law, 1803-10)

Mandeville, John, *The Travels of Sir John Mandeville*, ed. & trans. by C. W. R. D. Moseley (London: Penguin Classics, 1983)

Montagu, Lady Mary Wortley, 'Letters... Written, during Her Travels in Europe, Asia and Africa', in *Empire and Identity: An Eighteenth Century Sourcebook*, by Stephen H. Gregg (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 96-103

Moorcroft, William, and George Trebeck, *Travels in the Himalayan Provinces of Hindustan and the Panjab; in Ladakh and Kashmir; in Peshawar, Kabul, Kunduz and Bokhara by Mr. William Moorcroft and Mr George Trebeck, Prepared for the Press from the Original Journals and Correspondence from 1819 to 1825*, ed. by Horace Hayman Wilson, 2nd edn (Patiala: Languages Dept, Punjab, 1837)

Morrison, James, *Account of the Island of Tahiti & the Customs of the Island*, ed. by Paul Turnbull (London: Golden Cockerel Press, 1935)

Mortimer, Favell Lee, *The Night of Toil: Or A Familiar Account of the Labours of the First Missionaries in the South Sea Islands* (New York: American Tract Society, 1838)

Orange, James, *Narrative of the Late George Vason* (Derby: Henry Mozley, 1840)

Phayre, Arthur P., *History of Burma: From the Earliest Time to the End of the First War with British India* (Oxford: Routledge, 1883)

Randolph, Thomas, 'The Ambassage of the Right, Worshipfull Master Thomas Randolfe, Esquire, to the Emperour of Russia, in the Yeere 1568, Briefly Written By Himself', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), III, 102-8

Religious Tracts Society, *Missionary Records: Tahiti and Society Islands* (London: Religious Tract Society, n.d. [c. 1830s]), III

Robertson, George, *The Discovery of Tahiti: A Journal of the Second Voyage of H.M.S. Dolphin Round the World, under the Command of Captain Wallis, R.N., in the Years 1766, 1767, and 1768*, ed. by Hugh Carrington (London: Hakluyt Society, 1948)

Saunders, Thomas, 'The Voyage Made to Tripolis in Barbarie in the Yeere 1583 with a Ship Called the Jesus Wherein the Adventures and Distresses of Some Englishment Are Truly Reported, And Other Necessary Circumstances Observed. Written By Thomas Sanders', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), v, 292-311

Southam, Thomas, and John Sparke, 'The Way Discovered by Water by Us Thomas Southam & John Sparke, from the Towne of Colmogro, by the Western Bottom of the Baie of S. Nicholas, unto the Citie of Novogrod in Russia, Containing Many Particulars of the Way, and Distance of Miles, as Hereafter Followeth. Anno 1566', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), III, 73-83

Symes, Michael, *An Account of an Embassy to the Kingdom of Ava Sent by the Governor-General of India in the Year 1795* (London: Bulmer and Co., 1800)

— — —, *Journal of His Second Embassy to the Court of Ava in 1802*, ed. by D. G. E. Hall (London: Allen & Unwin, 1955)

Watts, Isaac, *The Works of the Rev. Isaac Watts, D.D. In Seven Volumes. Vol. III, Containing the Strength and Weakness of Human Reason; Rational Foundation of a Christian Church; Holiness of Times, Places &c; Ruin and Recovery of Mankind; on the Freedom of the Will; the Sacrifice of Christ*, 7 vols. (Leeds: Edward Baines, 1800), III

Willes, Richard, 'Notes Concerning This Fourth Voyage into Persia, Begun in the Moneth of July 1568 Gathered by M. Richard Willes, from the Mouth of Master Arthur Edwards, Which Was Agent in the Same', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), II, 143-49

Willoughby, Hugh, 'The True Copie of a Note Found Written in One of the Two Ships, to Whit, the Speranza, Which Wintred in Lappia, Where Sir Hugh Willoughby and All His Companie Died, Being Frozen to Death. Anno 1553', in *The Principal Navigations*, by Richard Hakluyt (London: Hakluyt Society, 1903), II, 212-24

Published Books, Articles and Chapters

Abu-Lughod, Janet L., *Before European Hegemony: The World System AD 1250-1350* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1989)

Ahmad, Siti Nuraishah, Shanthini Pillai, and Noraini Md. Yusof, 'Rehabilitating Eden: Archetypal Images of Malaya in European Travel Writing', *Journeys*, 12 (2011), 22-45

Alam, Muzaffar, and Sanjay Subrahmanyam, *Indo-Persian Travels in the Age of Discoveries, 1400-1800* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007)

Almeida, Hermione de, and George H. Gilpin, *Indian Renaissance: British Romantic Art and the Prospect of India* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2005)

Álvarez Recio, Leticia, 'The Politicization of the Pulpit in Seventeenth-Century England: Thanksgiving Sermons after the Duke of Monmouth's Rebellion', *Miscelánea*, 40 (2009), 13-23

Anderson, Benedict, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (London and New York: Verso, 1983)

Anderson, Clare, 'Introduction to Marginal Centers: Writing Life Histories in the Indian Ocean World', *Journal of Social History*, 42 (2011), 335-44

— — —, 'Writing Indigenous Women's Lives in the Bay of Bengal: Cultures of Empire in the Andaman Islands, 1789-1906', *Journal of Social History*, 45 (2011), 480-96

Andrea, Bernadette, 'The Tartar Girl, The Persian Princess, And Early Modern English Women's Authorship from Elizabeth I to Mary Wroth', in *Women Writing Back/Writing Women Back: Transnational Perspectives from the Late Middle Ages to the Dawn of the Modern Era*, ed. by Suzanna van Dijk, Anke Gilleir, and Alicia Montoya (Leiden: Brill, 2010), pp. 257-82

Andrea, Bernadette, and Linda McJannet, eds., *Early Modern England and Islamic Worlds* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011)

Ankarloo, Bengt, 'Sweden: The Mass Burnings (1668-76)', in *Early Modern European Witchcraft: Centres and Peripheries*, ed. by Gustav Henningsen and Bengt Ankarloo (Oxford: Clarendon, 1990), pp. 285-319

App, Urs, *The Birth of Orientalism* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010)

— — —, *The Cult of Emptiness: The Western Discovery of Buddhist Thought and the Invention of Oriental Philosophy* (Kyoto: University Media, 2012)

— — —, 'William Jones's Ancient Theology', *Sino-Platonic Papers*, 191 (2009), 1-125

Archer, John Michael, *Old Worlds: Egypt, Southwest Asia, India, and Russia in Early Modern English Writing* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001)

Armitage, David, 'The Elizabethan Idea of Empire', *Transactions of Royal Historical Society*, 14 (2004), 269-77

- Artemel, Suheyla, “‘The Great Turk’s Particular Inclination to Red Herring’: The Popular Image of the Turk during the Renaissance in England”, *Journal of Mediterranean Studies*, 5 (1995), 188-208
- Aston, Margaret, *Faith and Fire: Popular and Unpopular Religion 1350-1600* (London and Rio Grande: The Hambledon Press, 1993)
- Aune, M. G., ‘Travel Writing After Orientalism’, *Journal for Early Modern Cultural Studies*, 5 (2005), 120-38
- Baepler, Paul, ‘Introduction’, in *White Slaves, African Masters: An Anthology of American Barbary Captivity Narratives*, ed. by Paul Baepler (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1999), pp. 1-58
- Banerjee, Pompa, ‘Burning Questions: Widows, Witches, and Early Modern European Travel Narratives of India’, *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies*, 29 (1999), 529-61
- — —, *Burning Women: Widows, Witches and Early Modern European Travellers in India* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003)
- Barber, Alex, “‘Why Don’t Those Lazy Priests Answer the Book?’ Matthew Tindal, Censorship, Freedom of the Press and Religious Debate in Early Eighteenth-Century England”, *History*, 98 (2013), 680-707
- Barber, Peter, ‘Was Elizabeth I Interested in Maps - And Did It Matter?’, *Transactions of Royal Historical Society*, 14 (2004), 185-98
- Barbour, Richard, *Before Orientalism: London’s Theatre of the East 1576-1626* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003)
- Barnhart, William C., ‘Evangelicalism, Masculinity, and the Making of Imperial Missionaries in Late Georgian Britain, 1795-1820’, *The Historian*, 67 (2005), 712-33
- Baron, Samuel H., ‘Herberstein and the English “Discovery” Of Muscovy’, *Terrae Incognitae*, 18 (1986), 43-54
- — —, ‘Herberstein’s Image of Russia and Its Transmission Through Later Writers’, in *Explorations in Muscovite History*, by Samuel H. Baron (Hampshire: Varorium, 1991), pp. 245-72
- — —, ‘Osip Napea and the Opening of Anglo-Russian Commercial Relations’, *Oxford Slavonic Papers*, 11 (1978), 42-63
- — —, ‘The Influence in Sixteenth-Century England of Herberstein’s *Rerum Moscoviticarum Commentarii*’, in *Explorations in Muscovite History*, by Samuel H. Baron (Hampshire: Varorium, 1991), pp. 1-17
- — —, ‘The Muscovy Company, the Muscovite Merchants, and the Problem of Reciprocity in Russian Foreign Trade’, *Forschungen Zur Osteuropäischen Geschichte*, 27 (1980), 133-55
- Bartels, Emily C., *Spectacles of Strangeness: Imperialism, Alienation and Marlowe* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1993)
- Baumer, Franklin L., ‘England, the Turk, and the Common Corps of Christendom’, *The American Historical Review*, 50 (1944), 26-48
- Bayly, Christopher Alan, *Empire and Information: Intelligence Gathering and Social Communication in India, 1780-1870* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996)

— — —, *The New Cambridge History of India: Indian Society and the Making of the British Empire* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), II

Bayly, Christopher Alan, Sven Beckert, Matthew Connelly, Isabel Hofmeyr, Wendy Kozol, and Patricia Seed, 'AHR Conversation', *American Historical Review*, 111 (2006), 1441-64

Beaglehole, J. C., ed., *The Endeavour Journal of Joseph Banks, 1768-1771*, 5 vols. (Sydney: Angus Robertson, 1962)

Bebbington, David, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1780s to the 1830s* (London: Unwin Hymen, 1989)

Behdad, Ali, *Belated Travellers: Orientalism in the Age of Colonial Dissolution* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1994)

Behringer, Wolfgang, 'Weather, Hunger and Fear: Origins of the European Witch-Hunts in Climate, Society and Mentality', in *The Witchcraft Reader*, ed. by Darren Oldridge (London: Routledge, 2002), pp. 69-86

— — —, *Witches and Witch-Hunts: A Global History* (Cambridge: Polity, 2004)

Bent, James Theodore, 'Introduction', in *Early Voyages and Travels in the Levant* (London: Hakluyt Society, 1893), pp. i-xx

Berman, David, 'Deism, Immorality, and the Art of Theological Lying', in *Deism, Masonry, and the Enlightenment: Essays Honouring Alfred Owen Aldridge*, ed. by J. A. Leo Lemay (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1987), pp. 61-78

Berry, Lloyd E., 'Giles Fletcher, the Elder, and Milton's "A Brief History of Moscovia"', *The Review of English Studies*, 11 (1960), 150-56

di Biase, Carmine G., 'Introduction: The Example of the Early Modern Lexicographer', in *Travel and Translation in the Early Modern Period*, ed. by Carmine G. di Biase (Amsterdam and New York: Rodopi, 2006), pp. 9-32

Bisaha, Nancy, *Creating East and West: Renaissance Humanists and the Ottoman Turks* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004)

Blanks, David R., 'Western Views of Islam in the Premodern Period: A Brief History of Past Approaches', in *Western Views of Islam in Medieval and Early Modern Europe: Perception of Other*, ed. by Michael Frassetto and David R. Blanks (New York: St Martin's Press, 1999), pp. 1-54

Blecourt, William de, and Owen Davies, eds., *Witchcraft Continued: Popular Magic in Modern Europe* (Manchester, New York: Manchester University Press, 2004)

Bon, Ottaviano, *The Sultan's Seraglio: An Intimate Portrait of Life at the Ottoman Court*, ed. by Godfrey Goodwin (London: Saqi Books, 1996)

Borge, Francisco J., "'We (upon Peril of My Life) Shall Make the Spaniard Ridiculous to All Europe": Richard Hakluyt's "Discourse" of Spain', in *Richard Hakluyt and Travel Writing in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 167-76

Boruchoff, David A., 'Piety, Patriotism and Empire: Lessons for England, Spain and the New World in the Works of Richard Hakluyt', *Renaissance Quarterly*, 62 (2009), 809-58

Bosi, Roberto, *I Lapponi [The Lapps]*, trans. by James Cadell (London: Thames and Hudson, 1960)

- Bostridge, Ian, *Witchcraft and Its Transformations, c. 1650-c. 1750* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1997)
- Bosworth, Clifford Edmund, *An Intrepid Scot: William Lithgow of Lanark's Travels in the Ottoman Lands, North Africa and Central Europe, 1609-21* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2006)
- Bowen, Lloyd, 'Royalism, Print and the Clergy in Britain, 1639-1640 and 1642', *The Historical Journal*, 56 (2013), 297-319
- Bracewell, Wendy, and Alex Drace-Francis, eds., *A Bibliography of East European Travel Writing in Europe*, 3 vols. (Budapest: Central European University Press, 2007)
- Braddick, Michael J., *State Formation in Early Modern England, c. 1550-1700* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000)
- Braude, Benjamin, 'The Sons of Noah and the Construction of Ethnic and Geographic Identities in the Medieval and Early Modern Periods', *William and Mary Quarterly*, 53 (1997), 103-42
- Brekke, Torkel, 'Baptism and the Bible in Bengal', *History of Religions*, 45 (2006), 213-33
- Brett, Michael, 'Morocco and the Ottomans: The Sixteenth Century in North Africa', *Journal of African History*, 25 (1984), 331-41
- Brigden, Susan, 'Youth and the English Reformation', *Past and Present*, 95 (1982), 37-67
- Briggs, Robin, "'By the Strength of Fancie": Witchcraft and the Early Modern Imagination', *Folklore*, 115 (2004), 259-72
- Brown, Piers, "'That Full-Sail Voyage": Travel Narratives and Astronomical Discovery in Kepler and Galileo', in *The Invention of Discovery, 1500-1700*, ed. by James Dougal Fleming (Ashgate: Farnham, 2011), pp. 15-28
- Brown, Sylvia, 'The Radical Travels of Mary Fisher: Walking and Writing in the Universal Light', in *Women, Gender and Radical Religion in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Sylvia Brown (Boston: Brill, 2008), pp. 39-64
- Buick, Stephen, "'We Are yet Strangers in Our Own Country": Foreign and Mysterious Elements in the Elizabethan Settlement of Religion', in *The Mysterious and the Foreign in Early Modern England*, ed. by Helen Ostovich, Mary V. Silcox, and Graham Roebuck (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2008), pp. 234-48
- Bulman, William J., 'Enlightenment and Religious Politics in Restoration England', *History Compass*, 10/10 (2012), 752-64
- Burke, Peter, 'The Philosopher as Traveller: Bernier's Orient', in *Voyages and Visions: Towards a Cultural History of Travel*, ed. by Joan Pau Rubiés and Jas Elsner (London: Reaktion Books, 1999), pp. 124-37
- Burke, Peter, and R. Po-Chia Hsia, 'Introduction', in *Cultural Translation in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Peter Burke and R. Po-Chia Hsia (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), pp. 1-4
- Burton, Antoinette, 'Amitav Ghosh's World Histories from Below', *History of the Present*, 2 (2012), 71-77
- Burton, Jonathan, *Traffic and Turning: Islam and English Drama, 1579-1624* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2005)
- Bushnell, Rebecca W., *Tragedies of Tyrants: Political Thought and Theater in the English Renaissance* (New York: Cornell University Press, 1990)

- Cambers, Andrew, 'Demonic Possession, Literacy and "Superstition" in Early Modern England', *Past and Present*, 202 (2009), 3-35
- Cannon, Garland Hampton, 'Oriental Jones: Scholarship, Literature, Multiculturalism and Humankind', in *Objects of Enquiry: The Life, Contributions, and Influences of Sir William Jones, 1746-1794*, ed. by Garland Hampton Cannon and Kevin R. Brine (New York: New York University Press, 1995), pp. 21-50
- Cannon, Garland Hampton, and Michael J. Franklin, 'A Cymmrodor Claims Kin in Calcutta: An Assessment of Sir William Jones as Philologist, Polymath, and Pluralist', *Transactions of the Honourable Society of Cymmrodorion*, 11 (2005), 50-69
- Carey, Daniel, 'Hakluyt's Instructions: The Principal Navigations and Sixteenth-Century Travel Advice', *Studies in Travel Writing*, 13 (2009), 167-85
- — —, 'Inquiries, Heads, and Directions: Orienting Early Modern Travel', in *Travel Narratives, the New Science and Literary Discourse, 1569-1750*, ed. by Judy A. Hayden (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 25-51
- — —, 'Travel, Identity and Cultural Difference 1580-1700', in *Cross-Cultural Travel: Papers from the Royal Irish Academy International Symposium on Literature and Travel, National University of Ireland, November 2002*, ed. by Jane Conroy (Oxford: Peter Lang, 2003), pp. 39-48
- Carey, Daniel, and Claire Jowitt, 'Introduction: Early Modern Travel Writing: Varieties, Transitions, Horizons', *Studies in Travel Writing*, 13 (2009), 95-98
- — —, eds., *Richard Hakluyt and Travel Writing in Early Modern Europe* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012)
- Carpenter, Edward, *Thomas Tenison, Archbishop of Canterbury His Life and Times* (London: SPCK, 1949)
- Carson, Penelope, *The East India Company and Religion, 1698-1858* (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2012)
- Carter, Christopher, 'Meteors, Prodigies, and Signs: The Interpretation of the Unusual in Sixteenth-Century England', *Parergon*, 29 (2012), 107-33
- Cass, Jeffrey, 'Introduction', in *Interrogating Orientalism: Contextual Approaches and Pedagogical Practices*, ed. by Diane Long Hoeveler and Jeffrey Cass (Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 2006), pp. 1-24
- Cathcart, Michael, Tom Griffiths, Lee Watts, Vivian Anceschi, Greg Houghton, and David Goodman, *Mission to the South Seas: The Voyage of the Duff, 1796-1799* (Melbourne: Parkville, 1990)
- Cervantes, Fernando, 'The Devil's Encounter with America', in *Witchcraft in Early Modern Europe: Studies in Culture and Belief*, ed. by Jonathan Barry, Marianne Hester, and Gareth Roberts (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1996), pp. 119-44
- Chakrabarty, Dipesh, *Provincializing Europe: Postcolonial Thought and Historical Difference* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000)
- Champion, J. A. I., *The Pillars of Priestcraft Shaken: The Church of England and Its Enemies, 1660-1730* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992)
- Chaplin, Joyce E., 'The Pacific before Empire, c. 1500-c.1800', in *Pacific Histories: Ocean, Land, People*, ed. by David Armitage and Alison Bashford (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), pp. 53-74

- Charney, Michael W., 'Crisis and Reformation in a Maritime Kingdom of Southeast Asia: Forces of Instability and Political Disintegration in Western Burma (Arakan), 1603-1701', *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient*, 41 (1998), 185-219
- Chatterjee, Amal, *Representations of India, 1740-1840: The Creation of India in the Colonial Imagination* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2001)
- Chaudhuri, K. N., *The Trading World of Asia and the English East India Company 1660-1760* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978)
- Chew, Samuel, *The Crescent and the Rose: Islam and England during the Renaissance* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1937)
- Chirico, David, 'The Travel Narrative as a (Literary) Genre', in *Under Eastern Eyes: A Comparative Introduction to East European Travel Writing in Europe*, ed. by Wendy Bracewell and Alex Drace-Francis (Budapest: Central European University Press, 2008), pp. 27-60
- Clark, Stuart, *Thinking with Demons: The Idea of Witchcraft in Early Modern Europe* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1997)
- — —, *Vanities of the Eye: Vision in Early Modern European Culture* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007)
- Clavin, Patricia, 'Defining Transnationalism', *Contemporary European History*, 14 (2005), 421-39
- Claydon, Tony, *Europe and the Making of England, 1660-1760* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007)
- Clendinnen, Inga, 'Cortes, Signs and the Conquest of Mexico', in *The Transmission of Culture in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Anthony Grafton and Ann Blair (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1990), pp. 87-130
- — —, "'Fierce and Unnatural Cruelty": Cortes and the Conquest of Mexico', in *New World Encounters*, ed. by Stephen Greenblatt (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1993), pp. 12-47
- Cogley, Richard W., "'The Most Vile and Barbarous Nation of All the World": Giles Fletcher the Elder's The Tartars Or, Ten Tribes (ca. 1610)', *Renaissance Quarterly*, 58 (2005), pp. 781-814
- Cohen, Jeffrey Jerome, 'Hybrids, Monsters, Borderlands: The Bodies of Gerald of Wales', in *The Postcolonial Middle Ages*, ed. by Jeffrey Jerome Cohen (New York: St. Martin's Press, 2000), pp. 85-106
- Cohn, Bernard S., *Colonialism and Its Forms of Knowledge: The British in India* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996)
- Colley, Linda, *Britons: Forging the Nation 1707-1837* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992)
- — —, *Captives: Britain, Empire and the World, 1600-1850* (London: Jonathan Cape, 2002)
- Collinson, Patrick, 'English Reformations', in *A Companion to English Renaissance Literature and Culture*, ed. by Michael Hattaway (Oxford: Blackwell, 2002), pp. 27-43
- — —, *Godly People: Essays on English Protestantism and Puritanism* (London: Hambledon, 1983)

— — —, *The Birthpangs of Protestant England: Religious and Cultural Change in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries* (Houndmills: Macmillan, 1988)

— — —, 'The Fog in the Channel Clears: The Rediscovery of the Continental Dimension to the British Reformations', in *The Reception of Continental Reformation in Britain*, ed. by Polly Ha and Patrick Collinson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), pp. xxvii - xxxvii

— — —, *The Reformation* (London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 2003)

Cooper, Frederick, and Ann Laura Stoler, eds., *Tensions of Empire: Colonial Cultures in a Bourgeois World* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1997)

Copland, Ian, 'Christianity as an Arm of Empire: The Ambiguous Case of India under the Company, c. 1813-1858', *The Historical Journal*, 49 (2006), 1025-54

Cormack, Lesley B., 'Britannia Rules the Waves?: Images of Empire in Elizabethan England', in *Literature, Mapping and the Politics of Space in Early Modern Britain*, ed. by Andrew Gordon and Bernhard Klein (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), pp. 45-68

Corney, Bolton Glanvill, ed., *The Quest and Occupation of Tahiti by Emissaries of Spain during the Years 1772-1776*, trans. by Bolton Glanvill Corney, 3 vols. (London: Hakluyt Society, 1913)

Cox, Jeffrey, *The British Missionary Enterprise since 1700* (Oxford and New York: Routledge, 2008)

Cressy, David, 'Different Kinds of Speaking: Symbolic Violence and Secular Iconoclasm in Early Modern England', in *Protestant Identities: Religion, Society, and Self-Fashioning in Post-Reformation England*, ed. by Muriel McClendon, Joseph P. Ward, and Michael MacDonald (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1999), pp. 19-42

— — —, *Travesties and Transgressions in Tudor and Stuart England: Tales of Discord and Dissension* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000)

Crummey, Robert O., and Lloyd E. Berry, eds., *Rude and Barbarous Kingdom: Russia in the Accounts of Sixteenth-Century English Voyagers* (Madison and London: University of Wisconsin Press, 1968)

Dalrymple, William, 'The Porous Frontiers of Islam and Christendom: A Clash or Fusion of Civilizations?', in *Re-Orienting the Renaissance: Cultural Exchanges with the East*, ed. by Gerald MacLean (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. ix - xxiii

Daniel, Robert Warren, "'Have a Little Book in Thy Conscience, and Write Therein": Writing the Puritan Conscience, 1600-1650', in *Sin and Salvation in Reformation England*, ed. by Jonathan Willis (Farnham: Ashgate, 2015), pp. 245-58

Danson, Lawrence, 'The Sultan's Organ: Presents and Self-Presentation in Thomas Dallam's Diary', *Renaissance Studies*, 23 (2010), 639-58

Danvers, F. C., *Report on the India Office Records Relating to Persia and the Persian Gulf* (London: Eyre and Spottiswoode, 1889)

Darr, Orna Alyagon, *Marks of an Absolute Witch: Evidentiary Dilemmas in Early Modern England* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2011)

Daston, Lorraine, 'Marvellous Facts and Miraculous Evidence in Early Modern Europe', *Critical Inquiry*, 18 (1991), 93-124

Dávid, Géza, and Pál Fodor, *Ransom Slavery Along the Ottoman Borders: Early Fifteenth-Early Eighteenth Centuries* (Leiden: Brill, 2007)

- Davidson, J. W., 'Problems of Pacific History', *Journal of Pacific History*, 1 (1966), 5-21
- De Krey, Gary S., 'Between Revolutions: Re-Appraising the Restoration in Britain', *History Compass*, 6/3 (2008), 738-73
- — —, 'Reformation and "Arbitrary Government": London Dissenters and James II's Polity of Toleration, 1687-88', in *Fear, Exclusion and Revolution: Roger Morrice and Britain in the 1680s*, ed. by Jason McElligott (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2006), pp. 13-31
- Dening, Greg, *Mr Bligh's Bad Language: Power, Passion and Theatre on the Bounty* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992)
- Denney, Peter, 'Popular Radicalism, Religious Parody and the Mock Sermon in the 1790s', *History Workshop Journal*, 74 (2012), 51-78
- Deringil, Selim, *Conversion and Apostasy in the Late Ottoman Empire* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012)
- Descantes, Christophe, 'Simple Marae Of The 'Opunohu Valley, Moorea, Society Islands, French Polynesia', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 102 (1993), 187-216
- Dewey, Clive, and Anthony G Hopkins, eds., *The Imperial Impact: Studies in the Economic History of Africa and India* (London: Athlone Press for the Institute of Commonwealth Studies, 1978)
- Di Giovine, Michael A., 'Identities and Nation-Building in Early Modern Travel Accounts', *Journeys*, 12 (2011), 93-105
- DiMassa, Daniel, 'The Politics of Translation and the German Reception of Dante: Johannes Herold's Monarchy', in *Translation and the Book Trade in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by José María Pérez Fernández and Edward Wilson-Lee (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014)
- Dimmock, Matthew, "'Captive to the Turke": Responses to the Anglo-Ottoman Capitulations of 1580', in *Cultural Encounters Between East and West 1453-1699*, ed. by Matthew Birchwood and Matthew Dimmock (Newcastle-upon-Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Press, 2005), pp. 29-42
- — —, 'Hakluyt's Multiple Faiths', in *Richard Hakluyt and Travel Writing in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 219-28
- — —, *Mythologies of the Prophet Muhammad in Early Modern English Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013)
- — —, *New Turkes: Dramatizing Islam and the Ottomans in Early Modern England* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2005)
- Ditchfield, G. M., "'How Narrow with the Limits of This Toleration Appear?" Dissenting Petitions to Parliament, 1772-3', in *Parliament and Dissent*, ed. by Stephen Taylor and David L. Wykes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2005), pp. 91-106
- Ditchfield, Simon, 'Catholic Reformation and Renewal', in *The Oxford Illustrated History of the Reformation*, ed. by Peter Marshall (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015), pp. 152-85
- Dixon, Leif, 'William Perkins, "Atheisme", and the Crises of England's Long Reformation', *Journal of British Studies*, 50 (2012), 790-812
- Drace-Francis, Alex, 'Towards a Natural History of East European Travel Writing', in *Under Eastern Eyes: A Comparative Introduction to East European Travel Writing in Europe*, ed. by

Wendy Bracewell and Alex Drace-Francis (Budapest: Central European University Press, 2008), pp. 1-26

Druett, Joan, *Tupaia: The Remarkable Story of Captain Cook's Polynesian Navigator* (Auckland: Random House, 2011)

D'souza, Rohan, 'Crisis before the Fall: Some Speculations on the Decline of the Ottomans, Safavids and Mughals', *Social Scientist*, 30 (2002), 3-30

Duffy, Eamon, *Saints, Sacrilege and Sedition: Religion and Conflict in the Tudor Reformations* (London: Bloomsbury, 2012)

— — —, *The Stripping of the Altars: Traditional Religion in England c. 1400-c. 1580* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1992)

— — —, *The Voices of Morebath: Reformation and Rebellion in an English Village* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2001)

Dulles, Foster Rhea, *Eastward Ho! The First English Adventures to the Orient: Richard Chancellor, Anthony Jenkinson, James Lancaster, William Adams, Sir Thomas Roe* (Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin, 1931)

Dursteler, Eric R., *Venetians in Constantinople: Nation, Identity and Coexistence in the Early Modern Mediterranean* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2006)

Easthope, Anthony, *Privileging Difference*, ed. by Catherine Belsey (Houndmills: Palgrave, 2002)

Eaton, Natasha, 'Between Mimesis and Alterity: Art, Gift, and Diplomacy in Colonial India, 1770-1800', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 46 (2004), 816-44

— — —, 'Nostalgia for the Exotic: Creating An Imperial Art in London, 1750-1793', *Eighteenth Century Studies*, 39 (2006), 227-50

Edmond, Rod, 'Missionaries on Tahiti, 1797-1840', in *Voyages and Beaches: Pacific Encounters, 1769-1840*, ed. by Alex Calder, Jonathan Lamb, and Bridget Orr (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1999), pp. 226-40

— — —, *Representing the South Pacific: Colonial Discourse from Cook to Gauguin* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997)

— — —, 'The Pacific / Tahiti: Queen of the South Sea Isles', in *The Cambridge Companion to Travel Writing*, ed. by Peter Hulme and Tim Youngs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 139-55

Elmarsafy, Ziad, *The Enlightenment Qur'an: The Politics of Translation and the Construction of Islam* (Oxford: Oneworld, 2009)

Elwood, Christopher, 'A Singular Example of the Wrath of God: The Use of Sodom in Sixteenth-Century Exegesis', *The Harvard Theological Review*, 98 (2005), 67-93

Fazioli, K. Patrick, 'The Erasure of the Middle Ages from Anthropology's Intellectual Genealogy', *History and Anthropology*, 25 (2014), 336-55

Feingold, Mordechai, '"The Turkish Alcoran": New Light on the 1649 English Translation of the Koran', *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 75 (2012), 475-501

Fernandez-Armesto, Felipe, *Before Columbus: Exploration and Colonisation from the Mediterranean to the Atlantic, 1229-1492* (Houndmills: Macmillan Education, 1987)

Fink, David C., 'Was There a "Reformation Doctrine of Justification"?', *Harvard Theological Review*, 103 (2010), 205-35

Finkel, Caroline, "'The Treacherous Cleverness of Hindsight': Myths of Ottoman Decay", in *Re-Orienting the Renaissance: Cultural Exchanges with the East*, ed. by Gerald MacLean (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 148-74

Firges, Pascal W., Tobias P. Graf, Christian Roth, and Gülay Tulasoğlu, eds., *Well-Connected Domains: Towards an Entangled Ottoman History* (Leiden: Brill, 2014)

Fischer, Steven Roger, *A History of the Pacific Islands* (New York: Palgrave, 2002)

Fitzpatrick, Martin Hugh, 'From Natural Law to Natural Rights? Protestant Dissent and Toleration in the Late Eighteenth Century', *History of European Ideas*, 40 (2014), 1-27

Flannery, John M., *The Mission of the Portuguese Augustinians to Persia and Beyond (1602-1747)* (Leiden: Brill, 2013)

Fleming, James Dougal, 'Introduction: The Invention of Discovery, 1500-1700', in *The Invention of Discovery, 1500-1700*, ed. by James Dougal Fleming (Ashgate: Farnham, 2011), pp. 1-13

— — —, 'Making Sense of Science and the Literal: Modern Semantics and Early Modern Hermeneutics', in *The Word and the World: Biblical Exegesis and Early Modern Science*, ed. by Kevin Killeen and Peter J. Forshaw (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007), pp. 26-45

Foran, John, 'The Long Fall of the Safavid Dynasty: Moving beyond the Standard Views', *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, 24 (1992), 281-304

Franklin, Colleen, "'An Habitation of Devils, a Domicill for Unclean Spirits, and a Den of Goblins": The Marvellous North in Early Modern English Literature', in *The Mysterious and the Foreign in Early Modern England*, ed. by Helen Ostovich, Mary V. Silcox, and Graham Roebuck (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2008), pp. 27-38

— — —, *The Strange and Dangerous Voyage of Captaine Thomas James: A Critical Edition* (Montreal: McGill Queen's University Press, 2013)

Franklin, Michael J., "'And the Celt Knew the Indian": Sir William Jones, Oriental Renaissance and Celtic Revival', in *English Romanticism and the Celtic World*, ed. by G. Carruthers and A. Rawes (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), pp. 20-37

— — —, 'Cultural Possession, Imperial Control, and Comparative Religion: The Calcutta Perspectives of Sir William Jones and Nathaniel Brassey Halhed', *The Yearbook of English Studies*, 32 (2002), 1-18

— — —, "'I Burn with a Desire of Seeing Shiraz": A New Letter from Sir William Jones to Hartford Jones', *The Review of English Studies*, 56 (2005), 749-57

— — —, *Orientalist Jones: Sir William Jones, Poet, Lawyer, and Linguist, 1746-1794* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011)

Frenz, Margaret, "'A Race of Monsters": South India and the British "Civilizing Mission" in the Later Eighteenth Century', in *Colonialism as Civilizing Mission: Cultural Ideology in British India*, ed. by Harald Fischer-Tine and Michael Mann (London: Anthem Press, 2004), pp. 49-67

Fuller, Mary C., "'His Dark Materials": The Problem of Dullness in Hakluyt's Collections', in *Richard Hakluyt and Travel Writing in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 231-43

- — —, *Voyages in Print: English Travel to America 1576-1624* (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995)
- Games, Alison, *The Web of Empire: English Cosmopolitans in an Age of Expansion, 1560-1660* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008)
- Garrett, John, *To Live Among the Stars: Christian Origins in Oceania* (Fiji: WCC Publications, 1982)
- Gaskill, Malcolm, 'The Pursuit of Reality: Recent Research into the History of Witchcraft', *The Historical Journal*, 51 (2008), 1069-88
- — —, 'Witchcraft and Power in Early Modern England: The Case of Margaret Moore', in *Women, Crime and the Courts in Early Modern England*, ed. by Garthine Walker and Jenny Kermode (London: Routledge, 1994), pp. 125-45
- Gates Jr., Henry Louis, 'Critical Fanonism', *Critical Inquiry*, 17 (1991), 475-90
- Gauguin, Paul, *Noa Noa: The Tahitian Journal*, trans. by O. F. Theis (New York: Dover, 1920)
- Gayk, Shannon, 'Early English Orthodoxies: Reading the English Reformations', *Journal of English and Germanic Philology*, 112 (2013), 495-510
- Gaynor, Jennifer L., 'Piracy in the Offing: The Law of Lands and The Limits of Sovereignty at Sea', *Anthropological Quarterly*, 85 (2012), 817-57
- Gelders, Raf, 'Genealogy of Colonial Discourse: Hindu Traditions and the Limits of European Representation', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 51 (2009), 563-89
- Gelders, Raf, and S. N. Balagangadhara, 'Rethinking Orientalism: Colonialism and the Study of Indian Traditions', *History of Religions*, 51 (2011), 101-28
- van Gent, Jacqueline, 'Current Trends in Historical Witchcraft Studies', *Journal of Religious History*, 35 (2011), 601-13
- Gerbig, Andrea, 'Key Words and Key Phrases in a Corpus of Travel Writing: From Early Modern English Literature to Contemporary "Blogs"', in *Keyness in Texts*, ed. by Marina Bondi and Mike Scott (Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 2010), pp. 147-68
- Ghobrial, John-Paul, *The Whispers of Cities: Information Flow in Istanbul, London and Paris in the Age of William Trumbull* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013)
- Ghosh, Durba, 'Household Crimes and Domestic Order: Keeping the Peace in Colonial Calcutta', *Modern Asian Studies*, 38 (2004), 599-623
- Gibson, Marion, *Reading Witchcraft: Stories of Early English Witches* (London and New York: Routledge, 1999)
- Ginzburg, Carlo, 'Deciphering the Sabbath', in *Early Modern European Witchcraft: Centres and Peripheries*, ed. by Bengt Ankarloo and Gustav Henningsen (Oxford: Clarendon, 1990), pp. 121-38
- — —, *The Cheese and the Worms: The Cosmos of a Sixteenth-Century Miller* (London: Routledge and Keegan Paul, 1980)
- Glaisyer, Natasha, 'Networking: Trade and Exchange in the Eighteenth-Century British Empire', *The Historical Journal*, 47 (2004), 451-76

Goldie, M., 'The Theory of Religious Intolerance in Restoration England', in *From Persecution to Toleration: The Glorious Revolution and Religion in England*, ed. by O. P. Grell, Jonathan Israel, and Nicholas Tyacke (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991), pp. 331-68

Goldstone, Jack A., 'The Problem of the "Early Modern" World', *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient*, 41 (1998), 249-84

Gommans, Jos J. L., *The Rise of the Indo-Afghan Empire, c.1710-1780* (Leiden: Brill, 1995)

Goodcole, Henry, 'The Witch of Edmonton', in *The Witch of Edmonton*, ed. by Peter Corbin and Douglas Sedge (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1999)

Goodman, Jennifer, *Chivalry and Exploration, 1298-1630* (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 1998)

Gordon, Bruce, 'The Authority of Antiquity: England and the Protestant Latin Bible', in *The Reception of Continental Reformation in Britain*, ed. by Polly Ha and Patrick Collinson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), pp. 1-22

Grafton, Anthony, April Shelford, and Nancy Siraisi, *New Worlds, Ancient Texts: The Power of Tradition and the Shock of Discovery* (Cambridge, MA and London: Harvard University Press, 1992)

Greenblatt, Stephen, *Marvellous Possessions: The Wonder of the New World* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991)

Greene, Molly, *A Shared World: Christians and Muslims in the Early Modern Mediterranean* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000)

Gregg, Stephen H., ed., *Empire and Identity: An Eighteenth Century Sourcebook* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005)

— — —, 'Introduction', in *Empire and Identity: An Eighteenth Century Sourcebook*, ed. by Stephen H. Gregg, (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 1-25

Gregory, Jeremy, 'Introduction: Transforming "the Age of Reason" into "an Age of Faiths": Or, Putting Religions and Beliefs (Back) into the Eighteenth Century', *Journal for Eighteenth-Century Studies*, 32 (2009), 287-305

Gribben, Crawford, 'Angels and Demons in Cromwellian and Restoration Ireland: Heresy and the Supernatural', *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 76 (2013), 377-92

Gross, Irena Grudzinska, 'The Tangled Tradition: Custine, Herberstein, Karamzin and the Critique of Russia', *Slavic Review*, 50 (1991), 989-98

de Gruchy, John, ed., *The London Missionary Society in Southern Africa, 1799-1999: Historical Essays in Celebration of the Bicentenary of the LMS in Southern Africa* (Athens: Ohio University Press, 2000)

Guest, Harriet, *Empire, Barbarism, and Civilisation: James Cook, William Hodges, and the Return to the Pacific* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007)

Guiley, Rosemary, *The Encyclopaedia of Witches, Witchcraft and Wicca* (New York: Infobase Publishing, 2008)

Gunson, Neil, 'An Account Of The Mamaia Or Visionary Heresy Of Tahiti, 1826-1841', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 71 (1962), 208-43

— — —, 'Great Women And Friendship Contract Rites In Pre-Christian Tahiti', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 73 (1964), 53-69

- — —, *Messengers of Grace: Evangelical Missionaries in the South Seas 1797-1860* (Melbourne and New York: Oxford University Press, 1978)
- Guskin, Phyllis, 'The Context of Witchcraft: The Case of Jane Wenham (1712)', *Eighteenth Century Studies*, 15 (1981), 48-71
- Guy, John, 'Monarchy and Counsel: Models of the State', in *The Sixteenth Century, 1485-1603*, ed. by Patrick Collinson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), pp. 113-44
- Hackforth-Jones, Jocelyn, and Mary Robert, 'Introduction: Visualising Culture across the Edges of Empires', in *Edges of Empire: Orientalism and Visual Culture*, ed. by Jocelyn Hackforth-Jones and Mary Robert (Oxford: Blackwell, 2005), pp. 1-19
- Hadfield, Andrew, *Literature, Travel and Colonial Writing in the English Renaissance, 1545-162* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1998)
- — —, 'Peter Martyr, Richard Eden and the New World: Reading, Experience and Translation', *Connotations*, 5 (1995), 1-22
- Hadfield, Andrew, and John McVeagh, eds., *Strangers to That Land: British Perceptions of Ireland from the Reformation to the Famine* (Gerrard's Cross: Rowman & Littlefield, 1994)
- Haefeli, Evan, 'Toleration', *Religion Compass*, 4/4 (2010), 253-62
- Haigh, Christopher, *English Reformations: Religion, Politics and Society under the Tudors* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1993)
- — —, 'Success and Failure in the English Reformation', *Past and Present*, 173 (2001), 28-49
- Hambrick-Stowe, Charles E., 'Practical Divinity and Spirituality', in *The Cambridge Companion to Puritanism*, ed. by John Coffey and Paul C. H. Lim (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), pp. 191-205
- Hampton, Timothy, 'Turkish Dogs, Rabelais, Erasmus and the Rhetoric of Alterity', *Representations*, 41 (1993), 58-82
- Harland-Jacobs, Jessica L., 'Incorporating the King's New Subjects: Accommodation and Anti-Catholicism in the British Empire, 1763-1815', *Journal of Religious History*, 39 (2014), 1-21
- Harper, James, 'Introduction', in *The Turk and Islam in the Western Eye, 1450-1750*, ed. by James G. Harper (Ashgate: Farnham, 2011), pp. 1-20
- Harrison, Peter, 'Miracles, Early Modern Science, and Rational Religion', *Church History*, 75 (2006), 493-510
- Hathaway, Jane, *Beshir Agha: Chief Eunuch of the Ottoman Imperial Harem* (Oxford: Oneworld, 2005)
- Haupt, Heinz-Gerhard, and Jürgen Kocka, eds., *Comparative and Transnational History* (Leamington Spa: Berghahn Books, 2012)
- Haydon, Colin, 'Parliament and Popery in England, 1700-1780', *Parliamentary History*, 19 (2000), 49-63
- Heehs, Peter, 'Shades of Orientalism: Paradoxes and Problems in Indian Historiography', *History and Theory*, 42 (2003), 169-95
- Helfers, James P., 'The Explorer or the Pilgrim? Modern Critical Opinion and the Editorial Methods of Richard Hakluyt and Samuel Purchas', *Studies in Philology*, 94 (1997), 160-87

- Hess, Andrew, *The Forgotten Frontier: A History of the Sixteenth Century Ibero-African Frontier* (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1978)
- Heyberger, Bernard, 'Eastern Christians, Islam, and the West: A Connected History', *International Journal of Middle Eastern Studies*, 42 (2010), 475-78
- Heyberger, Bernard, and Chantal Verdeil, 'Spirituality and Scholarship: The Holy Land in Jesuit Eyes (Seventeenth to Nineteenth Centuries)', in *New Faith in Ancient Lands. Western Missions in the Middle East in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries*, ed. by Heleen Murre-van den Berg (Leiden: Brill, 2006), pp. 19-41
- Hezel, Francis X., 'New Direction in Pacific History', *Pacific Studies*, 11 (1988), 101-10
- Hindmarsh, D. Bruce, *The Evangelical Conversion Narrative: Spiritual Autobiography in Early Modern England* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008)
- Hobsbawm, Eric, *Nations and Nationalism since 1780* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990)
- Höfele, Andreas, and Werner von Koppenfels, *Renaissance Go-Betweens: Cultural Exchange In Early Modern Europe* (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2005)
- Houston, Chloe, "'Thou Glorious Kingdome, Thou Chiefe of Empires": Persia in Early Seventeenth-Century Travel Literature', *Studies in Travel Writing*, 13 (2009), 141-52
- Howard, Jean E., 'An English Lass Among The Moors: Gender, Race, Sexuality and Nationality Identity in Heywood's *The Fair Maiden Of The West*', in *Women, 'Race' and Writing in the Early Modern Period*, ed. by Margo Hendricks and Patricia Parker (London and New York: Routledge, 1994), pp. 101-17
- Howe, K. R., *Nature, Culture, and History: The 'Knowing' of Oceania* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 2000)
- Hudson, Wayne, 'Atheism and Deism Demythologized', in *Atheism and Deism Revalued: Heterodox Religious Identities in Britain, 1650-1800*, ed. by Jeffrey R. Wigelsworth, Wayne Hudson, and Diego Lucci (Farnham: Ashgate, 2014), pp. 13-24
- — —, *Enlightenment and Modernity: The English Deists and Reform* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2009)
- — —, *The English Deists: Studies in Early Enlightenment* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2009)
- Hughes, Sean F., "'The Problem of 'Calvinism'": English Theologies of Predestination c. 1580-1630', in *Belief and Practice in Reformation England: A Tribute to Patrick Collinson from His Students*, ed. by Susan Wabuda and Caroline Litzenberger (Aldershot: Ashgate, 1998), pp. 229-49
- Hulme, Peter, and Tim Youngs, 'Introduction', in *The Cambridge Companion to Travel Writing*, ed. by Peter Hulme and Tim Youngs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 1-16
- — —, eds., *The Cambridge Companion to Travel Writing* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002)
- Hunter, Michael, 'The Problem of "Atheism" in Early Modern England', *Transactions of Royal Historical Society*, 35 (1985), 135-57

- Hunt, Lynn, Margaret Jacob, and Wijnand Mijnhardt, *The Book That Changed Europe: Picart and Bernard's Religious Ceremonies of the World* (Cambridge, MA and London: Harvard University Press, 2010)
- Hutchins, Zachary McLeod, 'Building Bensalem at Massachusetts Bay: Francis Bacon and the Wisdom of Eden in Early Modern New England', *The New England Quarterly*, 83 (2010), 577-606
- Hutton, Ronald, 'The Local Impact of the Tudor Reformations', in *The English Reformation Revised*, ed. by Christopher Haigh (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987), pp. 114-38
- — —, 'Witch-Hunting in Celtic Societies', *Past and Present*, 212 (2011), 43-77
- Huxley, Andrew, 'Positivists and Buddhists: The Rise and Fall of Anglo-Burmese Ecclesiastical Law', *Law & Social Enquiry*, 26 (2001), 113-42
- Hyamson, Albert M., 'The Lost Tribes, and the Influence of the Search for Them on the Return of the Jews to England', *The Jewish Quarterly Review*, 15 (1903), 640-76
- Irving, David R. M., 'Lully in Siam: Music and Diplomacy in French-Siamese Cultural Exchanges, 1680-1690', *Early Music*, XL (2012), 393-420
- Irwin, Robert, *For Lust of Knowing: The Orientalists and Their Enemies* (London: Penguin, 2006)
- Israel, Jonathan, *Enlightenment Contested: Philosophy, Modernity, and the Emancipation of Man, 1670-1752* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006)
- — —, *Radical Enlightenment: Philosophy and the Making of Modernity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001)
- Johnson, Carina L., *Cultural Hierarchy in Sixteenth-Century Europe: The Ottomans and Mexicans* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011)
- — —, 'Idoltrous Cultures and the Practice of Religion', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67 (2006), 597-621
- Johnston, Anna, 'British Missionary Publishing, Missionary Celebrity, and Empire', *Nineteenth-Century Prose*, 32 (2005), 20-47
- — —, 'Missionary Men: Forming Identities in Imperial Evangelical Britain', *Australasian Victorian Studies Journal*, 9 (2003), 89-105
- — —, *Missionary Writing and Empire, 1800-1860* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003)
- — —, 'The Book Eaters: Textuality, Modernity and the London Missionary Society', *Semeia*, 88 (1999), 13-40
- Jones, Aled, 'Culture, "Race" and the Missionary Public in Mid-Victorian Wales', *Journal of Victorian Culture*, 10 (2010), 157-83
- Jones, Norman, *The English Reformation: Religion and Cultural Adaptation* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2002)
- Jones, William, *The Collected Works of William Jones*, ed. by Garland Hampton Cannon, 13 vols. (Richmond: Curzon, 1993)
- Jütte, Daniel, 'Trading in Secrets: Jews and the Early Modern Quest for Clandestine Knowledge', *Isis*, 103 (2012), 668-86

Kaiser, Thomas, 'The Evil Empire? The Debate on Turkish Despotism in Eighteenth-Century French Political Culture', in *Early Modern Europe: Issues and Interpretations*, ed. by James B. Collins and Karen L. Taylor (Oxford: Blackwell, 2006), pp. 69-81

Kamps, Ivo, and Jyotsna G. Singh, 'Introduction', in *Travel Knowledge: European 'Discoveries' in the Early Modern Period*, ed. by Ivo Kamps and Jyotsna G. Singh (New York: Palgrave, 2001), pp. 1-17

— — —, eds., *Travel Knowledge: European 'Discoveries' in the Early Modern Period* (New York: Palgrave, 2001)

Kapila, Shruti, 'Race Matters: Orientalism and Religion, India and Beyond, c. 1770-1880', *Modern Asian Studies*, 41 (2007), 471-513

Kay, Dennis, 'Who Says "Miracles Are Past"? Some Jacobean Marvels and the Margins of the Known', in *Wonders, Marvels, and Monsters in Early Modern Culture*, ed. by Peter G Platt (Newark and London: Associated University Press, 1999), pp. 164-86

Kearney, H. F., 'Puritanism, Capitalism and the Scientific Revolution', *Past and Present*, 28 (1964), 81-101

Keary, Anne, 'Origins Stories: Missionary Projects and Colonial Translations in Tahiti, North-Western America and Eastern Australia', in *Decentring Empire: Britain, India and the Transcolonial World*, ed. by Durba Ghosh and Dane Kennedy (Hyderabad: Orient Longman, 2006), pp. 182-212

Kidd, Thomas S., "'Is It Worse to Follow Mahomet than the Devil?'" Early American Uses of Islam', *Church History*, 72 (2003), 766-90

Killeen, Kevin, 'Chastising with Scorpions: Reading the Old Testament in Early Modern England', *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 73 (2010), 491-506

Kivelson, Valerie A., 'Male Witches and Gendered Categories in Seventeenth-Century Russia', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 45 (2003), 606-31

Klein, Dietrich, 'Inventing Islam in Support of Christian Truth: Theodore Hackspan's Arabic Studies in Altdorf, 1642-6', *History of Universities*, 25 (2010), 26-55

Kooijman, Simon, 'Ancient Tahitian God-Figures', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 73 (1964), 110-25

Krstić, Tijana, *Contested Conversion to Islam: Narratives of Religious Change in the Early Modern Ottoman Empire* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2011)

— — —, 'Conversion and Converts to Islam in Ottoman Historiography of the Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries', in *Writing History at the Ottoman Court: Editing the Past, Fashioning the Future*, ed. by H. Erdem Çipa and Emine Fetvacı (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2013), pp. 58-79

Lalitha, Jayachitra, 'Did LMS Women Missionaries "Save" Native Women? Triple Colonisation of the Travancore Bible Women in the 19th Century', in *Construction of the Other, Identification of the Self: German Mission in India*, ed. by Martin Tamcke and Gladson Jathanna (Zurich and Berlin: Lit Verlag Münster, 2012), pp. 55-66

— — —, 'Postcolonial Feminism, The Bible and Native Indian Women', in *Evangelical Postcolonial Conversations: Global Awakenings in Theology and Praxis*, ed. by Kay Higuera Smith, Jayachitra Lalitha, and L. Daniel Hawk (Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press, 2014), pp. 75-87

- Lalor, Matthew, *Matthew Tindal, Freethinker: An Eighteenth Century Assault on Religion* (London: Continuum, 2006)
- Lamb, Jonathan, Vanessa Smith, and Nicholas Thomas, eds., *Exploration and Exchange: A South Seas Anthology 1680-1900* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2000)
- Lamb, Jonathan, Vanessa Smith, and Nicholas Thomas, 'Introductions', in *Exploration and Exchange: A South Seas Anthology 1680-1900* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2000), pp. xiii - xxv, 2-7, 120-22
- Landau, Paul, review of *The London Missionary Society in Southern Africa*, ed. by John de Gruchy, by John de Gruchy, *The International Journal of African Historical Studies*, 33 (2000), 703-5
- Lapidus, Ira M., *A History of Islamic Societies* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002)
- Lazarus, Neil, 'Transnationalism and the Alleged Death of the Nation-State', in *Cultural Readings of Imperialism: Edward Said and the Gravity of History*, ed. by Keith Ansell-Pearson, Benita Parry, and Judith Squires (London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1997), pp. 28-48
- Leach, E. R., 'The Frontiers of "Burma"', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 3 (1960), 49-68
- Leask, Nigel, *Curiosity and the Aesthetics of Travel-Writing, 1770-1840: 'From an Antique Land'* (Oxford: Clarendon, 2002)
- Ledger-Lomas, Michael, "'Glimpses of the Great Conflict": English Congregationalists and the European Crisis of Faith, circa 1840-1875', *Journal of British Studies*, 46 (2007), 826-60
- Levitin, Dmitri, 'From Sacred History to the History of Religion: Paganism, Judaism, and Christianity in European Historiography from Reformation to "Enlightenment"', *The Historical Journal*, 55 (2012), 1117-60
- Levy, Robert I., 'Tahiti Observed: Early European Impressions Of Tahitian Personal Style', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 77 (1968), 33-42
- Lieberman, Victor B., 'Ethnic Politics in Eighteenth-Century Burma', *Modern Asian Studies*, 12 (1978), 455-82
- Ligota, Christopher, and Jean-Louis Quantin, 'Introduction', in *History of Scholarship: A Selection of Papers from the Seminar on the History of Scholarship Held Annually at the Warburg Institute*, ed. by Christopher Ligota and Jean-Louis Quantin (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), pp. 1-38
- Lincoln, Bruce, 'Isaac Newton and Oriental Jones on Myth, Ancient History, and the Relative Prestige of Peoples', *History of Religions*, 42 (2002), 1-18
- Lindsay, Robert O., 'Richard Hakluyt and Of the Russe Common Wealth', *Bibliographic Society of America*, 57 (1963), 312-27
- Litzenberger, Caroline, 'Defining the Church of England: Religious Change in the 1570s', in *Belief and Practice in Reformation England: A Tribute to Patrick Collinson from His Students*, ed. by Susan Wabuda and Caroline Litzenberger (Aldershot: Ashgate, 1998), pp. 137-53
- Loades, David, *Revolution in Religion: The English Reformation 1530-1570* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1992)
- Lomas, Sophie Crawford, ed., *Calendar of State Papers Foreign, Elizabeth, 1558-1589: July 1583-July 1584*, 20 vols. (London: His Majesty's Stationery Office, 1914), xviii

- Loop, Jan, 'Johann Heinrich Hottinger (1620-1667) and the "Historia Orientalis"', *Church History and Religious Culture*, 88 (2008), 169-203
- López-Peláez Casellas, Jesús, "'Menne of Straunge Borders': Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis. An Introduction', in *The Construction of the Other in Early Modern Britain: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis*, ed. by Rüdiger Ahrens (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter, 2013), pp. 1-12
- Lovett, Richard, *The History of the London Missionary Society, 1795-1895*, 2 vols. (London: Henry Froude, 1899)
- Lowe, Kate J. P., 'Introduction: The Black African Presence in Renaissance Europe', in *Black Africans in Renaissance Europe*, ed. by Kate J. P. Lowe and Thomas Foster Earle (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), pp. 1-14
- Lowe, Lisa, *Critical Terrains: British and French Orientalisms* (New York: Cornell University Press, 1991)
- Lucci, Diego, *Scripture and Deism: The Biblical Criticism of the Eighteenth-Century British Deists* (Bern: Peter Lang, 2008)
- Luxon, Thomas, *Literal Figures, Puritan Allegory and the Reformation Crisis in Identity* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995)
- Lynch, Kathleen, *Protestant Autobiography in the Seventeenth-Century Anglophone World* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012)
- Mace, Emily, 'Comparative Religion and the Practice of Eclecticism: Intersections in Nineteenth-Century Liberal Religious Congregations', *The Journal of Religion*, 94 (2014), 74-96
- Mack, Phyllis, *Heart Religion in the British Enlightenment: Gender and Emotion in Early Methodism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008)
- — —, *Visionary Women: Ecstatic Prophecy in Seventeenth-Century England* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992)
- MacLean, Gerald, *Looking East: English Writing and the Ottoman Empire before 1800* (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007)
- — —, 'Ottomanism before Orientalism? Bishop Henry King Praises Henry Blount, Passenger', in *Travel Knowledge: European 'Discoveries' in the Early Modern Period*, ed. by Ivo Kamps and Jyotsna G. Singh (New York: Palgrave, 2001), pp. 75-96
- — —, ed., *Re-Orienting the Renaissance: Cultural Exchanges with the East* (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005)
- — —, *The Rise of Oriental Travel: English Visitors to the Ottoman Empire, 1580-1720* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004)
- MacLean, Gerald, and Nabil Matar, *Britain and the Islamic World, 1558-1713* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011)
- Majid, Anouar, *Unveiling Traditions: Postcolonial Islam in a Polycentric World* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2000)
- Maltby, William S., *The Black Legend in England: The Development of Anti-Spanish Sentiment, 1558-1660* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1971)

- Mancall, Peter C., 'What Fynes Morrison Knew', in *Bringing the World to Early Modern Europe: Travel Accounts and Their Audiences*, ed. by Peter C. Mancall (Leiden: Brill, 2007), pp. 1-10
- Mann, Michael, 'Dealing with Oriental Despotism: British Jurisdiction in Bengal, 1772-93', in *Colonialism as Civilizing Mission: Cultural Ideology in British India*, ed. by Harald Fischer-Tine and Michael Mann (London: Anthem Press, 2004), pp. 29-48
- Marchand, Suzanne L., *German Orientalism in the Age of Empire: Religion, Race and Scholarship* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009)
- Markley, Robert, ed., *The Far East and the English Imagination, 1600-1730* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006)
- Marshall, Peter, 'Ann Jeffries and the Fairies: Folk Belief and the War on Scepticism in Later Stuart England', in *The Extraordinary and the Everyday in Early Modern England: Essays in Celebration of the Work of Bernard Capp*, ed. by Angela McShane and Garthine Walker (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), pp. 127-41
- — —, '(Re)defining the English Reformation', *Journal of British Studies*, 48 (2009), 564-86
- — —, ed., *The Impact of the English Reformation, 1500-1640* (London and New York: Arnold, 1997)
- — —, 'The Naming of Protestant England', *Past and Present*, 214 (2012), 87-128
- Marshall, P. J., 'The Whites of British India, 1780-1830: A Failed Colonial Society', in *Trade and Conquest: Studies on the Rise of British Dominance in India*, ed. by P. J. Marshall (Brookfield: Varorium, 1993), pp. 26-44
- Marshall, P. J., and Glyndwr Williams, *The Great Map of Mankind: British Perceptions of the World in the Age of Enlightenment* (London: J. M. Dent & Sons, 1982)
- Matar, Nabil, 'Arab Views of Europeans, 1578-1727: The Western Mediterranean', in *Re-Orienting the Renaissance: Cultural Exchanges with the East*, ed. by Gerald MacLean (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 126-47
- — —, *Britain and Barbary, 1589-1689* (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2005)
- — —, 'Britons and Muslims in the Early Modern Period: From Prejudice to (a Theory Of) Toleration', in *Anti-Muslim Prejudice: Past and Present*, ed. by Maleiha Malik (London and New York: Routledge, 2010), pp. 7-25
- — —, 'Introduction', in *Piracy, Slavery and Redemption: Barbary Captivity Narratives from Early Modern England*, by Daniel J. Viktus (New York: Columbia University Press, 2001), pp. 1-52
- — —, *Islam in Britain 1558-1665* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998)
- — —, 'The Question of Occidentalism in Early Modern Morocco', in *Postcolonial Moves: Medieval through Modern*, ed. by Patricia Clare Ingham and Michelle R. Warren (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003), pp. 153-72
- — —, *Turks, Moors, and Englishmen in the Age of Discovery* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999)
- — —, 'Wives, Captive Husbands and Turks: The First Women Petitioners in Caroline England', *Explorations in Renaissance Culture*, 23 (1997), 111-29

Matthee, Rudi, 'Was Safavid Iran an Empire?', *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient*, 53 (2010), 233-65

Maude, H. E., 'Post-Spanish Discoveries In The Central Pacific', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 70 (1961), 67-111

Maxwell-Stuart, Peter, *The British Witch: The Biography* (Stroud: Amberley Publishing Ltd, 2014)

May, Andrew, and Patricia Grimshaw, eds., *Missionaries, Indigenous Peoples and Cultural Exchange* (Eastbourne: Sussex Academic Press, 2010)

Mazumdar, Sucheta, Vasant Kaiwar, and Thierry Labica, 'Introduction: From Orientalism to Postcolonialism: Asia, Europe and the Lineages of Difference', in *From Orientalism to Postcolonialism: Asia, Europe and the Lineages of Difference*, ed. by Sucheta Mazumdar, Vasant Kaiwar, and Thierry Labica (London: Routledge, 2009), pp. 1-16

McClintock, Anne, *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest* (New York and London: Routledge, 1995)

McEachern, Claire, *The Poetics of English Nationhood, 1590-1612* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007)

McJannet, Linda, 'Purchas His Pruning: Refashioning the Ottomans in Seventeenth-Century Travel Narratives', *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 74 (2011), 219-42

— — —, *The Sultan Speaks: Dialogue in English Plays and Histories about the Ottoman Turks* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006)

McLaren, Anne, 'Gender, Religion and Early Modern Nationalism: Elizabeth I, Mary Queen of Scots, and the Genesis of English Anti-Catholicism', *The American Historical Review*, 107 (2002), 739-67

Mears, Natalie, 'Public Worship and Political Participation in Elizabethan England', *Journal of British Studies*, 51 (2012), 4-25

Melman, Billie, *Women's Orients: English Women and the Middle East, 1718-1918: Sexuality, Religion and Work* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1995)

Meuwese, Mark, 'Subjects or Allies: The Contentious Status of the Tupi Indians in Dutch Brazil, 1625-1654', in *Bridging the Early Modern Atlantic World: People, Products and Practices on the Move*, ed. by Caroline A. Williams (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009), pp. 113-30

Mewshaw, Michael, 'Travel, Travel Writing and the Literature of Travel', *South Central Review*, 22 (2005), 2-10

Middell, Matthias, and Lluís Roura Aulinas, eds., *Transnational Challenges to National History Writing* (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012)

Millner, Matthew, *The Senses and the English Reformation* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2011)

Mitchell, Stephen A., 'A Case of Witchcraft Assault in Early Nineteenth-Century England as Ostensive Action', in *Witchcraft Continued: Popular Magic in Modern Europe*, ed. by Willem de Blecourt and Owen Davies (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 2004), pp. 14-28

— — —, 'Nordic Witchcraft in Transition: Impotence, Heresy and Diabolism in 14th-Century Bergen', *Scandia*, 63 (1997), 17-33

— — —, 'Witchcraft Persecutions in the Post-Craze Era: The Case of Ann Izzard of Great Paxton, 1808', *Western Folklore*, 59 (2000), 304-28

Mitter, Partha, 'Can We Ever Understand Alien Cultures? Some Epistemological Concerns Relating to the Perception And Understanding of the Other', *Comparative Criticism*, 9 (1987), 3-34

Monga, Luigi, 'Translating the Journey: A Literary Perspective on Truth in Cartography', in *Cross-Cultural Travel: Papers from the Royal Irish Academy International Symposium on Literature and Travel, National University of Ireland, November 2002*, ed. by Jane Conroy (Oxford: Peter Lang, 2003), pp. 11-30

Monter, E. William, 'Scandinavian Witchcraft in Anglo-American Perspective', in *Early Modern European Witchcraft: Centres and Peripheries*, ed. by Bengt Ankarloo and Gustav Henningsen (Oxford: Clarendon, 1990), pp. 425-34

Moore, R. A. Leslie, 'The Gods of the Hindus', *Journal of the East India Association*, New Series, VI (1915), 68-92

Morton, Margaret B. Graham, *The Jenkinson Story* (Glasgow: William MacLellan, 1962)

Müller, Sabine Lucia, 'William Harborne's Embassies: Scripting, Performing and Editing Anglo-Ottoman Diplomacy', in *Early Modern Encounters with the Islamic East: Performing Cultures*, ed. by Sabine Schülting, Sabine Lucia Müller, and Ralf Hertel (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 11-26

Mulsow, Martin, 'Idolatry and Science: Against Nature Worship from Boyle to Rudiger, 1680-1720', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67 (2006), 697-711

— — —, 'Socinianism, Islam and the Radical Uses of Arabic Scholarship', *Al-Quantara*, 31 (2010), 549-86

Nanda, Meera, *European Travel Accounts During the Reigns of Shahjahan and Aurangzeb* (Kurukshetra: Nirmal Book Agency, 1994)

Narveson, Kate, *Bible Readers and Lay Writers in Early Modern England: Genre and Self-Definition in an Emergent Writing Culture* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012)

Nayar, Pramod K., 'Marvellous Excesses: English Travel Writing and India, 1608-1727', *Journal of British Studies*, 44 (2005), 213-38

Netton, Ian Richard, 'The Mysteries of Islam', in *Exoticism in the Enlightenment*, ed. by George Sebastian Rousseau and Roy Porter (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1990), pp. 23-45

Newbury, Colin, 'Aspects Of Cultural Change In French Polynesia: The Decline Of The Ari''i', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 76 (1967), 7-26

— — —, *Tahiti Nui: Change and Survival in French Polynesia, 1767-1945* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1980)

— — —, 'Te Hau Pahu Rahi: Pomare II and the Concept of Inter-Island Government in Eastern Polynesia', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 76 (1967), 477-514

Nippel, Wilfried, 'Facts and Fiction: Greek Ethnography and its Legacy', *History and Anthropology*, 9 (1996), 125-38

Noonan, F. Thomas, *The Road to Jerusalem: Pilgrimage and Travel in the Age of Discovery* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007)

Notestein, Wallace, *History of Witchcraft in England From 1558-1718* (Washington: American Historical Association, 1909)

Nussbaum, Damian, 'Reviling the Saints or Reforming the Calendar? John Foxe and His "Kalendar" of Martyrs', in *Belief and Practice in Reformation England: A Tribute to Patrick Collinson from His Students*, ed. by Susan Wabuda and Caroline Litzenberger (Aldershot: Ashgate, 1998), pp. 113-36

Oates, Rosamund, 'Elizabethan Histories of English Christian Origins', in *Sacred History: Uses of the Christian Past in the Renaissance World*, ed. by Simon Ditchfield, Katherine van Liere, and Howard Louthan (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), pp. 165-85

O'Brien, Sheilagh Ilona, "[A] Solemne League and Contract with the Devill": Narratives of Sin and Desire in A True and Exact Relation (1645)', in *Sin and Salvation in Reformation England*, ed. by Jonathan Willis (Farnham: Ashgate, 2015), pp. 117-35

O'Donnell, Paris, 'Pilgrimage or "Anti-Pilgrimage"? Uses of Mementoes and Relics in English and Scottish Narratives of Travel to Jerusalem, 1596-1632', *Studies in Travel Writing*, 12 (2009), 125-39

Ogborn, Miles, *Indian Ink: Script and Print in the Making of the English East India Company* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2007)

— — —, 'Light from Darkness: The Problem of Evil in Early Modern England', *The Seventeenth Century*, 27 (2012), 389-409

Oliver, Douglas, *Ancient Tahitian Society*, 3 vols. (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1973)

Ord, Melanie, *Travel and Experience in Early Modern English Literature* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008)

Origo, Iris, 'The Domestic Enemy: The Eastern Slaves in Tuscany in the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries', *Speculum*, 30 (1955), 321-66

Oster, Emily, 'Witchcraft, Weather and Economic Growth in Renaissance Europe', *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 18 (2004), 215-28

Pagden, Anthony, *European Encounters With The New World: From Renaissance to Romanticism* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1993)

— — —, *The Fall of Natural Man: The American Indian and the Origins of Comparative Ethnology*, 2nd edn (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986)

Pailin, David Arthur, *Attitudes to Other Religions: Comparative Religion in Seventeenth and Eighteenth Century Britain* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1984)

Palmer, Daryl W., *Writing Russia in the Age of Shakespeare* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004)

Palmer, Patricia, *Language and Conquest in Early Modern Ireland: English Renaissance Literature and Elizabethan Imperial Expansion* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001)

Palmer, Philip S., "'All Suche Matters as Passed on This Vyage": Early English Travel Anthologies and the Case of John Sarra coll's Maritime Journal (1586-87)', *Huntingdon Library Quarterly*, 76 (2013), 325-44

Parker, Charles H., *Global Interactions in the Early Modern Age, 1400-1800* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010)

- Parker, Kenneth, ed., *Early Modern Tales of Orient: A Critical Anthology* (London and New York: Routledge, 1999)
- Parman, Susan, 'A Harrowing True Mysterious Pilgrimage Travel Adventure on the Road Less Travelled (by Bike/Camel/Motorcycle/Ultralight) into the Heart of a Dark Lost Island as Told by the Sole Survivor of a Zen Odyssey among Jaguars, Serpents, and Savages: Travel as Western Cultural Practice Revealed by the Titles of Travel Books', *Journeys*, 3 (2002), 50-60
- Parsons, Claire D., *Healing Practices in the South Pacific* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1995)
- Payne, Anthony, *Richard Hakluyt: A Guide to His Books and to Those Associated with Him, 1580-1625* (London: Bernard Quaritch, 2008)
- Peers, Douglas M., *India under Colonial Rule: 1700-1885* (Edinburgh: Pearson, 2006)
- Philips Jr., William D., 'Slavery in the Atlantic Islands and the Early Modern Spanish Atlantic World', in *The Cambridge World History of Slavery*, ed. by David Eltis and Stanley L. Engerman (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2011), III, 325-49
- Phillips, Kim, *Before Orientalism: Asian People and Cultures in European Travel Writing, 1245-1510* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013)
- Pickett, Holly Crawford, 'Dramatic Nostalgia and Spectacular Conversion in Dekker and Massinger's "The Virgin Martyr"', *Studies in English Literature, 1500-1900*, 49 (2009), 437-62
- Pignot, Hélène, 'A Trip to the Origins of Christianity: Sir Paul Rycaut's and Rev. Thomas Smith's Accounts of the Greek Church in the Seventeenth Century', *Studies in Travel Writing*, 13 (2009), 193-205
- Pinch, William R., 'Same Difference in India and Europe', *History and Theory*, 38 (1999), 389-407
- Pincus, Steven, 'The European Catholic Context of the Revolution of 1688-89: Gallicanism, Innocent XI, and Catholic Opposition', in *Shaping the Stuart World, 1603-1714: The Atlantic Connection*, ed. by A. I. MacInnes and A. H. Williamson (Leiden: Brill, 2006), pp. 79-114
- — —, 'The State and Civil Society in Early Modern England: Capitalism, Causation and Habermas's Bourgeois Public Sphere', in *The Politics of the Public Sphere in Early Modern England*, ed. by Steven Pincus and Peter Lake (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2007), pp. 213-31
- Pipes, Richard, and John V. A. Fine Jr., 'Introduction', in *Of the Russe Commonwealth*, ed. by Richard Pipes and John V. A. Fine Jr. (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1966)
- Poe, Marshall T., *A People Born to Slavery: Russia in Early Modern European Ethnography, 1476-1748* (New York: Cornell University Press, 2000)
- — —, ed., *Early Exploration of Russia*, 12 vols. (London: Routledge Curzon, 2003)
- Porter, Andrew, *Religion versus Empire?: British Protestant Missionaries and Overseas Expansion, 1700-1914* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2004)
- Porter, Chloe, "'I Satt and Saw': Negotiating the Gaze in the Travel Writings of Anthony Munday and Thomas Dallam", *Journeys*, 14 (2013), 50-68
- Porter, Dennis, 'Orientalism and Its Problems', in *Colonial Discourse and Postcolonial Theory: A Reader*, ed. by Laura Chrisman and Patrick Williams (Hemel Hempstead: Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1994), pp. 150-61

Prakash, Gyan, 'Edward Said in Bombay', in *Edward Said: Continuing The Conversation*, ed. by W.T. J. Mitchell and Homi Bhabha (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2005), pp. 135-41

— — —, 'Orientalism Now', *History and Theory*, 34 (1995), 199-212

Pratt, Mary Louise, *Imperial Eyes: Studies in Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992)

Purkiss, Diane, 'Sounds of Silence: Fairies and Incest in Scottish Witchcraft Stories', in *Languages of Witchcraft: Narrative, Ideology and Meaning in Early Modern Culture*, ed. by Stuart Clark (London: Routledge, 2000), pp. 81-98

Quadflieg, Helga, "'As Mannerly and Civil as Any in Europe": Early Modern Travel Writing and the Exploration of the English Self', in *Perspectives on Travel Writing*, ed. by Glenn Hooper and Tim Youngs (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004), pp. 27-40

Questier, Michael, *Conversion, Politics and Religion in England, 1580-1625* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996)

— — —, 'Loyalty, Religion and State Power in Early Modern England: English Romanism and the Jacobean Oath of Allegiance', *The Historical Journal*, 40 (1997), 311-29

Quinn, D. B., *The Hakluyt Handbook*, 2 vols. (London: Hakluyt Society, 1974)

Quinn, Frederick, *The Sum of All Heresies: The Image of Islam in Western Thought* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007)

Ramachandra, G. P., 'Captain Hiram Cox's Mission to Burma, 1796-1798: A Case of Irrational Behaviour in Diplomacy', *Journal of Southeast Asian Studies*, 12 (1981), 433-51

Raudvere, Catharina, 'Trolldómur in Early Medieval Scandinavia', in *The Athlone History of Witchcraft and Magic in Europe: The Middle Ages*, 6 vols. (London: Athlone Press, 2002), III, 73-172

Raudvere, Catharina, and Jens Peter Schjodt, eds., *More than Mythology: Narratives, Ritual Practices and Regional Distribution in Pre-Christian Scandinavian Religions* (Lund: Nordic Academic Press, 2012)

Redwood, J. A., 'Charles Blount (1654-93), Deism, and English Free Thought', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 35 (1974), 490-98

Richey, Russell E., 'From Puritanism to Unitarianism in England: A Study in Candour', *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 41 (1973), 371-85

Robbins, Joel, 'How Do Religions End? Theorizing Religious Traditions from the Point of View of How They Disappear', *Cambridge Anthropology*, 32 (2014), 2-15

Rocher, Rosane, 'Weaving Knowledge: Sir William Jones and Indian Pandits', in *Objects of Enquiry: The Life, Contributions, and Influences of Sir William Jones, 1746-1794*, ed. by Garland Hampton Cannon and Kevin R. Brine (New York: New York University Press, 1995), pp. 51-81

Roeber, A. G., 'The Waters of Rebirth: The Eighteenth Century and Transoceanic Protestant Christianity', *Church History*, 79 (2010), 40-76

Rogers, Edmund, '1688 and 1888: Victorian Society and the Bicentenary of the Glorious Revolution', *Journal of British Studies*, 50 (2012), 892-916

Rothman, E. Natalie, *Brokering Empire: Trans-Imperial Subjects between Venice and Istanbul* (New York: Cornell University Press, 2012)

Roy, Tirthankar, 'Where Is Bengal? Situating an Indian Region in the Early Modern World Economy', *Past and Present*, 213 (2011), 115-46

Rubiés, Joan Pau, 'Christianity and Civilization in Sixteenth-Century Ethnological Discourse', in *Shifting Cultures: Interaction and Discourse in the Expansion of Europe*, ed. by Henriette Bugge and Joan Pau Rubiés (Munster: Lit Verlag, 1995), pp. 35-60

— — —, 'Hugo Grotius's Dissertation on the Origin of the American Peoples and the Use of Comparative Methods', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 52 (1991), 221-44

— — —, 'Instructions for Travellers: Teaching the Eye to See', *History and Anthropology*, 9 (1996), 139-91

— — —, ed., *Medieval Ethnographies: European Perceptions of the World Beyond* (Farnham: Ashgate Variorum, 2009)

— — —, 'Theology, Ethnography and the Historicization of Idolatry', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67 (2006), 571-96

— — —, *Travel and Ethnology in the Renaissance: South India through European Eyes, 1250-1625* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000)

— — —, *Travellers and Cosmographers: Studies in the History of Early Modern Travel and Ethnology* (Aldershot: Ashgate Variorum, 2007)

Rubiés, Joan Pau, and Jas Elsner, eds., *Voyages and Visions: Towards a Cultural History of Travel* (London: Reaktion Books, 1999)

Ruiz Mas, José, 'Another Brick in the Wall of the Turkish Black Legend: The Fall of Nicosia and Its Impact in English Literature', in *The Construction of the Other in Early Modern Britain: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis*, ed. by Rüdiger Ahrens (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter, 2013), pp. 189-204

— — —, 'The Image of the Great Turk after the Ottoman Conquest of Famagusta and Marc Antonio Bragadino's Martyrdom: From Its Genesis in the Anti-Turkish Propaganda of Venetian Narratives and Chronicles to Its Impact in English Literature', in *Strangers in Early Modern English Texts*, ed. by Jesús López-Peláez Casellas (Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, 2011), pp. 171-90

Ryan, Michael T., 'Assimilating New Worlds in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 23 (1981), 519-38

Ryrie, Alec, *Being Protestant in Reformation Britain* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013)

Said, Edward W., *Identity, Authority and Freedom: The Potentate and the Traveller* (Cape Town: University of Cape Town, 1991)

— — —, *Orientalism: Western Conceptions of the Orient* (London and New York: Penguin, 1978)

— — —, 'Travelling Theory', in *The Edward Said Reader*, ed. by Moustafa Bayoumi and Andrew Rubin (New York: Random House, 2000), pp. 195-217

— — —, 'Travelling Theory Reconsidered', in *The Edward Said Reader*, ed. by Moustafa Bayoumi and Andrew Rubin (New York: Random House, 2000), pp. 436-52

- Sanson, Jane, 'Translation Teams: Missionaries, Islanders, and the Reduction of Language in the Pacific', in *Missionaries, Indigenous Peoples and Cultural Exchange*, ed. by Patricia Grimshaw and Andrew May (Eastbourne: Sussex Academic Press, 2010), pp. 96-109
- Sapra, Rahul, 'Orientalism of Capitalism: Warren Hastings and the Rhetoric of Empire', in *Tall Tales and True: India, Historiography and British Imperial Imaginings*, ed. by Kate Brittlebank (Clayton: Monash University Press, 2008), pp. 8-19
- — —, *The Limits of Orientalism: Seventeenth Century Representations of India* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2011)
- Schleck, Julia, 'Forming Knowledge: Natural Philosophy and English Travel Writing', in *Travel Narratives, the New Science and Literary Discourse, 1569-1750*, ed. by Judy A. Hayden (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 53-70
- — —, 'Forming the Captivity of Thomas Saunders: Hakluyt's Editorial Practices and Their Ideological Effects', in *Richard Hakluyt and Travel Writing in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 129-38
- — —, '"Plain Broad Narratives of Substantial Facts": Credibility, Narrative and Hakluyt's Principall Navigations', *Renaissance Quarterly*, 59 (2006), 768-94
- — —, *Telling True Tales of Islamic Lands: Forms of Mediation in English Travel Writing, 1575-1630* (Cranbury: Susquehanna University Press, 2011)
- Schmidt, Gary, *Renaissance Hybrids: Culture and Genre in Early Modern England* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2013)
- Schmitt, Robert C., 'Missionary "Censuses" of Tahiti, 1797-1830', *Journal of the Polynesian Society*, 76 (1967), 27-34
- Schochet, Gordon J., 'Patriarchalism, Politics and Mass Attitudes in Stuart England', *The Historical Journal*, 12 (1969), 413-41
- Schuger, Deborah, *The Renaissance Bible: Scholarship, Sacrifice, and Subjectivity* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1994)
- Schulman, Alex, *The Secular Contract: The Politics of Enlightenment* (New York: Continuum, 2011)
- Schultz, Albert J., 'John Davies's Hibernia Journal: Missing Epsilons and the Tongan Presence', *The Journal of Pacific History*, 15 (1980), 108-9
- — —, 'Urbanization in French Polynesia', *Land Economics*, 38 (1962), 71-75
- Sell, Jonathan P. A., *Rhetoric and Wonder in English Travel Writing, 1560-1613* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2006)
- Selwood, Jacob, *Diversity and Difference in Early Modern London* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2010)
- Shapin, Steven, *A Social History of Truth: Civility and Science in Seventeenth-Century England* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994)
- Sharpe, James, *Witchcraft in Early Modern England* (New York: Longman, 2001)
- Sheehan, Jonathan, 'Introduction: Thinking about Idols in Early Modern Europe', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67 (2006), 561-69
- — —, 'Sacred and Profane: Idolatry, Antiquarianism and the Polemics of Distinction in the Seventeenth Century', *Past and Present*, 192 (2006), 35-67

— — —, 'The Altars of the Idols: Religion, Sacrifice, and the Early Modern Polity', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 67 (2006), 649-73

Shell, Alison, *Catholicism, Controversy and the English Literary Imagination, 1558-1660* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999)

Sheppard, Kenneth, 'Atheism, Apostasy, and the Afterlives of Francis Spira in Early Modern England', *The Seventeenth Century*, 27 (2012), 410-34

Sherman, William H., 'Settings and Searchings (1500-1700)', in *The Cambridge Companion to Travel Writing*, ed. by Peter Hulme and Tim Youngs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 17-36

Shoemaker, Nancy, *A Strange Likeness: Becoming Red and White in Eighteenth-Century North America* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004)

Sievers, Julie, 'Drowned Pens and Shaking Hands: Sea Providence Narratives in Seventeenth-Century New England', *William and Mary Quarterly*, 63 (2006), 743-76

Sivasundaram, Sujit, *Nature and the Godly Empire: Science and Evangelical Mission in the Pacific, 1795-1850* (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005)

Skilliter, Susan A., *William Harborne and the Trade with Turkey, 1578-1582: A Documentary Study of the First Anglo-Ottoman Relations* (London: Oxford University Press, 1977)

Smith, Bernard, *European Vision and the South Pacific 1768-1850: A Study in the History of Art and Ideas*, 2nd edn (London: Oxford University Press, 1960)

Smith, Helen, 'Metaphor, Cure and Conversion in Early Modern England', *Renaissance Quarterly*, 67 (2014), 472-502

Smith, Vanessa, *Intimate Strangers: Friendship, Exchange and Pacific Encounters* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010)

— — —, *Literary Culture and the Pacific: Nineteenth-Century Textual Encounters* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998)

Sood, Gagan D. S., 'Circulation and Exchange in Islamicate Eurasia: A Regional Approach to the Early Modern World', *Past and Present*, 212 (2011), 113-62

Sörlin, Per, *Wicked Arts: Witchcraft and Magic Trials in Southern Sweden, 1635-1754* (Leiden: Brill, 1999)

Sowerby, Scott, 'Forgetting the Repealers: Religious Toleration and Historical Amnesia in Late Stuart England', *Past and Present*, 215 (2012), 85-123

— — —, 'Opposition to Anti-Popery in Restoration England', *Journal of British Studies*, 51 (2012), 26-49

Spence, Martin, *Heaven on Earth: Reimagining Time and Eternity in Nineteenth-Century British Evangelism* (Eugene: Pickwick Publications, 2015)

Spinks, Bryan D., *Freedom or Order? The Eucharistic Liturgy in English Congregationalism 1645-1980* (Allison Park: Pickwick Publications, 1984)

Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty, *A Critique of Postcolonial Reason: Toward a History of the Vanishing Present* (Cambridge, MA and London: Harvard University Press, 1999)

- Spurr, John, “‘Rational Religion’ in Restoration England”, *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 49 (1988), 563-85
- — —, ‘The English “Post-Reformation”?’’, *The Journal of Modern History*, 74 (2002), 101-19
- Stafford, Barbara Maria, *Voyages into Substance: Art, Science, Nature, and the Illustrated Travel Account, 1760-1840* (Cambridge, MA and London: The MIT Press, 1984)
- Stagl, Justin, and Christopher Pinney, ‘Introduction: From Travel Writing to Ethnography’, *History and Anthropology*, 9 (1996), 121-24
- Stallybrass, Peter, ‘Books and Scrolls: Navigating the Bible’, in *Books and Readers in Early Modern England*, ed. by Jennifer Andersen and Elizabeth Sauer (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2002), pp. 42-79
- Stark, Laura, ‘Narrative and the Social Dynamics of Magical Harm in the Late Nineteenth- and Early Twentieth-Century Finland’, in *Witchcraft Continued: Popular Magic in Modern Europe*, ed. by Willem de Blecourt and Owen Davies (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 2004), pp. 69-88
- Stevens, Laura M., ‘Why Read Sermons? What Americanists Can Learn from the Sermons of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts’, *History Compass*, 3 (2005), 1-19
- Stevens, Paul, and Rahul Sapra, ‘Akbar’s Dream: Mughal Toleration and English/British Orientalism’, *Modern Philology*, 104 (2007), 379-411
- Stolzenberg, Daniel, ed., *The Great Art of Knowing: The Baroque Encyclopaedia of Athanasius Kircher* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001)
- Stout, Felicity, “‘The Strange and Wonderful Discoverie of Russia’: Hakluyt and Censorship’, in *Richard Hakluyt and Travel Writing in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Daniel Carey and Claire Jowitt (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 153-63
- Stroumsa, Guy G., ‘John Spenser and the Roots of Idolatry’, *History of Religions*, 41 (2001), 1-23
- Subrahmanyam, Sanjay, *Three Ways to Be Alien: Travails and Encounters in the Early Modern World* (Waltham: Brandeis University Press, 2011)
- Suggett, Richard, *A History of Magic and Witchcraft in Wales* (Brimscombe: The History Press, 2008)
- Sullivan, Ceri, ‘Disposable Elements? Indications of Genre in Early Modern Titles’, *The Modern Language Review*, 102 (2007), 641-53
- Suranyi, Anna, *The Genius of the English Nation: Travel Writing and National Identity in Early Modern England* (Cranbury: Associated University Press, 2008)
- Tagliacozzo, Eric, ‘Strange Parallels and the Big Picture: “Asia” Writ Large Over a Turbulent Millennium’, *The Journal of Asian Studies*, 70 (2011), 939-63
- Talvet, Jüri, “‘Self’ and ‘Other’: Thinking with Montaigne, Liiv and Lotman’, in *The Construction of the Other in Early Modern Britain: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis*, ed. by Rüdiger Ahrens (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter, 2013), pp. 13-26
- Tavakoli-Targhi, Mohamad, *Refashioning Iran: Orientalism, Occidentalism and Historiography* (Normal: Palgrave Macmillan, 2001)

- Tejirian, Eleanor H., and Reeva Spector Simon, *Conflict, Conquest, and Conversion: Two Thousand Years of Christian Missions in the Middle East* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2014)
- Teltscher, Kate, 'India / Calcutta: City of Palaces and Dreadful Night', in *The Cambridge Companion to Travel Writing*, ed. by Peter Hulme and Tim Youngs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 191-206
- — —, *India Inscribed: European and British Writing on India 1600-1800* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1995)
- Testa, Simon, 'Travellers' Accounts, Historians and Ambassadors in the Sixteenth Century', in *Cross-Cultural Travel: Papers from the Royal Irish Academy International Symposium on Literature and Travel, National University of Ireland, November 2002*, ed. by Jane Conroy (Oxford: Peter Lang, 2003), pp. 31-38
- Thauvette, Chantelle, 'Masculinity and Turkish Captivity in Swetnam, the Woman-Hater', *Studies in English Literature 1500-1900*, 52 (2012), 425-45
- Thorne, Susan, *Congregational Missions and the Making of an Imperial Culture in Nineteenth-Century England* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1999)
- Tillotson, Giles, *The Artificial Empire: The Indian Landscapes of William Hodges* (Richmond: Curzon, 2000)
- Tinkle, Theresa, 'God's Chosen Peoples: Christians and Jews in the Book of John Mandeville', *The Journal of English and Germanic Philology*, 113 (2014), 443-71
- Tobin, Beth Fowkes, *Picturing Imperial Power: Colonial Subjects in Eighteenth Century British Painting* (Duke University Press, 1999)
- Todorov, Tzvetan, *The Conquest of America: The Question of the Other*, trans. by Richard Howard (New York: Harper Perennial, 1992)
- Todorov, Tzvetan, and Richard M. Berrong, 'The Origin of Genres', *New Literary History*, 8 (1976), 159-70
- Toivo, Raisa Maria, 'Marking (dis)order: Witchcraft and the Symbolics of Hierarchy in Late Seventeenth- and Early Eighteenth-Century Finland', in *Beyond the Witch Trials: Witchcraft and Magic in Enlightenment Europe*, ed. by Owen Davies and Willem de Blecourt (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 2004), pp. 9-25
- Toledano, Ehud R., 'Enslavement in the Ottoman Empire in the Early Modern Period', in *The Cambridge World History of Slavery*, ed. by David Eltis and Stanley L. Engerman (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2011), III, 25-46
- Tomlinson, Gary, *The Singing of the New World: Indigenous Voice in the Era of European Contact* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009)
- Toomer, G. J., *Eastern Wisdom and Learning: The Study of Arabic in Seventeenth-Century England* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1996)
- Trautmann, Thomas R., 'Does India Have History? Does History Have India?', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 54 (2012), 174-205
- Travers, Robert, *Ideology and Empire in Eighteenth-Century India* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007)
- — —, 'The Eighteenth Century in Indian History', *Eighteenth Century Studies*, 40 (2007), 492-508

Trompf, Garry W., 'New Religious Movements in Oceania', *Nova Religio: The Journal of Alternative and Emergent Religions*, 18 (2015), 5-15

Tschurennev, Jane, 'Between Non-Interference in Matters of Religion and the Civilizing Mission: The Prohibition of Suttee in 1829', in *Colonialism as Civilizing Mission: Cultural Ideology in British India*, ed. by Harald Fischer-Tine and Michael Mann (London: Anthem Press, 2004), pp. 68-91

Tuson, Penelope, *The Records of the British Residency and Agencies in the Persian Gulf* (London: India Office Library and Records, 1979)

Tyacke, Nicholas, *Anti-Calvinists: The Rise of English Arminianism, c. 1590-1640* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1990)

Valensi, Lucette, 'The Making of A Political Paradigm: The Ottoman State and Oriental Despotism', in *The Transmission of Culture in Early Modern Europe*, ed. by Anthony Grafton and Ann Blair (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1990), pp. 173-203

Varisco, Daniel Martin, *Reading Orientalism: Said and the Unsaid* (Washington: University of Washington Press, 2007)

Veléz, Rafael, 'Imperial Moments: The Cromwellian Black Legend', in *The Construction of the Other in Early Modern Britain: Attraction, Rejection, Symbiosis*, ed. by Rüdiger Ahrens (Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter, 2013), pp. 205-15

Viktus, Daniel J., ed., *Piracy, Slavery and Redemption: Barbary Captivity Narratives from Early Modern England* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2001)

— — —, *Turning Turk: English Theater And The Multicultural Mediterranean, 1570-1630* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003)

— — —, 'Turning Turk in Othello: The Conversion and Damnation of the Moor', *Shakespeare Quarterly*, 48 (1997), 145-76

Vogel, Klaus A., 'Cultural Variety in a Renaissance Perspective: Johannes Boemus on "The Manners, Laws and Customs of All People" (1520)', in *Shifting Cultures: Interaction and Discourse in the Expansion of Europe*, ed. by Joan Pau Rubiés (Munster: Lit Verlag, 1995), pp. 17-34

Waraich, Saleema, 'Competing and Complementary Visions of the Court of the Great Mogor', in *Seeing Across Cultures in the Early Modern World*, ed. by Dana Liebsohn and Jeanette Favrot Peterson (Farnham: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 73-96

Wagoner, Philip B., 'Precolonial Intellectuals and the Production of Colonial Knowledge', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 45 (2003), 783-814

Walker, Garthine, 'The Strangeness of the Familiar: Witchcraft and the Law in Early Modern England', in *The Extraordinary and the Everyday in Early Modern England: Essays in Celebration of the Work of Bernard Capp*, ed. by Angela McShane and Garthine Walker (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), pp. 105-24

Wallace, David, *Premodern Places: Calais to Surinam, Chaucer to Aphra Behn* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2004)

Walsham, Alexandra, *Providence in Early Modern England* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999)

— — —, 'The Godly and Popular Culture', in *The Cambridge Companion to Puritanism*, ed. by John Coffey and Paul C. H. Lim (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), pp. 277-93

— — —, *The Reformation of the Landscape: Religion, Identity and Memory in Early Modern Britain and Ireland* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011)

Wang, Ning, 'Orientalism and Occidentalism', *New Literary History*, 28 (1997), 57-67

Warren, James Francis, *The Sulu Zone, 1768-1898: The Dynamics of External Trade, Slavery, and Ethnicity in the Transformation of a Southeast Asian Maritime State*, 2nd edn (Singapore: National University of Singapore Press, 1981)

Webster, Anthony, 'Business and Empire: A Reassessment of the British Conquest of Burma in 1885', *The Historical Journal*, 43 (2000), 1003-25

Werner, Michael, and Bénédicte Zimmermann, 'Beyond Comparison', *History Theory*, 45 (2006), 30-50

Werner, Winter Jade, 'William Ellis, John Williams, and the Role of History in Missionary Nation-Making', *The Journal of the Midwest Modern Language Association*, 46 (2013), 71-91

Whitford, David M., *The Curse of Ham in the Early Modern Era: The Bible and the Justifications for Slavery* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009)

Wigelsworth, Jeffrey R., *Deism in Enlightenment England: Theology, Politics and Newtonian Public Science* (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 2009)

Wigelsworth, Jeffrey R., Wayne Hudson, and Diego Lucci, eds., *Atheism and Deism Revalued: Heterodox Religious Identities in Britain, 1650-1800* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2014)

Wilby, Emma, *Cunning Folk and Familiar Spirits: Shamanistic Visionary Traditions in Early Modern British Witchcraft and Magic* (Brighton: Sussex Academic Press, 2005)

Willen, Diane, "'Communion of the Saints': Spiritual Reciprocity and the Godly Community in Early Modern England", *Albion: A Quarterly Journal Concerned with British Studies*, 27 (1995), 19-41

Williamson, Arthur H., 'An Empire to End Empire: The Dynamic of Early Modern British Expansion', *Huntington Library Quarterly*, 68 (2005), 227-56

Willumsen, Liv Helene, *Witches of the North: Scotland and Finnmark* (Leiden: Brill, 2013)

Witteck, Paul, 'The Turkish Documents in Hakluyt's Voyages', *Historical Research*, 19 (1942), 121-39

Wolff, Larry, 'The Traveller's View of Central Europe: Gradual Transitions and Degrees of Difference in European Borderlands', in *Shatterzone of Empires: Coexistence and Violence in the German, Habsburg, Russian and Ottoman Borderlands*, ed. by Omar Bartov and Eric D. Weitz (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2013), pp. 23-42

Woodward, Wendy, 'The Petticoat and the Kaross: Missionary Bodies and the Feminine in the London Missionary Society, 1816-1828', *Kronos*, 23 (1996), 91-107

Woolf, Daniel Robert, "'Of Danes and Giants': Popular Beliefs about the Past in Early Modern England", *Dalhousie Review*, 71 (1991), 166-209

Wootton, David, 'Unbelief in Early Modern Europe', *History Workshop*, 20 (1985), 82-100

Worden, Blair, 'Providence and Politics in Cromwellian England', *Past and Present*, 109 (1985), 55-99

Wykes, David L., 'Introduction: Parliament and Dissent from the Restoration to the Twentieth Century', *Parliamentary History*, 24 (2005), 1-26

Yelle, Robert A., 'The Hindu Moses: Christian Polemics Against Jewish Ritual and the Secularization of Hindu Law Under Colonialism', *History of Religions*, 49 (2009), 141-71

Young, Robert, *Postcolonialism: An Historical Introduction* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2001)

Zika, Charles, *Exorcising Our Demons: Magic, Witchcraft, and Visual Culture in Early Modern Europe* (Leiden: Brill Academic Publishers, 2003)

— — —, *The Appearance of Witchcraft: Print and Visual Culture in Sixteenth Century Europe* (London and New York: Routledge, 2007)

Unpublished Dissertations & Conference Papers

Carey, Daniel, 'Richard Hakluyt as Editor', in *The Hakluyt Society Annual Lecture* (London: Hakluyt Society, 2012), pp. 1-28

Howgego, Raymond, 'Invented and Apocryphal Narratives of Travel from Ancient Egypt to the Present Day', in *The Hakluyt Society Annual Lecture* (London: Hakluyt Society, 2010), pp. 1-17

Jessop, Maia Kerr, 'Unwrapping Gods: Encounters with Gods and Missionaries in Tahiti and the Austral Islands 1797-1830' (unpublished PhD thesis, University of East Anglia, 2007), <uk.bl.ethos.490367> [accessed 31 October 2012]

Meshkat, K., 'The Journey of Master Anthony Jenkinson to Persia (1562)' (unpublished Cand. Philol. Degree, University of Oslo, 2005), <https://www.academia.edu/611698/The_journey_of_Master_Anthony_Jenkinson_to_Persia_1562_Publisert_ar_2005_Dokumenttype_Hovedoppgave_Sprak_Engelsk> [accessed 2 December 2013]

Oldridge, Darren, "'Doubtful Spirits": Fairies, Imps and Demons in Early Modern England' (presented at the Magic and the Supernatural in the Medieval and Early Modern Periods, Cardiff University: unpublished paper, 2015)

Ryrie, Alec, 'Faith, Doubt and the Problem of "Atheism" in Early Modern Britain.', in *Society of Renaissance Studies 4th Annual Welsh Lecture 2015* (presented at the Society for Renaissance Studies 4th Welsh Lecture, Cardiff University: unpublished paper, 2015)

Schmuck, Stephen, 'Politics of Anxiety: The Imago Turci in Early Modern English Prose c. 1550-1620' (unpublished PhD thesis, University of Wales, Aberystwyth, 2007), <<http://hdl.handle.net/2160/1938>> [accessed 31 October 2012]

Wigelsworth, Jeffrey R., "'Their Grosser Degrees of Infidelity": Deists, Politics, Natural Philosophy, and the Power of God in Eighteenth-Century England' (unpublished PhD thesis, University of Saskatchewan, 2005)

Online Sources

Anjaria, Dhara, 'Someone Else's Empire: European Colonialisms in South East Asia, 1800 to 1914', *Middle Ground Journal*, 2012, <<http://www2.css.edu/app/depts/HIS/historyjournal/index.cfm?name=Review-Essay%3A-Someone-Else's-Empire%3A-European-Colonialisms-in-South-East-Asia%2C-1800-to-1914&cat=7&art=121>> [accessed 10 January 2013]

- Appleby, John H., 'Jenkinson, Anthony (1529-1610/11)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2011, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/14736>> [accessed 6 September 2011]
- Baldwin, R.C.D., 'Aldersey, Laurence', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2012, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/302>> [accessed 24 January 2012]
- Burton, Jonathan, 'Review of The Rise of Oriental Travel: English Visitors to the Ottoman Empire, 1580-1720, by Gerald MacLean (review 406)', *Reviews in History*, 2009, <<http://www.history.ac.uk/reviews/review/406>> [accessed 10 September 2012]
- Carey, Daniel, *Establishing Credibility in Early Modern Travel: Authors, Readers, and the Problem of Belief* (Helsinki Collegium, 2015), <<http://vn-rec.it.helsinki.fi/tcs/?id=53E28634-C090-43B6-AD20-1674553F57A4>> [accessed 15 October 2015]
- Chancellour, Richard, 'The Booke of the Great and Mighty Emperor of Russia, and Duke of Muscouia, and of the Dominions Orders and Commodities Thereunto Belonging: Drawen by Richard Chancelour', *The Principal Navigations, Voyages, Traffiques and Discoveries of the English Nation*, by Richard Hakluyt, 2014, <<http://ebooks.adelaide.edu.au/h/hakluyt/voyages/v03/chapter5.html#chapter5>> [accessed 18 March 2014]
- Cust, L. H., 'Hodges, William', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2009, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/13425>> [accessed 21 December 2012]
- Gjerde, Tor, 'Sámi Drums or Runebommer', *Sámi Drums*, [no date], <<http://old.no/samidrum/>> [accessed 22 January 2012]
- Goodwin, George, 'Franklin, William', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/10081>> [accessed 21 December 2012]
- Hakluyt, Richard, 'The Principal Navigations [Digital Full-Text Edition]', *University of Adelaide eBooks*, 1589; 2014, <<http://ebooks.adelaide.edu.au/h/hakluyt/>> [accessed 6 September 2011]
- Hodges, William, *A View of the Monuments of Easter Island [Rapanui]*, c 1776, <<http://collections.rmg.co.uk/collections/objects/13275.html>> [accessed 9 December 2015]
- Jowitt, Claire, and Daniel Carey, 'The Richard Hakluyt "Principal Navigations" Editorial Project', *University of Southampton*, 2012, <http://www.southampton.ac.uk/english/research/projects/hakluyt_editorial_project.page> [accessed 19 October 2015]
- Kent, Christopher, 'Dallam, Thomas', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/7030>> [accessed 26 October 2012]
- Laughton, J. K., 'Forrest, Thomas', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2015, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/9891>> [accessed 8 November 2015]
- Lock, Julian, 'Randolph, Thomas (1525/6-1590)', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/23122>> [accessed 24 July 2012]
- Marshall, P. J., 'Hastings, Warren', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2008, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/12587>> [accessed 18 October 2013]
- Matar, Nabil, 'Blount, Sir Henry', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/2687>> [accessed 21 September 2012]

- McConnell, Anita, 'Pitts, Joseph', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2010, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/22345>> [accessed 3 December 2013]
- McDermott, James, 'Chancellor, Richard', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.odnb.com/view/article/5099>> [accessed 18 June 2015]
- — —, 'Lok, Sir William', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2008, <<http://www.odnb.com/view/article/16951>> [accessed 18 June 2015]
- — —, 'Willoughby, Sir Hugh', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/29599>> [accessed 18 October 2011]
- Morrison, Stuart, 'Mapping the Religious Landscape of Early Modern Europe', *Canterbury Cathedral Library*, 2015, <<http://www.canterbury-cathedral.org/2015/07/01/mapping-the-religious-landscape-of-early-modern-europe/>> [accessed 4 July 2015]
- Muravchik, Joshua, 'Enough Said: The False Scholarship of Edward Said', *World Affairs*, March/April 2013, <<http://www.worldaffairsjournal.org/article/enough-said-false-scholarship-edward-said>> [accessed 2 September 2014]
- Munro, Lucy, 'Fletcher, Giles, the Elder', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2008, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/9726>> [accessed 12 February 2014]
- Ngai, Mae M., 'Promises and Perils of Transnational History', *Perspectives on History*, 2012, <<https://www.historians.org/publications-and-directories/perspectives-on-history/december-2012/the-future-of-the-discipline/promises-and-perils-of-transnational-history>> [accessed 26 October 2015]
- Peers, Douglas M., 'Symes, Michael', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/26880>> [accessed 12 September 2013]
- Smirke, Robert, *The Cession of the District of Matavai in the Island of Otaheité to Captain James Wilson, for the Use of the Missionaries of the London Missionary Society*, 1 January 1803, <<http://www.gac.culture.gov.uk/work.aspx?obj=17048>> [accessed 27 July 2015]
- Sorley, W. R., 'Berkeley and Contemporary Philosophy', in *The Cambridge History of English and American Literature: An Encyclopedia*, ed. by A. W. Ward and A. R. Waller, 18 vols. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1907), IX <<http://www.bartleby.com/219/>> [accessed 23 September 2015]
- Vance, Norman, 'Vallancey, Charles', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2004, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/28051>> [accessed 22 October 2013]
- Woodhead, Christine, 'Harborne, William', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2008, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/12234>> [accessed 24 August 2012]
- Wooding, Lucy, 'The Voices of Morebath: Reformation and Rebellion in an English Village, (review No. 266)', *Reviews in History*, 2001, <<http://www.history.ac.uk/reviews/review/266>> [accessed 4 July 2015]
- Woolf, Daniel Robert, 'Howell, James', *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, 2008, <<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/13974>> [accessed 26 November 2010]